
Re: [EXTERNAL] RE: staff report available

From Ellen Thackery <ellen.thackery@detroitmi.gov>

Date Tue 9/9/2025 1:29 PM

To nafshar@comcast.net <nafshar@comcast.net>

Cc 'Bardia Madani' <bardiahome@gmail.com>

Hello. Thank you for your email. I will post this on the webpage today and note there that this is new information.

- (1) Violations stay with a property. Please feel free to let the commissioners know that you didn't remove these windows, but an open violation remains open until it's resolved, regardless of ownership or if the property changes hands.
- (2) I pdfed our email conversations and posted them. I believe those PDFs are complete. I see in one of them links to realtor.com and homes.com and those links remain live. Is that where you are referring to average home costs? If you sent me a document and I neglected to post it, please resend it to me—I'll post it right away. Your email from today with its images, along with its attachments, will be posted on the site today and marked as new to the commissioners as of today.
- (3) Your email and the Cortland approval will be posted on the meeting webpage today for the commissioners. In case it is helpful to you, I would note that every property is different. They each come into the historic district in different states and conditions. The Cortland house may not have had any historic windows left, even when it was designated, whereas your Sturtevant house still has some of its historic windows remaining. Historic district commissions strive to preserve historic materials where they exist using the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The commission takes staff recommendations into account, but they will ask for information you want them to know before they begin their deliberations and before they make their decision. Please have your information about the economics of your house, and any other information you want them to know, ready to share with them.

Thank you.

Ellen

Ellen Thackery

Planner III, Historic Preservation | Planning & Development | City of Detroit

Coleman A. Young Municipal Center, 2 Woodward Ave. Suite 808, Detroit, MI 48226

🌐 www.detroitmi.gov/hdc

✉️ ellen.thackery@detroitmi.gov

Michael E. Duggan, Mayor



From: nafshar@comcast.net <nafshar@comcast.net>
Sent: Monday, September 8, 2025 9:51 PM
To: Ellen Thackery <ellen.thackery@detroitmi.gov>
Cc: 'Bardia Madani' <bardiahome@gmail.com>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] RE: staff report available

Dear Ellen,

We have examined the staff recommendation in detail and have some concerns with the information presented:

1- Violation 24-866 refers to April of 2024. We took possession of the house in 2025, therefore this violation cannot apply to us.

The photo below, taken on the day of the purchase which shows overgrowth in front of the house along with the collapsed porch, clearly indicate no windows present on the two openings which are the subject of the violation noted.



2 – We had provided references for the average cost of homes in our area, which you did not include in the documents. We are providing another screen shot from Zillow, which shows the current value of the house next door (4764 Sturtevant), which **has exactly the same style in every aspect to our house and the same square footage**. At \$136,000 market value, it clearly puts into question the viability of spending \$100,000+ on wood windows and restoration costs. Total cost of restoration of this house is far more than the windows, roof and gutters.

Additionally, we have just scoped the sewer and have found the underground sewer to have collapsed. The cost of repairing this item alone is between \$7,000 - \$15,000 depending on how far out the sewer has collapsed, which we will not know until we remove the concrete slab in the back yard. See attached description from B&C Sewer.

The estimated cost provided by Land Bank is from 2018, likely prior to the fire, as such woefully inadequate for returning this home to a livable space. Even if you did cut corners and refrained from many of the structural damages that the house has sustained, and took the DLB estimate at full value, there is no room to add \$100,000 in wood windows and restoration. This recommendation is simply and financially unrealistic.

Home value

Cost calculator

Owner options

 54 / 100
Somewhat Walkable

 48 / 100
Some Transit

 48 / 100
Somewh

Nearby homes



3 – The proposed windows, as noted on a number of prior communications, has already been approved by DHC in 2023. See the approval attached for 4021 Cortland, which is two blocks from us and in the same Historic District. It would clearly not be a fair treatment, if our project were to be denied using the same windows.

We kindly request that this information be shared with the commission for Wednesday's meeting.

Thanks & Regards
Nader Afshar
Bardia Madani

From: Ellen Thackery <ellen.thackery@detroitmi.gov>
Sent: Saturday, September 6, 2025 7:47 PM
To: nafshar@comcast.net
Subject: staff report available

Mr. Afshar,

Attached is report outlining staff response and recommendation to the Historic District Commission regarding your application for work at 4758 Sturtevant, to be heard at the Detroit Historic District

Commission meeting on **9/10/25 at 4:30 PM**.

Note that the Commission is not required to follow staff recommendations and you should be prepared to make a case to the Commission as to why your project should be approved as designed. You will have the opportunity to vocalize a presentation and respond to staff analysis.

This meeting will be held in person at the Coleman A. Young Municipal Center but can be attended by applicants online, via Zoom. We recommend that applicants attend in person if possible. After 5:00PM, the only entrance to the building is via the Randolph Street entrance. **Please respond to this email letting me know what members of your applicant team expect to join via Zoom, so they can be identified by our staff for "promotion" to the webinar panel at the appropriate time.**

Historic District Commission Meeting Details:

Wednesday, 9/10/25 at 4:30 PM

(In person) - Coleman A. Young Municipal Center, 2 Woodward Ave, Detroit, MI 48226
Erma Henderson Auditorium, 13th floor

(Via Zoom) - Meeting Link: <https://cityofdetroit.zoom.us/j/532007617>

By Phone: 312-626-6799 (Meeting ID # 532007617)

Please take this opportunity to carefully review the staff report and alert me immediately to any omissions or errors of fact you detect. Should you wish to add additional information to your submission, or clarify any matters, you are welcome to do so prior to the meeting, and your updates will be posted to the webpage for your agenda item. Staff and applicants will also have the opportunity to clarify/discuss matters during your Commission review. The Commission may also have additional questions or comments concerning your proposal, outside of what is discussed in the staff report, which you should be ready to answer.

Also, please confirm that all your submitted materials have been made available for Commission review (click on your property) at the website below:

<https://detroitmi.gov/events/regular-historic-district-commission-hdc-meeting-09102025>

Thank you.

Ellen Thackery

Planner III, Historic Preservation | Planning & Development | City of Detroit

Coleman A. Young Municipal Center, 2 Woodward Ave. Suite 808, Detroit, MI 48226

 www.detroitmi.gov/hdc

 ellen.thackery@detroitmi.gov

Michael E. Duggan, Mayor

