

1453 W Boston Blvd – Project Review Request Roof Replacement

1. Description of Existing Condition:

The current roof 1453 W Boston Blvd is natural slate. The entire roof is slate except for the section over the kitchen which is rubber walkout. Both front dormers are wood siding. Roof has metal flashing around chimney and dormers.

The bulk of the slate roof tiles are original to the house, which was built in 1915. Most slate roofs have a life expectancy of 75-90 years. This roof is roughly 108 years old. While certain sections of the primary roof are in good condition, there are many sections in poor condition. There are several loose tiles and many that are chipped/damaged. The garage roof has damaged and missing tiles as well. Additionally, the garage roof has severe framing issues with large sections of framing and siding missing.

The previous owner has made various repairs in the attempt to upkeep the slate roof. However, they were done to a subpar quality and were not done consistently enough to preserve the roof long-term.

A repair specialist from Butcher & Butcher Construction came out to the property on two separate occasions to review the property. Their position was the following:

John Edwards - Field Supervisor & Estimator, Butcher & Butcher Construction

Simply from walking around at ground level and looking over the roof surface from a drone, I see a lot of issues. The flat roofs are shot and improperly repaired who knows how many times over. The roof flanged gutter system is failing and crushed at multiple areas. All the steel flashings look to be rusting out and failing at almost every point. The dormers all look to have rotted trim along roof flashing points. I can see mastic and caulking spread at several areas where we should never expect to see that on a slate roof especially, because water that gets in cannot get out. There are loads of slate that are falling out of place, missing or broken, and I have no idea the degree of any kind of decking issues at this time. The garage aside from needing a pallet of slate and serious decking work has structural issues as well.

For these reasons, I simply cannot give you an estimated price for repairs, and I wouldn't recommend repairs due to the overwhelming amount of issues that I've already listed. Aside from possibly having "temporary emergency repairs" just to stop leaks until you can budget for a full replacement.

Additionally, I would like to emphasize that there is visible water damage in the kitchen, level 2 bedroom and level 3 bathroom. The level 3 bathroom has been damaged so much that it is not currently useable.

Based on this information, this roof requires a full replacement with all new underlayment, new tiles, new flashing, gutters, downspouts, etc.

2. Description of Project:

Existing slate roof would be removed and replaced with a new high-quality asphalt shingle. The same roof material would be used on the primary roof and garage roof.

I love the beauty of the current slate roof. If I could keep it, I would. Unfortunately, I believe this roof is beyond its life expectancy and would require a number of very costly repairs over the coming years. It would be a series of patchworks that will only cause more issues in the future.

Based on my research and input from John of Butcher & Butcher, any effort made to repair or replace the existing slate would be cost prohibitive. Quotes showed that the cost to replace the slate roof for the primary house and garage would be between \$175,000 and \$200,000. I asked about synthetic slate and they said the cost would be roughly the same. Neither of these options are viable.

I believe a new, high-quality asphalt shingle roof, in a color style and character that matches the house and its neighbors, is the best possible option.

Preferred Option:

Certainteed Landmark® Climateflex® - Colonial Slate

It is several shades of grey with undertones of blue and red.

Photos below: Existing slate (left) vs. example Colonial Slate asphalt roof



I would like to add some additional context. This house is a very large project. The roof is just one of many issues with this house. I purchased this home with the goal of renovating a beautiful Detroit home in a historic neighborhood that my family could enjoy for many decades. While I cannot afford to replace the roof with slate, I do plan to repair and replace other aspects of the home. I plan to restore and maintain the home for the foreseeable future.

It is vital that we install a new roof. This new roof will provide the foundation for all future improvements and long-term maintenance of the home.

Additional improvements planned for the current home renovation:

- Restore/repair all existing (47) original windows
- Restore/repair all existing (27) original doors
- Restore original hardwood floors on levels 1, 2 and 3
- Repair all (3) bathrooms
- Repair damaged siding/fascia and paint to match existing finish and color
- Replace damaged/defective garage doors to match color and feel of home *(Already approved by HDC)*

- Repair all damaged plaster and painted surfaces
- Repair/Replace all damaged wall trim
- Remove existing knob and tube wiring and replace with modern electrical throughout the entire house
- Add HVAC to the second and third levels of the home
- Install a Concrete driveway from street up to the garage – currently no driveway from front of house to garage (*Separate application to HDC*)
- Install new Concrete Slab for Garage

3. Detailed Scope of Work for Proposed Roof Replacement (Primary Roof and Garage):

- Removal of existing slate tile roof
- Removal and replacement of rotten and damaged wood
- Installation of underlayment
- Installation of ice and water shield installed along valleys and bottom edges
- Installation of asphalt shingle roof (Certaineed Landmark® Climateflex® - Colonial Slate)
- Installation of ridge and eave vents on main roof
- Installation of chimney, step and counter flashing
- Installation of peel and stick base and cap sheet or torch down bitumen to back flat sleeping kitchen roof
- Repair all dormer siding and trim to match existing finish
- Install all new gutters and downspouts to match existing color
- Garage will require additional framing repair