

**STAFF REPORT:** 02/11/2026 MEETING  
**APPLICATION NUMBER:** HDC2026-00005  
**ADDRESS:** 19630 ROSLYN

**PREPARED BY:** A. DYE

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** SHERWOOD FOREST  
**APPLICANT:** ALBERT BENEZRA, WEATHERGARD WINDOWS  
**PROPERTY OWNER:** LADONNA BARNES  
**DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION:** 01/20/2026  
**DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT:** 01/28/2026

**SCOPE:** REPLACE VINYL WINDOWS WITH CASEMENT-STYLE VINYL WINDOWS

**EXISTING CONDITIONS**

The dwelling at 19630 Roslyn was erected in 1926. The house exhibits Tudor revival styling through the steeply pitched roof, asymmetrical front elevation with multiple front-facing gables, an oriel window, and arched front entry with flanking small arched window. Vinyl siding covers some of the wall surfaces on each elevation; the pattern gives reference to possibly covered half-timber and stucco finishes. obscuring the original architectural character of the house



*Staff photo, January, 28, 2026.*

**STAFF SUMMARY OF SCOPE OF WORK:**

Based on staff review of the submitted documents, the following work is proposed:

- **Replace four (4) existing vinyl windows with new vinyl windows**
  - Location: Side (north) wall, first and second story
  - Operation and design: casement with undivided glass
  - Color: Royal Brown - window and aluminum coil/trim

## STAFF ANALYSIS, OBSERVATIONS, AND RESEARCH

- The Sherwood Forest Historic District was enacted on May 13, 2002.
- The building permit for the house and garage was issued in June 1926.

19630	
Roßlyn Rd	70
11351 6-24-26	LOT NO.
Dwelling	DATE
USE	Brk Ven.
CONS.	
REMARKS	O. K. O. K.

Permit card, BSEED.



Designation photo, 2002. HDAB.

- Per the designation photo, the house's original windows were no longer extant at the time of district designation.
  - The vinyl window units do not have architectural or historical significance.
  - Brown window sash conforms to Color System D (Tudor, Gothic and English Cottage Styles).
  - Tall and narrow casement windows, often grouped to make a wider than tall window opening, are very common for English Revival structures.
- The Sherwood Forest's Elements of Design discuss windows as they relate to differing architectural designs of residential buildings:
  - (3) Proportion of openings within the façades. Proportion of openings varies greatly according to the style of the building. Typical openings are taller than wide, but individual windows are often grouped together to fill a single opening which is wider than tall. Windows are usually subdivided; buildings designed in English Revival styles frequently display leaded glass in casement windows and transoms...In general, openings amount to between 20 percent and 35 percent of the front façades.*
  - (7) Relationship of materials. The majority of houses are faced with pressed, wire cut or glazed brick, often combined with wood, stone and/or stucco. Stone trim is common, and wood is almost universally used for window frames, half-timbering, and other functional trim. Windows are commonly either of the metal casement or wooden sash variety. Glass block exists as an original material in some window openings of modern buildings...*
  - (10) Relationship of architectural details. The architectural elements and details of each structure generally relate to its style. Residential buildings derived from characteristic elements and details displayed on vernacular English Revival-influenced buildings include arched windows and door openings, steeply pitched gables, towers, and sometimes half-timbering. Tall, clustered chimney stacks and decorative chimney pots are features of the district...In general, the district is rich in early to mid 20<sup>th</sup> Century architectural styles. Garages correspond in architecture to the main residential dwelling.*
- According to the National Park Service's document Replacement Windows that meet the Standards:
  - Replacement windows for missing or non-historic windows must be compatible with the historic appearance and character of the building and consistent with the general characteristics of a historic window of the type and period.
  - Replacing existing incompatible, non-historic windows with similarly incompatible new windows does not meet the Standards.
- Through the limits of fabrication and material, it is staff's opinion that vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic districts.
  - Vinyl windows and wrapped brickmould offer a plasticity and flat/thick appearance that does not adequately match the profile/dimensionality and appearance of historic windows, such as wood.

- Consumer grade vinyl windows weather poorly, deteriorate rapidly, and exhibit poor detailing and detracting color/sheen.
- The framing material, glazing, and seals (which keeps the argon gas intact between the insulated glass) of vinyl windows break down more quickly in ultraviolet light than wood or steel-framed windows.
- Vinyl also lacks rigidity and can expand and contract more greatly than wood and steel. This can result in discoloration and warping of the vinyl frames, as well as condensation between the glass layers.
- The below view of the north-side wall and west-front walls offers a good view of the position of the four (4) window openings included in this application. Two individual openings are at the first floor, one double window-mulled unit is at the second floor, and all are undivided casement windows. Flat aluminum coil stock surrounds each window.



Staff photo, looking southeast from the Roslyn sidewalk, January 28, 2026.  
Right: Applicant photo.



## ISSUES

- Through the limits of fabrication and material, vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic districts.
  - Vinyl windows and wrapped brickmould offer a plasticity and flat/thick appearance that does not adequately match the profile/dimensionality and appearance of historic windows, such as wood.
  - Consumer grade vinyl windows weather poorly, deteriorate rapidly, and exhibit poor detailing and detracting color/sheen.
  - The framing material, glazing, and seals (which keeps the argon gas intact between the insulated glass) of vinyl windows break down more quickly in ultraviolet light than wood or steel-framed windows.
  - Vinyl also lacks rigidity and can expand and contract more greatly than wood and steel. This can result in discoloration and warping of the vinyl frames, as well as condensation between the glass layers.
- Flat aluminum coil stock surrounds each window. Staff doesn't know if the original wood brickmould remains under the aluminum, but it is highly likely. Any window replacement application should consider the condition of removal of the aluminum coil and exposure of the profiled wood trim.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

### **Recommendation 1 of 1, Denial**

Staff recommends that the proposed work will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Sherwood Forest Historic District's Elements of Design, specifically:

*Standard 9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

AND

*Elements of Design 3, 7, and 10.*

For the following reasons;

- Through the limits of fabrication and material, vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic districts.
  - Vinyl windows and wrapped brickmould offer a plasticity and flat/thick appearance that does not adequately match the profile/dimensionality and appearance of historic windows, such as wood.
  - Consumer grade vinyl windows weather poorly, deteriorate rapidly, and exhibit poor detailing and detracting color/sheen.
  - The framing material, glazing, and seals (which keeps the argon gas intact between the insulated glass) of vinyl windows break down more quickly in ultraviolet light than wood or steel-framed windows.
  - Vinyl also lacks rigidity and can expand and contract more greatly than wood and steel. This can result in discoloration and warping of the vinyl frames, as well as condensation between the glass layers.