

STAFF REPORT: OCTOBER 8, 2025 MEETING

PREPARED BY: E. THACKERY

APPLICATION NUMBER: HDC2025-00577

ADDRESS: 19219 WARRINGTON DRIVE

HISTORIC DISTRICT: SHERWOOD FOREST HISTORIC DISTRICT

APPLICANT: PAUL HAYTER, PREMIER BUILDER INC

PROPERTY OWNER: CARRON PINKINS

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 9/15/2025

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: 9/23/25

SCOPE: REMOVE EXISTING WOOD ROOF SHINGLES AND REPLACE WITH ASPHALT ROOF ON HOUSE AND GARAGE

EXISTING CONDITIONS

19219 Warrington Drive is a Tudor Revival style house in the Sherwood Forest local historic district. Both the house and garage (noted as brick veneer) were permitted in 1941.

According to city HDC records, in 2023, a wood shake roof was approved to replace the existing wood shake roof. Applicant now seeks to replace the existing wood shake roof with asphalt.

Other past permits include:

- 2002: Remove vinyl siding from rear two-story porches and restore railing, install screens
- 1971: Above-ground pool
- 1954: 6'-high brick wall along rear lot line



19219 Warrington Drive, front (east) façade, north side, and garage, September 2025, staff photo. Wood shingle roof evident on both house and garage.



19219 Warrington Drive outlined in yellow, Detroit Parcel Viewer. Both house and garage are shown.

The applicant first applied to the historic district commission to replace the garage roof only, and then added the house to the scope of work as well. The homeowner and contractor plan to complete the work in phases, starting with the garage and then finishing with the house, but seek both approvals now.



19219 Warrington Drive, Sherwood Forest, Designation Photo, 2002. Wood shingles were on the house and garage at the time of designation.



19219 Warrington Drive, front (east) façade, September 2025, staff photo. Wood shingle roof evident on both house and garage.



19219 Warrington Drive, front (east) façade and some of the north side visible, September 2025, staff photo. Wood shingle roof evident on both house and garage.



19219 Warrington Drive, north side bay window and side door elements and garage's east side, September 2025, staff photo. Wood shingle roof evident.



19219 Warrington Drive, garage's front (east) façade, September 2025, staff photo.



19219 Warrington Drive, north side shown, along with garage, September 2025, staff photo. Some of the house's east (front) end shown as well.



19219 Warrington Drive, south side, along with some of the house's east façade as well. September 2025, staff photo.



The two houses above are neighboring houses to 19219 Warrington and their garage roofs match the house roofs.



The two houses above are neighboring houses to 19219 Warrington and their garage roofs match the house roofs.

PROPOSAL

- Remove existing wood shake shingles from house and garage roofs, install asphalt shingles on both

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The Sherwood Forest Local Historic District was designated in 2002.
- The district's period of significance is 1922-1955, so both the house and garage are contributing resources.
- The wood shake roof is a distinctive feature of both of these contributing resources, and was present at the time of designation.
- The Historic Designation Advisory Board **district report** stated, "Garages could be erected, but only for the private use of the homeowner, except for lots on Livernois Avenue. Apartments for household employees could be located in two-story garages. All garages were required to correspond in architecture and material to the main residence." Because of this architectural style and material requirement, approximately 300 detached garages contribute to the district. Today, there is a wide variety of roofing materials on the houses and garages immediately surrounding 19219 Warrington across different lots; on individual lots, however, even today, roofs on houses and their garages match.
- The report also states, "The residential buildings of Sherwood Forest are predominantly Neo-Tudor, a style based on English Medieval and early Renaissance architecture. This style, very popular in Detroit through the 1930s, is typified by features that include steeply pitched roofs, battlements, decorative half-timbering, Tudor arches, facades dominated by one or more prominent cross gables, and decorative windows, usually in multiple groups with multi-pane glazing or heraldic stained glass. Massive, twisted chimney stacks crowned with decorative chimney pots are often found on Neo-Tudor houses. All of the houses are of masonry construction, the majority of which are brick veneer over frame, concrete block, or hollow clay tile. Other materials include stone and concrete block clad in stucco. Contrasting limestone trim was used for window and door surrounds, chimney caps, and coping. Roofs are often slate of random widths and colors." The report does not mention wood or shake shingle roofs.
- Turning to the district's **Elements of Design** for Sherwood Forest, relevant elements for this house and/or proposed project include the Elements below:
 - 7) *Relationship of materials. ...Roofs on the majority of the buildings in the Sherwood Forest Historic District are either slate or slate-like asphalt shingles.*
 - 8) *Relationship of textures. The major textural relationship is that of brick laid in mortar, often juxtaposed with wood, or with smooth or rough-faced stucco and/or stone elements and trim. Textured brick and brick laid in patterns creates considerable interest, as does half-timbering, leaded and subdivided windows, and wood-shingled or horizontal-sided elements. Slate roofs have particular textural values where they exist. Asphalt shingles generally have little textural interest, even in those types which purport to imitate natural materials. Garages correspond in materials to the main residential dwelling.*
 - 9) *Relationship of colors. Roofs are in natural slate colors, and asphalt shingles are predominantly within this same dark color range. ... Colors used on garages should relate to the colors of the main dwelling.*
 - 10) *Relationship of architectural details. Garages correspond in architecture to the main residential dwelling.*
 - 13) *Relationship of significant landscape features and surface treatments. The typical treatment of individual properties is that of a dwelling erected on a grade of approximately 15 to 20 inches above the inner grade line of the public sidewalk. The front lawn area is generally covered with grass turf, subdivided by a straight or curving concrete, stone, or brick walk leading to the front entrance and a single width side driveway leading to a garage, which is most often located at the rear of the lot but*

sometimes attached to the rear, side, or, less frequently, the front of the main dwelling. On corner lots, garages are located on the side streets and the width of the driveway corresponds to the width of the garage. A single storage building, including garden and tool sheds, shall be permitted, provided, that it is placed at the rear of the property, is harmonious in color and design to the contiguous property, does not exceed six feet by ten feet in length and width, and six feet in height.

- To remove a material that the Elements of Design emphasize as lending considerable interest (wood shingles) and replace it with a material (asphalt shingles) the Elements describe as having little textural interest seems to staff to contradict the Elements of Design for this district.
- Considering the **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**, since this roof is a distinctive feature on a contributing historic resource, staff finds that the relevant Standard to consider is Standard 6: "Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence."
- Staff does not find that the asphalt roof proposed for the house and garage is a close enough visual match for the existing wood shake roofing in design, color, texture, or materials to meet this Standard.
- It is important to note that a historic feature replaced under Standard 6 does not lose its character-defining quality. In other words, although these specific wood shakes may not date from 1941 when the house and garage were first constructed, they replaced wood shakes that existed on the house historically, retaining that historic, character-defining feature and that thread of historic importance.

ISSUES

- Both the house and garage contribute to the historic district and both are currently covered in wood shake roofing, which is a distinctive and historic character-defining feature of the resources.
- Applying Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #6, staff does not find that the asphalt roof proposed for the house and garage is a close enough visual match for the existing wood shake roofing in design, color, texture, or materials to meet this Standard.
- The Elements of Design for the district (#8) highlight the fact that wood shakes lend textural interest to the district, and that asphalt shingles have little textural interest.
- Both the Elements of Design and the designation report state that it is significant in the district that garages relate to the primary house on the lot; the garages must take their cues from the materials, colors, and architectural styles used on the main house. As a result, whatever roofing material is selected at this property, both the house and the garage must be roofed with the same material.

RECOMMENDATION

Section 21-2-78, Determinations of Historic District Commission

Recommendation 1 of 1, Denial

Staff recommends that the proposed work will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Sherwood Forest Historic District's Elements of Design, specifically:

- *Standard 6: Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features*

shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
and

- *Elements of Design #8.*

For the following reasons:

- Both the house and garage contribute to the historic district and both are currently covered in wood shake roofing, which is a distinctive and historic character-defining feature of the resources.
- The asphalt roof proposed for the house and garage is not a close enough visual match for the existing wood shake roofing in design, color, texture, or materials.
- The Elements of Design for the district (#8) state that wood shakes lend textural interest to the district, whereas asphalt shingles have little textural interest.