STAFF REPORT: JULY 9, 2025 MEETING PREPARED BY: B. SALIE

APPLICATION NUMBER: HDC2025-00191 ADDRESS: 19410 CANTERBURY ROAD HISTORIC DISTRICT: SHERWOOD FOREST APPLICANT: ALEXANDER BELILOVSKY PROPERTY OWNER: CALVIN FOSTER

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 06/20/2025

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: 06/26/2025

**SCOPE**: REPLACE HISTORIC WINDOWS

### **EXISTING CONDITIONS**

This parcel at 19410 Canterbury Street is occupied by a two-story, single-family residence, located between Canterbury and Stratford Road in the Sherwood Forest Historic District. Erected in 1950, the house was designed by Architect Philip H. Funke for Abe Raitt. The building features a complex hipped roof with deep, overhanging eaves. Exterior walls are clad with brick and permastone. Windows are largely the original wood casement and fixed units, with five vinyl replacement units, located at the building's rear wall, first story.



19410 Canterbury Street, Current Appearance. Taken by staff on 06/26/2025.



Detroit Parcel Viewer

Aerial View of 19410 Canterbury Street

Google Earth





Photos taken by staff on 06/26/2025.





Photos taken from Zillow listing, show existing interior of wood windows as a character defining feature.

## **PROPOSAL**

Per the submitted application, the proposed scope of work is as follows:

- Remove all existing historic wood and windows to rough opening
- Remove four existing fixed vinyl windows at rear wall, first story
- Install aluminum clad wood window

• Per the applicant's submission, with the exception of five windows at the rear wall, first-story, all remaining windows are the original wood casement and fixed units (see the below photos)



Rear Exterior Elevation

- Windows 1-4 are all vinyl
- All remaining windows are historic wood



Front Exterior Elevation



Right Side Exterior Elevation

### STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

• The Sherwood Forest Historic District was designated in 2002



19410 Canterbury Street, designation photo taken July 2, 2002

- It is Staff's opinion that the building's historic wood windows are distinctive, character-defining feature of the property, while the four vinyl replacement units at the rear of the building, first story, do not contribute to the building's historic character.
- A review of the photos provided by the applicant revealed that the wood windows which are
  proposed for replacement appear to be in good condition and repaired, if necessary <u>Detailed</u>
  <u>Window Photos company cam report</u>. It is therefore Staff's opinion that their proposed
  replacement does not meet the standards, which require the retention of character defining
  features which can be repaired.
- With respect to the proposal to replace four fixed non-historic vinyl windows at the rear wall, first-story with new aluminum-clad wood units, it is the staff's opinion that the work item does meet the standards.
- As per the NPS'S Guidance regarding the replacement of non-historic windows, Replacement Windows that Meet the Standards Historic Preservation Tax Incentives (U.S. National Park Service), "Replacement windows for missing non historic windows must be compatible with the historic appearance and character of the building."
- The Application proposes to install windows of a material (aluminum-clad wood), operation (casement and fixed), and lite configuration (divided lite and full/undivided) which is compatible with the existing historic units. Staff therefore recommend that the commission approve this work item.

### **ISSUES**

- The wood windows proposed for replacement are of historic age and are distinctive character defining features of the property in the staff's opinion.
- In the staff's opinion, the wood windows are in repairable condition. Therefore, per the Standards, these windows should not be removed.

#### **RECOMMENDATION(S)**

Section 21-2-78, Determinations of Historic District Commission

# <u>Recommendation 1 of 2 - Denial - Replace historic wood and non-historic vinyl windows with</u> aluminum clad wood frame windows

Staff recommends that the proposed work will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Sherwood Forest Historic District's Elements of Design, specifically:

#### Standards #:

- (2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- (5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- (6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Elements of Design #: 7

### For the following reasons:

• The wood windows proposed for removal are significant historic features that contribute to the character of the property and as they have been shown to be in repairable condition, should be retained and repaired when necessary.

# <u>Recommendation 2 of 2 - Certificate of Appropriateness - Replace non-historic vinyl windows with aluminum clad wood frame windows</u>

Staff recommends that the remaining work items will be appropriate, according to the Secretary of Interior's standards for Rehabilitation and the Sherwood Forest Historic District's Elements of Design.