

**STAFF REPORT: JULY 9, 2025 MEETING**  
**APPLICATION NUMBER: HDC2025-00291**  
**ADDRESS: 1068 HUBBARD**

**PREPARED BY: E. THACKERY**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: HUBBARD FARMS**  
**APPLICANT: MATTHEW RYAN LENHOFF**  
**PROPERTY OWNER: MATTHEW RYAN LENHOFF**  
**DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: JUNE 13, 2025**  
**DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: JUNE 23, 2025**

**SCOPE: REPLACE WINDOWS ON THE FIRST AND SECOND FLOORS**

### **EXISTING CONDITIONS**

The 2-1/2 story dwelling at 1068 Hubbard is an American four-square house of reddish-brown brick with a clay-colored asphalt roof. Three dormer windows punctuate the main hipped roof on the house's north, west, and south sides. The front (west) elevation features a two-story bay window and a one-story front porch with square brick columns, low brick walls around the porch, and brick wing walls flanking the front steps. The City's building permit records show that the house was built in 1911. It has a high degree of historic integrity and contributes to the Hubbard Farms Historic District. From the sidewalk, besides the sashes in the dormer windows, all of the windows look to be: historic wood windows with divided lights in the upper sashes; fixed windows with leaded glass transoms; or stained glass windows. All appear to be in good condition from the sidewalk.



*Photo 1, west (front) facade, some of the south façade also visible, site visit, 6/23/25, staff.*





*Photo 2, south façade with some of the west (front) façade visible, site visit, 6/23/25, staff. Stained glass is in the oval window close to the front porch, and leaded or stained glass is in the central arched window. On the front of the house, an oval stained glass window is visible centered above the front door and a transom with leaded glass is barely visible behind the square porch column.*





*Photo 3, north façade with some of the west (front) façade visible, site visit, 6/23/25, staff. Because the houses on this side of the property are close together, it is difficult to get an assessment of the north-side windows from the street. On the front of the house, the leaded glass in the bay window mirrors the leaded glass transom behind the porch column shown in Photo 2.*

## PROPOSAL

- Replace 13 existing wood double-hung windows (6/1 and 8/1) on the first and second floors with new aluminum-clad wood units. Pocket fit install
- Patterns of existing sashes to be duplicated; simulated divided lights where divided lights exist.

## STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The Hubbard Farms Local Historic District was enacted in 1993.
- The sashes in the dormer windows are replacement windows that were approved in approximately 2017.
- Application states, “Fixed windows above double hungs with decorative glass and metal grill patterns will remain untouched.” Staff understands this to mean that stained glass and leaded glass windows will remain in place as is, but commission may wish to confirm.
- The wood windows in this house which are proposed for replacement are significant character-defining features.
- The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation Standard 6 requires a two-part review for window replacement applications subject to the review by the Commission. First, the condition of the existing windows must be understood. Only after confirmation that the windows have deteriorated beyond repair should the Commission consider whether the selected replacement windows are appropriate for the structure and window locations.
  - Regarding condition, the applicant has provided the proposed window order/quote and an exterior photo of almost every window proposed for replacement to help clarify the window order. However, as only representative photos of window damage have been submitted, the application does not provide a detailed photo documentation of every windows proposed for replacement which shows their current condition.
  - Staff finds some of the conditions photos difficult to see or understand, although some wood damage on window frames, stools/sills, and sashes can be seen. The application mentions cracked glass, missing ropes, and windows being sealed shut in addition to the wood damage mentioned.
  - The applicant mentioned that they didn’t seek window restoration help because the issues the applicant experiences go beyond aesthetic concerns.
  - The Secretary of the Interior’s Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings states that it is Not Recommended to replace windows “solely because of peeling paint, broken glass, stuck sash, or high air infiltration. These conditions, in themselves, do not indicate that windows are beyond repair.”
  - Staff believes that more detailed photographs of each window’s condition and/or an assessment from a window restoration professional would help provide more complete information for the commission to make their assessment about repairability.
  - If the first condition about repair infeasibility could be met, staff identified some concerns regarding appropriateness of the proposed replacements. Specifically, staff is concerned about the bright white of the aluminum cladding on this reddish/brownish brick home, and the slight difference in dimensionality that the new/ca. 2017 windows exhibit in the dormer. Even from the ground, the viewer can perceive that those windows in the dormers are different; they appear a little flatter. When multiplied across the entire front façade and two sides of the house, especially when closer to the viewer’s eye level, staff believes there will likely be a difference in the way the facades and windows appear. There may be some loss in richness of detail and some dimensionality.

## ISSUES

- The wood windows proposed for replacement are distinctive, character-defining features of the property.
- The current application does not provide documentation of each window proposed for replacement that demonstrates that they are deteriorated beyond repair.
- The existing historic windows proposed for replacement should therefore be retained and repaired in kind, where necessary as required by the Standards.

## RECOMMENDATION

### **Recommendation # 1 of 1 Denial – Replacement of wood windows**

Staff recommends that the proposed work will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Hubbard Farms Historic District's Elements of Design, specifically, Standard #: 2, 5 & 6

*2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

*5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

*6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

For the following reasons:

- The wood windows proposed for replacement are distinctive, character-defining features of the property.
- The current application does not provide documentation of each window proposed for replacement that demonstrates that they are deteriorated beyond repair.
- The existing historic windows proposed for replacement should therefore be retained and repaired in kind, where necessary.