

SUPPLEMENTARY

STAFF REPORT 11-13-2024 REGULAR MEETING

PREPARED BY: G. LANDSBERG

APPLICATION NUMBER: HDC2024-00623

ADDRESS: 708 PALLISTER

HISTORIC DISTRICT: NEW CENTER AREA

APPLICANT/ARCHITECT: TIM FLINTOFF, AIA/4545 ARCHITECTURE

OWNER: THOMAS TYPINSKI

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 11-12-2024

DATES OF STAFF SITE VISITS: 11-13-2024

SCOPE: UNAPPROVED AS-BUILT REVISION TO PREVIOUSLY APPROVED DESIGN, INCLUDING ALTERATIONS TO EXISTING AND NEW DORMERS, FRONT PORCH, REPLACEMENT OF HISTORIC WINDOWS, ALTERATION OF WINDOW/DOOR OPENINGS, AND OTHER SCOPE ITEMS



View of 708 Pallister, looking north from the sidewalk. Stop work order (orange sticker) is visible on one of the replaced windows. Staff photo, November 13, 2024.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

This is a 2½ story frame house located on the north side of Pallister Street between 3rd Avenue and Bethune Court. The house was erected prior to 1915 and is finished in narrow-exposure clapboard at the 1st story, and true wood shake at the 2nd story, juxtaposed with generous wood trim. Prior to their recent unapproved replacement, the house featured handsome and distinctively character-defining wooden divided-lite windows, some of them with an unusual 2/1 geometry. The quality and care incorporated into the original materials and design is evident.

The original porch is missing, with only its original roof surviving, and was replaced decades ago by a concrete block porch of poor design, which negatively impacts the overall historic character. The

Adjacent to the property is a vacant lot where a historic house stood until about thirty years ago. The larger

context of the block is somewhat unique, as the neighborhood underwent radical changes during a late 1970s urban renewal project meant to accommodate future development. The designation of the area as a historic district occurred during this transitional era. This block of Pallister Street is closed to regular automobile traffic, boasts a brick-paved street, and is notably accessed by cars only at the rear. Every property, subject to deed restrictions and agreements during the renewal era, was required to erect or maintain a historically appropriate garage and pave an additional rear parking (“visitor”) spot convenient to the rear service drive.



View of 708 Pallister prior to this year's work, looking northwest from the sidewalk. Staff photo, January 24, 2024.

VIOLATIONS

The Commission approved a professionally designed historic rehabilitation for the property at the February 7, 2024 meeting, which preserved the property's character-defining features while allowing interior expansion. Despite this, unapproved work destructive to historic character began by the owner's contractors almost immediately after this approval, contrary to the Commission's approval and prior to any HDC staff review of revised drawings or BSEED approval of the permit drawings, which were approved expeditiously on February 28, 2024. Those permit drawings, available to the Commission on the meeting website, satisfied staff conditions concerning the rear deck doors (which were expected to feature a 2/1 design to match all the existing historic windows). It is staff's understanding that the architect for this project was not retained for construction administration and had no oversight or observation role over the construction work. Subsequent to BSEED's stop work orders, the original architect was retained to present the as-built design for your review.

Our office has recorded the following complaints and enforcement actions (list not exhaustive):

2/12/2024 - See Click Fix/Improve Detroit community complaint or email. Staff site visit.

2/13/2024- BSEED Inspection

2/15/2024 Inspection/Stop Work

2/16/2024- Stop Work Posting

7/16/2024 Failed Inspection

7/17/2024 Stop Work Order

7/23/2024 Re-Inspection

8/2/2024 - See Click Fix/Improve Detroit community complaint or email. Staff site visit.

10/03/2024 Re-Inspection – BSEED inspection scheduled with NPO, Failed inspection

10/7/2024 – BSEED inspection

10/8/2024 – See Click Fix/Improve Detroit community complaint or email. Staff site visit/referral to BSEED.

10/29/2024- See Click Fix/Improve Detroit community complaint or email. Staff site visit/referral to BSEED.

10/30/2024 - See Click Fix/Improve Detroit community complaint or email. HDC staff again visits site and makes the following report to BSEED: *Staff observed evidence of continued work on site, including fresh painting. Received additional field report of paint stripping activities that ejected paint chips and debris on to neighboring properties. Ladders and paint cans at rear of property suggesting work in progress. No one on site during visit. Please send to BSEED requesting continue monitoring and escalation to NPO for enforcement if necessary to enforce Stop Work order.*

10/31/2024 Inspection

11/4/2024 – BSEED inspection

11/7/2024 - See Click Fix/Improve Detroit community complaint or email. Referral to BSEED.

11/13/2024 - See Click Fix/Improve Detroit community complaint or email. Staff site visit/referral to BSEED.

11/13/2024 – BSEED inspection with Officer Gibson (NPO), BSEED Inspectors Arrington and Irving, and PDD/HDC Staff

Earlier today, HDC staff visited the property accompanied by BSEED inspectors and the DPD to enforce the Stop Work order. Inspector Arrington made the following report to the Commission:

“We visited the home at 708 Pallister, accompanied by Inspector Irving, Officer Gibson, historic- Garrick Landsberg and Tim Boscarino. There were two workers on site who left the property once reminded of the stop work posting. We also spoke with the homeowner Thomas Typinski by phone, he has a meeting today with historic and was informed that there should be no work at the property until this situation is resolved. Inspector Irving is writing the inspection report and attaching an additional fee.”

Supervising Building Inspector Jerrid Pernell has ordered the property referred to court and tickets issued. The Commission's decision tonight will affect what scope is subject to court action. As described in the 2019 Detroit City Code, Section 21-2-59, “Enforcement,” :

(d)A person or individual who, or a partnership, firm, corporation, organization, institution, or agency

of government performing work on a resource prior to the issuance of or contrary to conditions specified in a certificate of appropriateness or notice to proceed, or permit issued for work on a resource in violation of this article is subject to a civil fine under Section 21-1-3 of this Code.

(e) A person or individual who, or a partnership, firm, corporation, organization, institution, or agency of government which, violates this article may be ordered by a court to pay the costs to restore or replicate a resource unlawfully constructed, added to, altered, repaired, moved, excavated, or demolished under Section 21-1-3 of this Code.

Through today, staff has identified the following unapproved work (violations) at this property:

1. Replacement of 14 (fourteen) original 2-over-1 and other multi-lite wooden single-hung windows with vinyl clad wood 1/1 windows, contrary to the Commission's approval of a plan for their preservation and restoration.
2. New side and rear dormers built 10'-0" wide, contrary to the Commission's approval of 7'-2" wide dormers to match the existing historic front dormer.
3. New side dormers built with gable-end roofs and narrow eaves, contrary to the Commission's approval of hipped roofs with wide eaves, to match the existing historic front dormer. The rear dormer, while showing a more correct roof form, was also built too wide, resulting in incompatibly narrow eaves.
4. Sliding, vinyl-clad windows have been installed in the new west side and rear dormer, contrary to the Commission's approval of 8-lite, simulated divided lite fibrex (Anderson 100) casement units to match the historic front dormer window.
5. At the new east side dormer, no window has been installed at all, contrary to the Commission's approval of an 8-lite, simulated divided lite fibrex (Anderson 100) casement unit to match the historic front dormer window.
6. All dormers, including the historic dormer, have been reclad with apparent vinyl or composition artificial shake shingles with imitation wood grain, contrary to the Commission's approval of true wood shake to match the historic front dormer. This artificial product is notably white in the context of the off-white ("yellowish white") paint at the rest of the house.
7. In addition to the artificial vinyl/composition shake treatment, all of the dormer eaves (including that of the original) have been covered with artificial siding, contrary to the wood eaves approved by the Commission.
8. At the east (side) wall, a new window framed by vinyl or composite imitation wood grain boards was installed at a forward 1st story location, contrary to the intended replacement of the existing rearward window with an Anderson 100 unit, which location has instead been closed up. The imitation framing of the new window is noticeably wider than those at the historic windows, and extends into the "belt band" separating the 1st and 2nd stories.
9. Also at the east (side) wall, a historic 6/1 window has been removed, framed down, and infilled with a much smaller sliding window, also a vinyl-clad Anderson 400 unit.
10. Also at the east (side) wall, two basement windows have been replaced with glass block, contrary to the Commission's approval to rehabilitate the existing windows here. The glass block installation is not per HDC staff-approvable guidelines as they are not inset to the plane of the original windows.
11. At the west wall, not shown on either the original permit or the proposed revised drawings, a large HVAC unit has been installed at a forward position at the 1st story./
12. At the rear, 1st story, the eastward window has been replaced with a sliding vinyl-clad (Anderson 400) window, contrary to the Commission's approval of a new 12-light single-hung Anderson 100 window with simulated divided lites.
13. Also at the rear, 1st story, the original pair of 2/1 windows has been replaced with a standard set of exterior French doors with between-the-glass grids, contrary to the custom 2/1 simulated divided-lite design approved by the Commission as a condition to the approval, and subsequently approved in revised permit drawings prepared by the architect, which was intended to match the consistent 2/1 historic windows present on all sides of the house.
14. At the front, 1st story porch, the concrete block base has been veneered with new brick and then painted, contrary to the Commission's approval of keeping the current condition with paint.



View of 708 Pallister, looking northwest from the sidewalk. Note large east-facing dormer at right side, with incompatible gable roof and no window at all. Staff photo, November 13, 2024.



View of 708 Pallister, looking northeast. Note replacement windows in all openings, and the large gable-roofed dormer facing west, with incompatible sliding window, which reorients the emphasis from the front facade. Note also the apparent difference in color tone between the factory "white" of the dormer and the correct "yellowish white" color of main house. Staff photo, November 13, 2024.



View of 708 Pallister, detail view of newly built west-facing (side) dormer. Note amateurish detailing, artificial shakes with imitation "wood grain" enclosed by corner trim pieces (red arrow), sliding vinyl-clad window, and vinyl clad eaves. Fascia boards also appear to be composite or vinyl rather than wood. Staff photo, November 13, 2024.



View of 708 Pallister, at the rear. Visible are the incorrect eastward sliding window (left), and the incorrect French doors with "between-the-glass" grids, right. Note also the factory white roof dormer, incorrectly clad with imitation shake and with a sliding window installed, as compared to the "yellowish white" of the approved HDC color choice. Building inspectors and NPO are visible here. Staff photo, November 13, 2024.



View of 708 Pallister, detail view of incorrect rear sliding window. Note also how the framing is recessed short of the clapboard surrounding it, an incorrect condition. Staff photo, November 13, 2024.



Rear view of 708 Pallister, detail view of incorrect French doors with internal imitation muntins, contrary to the Commission's conditional approval of custom reproduction 2/1 units. Staff photo, November 13, 2024.



View of 708 Pallister, view of west (side) wall. This window opening was not approved, and trespasses into the historic wooden "belt band" between the 1st and 2nd stories (red arrow). The framing is incompatible in width, inset, and material (imitation "wood grain" composite). Staff photo, November 13, 2024.



View of large HVAC unit under installation at west (side) wall. Staff photo, November 13, 2024.



View of glass block windows at east side basement wall. Staff photo, November 13, 2024.



Newly painted brick veneer and steps at front porch. Staff photo, November 13, 2024.