

**STAFF REPORT:** 12/14/2022 REGULAR MEETING

**PREPARED BY:** T. BOSCARINO

**APPLICATION NUMBER:** 22-8163

**ADDRESS:** 2418 LONGFELLOW

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** BOSTON-EDISON

**APPLICANT:** LINDA HRIBAR, WEATHERGARD WINDOWS

**PROPERTY OWNER:** JACQUELINE FRAZIER

**DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION:** NOVEMBER 10, 2022

**DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT:** NOVEMBER 23, 2022

**SCOPE:** INSTALL VINYL WINDOWS

### **EXISTING CONDITIONS**

2418 Longfellow is a two-story, red brick, flat-decked hip roof house built in 1921 and displaying elements of the Colonial Revival and Arts and Crafts styles. It faces south onto Longfellow Avenue and sits among a row of two-story, hip-roof brick houses of comparable style, age, and scale. Most windows on the house appear to be original or historic double-hung wood windows that also feature original or historic wood, two-pane storm windows, with both primary windows and storm windows painted bright white. This includes the windows on a projecting, rear sun porch, subject of this application.



*July 2022 photo by staff. Four of the windows subject of this application are visible at the lower right of the image.*

### **PROPOSAL**

The applicant proposes to replace twelve (12) windows on a two-story, projecting rear sun porch or “sunroom” with vinyl windows. This rear extension contains twelve windows on each floor (twenty-four total), the application only

proposes replacement of the first-floor windows.



*Windows proposed for replacement, highlighted by red boxes. Image by staff, viewed from alley during site visit.*



*Image from application, cropped by staff. Additional interior and exterior photos are included in the submitted application materials.*

The proposed new windows are WeatherGard 700 Series custom one-over-one sash windows with “premium” low-E glass and screens on the lower half. Sashes are to be white. Exact dimensions of the rails are not provided. Trim is to be aluminum stock in “Cranberry 820.”



*Left: WeatherGard 700 Series windows. Note that the simulated muntins shown are not proposed in this application. Image: [www.weathergard.com](http://www.weathergard.com). Right: Quality Aluminum Products Cranberry 820. Source: [www.myperfectcolor.com](http://www.myperfectcolor.com).*

## **STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH**

- The Boston-Edison Historic District was established by resolution of the City Council in 1974. No Final Report was prepared for this district.
- The Elements of Design (Sec. 21-2-106) mention windows as “always subdivided” with “the most common window type is double-hung with sashes.” Importantly, the Elements of Design state that “windows are sometimes grouped into a combination that is wider than tall,” as is the case in this instance, and also that “sun porches, with a very high proportion of window openings subdivided by mullions and muntins, are common,” suggesting that they are a defining feature of both the house and the district.
- The Elements of Design also note that “wood is almost universally used for window frames,” which presumably includes the mullions in this case.
- Staff does not observe any major deterioration of windows or storm windows visible in either the photos or from the site visit.
- Staff suggests that Color System C or D would be appropriate, given the architectural style of the house. Cranberry 320 is an appropriate color as it very closely resembles A:9, Moderate Reddish Brown, a recommended trim color from Color System D. A similar color is also already found on window surrounds on the front of the house. (Pure white is not shown in either color system, but many shades of off-white are recommended as appropriate sash and trim colors.)

## **ISSUES**

- The building’s windows are both historic (original to the house) and distinctive (as suggested by the Elements of Design), and should not be removed, according to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for

Rehabilitation, as shown below.

- The subdivision of the windows by mullions is also a distinctive feature, as described in the Elements of Design. Addition of aluminum stock would alter this feature, and should be avoided, according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

### Section 21-2-78: Determination of Historic District Commission

Staff recommends that the Commission issue a Denial of the proposed work as it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

- 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*