

**STAFF REPORT: NOVEMBER 16, 2022 MEETING**

**PREPARED BY: A. DYE**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 22-8105**

**ADDRESS: 4871 CORTLAND**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: RUSSELL WOODS-SULLIVAN**

**APPLICANT: LINDA HRIBAR, WEATHERGARD WINDOWS**

**PROPERTY OWNER: CAHUNTE & JOHN DAVIS**

**DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: OCTOBER 17, 2022**

**DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: OCTOBER 25, 2022**

**SCOPE: REPLACE WOOD WINDOWS WITH VINYL WINDOWS**

**EXISTING CONDITIONS**

Erected in 1925, this Tudor Revival-style dwelling is clad in dark red and black brick at the first floor; pink and white aluminum siding at the second floor covers wood shake shingle siding (which is visible on the east wall where a portion of aluminum siding is no longer in place). The roofing material is dimensional asphalt shingles. A large front-facing gable fills the width of the primary elevation. A smaller gable, supported by square brick piers and stone tops, projects from the house and creates a vestibule for the front entry. Angled concrete steps lead from the front walk to the raised open porch. A low black railing runs the perimeter edges of the front and west sides of the porch.

Leaded glass wood windows are located on the front and side elevations. Three mullied double-hung units with a 15-over-1 pattern fill the front elevation first-floor window opening, and a small casement (or fixed) 12-light (3 wide by 4 high) leaded glass unit remains at the upper area of the large gable. Small leaded glass window units are on each side of the house, near the front elevation. The remaining windows appear to be wood-framed double-hung units or white vinyl double-hung replacement units.



*HDC staff photo, October 25, 2022*

## PROPOSAL

Replace six windows: five on the first floor, and one at the second floor. Openings are circled below.



HDC staff photos, October 25, 2022

## STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District was established in 1999.
- The three front elevation double-hung windows have a 15-over-1 pattern. The lead comes create a subtle division to the glass making the windows distinctive character-defining features. The aluminum-framed storm windows cover the wood frames but do not obscure the full historic sash.
- The windows on the side elevation proposed for replacement are one-over-one wood double-hung units and are covered with aluminum-framed storm windows that match the operation of the windows.
- The total price on the submitted window order is \$7843, which is roughly \$1300/window. A repair estimate from a company experienced in repairing wood frame and leaded glass windows was not submitted. Exterior and interior photographs show the six windows are fully intact and appear to be in good condition.

## ISSUES

- Vinyl windows are not appropriate for historic houses in the Russell Woods HD in general, and this property in particular. The level of detail of the existing windows cannot be matched by current vinyl production methods.
  - Staff is concerned that installing windows that have thicker, flat and bright white frames will insert a contemporary alteration to the English revival-style house.
  - The leaded windows give authenticity to the time of the dwelling's construction and can't be duplicated in any way by the proposed vinyl windows. Furthermore, the flat between-the-glass grids would take up so much space for a fifteen-light division that there would hardly be any visible glass surface in the upper sash of the front windows.
  - The side elevation window openings are highly visible from the public right-of-way due to the location of the driveway as well as the currently vacant neighboring lot.



## **RECOMMENDATION**

### Section 21-2-78, Determination of Historic District Commission

It is staff's opinion the replacement of the wood windows with vinyl windows will alter the features and spaces that characterize the property. Staff therefore recommends the Commission deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as proposed because it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and the Elements of Design for the district.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*