

STAFF REPORT: NOVEMBER 16, 2022 MEETING

PREPARED BY: A. DYE

APPLICATION NUMBER: 22-8102

ADDRESS: 14894 GREENVIEW

HISTORIC DISTRICT: ROSEDALE PARK

APPLICANT: ELIZABETH GERSTER

PROPERTY OWNER: ELIZABETH GERSTER

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: OCTOBER 17, 2022

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: OCTOBER 25, 2022

SCOPE: REPLACE STEEL WINDOWS WITH VINYL WINDOWS

EXISTING CONDITIONS

Erected in 1936, this Tudor Revival-style dwelling is clad in a range of red and brown brick and dark brown aluminum siding. The roofing material is dimensional asphalt shingles. The front elevation features double front-facing gables, the smallest of which is clad in beige stone. A curvilinear concrete front walk leads to a raised open landing which is accessed by three narrow brick-faced steps and a single black aluminum handrail. The landing extends the width of the gabled wall and the entry door is framed by a smooth cut stone surround. The intact historic wood door with a small offset window is behind a non-historic storm door. On each elevation are varying sized window openings of steel sash that include casement and fixed units.



HDC staff photo, October 25, 2022

PROPOSAL

Replace all of the windows on the first floor, and one second floor (bathroom) window.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The Rosedale Park Historic District was established in 2007.
- The windows, due to their thin sash dimensions and multiple operations within each opening, are distinctive character-defining features on each elevation of the dwelling.
- The front and side elevations (the applicant didn't submit a photo of the rear elevation) retain almost all of its historic components. Those components that have been altered, specifically the front entry brick steps, aluminum railing, and aluminum siding on the dormers, were in place at time of local historic district designation. It is staff's opinion the stairs and railings are minimally designed contemporary components, and the aluminum siding could be removed as the original wood siding is likely intact underneath.

ISSUES

- A repair estimate from a company experienced in repairing steel windows was not submitted. The submitted photographs and property owner description of the existing windows do not demonstrate the windows are beyond repair.
- Steel window sash frames have very thin, narrow profiles and dimensional muntins and mullions. Vinyl windows, in contrast, offer thick, flat frames and flat muntin bars that are between glass which removes all dimensional qualities to the grid pattern. Also, very few vinyl window companies offer window sash in dark brown, which is the appropriate window sash color for this Tudor Revival house.
- At the time of writing the staff report, the applicant has not replied to staff's requests for:
 - Additional information on the existing windows, including window dimensions and location of the second floor window,
 - A photograph of the rear elevation, and
 - A brochure of the selected windows and details on the operation of the proposed sash.

RECOMMENDATION

Section 21-2-78, Determination of Historic District Commission

It is staff's opinion the replacement of the steel windows with vinyl windows will alter the features and spaces that characterize the property. Staff therefore recommends the Commission deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as proposed because it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and the Elements of Design for the district.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*