

STAFF REPORT: 10/12/2022 REGULAR MEETING

PREPARED BY: J. ROSS

ADDRESS: 461 W. FOREST

APPLICATION NO: #22-8083

HISTORIC DISTRICT: WARREN-PRENTIS

APPLICANT: GREGORY VERANO

OWNER: GREGORY AND KATHLEEN VERANO

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: 9/30/2022

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 9/22/2022

SCOPE: REMOVE SLATE ROOF, INSTALL ASPHALT SHINGLE ROOF (WORK COMPLETED WITHOUT APPROVAL)

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The building located at 461 W. Forest is a 2 ½-story single family home that was erected ca. 1895. Exterior walls are red brick at stories 1 and 2 while a rusticated stone foundation wall is visible at the basement level. The building features a centrally-located hipped-roof with a projecting hipped-roof wing at the rear, projecting gables at the front and side elevations, and hipped-roof dormers. Slate shingles are visible at the front and side gable ends and at the dormer front and side walls. Original slate roofing has been removed from all other roof surfaces and asphalt shingles have been installed at the roof. A flat-roof, partial-width porch at the front elevation shelters the building's primary entrance. Windows are wood double-hung or fixed units.





461 W. Forest, current appearance (9/30/2022 staff photos). Note that slate remains at the front and side elevation gable ends and the dormer front and side walls.

PROPOSAL

In August 2022, HDC staff received a report from a community member that the property owner of 461 W. Forest was in the process of replacing the building’s historic slate roof with asphalt shingles. Staff consulted HDC and building department files and noted that the Commission had not received an application/issued an approval for the work and that a building permit had not been pulled for the project. Staff therefore reached out to the property owner and requested that they submit an application for the work. The property owner has submitted the current application in an effort to receive the Commission’s approval for the work that they have undertaken, which includes the replacement of the original slate roof with asphalt shingles (GAF Slateline, color grey). The slate in the side and front gable ends and at the dormer front and side walls will be retained. Any deteriorated slate at the gable ends and dormer walls will be replaced with slate shingles which have been salvaged from the roof. The applicant has indicated that the project is currently at 80% completion.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The applicant has noted that they initiated the replacement of the slate roof in in 2017. The homeowner has been conducting the work themselves and have not pulled a permit for the work. As previously noted, the project is 80% completed.

- The applicant has noted that the historic roof was failing largely due to the corrosion of the slating nails. They have also noted that the slate shingles were generally in poor condition with pieces thinning/delaminating and cracking. Per the application, the roof was leaking in 17 areas. The application includes photos which illustrate the condition of the slating nails and slate shingles. The applicant has also provided photos which illustrate the interior areas where the roof is leaking
- Staff is satisfied that the applicant has demonstrated that the slate roof was failing to an extent which merits its wholesale replacement.
- Staff does note that the slate roof was a distinctive character-defining feature of the building. However, staff does recognize that it is not economically feasible to install a new slate roof on a residential property. As such it is staff's opinion that an appropriately colored asphalt shingle roof is a compatible solution in this case and would conform to the SOI Standards.

ISSUES

- None

RECOMMENDATION

Section 21-2-78. Determination of the Historic District Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness

HDC staff recommends that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as presented because it meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and conforms to the Elements of Design for the district.