

STAFF REPORT: 10/12/22 REGULAR MEETING

PREPARED BY: T. BOSCARINO

APPLICATION NUMBER: 22-8050

ADDRESS: 19471 SHREWSBURY

HISTORIC DISTRICT: SHERWOOD FOREST

APPLICANT: MIKE FISHER

PROPERTY OWNER: MIKE FISHER & MICHELE ARIANE

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: SEPTEMBER 15, 2022

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: OCTOBER 1, 2022

SCOPE: INSTALL SECURITY DOORS, REPLACE PATIO DOORS

EXISTING CONDITIONS

19471 Shrewsbury is a two-story, Tudor Revival (sometimes called English Revival) house in the Sherwood Forest Historic District, facing northeast onto a curvilinear street. Its Romantic design elements such as decorative half-timbering, tabbed stone surrounds, English bond brickwork, and mullioned windows, further subdivided by muntins, are defining features characteristic of the building and commonly found on buildings throughout the district. The front door, one of the work areas subject to this application, is a heavy, wood, arched panel door recessed within an arched stone opening. Other work areas include a side (northwest) door, and two rear patio doors that each consist of interior steel doors covered by exterior wood storm doors.



September 2022 photo by staff.

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to add to or alter four openings, as follows:

Security Doors

New security doors are proposed to be added to the front and side (northeast and northwest) door openings. These

are to be steel security doors produced by Duraweld Doors. They are proposed to be hunter green, which the applicant believes to be the original sash and door paint color, as evidenced by the garage sashes and patio doors.



Front door (left) and side door (right). Photos by applicant.



Proposed security door by Duraweld (shown on different property). Image by applicant.

Patio Doors

- The applicant proposed to replace two patio doors. On the narrower door opening without sidelights, the entire unit will be replaced. On the wider door opening with sidelights, the operable doors will be replaced

and the sidelights will remain. The proposed new doors are single-glazed steel doors, to be hunter green in color.



Exterior doors proposed for replacement. Images by applicant.



Proposed new exterior door (shown on different property). Image by applicant.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The Sherwood Forest Historic District was established by Ordinance 02-02 in 2002. Its Elements of Design

(Sec. 21-2-178 [d]) describe windows as “usually subdivided” and observe that the presence of subdivided windows creates “considerable” textural interest. Arched openings are a common feature. Regarding materials, “wood is almost universally used for window frames” which are, on English Revival buildings, “dark brown, gray, buff, or shades of cream.” The Elements of Design note a “higher degree of complexity” in the facades of English Revival buildings.

- The Final Report states that the Sherwood Forest Historic District is significant for both architecture and community planning from the 1920s through the 1940s.
- Staff requested additional photos of the rear elevation, but they have not arrived as of the time of this report.

Security Doors

- Staff surveyed several blocks in the Sherwood Forest Historic District and observed that houses feature security doors, storm doors, and uncovered original doors in approximately equal numbers. Staff observed security doors in a wide variety of designs. Security doors such as the ones proposed would not be out of place in the district.



Doors in the Sherwood Forest Historic District. Photos by staff.

Patio Doors

- The exterior patio doors proposed for replacement are not visible from the public right-of-way.
- Based on materials, design, and hardware, staff concludes that the exterior patio doors date from the Period of Significance. It is possible that they were originally screen doors rather than glazed.
- The applicant states that the exterior patio doors are not functional due to missing knobs and latches, and “the wood is sagging and rotted at the bottom of each door.”
- The applicant expressed a preference for single-glazed, clear doors, to allow the interior doors to be more visible from the outside and to eliminate a current condition where muntins on interior and exterior doors do not line up and “clash.”
- The interior patio doors are likewise not visible from the public-right-of-way, and in photos included in the application, they are partly concealed behind the exterior doors. Staff is therefore unable to provide additional information on the operation or other qualities of the interior doors. The applicant states that the interior doors are steel.

ISSUES

Security Doors

- The color of the security door should not exactly match the sash color. It should be “differentiated” (Standard #9) to avoid creating a “false sense of historical development” (Standard #3). A dark brown or black color would reduce the door’s visibility and avoid distracting from the historic wood door and stone surround (Standard #2).
- The diamond pattern on the proposed security door introduces an incompatible visual element which distracts from the architectural character of the doorway and opening (Standards #2 and #9). A design without this element would be appropriate.

Patio Doors

- The current exterior patio doors provide “textural interest” and “complexity,” as described in the Elements of Design. Eliminating the current doors will diminish these qualities.
- The design of the current exterior patio doors, with wider vertical elements separating multilight windows, is consistent with the muntin-and-mullion character of the building’s windows. A door with a different design would be a deviation from this character.
- The exterior patio doors are both historic (original or dating from the Period of Significance) and distinctive (as suggested by “textural interest” and “complexity” items in the Elements of Design, and the consistency in character with the building’s windows as mentioned above) and have not deteriorated beyond repair. The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, cited below, direct that they be retained and preserved or repaired.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation #1) Section 21-2-78: Determination of Historic District Commission (Security Doors)

Staff therefore recommends that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for this proposed installation of security doors as it conforms to the district’s Elements of Design and meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, subject to the following conditions:

- The security doors shall be black, or another appropriate color subject to approval by staff.
- The design of the security doors shall eliminate the proposed central diamond pattern, subject to approval by staff.

Recommendation #2) Section 21-2-78: Determination of Historic District Commission (Patio Doors)

Staff recommends that the Commission issue a Denial of the proposed patio door replacement as it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.