

STAFF REPORT: 7/13/2022 MEETING

PREPARED BY: J. ROSS

ADDRESS: 2151 SEMINOLE

APPLICATION NO: #22-7907

HISTORIC DISTRICT: INDIAN VILLAGE

APPLICANT/ARCHITECT: JASON FLIGGER

OWNER: AISLINN SCOFIELD

DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: 7/2/2022

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 6/20/2022

SCOPE: REBABILITATE GARAGE, INSTALL REAR YARD WALK AND PATIO, AND ERECT TRASH ENCLOSURE

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The property located at 2151 Seminole includes a 2 ½ -story single family home and a detached garage. This Tudor-style home was designed by C. Howard Crane for Ralph E. Burnham ca.1915. The home features a side-gabled roof with projecting 2 ½-story wings at the front elevations. Red brick is located at the first story and stucco with half-timber detailing at the second story and in the primary elevation gable end. Windows are double-hung wood units. A side-gabled concrete block garage is located within the property's rear yard. The garage's front elevation faces towards Seminole and includes two, non-historic overhead metal doors. The garage's rear elevation faces directly on Maxwell Steet and includes the original paired wood overhead doors. The garage's north elevation includes a single wood door and glass block window. A second wood person door is located within a shed-roof entry at the south elevation. Synthetic shingles are located in the garage's gable ends.



2151 Seminole, 7/2/2022 staff photo



Garage, front elevation, facing Seminole, applicant photo



Garage, south elevation, applicant photo



2151 Seminole garage, rear elevation (facing Maxwell), 7/2/2022 staff photo

PROPOSAL

With the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to rehabilitate the garage to include the following work items:

- Remove the shingles in the gable end and install cement fiber, faux stucco panels with cement fiber trim (painted to resemble half timbering)

- Paint concrete block walls reddish brown to resemble the color of the home's red brick exterior walls
- Replace historic-age person door and windows at south elevation with new fiberglass French doors and fibrex sidelite
- Repair existing cornice trim with new cedar/wood trim where necessary
- Install new aluminum downspouts and gutters. Also replace rotted fascia with new wood/cedar fascia to be painted dark green per application materials
- At south shed addition, replace existing deteriorated wood door with a new wood/cedar clad door to be painted dark green per application materials
- Install a new 7'-0"-high cedar privacy screen at the garage's south elevation
- Install a new 4'-0"-high cedar garbage/compost enclosure
- Add new wood chip ground cover, walkway and patio to east of garage
- At rear/west elevation of garage, replace existing historic wood garage doors with new steel garage doors
- At front/east elevation of garage, replace existing non-historic steel garage doors with new steel garage doors



PROPOSED VIEW FROM SOUTHEAST



PROPOSED VIEW FROM NORTHEAST



Pavers proposed for new walkways and patio

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- It is staff's opinion that the garage is a contributing resource to the property and district. The garage sits well to the back of the yard and the front elevation is visible from the public right-of-way from Seminole/within the district. The rear elevation faces directly onto Maxwell Street.
- The garage's concrete block walls are currently painted white. While the proposed painting scheme is novel, it falls within the reddish brown color family and is generally in keeping with the appearance of the red brick found at the home's first story.
- The synthetic shingles in the gable end are historic age. However, they are not character defining. The cement fiber cladding proposed for installation at this location will not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The siding will not create a false sense of historical development as its materiality is clearly of a recent vintage and is easily discernable from stucco.
- The windows proposed for replacement at the side elevation are of historic age. Also, the doors and windows at this elevation are not visible from the public right of way
- The doors at the garage's front elevation are not of historic age. It is staff's opinion that the new doors are compatible with the garage's historic appearance

ISSUES

- The garage doors which are located at the building's rear/west elevation are likely date to the building's original construction. It is staff's opinion that the doors are distinctive character-defining elements of the building. Staff visited the building and observed the doors' current condition. While deteriorated, especially at the bottom panel at each door, the doors do not appear to be beyond repair. The removal of the doors therefore does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standard #6, which prioritizes repair over replacement. Staff did request that the applicant share photos of the doors from the interior so that the full condition of the doors might be discerned, but the applicant has yet to provide the requested photos

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation #1). Section 21-2-78. Determination of the Historic District Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness

HDC staff recommends that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project, *with the exception of the proposed removal and replacement of the west elevation (Maxwell Street facing) garage doors*, because the work conforms to the district's Elements of Design and meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Recommendation #2). Section 21-2-78. Determination of the Historic District Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness

HDC staff recommends that the Commission issue a *Denial* for the proposed removal and replacement of the west elevation garage doors because the work does not conform to the district's Elements of Design nor does it meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, in particular Standards #:

- 2.) *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*
- 5.) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

and

6). Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence