



**PLANNING AND
DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT**

Coleman A. Young Municipal Center
2 Woodward Avenue, Suite 808
Detroit, Michigan 48226

Phone 313•224•1339
www.detroitmi.gov

SR-2 – ADVISORY STAFF REPORT (09-04-2026)

This advisory report, prepared by staff, represents the opinion and advice of professional staff, and does not represent nor direct the separate review and decision of the Historic District Commission. This report serves as an addendum to SR-1, an objective staff summary of the proposal and property.

ADDRESS: 1459 ATKINSON

MEETING DATE: 09-09-2026

APPLICATION NUMBER: HDC2026-00439

SCOPE: REPLACE WOOD WINDOWS WITH ALUMINUM CLAD WOOD WINDOWS,
REPLACE SIDING AT GABLE ENDS AND DORMER WALLS

ADVISORY STAFF REPORT PREPARED BY: B. SALIE

STAFF OBJECTIONS TO APPROVAL:

This first section describes itemized conclusions/concerns, which, in staff's professional opinion, would prevent the issue of an unconditional Certificate of Appropriateness (COA). "None" means staff has no objections and believes a COA is warranted, with no conditions. The Historic District Commission is not required to accept staff opinions or recommendations.

1. The original wood windows are distinctive, historic character-defining features that date to the resource's Period of Significance.
2. The proposal, which seeks to replace the original wood windows, does not demonstrate that the historically distinctive, character-defining windows are beyond reasonable repair.
3. No finish color is specified for the cedar shakes. If finishing or staining is desired, no color has been provided. Unfinished cedar is acceptable.

STAFF ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION:

This second section expands on the reasoning and analysis leading to staff's conclusions given in the first section above. The Historic District Commission is not required to accept staff opinions or recommendations.



1459	
Atkinson	3
18403	9-14-17
USE Dwelling	LOT NO.
CONS. Brick Veneer	DATE
REMARKS	O. K.
Brick Garage	

ABOVE: Building Permit Card
LEFT: Designation Photo 1984

- Atkinson Avenue was designated as a historic district in 1984.
- The house, which was erected in 1916, appears to have retained a majority of its historic-age wood windows.



The above exterior photos were taken by staff on 08/26/2026. The windows proposed for replacement are highlighted in yellow. Interior photos show the windows current condition, provided by applicant

- The historic-age wood windows are distinctive, character-defining features that add important detail and texture to the building's expression. As the Elements of Design (Sec. 21-2-139) mention "wooden functional trim and window frames and sash are common, and wood is used in many examples as decorative trim as well"



Wood windows located at the rear facing dormer. Photos provided by applicant

- The applicant identifies several concerns with the existing windows. For example, the applicant has listed the following issues for window #1, which is located on the front dormer:
 - a. *Visible Envelope Failure (Red Arrows): Direct daylight is visible along the upper arched head rail, demonstrating severe frame sagging and sash deflection over time.*
 - b. *Inability to Weather-Seal: The structural separation along the arched top rail creates an unsealable gap that permits continuous bulk water and air infiltration into the wall cavity and interior framing.*
 - c. *Rotted Wood & Drainage Failure (Blue Arrows): Severe timber decay and persistent moisture damage along the lower sash rail and sill assembly demonstrate improper water shed and irreparable wood rot.*
 - d. *Technical Infeasibility of Repair: Due to permanent warping of both the window frame and the arched top sash rail, weatherstripping or surface repairs cannot restore an airtight seal or structural integrity, rendering full restoration technically infeasible.*
- Per the Secretary of Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation:
 - 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
 - It is staff's opinion that the historic-age wood windows do not appear to be beyond feasible repair and where possible, should be retained and repaired.
 - 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*
 - The replacement of the distinctive, character-defining windows will alter the historic integrity of the house.
 - 6) ***Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced.*** *Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*
- However, should the Commission elect to approve the replacement of the historic-age wood windows, it is staff's opinion that the aluminum-clad wood windows will be an appropriate window replacement type as they will closely resemble the dimensions, lite configuration, operability, and materiality of the existing wood windows.

CEDAR SHAKE SIDING



Photo taken by staff on 08/26/2026

- Staff has no objection to the *in-kind replacement of cedar shake siding at the gable ends.
 - **“In-kind” is defined as faithfully reproducing original, historic, or documented character-defining features, elements, and assemblies with respect to design, color, finish, texture, craftsmanship, materials, relationship to other elements or spaces, and other visual qualities.*
- Staff has no objection to the removal of asphalt shingles on the dormer walls, which will be replaced with the cedar shake siding.
 - The permit for the replacement of the asphalt shingle roof, dated October 25, 2005, specifies “Remove all roofing including rear flat and **dormer walls**”
 - It is staff’s opinion that the installation of cedar shake at the dormer walls will be an appropriate replacement as it complements the cedar shake siding found on the gable ends and adheres to the district’s elements of design #7, (Sec. 21-2-139) which mentions “Wood sheathing is occasionally used on the attic story and/or dormers.”



Photo taken by staff on 08/26/2026

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: *This third and final section takes staff's itemized "objections" identified in the first section, and presents them in the form of "conditions" in support of a proposed approval recommendation or "reasons" in support of a proposed denial recommendation, in the form required by Section 21-2-78 of the City Code. The Historic District Commission is not required to accept staff opinions or recommendations.*

Section 21-2-78, Determinations of Historic District Commission

Recommendation 1 of 2, Denial: Replace historic-age wood windows with aluminum clad wood windows

Staff recommends that the proposed work will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Atkinson Avenue Historic District's Elements of Design, specifically:

- Standards (2, 5, & 6)

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

- Elements of Design (7)

For the following reasons;

1. The original wood windows are distinctive, historic character-defining features that date to the resource's Period of Significance.
2. The proposal, which seeks to replace the original wood windows, does not demonstrate that the historically distinctive, character-defining windows are beyond reasonable repair.

Recommendation 2 of 2, Certificate of Appropriateness: Replace cedar shake siding at gable ends and dormer walls

Staff recommends that the proposed work will be appropriate according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Atkinson Avenue Historic District's Elements of Design, with the condition that:

1. The cedar shakes, if finished with paint or stain, shall be finished with colors that are compatible within the Historic Districts' Color Chart System, subject to staff approval. An unfinished installation is acceptable.