10/15/2024

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Robert Naeyaert Lunar Garages & Modernization Inc, 13491 E. Mile Rd Warren, MI 48089

RE: Application Number HDC2024-00520; 15107 Minock; Rosedale Park Historic District

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on October 9, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission ("DHDC") reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on October 15, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the district's Elements of Design:

- Demolition of garage
- Erection of new garage
- Replacement of windows and front door

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work will destroy architectural features that characterize the property.

- No documentation establishing that the original condition of the original garage was beyond repair was submitted or available.
- The original garage is a contributing building that was present at the time of historic designation and exemplifies the modest, yet character-defining features that bore strong relationship to the main house, namely the lower pitched, overhanging front gable that complements the front façade of the house, which is indicative of the modest form of mid-century architecture that defines this historic district.
- No documentation establishing that the original condition of the wood windows was beyond repair was submitted or available.
- The replacement of the original wood windows with vinyl windows with between the glass grilles is not compatible with historic architecture in the house in that they:
 - o destroy the distinctive, character-defining features of the original windows, particularly the true-divided lights,
 - o introduce a new design, material, and scale that does not conform to the District's Elements of Design.
- The half-moon shaped vision panel of the front door is not compatible with the Colonial Revival style of the house.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable. Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building 525 West Ottawa Street, P.O. Box 30754, Lansing, MI 48909 Phone: 517-335-0665 E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:

D. Kesse Daniel Rieden

Staff for the Detroit Historic District Commission

DHDC 2024-00520

APPROVAL DOCUMENT - POST AT WORK LOCATION

CITY OF DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION 2 WOODWARD, SUITE 808 DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226

10/15/2024

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Robert Naeyaert Lunar Garages & Modernization Inc, 13491 E. Mile Rd Warren, MI 48089

RE: Application Number 2024-00520; 15107 Minock; Rosedale Park Historic District

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on October 9, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission ("DHDC") reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1) and Sections 21-2-73/21-2-78 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Certificate of Appropriateness ("COA") for the following work, effective on October 15, 2024, as it meets the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the district's Elements of Design:

Replace side door per submitted materials.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

• The color of the door be selected from the HDC Color Guidelines, Color System C.

Please retain this COA for your files and post it at the subject property until work is complete. It is important to note that approval by the DHDC does not waive the applicant's responsibility to comply with any other applicable ordinances or statutes. If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:

Daniel Rieden

V. Kiese

Detroit Historic District Commission