

09/17/2024

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Brett Mahaffey
Renewal by Andersen
37720 Amrhein Rd.
Livonia, MI 48150

RE: Application Number HDC2024-00435; 4031 Fullerton; Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on September 11, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on September 17, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

- ***Replace steel sash windows with fibrex composite windows***

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work will destroy architectural features that characterize the property.

- No documentation establishing that the original condition of the casement windows was beyond repair was submitted or available, nor was a cost estimate provided for the repair of these windows.
- A full replacement of the original windows may not be necessary to return to acceptable service.
- The replacement of the original steel casements with fibrex casements is not compatible with historic architecture in the house in that they:
 - destroy the distinctive, character-defining features of the original windows, particularly the true-divided lights, transoms and sidelight detailing,
 - introduce a new design, operation, and scale,
 - introduces a new material, fibrex, which is contrary to National Park Service guidance and not historically appropriate material and does not conform to the District’s Elements of Design.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standards:

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable. Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General
2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street, P.O. Box 30754, Lansing, MI 48909
Phone: 517-335-0665 E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Daniel Rieden
Staff for the Detroit Historic District Commission