

July 17, 2024

**NOTICE OF DENIAL**

Nicole Rodriguez  
3417 Seminole  
Detroit MI 48214

**RE: Application Number HDC2024-00273; 3417 Seminole; Indian Village Historic District  
Project Scope: Demolish garage, erect garage**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on June 12, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on July 17, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

***Demolish garage and erect new garage per the submitted documents, drawings, and product data.***

The Commission’s reason for the denial is that:

- The existing concrete block garage is a contributing structure/resource to the property and district and retains its integrity.
  - The wall material identifies the structure as being erected in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century,
  - Its materiality and neutral color are similar to the house’s stucco walls (which likely remains under the vinyl siding),
  - The cobblestone pattern relates to the English revival features of the house, and
  - The straightforward form of the garage and lack of additional architectural details is compatible with the stucco walls and general design of the dwelling
  - The historic openings on the east and west walls of the garage remain, and the wood pedestrian doors and double-hung windows are intact and in repairable condition.
- The applicant must submit a repair/rebuild estimate, along with the estimate for demolition/new construction so the Commission can fairly assess the economic feasibility of retaining the contributing resource.
- The proposed new garage is not compatible with the house and property, due to its massing, complex roof forms, multiple wall materials and design details. Erecting a “Victorian-style” garage, however defined, would be anachronistic for this property.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards or Elements:

- **Standard 2)** *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- **Standard 3)** *Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.*
- **Standard 5)** *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved*
- **Standard 9)** *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
- **Elements of Design 7) Relationship of materials.** *The majority of the buildings are faced with brick, while many are partially or totally stucco. There are some stone buildings; clapboard is rare, and almost never the sole material. Wood shingle is occasionally used as a wall covering, usually at the second floor level, and never as the sole material. Roofing includes slate, tile, and wooden and asphalt shingles. Stone trim is common. Wood is almost universally used for window frames and other functional trim, and is used in many examples for all trim. Because of the existence of several subdivisions and their related deed restrictions, the exterior textures and materials may vary from block to block in the district.*
- **Elements of Design 8) Relationship of textures.** *The most common relationship of textures in the district is that of the low-relief pattern of mortar joints in brick contrasted to the smooth surface of wood or stone trim. The use of stucco or concrete, with or without half-timbering, as a contrast to brick surfaces is not unusual. Tile, slate, or wood shingle roofs have particular textural values where they exist. Asphalt shingles, generally, have little textural interest, even in those types which purport to imitate some other variety.*
- **Elements of Design 9) Relationship of colors.** *Natural brick colors (red, yellow, brown, buff) predominate in wall surfaces. Natural stone colors also exist. Where stucco or concrete exists, it is usually left in its natural state, or painted in a shade of cream. Roofs are in natural colors (tile and slate colors, wood colors) and asphalt shingles are predominantly within this same dark color range. Paint colors often relate to style. The classically inspired buildings, particularly Neo-Georgian, generally have woodwork painted white, cream or in the range of those colors, including putty. Doors and shutters are frequently dark green or black. Colors known to have been in use on buildings of this type in the 18<sup>th</sup> Century or early 19<sup>th</sup> Century on similar buildings may be considered for suitability. Buildings of Medieval inspiration (notably Neo-Tudor) generally have painted woodwork and window frames of dark brown or cream color. Half-timbering is almost always stained dark brown. Queen Anne or Late Victorian examples may have several paint colors on a single façade. These tend to be dark in tone and frequently of the earth tone family. The original colors of any house, as determined by professional analysis, are always acceptable for that house, and may provide suggestions for similar houses.*
- **Elements of Design 10) Relationship of architectural details.** *These generally relate to style. Neo-Georgian buildings display classic details, mostly in wood, and sometimes in stone. Areas commonly, but not always, treated are porches, shutters, window frames, cornices, and dormer windows. Details on Mediterranean style or vernacular buildings are often done in stone, brick, tile, and sometimes in stucco. They include arched windows, door openings, and porches. Buildings of Medieval inspiration tend to have details in the form of carved wood or carved stone ornament on window frames, door frames, and eaves. Queen Anne or Late Victorian style buildings tend to have details in wood, stone, or molded brick commonly embellishing cornices, window frames and door frames. In general, the various styles are rich in architectural details.*

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have

been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General  
2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building  
525 West Ottawa Street  
P.O. Box 30754  
Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665  
E-mail: [stuckeyj@michigan.gov](mailto:stuckeyj@michigan.gov)

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or [hdc@detroitmi.gov](mailto:hdc@detroitmi.gov).

For the Commission:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Audra Dye", with a stylized flourish at the end.

Audra Dye  
Detroit Historic District Commission