

July 16, 2024

NOTICE OF DENIAL

John Johnson
19511 Shrewsbury
Detroit MI 48221

**RE: Application Number HDC2024-00326; 19511 Shrewsbury; Sherwood Forest Historic District
Project Scope: Replace porch paving**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on July 10, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on July 16, 2024, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

The replacement of historic porch tiles with concrete pavers per the submitted documents, drawings, and product data.

Excepting the following items from denial:

- ***The replacement of the deteriorated (exposed) sections of historic porch tiles with quarry tiles.***

The Commission’s reason for the denial is that:

- Materiality and finish (i.e., stone)
 - The current tiles have a matte finish, whereas the pavers have a polished sheen.
 - The pavers have beveled edges and the symmetry block has a stamped adjoining square block, all of which does not mimic the clean edges and uniform four-sided mortar joints of stone and brick.
 - The use of sand between the blocks, rather than mortar, creates a monolithic appearance to this flooring/pavement system.
- Uniform geometric pattern close in size to the existing 12-inch octagon
 - The proposed product is twice the size (24-inch octagon, compared to existing 12-inch).
 - This increased size will drastically change the proportion of the pattern and increase the visual dominance of the porch floor. The proposed paving pattern may work well with a large expanse, such as a driveway and patio, but will likely overpower the small dimensions of this porch and its proportional relationship with the other building materials.
- A consistently designed border (emulating the formality of the Tudor Revival design) are the features to be matched.
 - The applicant must submit a plan that identifies the material, dimension, pattern and color of the bordering material.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) ***The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.***
- 5) ***Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.***
- 6) ***Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.***

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General
2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street
P.O. Box 30754
Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665
E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Audra Dye
Detroit Historic District Commission

HDC2024-00031

APPROVAL DOCUMENT – POST AT WORK LOCATION

CITY OF DETROIT
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 WOODWARD, SUITE 808
DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226

July 16, 2024

John Johnson
19511 Shrewsbury
Detroit MI 48221

**RE: Application Number HDC24-00326; 19511 Shrewsbury; Sherwood Forest Historic District
Project Scope: Replace porch paving**

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on July 10, 2024, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1) and Sections 21-2-73/21-2-78 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Certificate of Appropriateness (“COA”) for the following work, effective on July 16, 2024, as it meets the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

The replacement of the deteriorated portions of porch tiles with quarry tiles per the submitted documents and photographs.

Please retain this COA for your files and post it at the subject property until work is complete. It is important to note that approval by the DHDC does not waive the applicant's responsibility to comply with any other applicable ordinances or statutes. If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Audra Dye
Detroit Historic District Commission