



CITY OF DETROIT
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

65 CADILLAC SQ., SUITE 1300
DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226
PHONE 313-224-6536
FAX 313-224-1310

October 11, 2001

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Raul Guerrero
3844 Bagley
Detroit, MI 48216

RE: Application Number 01-241; 3844 Bagley; Hubbard Farms Historic District

Dear Mr. Guerrero:

Pursuant to Section 5(10) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205, MSA 5-3407(5)(10) and Section 25-2-20 of the 1984 Detroit City Code, the Detroit Historic District Commission has reviewed the above-referenced application for building permit and has issued a Certificate of Appropriateness effective as of October 13, 2001.

The work is appropriate for the following reasons:

The installation of the vinyl siding, installation of a window on second story, window hoods, fish scale siding, window replacement, wood porch columns to match historic condition and the repainting of the trim as completed meets "The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings" standard number 6, "Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence."

Please retain this Certificate of Appropriateness for your files. You should now proceed to obtain a building permit from the City of Detroit Buildings and Safety Engineering Department. Approval by the Detroit Historic District Commission does not waive the applicant's responsibility to comply with any other applicable ordinance or statute. If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please telephone the Detroit Historic District Commission at 224-6536.

On Behalf of the Commission:


Kristine M. Kidorf

Staff
Detroit Historic District Commission

copy: Shanker Warriar, B&SE

PROPOSAL

This application was submitted in response to a violation letter dated July 24, 2001, the work has been completed. The applicant has installed vinyl siding, installed wood fish scale siding, painted the trim, replaced the windows, opening a space for a window, and also proposes to replace windows on the east elevation. According to the applicant, a fire occurred in the house in the late 1980's prior to designation. To get the property in livable condition, but unable to repair the property to match the original look, the front gable end was covered in wood lap siding, an original window was covered over and window hoods were removed. The designation colors were light green siding and white trim.

The applicant has covered the lap siding on all four sides with gray vinyl siding and in the gable end has installed fish scale type wood siding painted red. The front stoop was also sided with the wood scales and painted red. The windows were replaced, the previous windows being wood double hung, six over one or one over one, they were painted red during a violation photo from 7/19/00. The new windows are white vinyl replacement windows with red trim. On the front elevation of the second story, between two replaced windows, the third 'missing' window was installed, the designation photo shows the wood patch for this window. Above the third story windows are pedimented window hoods, painted dark green.

The applicant also proposes to install porch columns and wood railings for the front smaller porch in place of the existing aluminum supports. On the east elevation of the house, the applicant is proposing to remove the existing large windows and re-size the windows so that they match the remaining windows in the house. The applicant states that he would rather have all the windows be the same size. A letter was sent to the owner regarding the installation two satellite dishes August 29, 2000, currently one dish has been removed and another is lying on the roof of the side porch.

TREATMENT LEVEL AND ELEMENTS OF DESIGN

Hubbard Farms Historic District is designated at the conservation treatment level.

- (3) *Proportion of openings within the facade.* Proportion varies according to building type, age, and style. Generally, window openings in the district are predominantly taller than wide; several windows are frequently grouped into combinations wider than tall. Window openings are most often subdivided, the most common window type being double-hung sash, whose area is generally further subdivided by muntins.
- (4) *Rhythm of solids to voids in front facades.* Window openings are usually regularly arranged by floor, although there is most often variety between floor levels. In the Queen Anne and Richardsonian Romanesque style buildings, openings are often irregularly arranged. Many of the residential buildings have dormers or gables that are fenestrated.
- (6) *Rhythm of entrance and/or porch projections.* Placement of entrance and porch projections vary from building to building, usually depending on type, size and style. Other examples display more freedom in entrance and porch placement. Secondary entrances are common; Italianate houses and small Queen Anne cottages frequently have small side porches. Porches on houses built around the turn of the century tend to be large, sometimes stretching along most of the first story.

- (7) *Relationship of materials.* Many wood frame buildings are clad in clapboard. Wood trim is most commonly used for window, porch, and functional elements as well as decorative trim; stone lintels and sills also exist.
- (8) *Relationship of textures.* A variety of rich textural relationships exist in the district - those created by the juxtaposition of various materials, such as brick, stone, stucco, and/or wood, and those created by the repetition of the materials themselves, such as clapboard, wood fish scale shingles or decorative brick.
- (9) *Relationship of colors* Wooden elements display a variety of colors, depending on what is appropriate for their style. In general, wooden elements of Victorian buildings show more freedom, ranging from shades of rose to green, sometimes with a contrasting color highlighting the architectural detail. The original colors of any building, as determined by professional analysis, are always acceptable for that building, and may provide suggestions for similar buildings.
- (10) *Relationship of architectural details.* Architectural details generally relate to style. Buildings of Victorian substyles also tend to have details of wood located around the entrance, porch, windows, bays, towers, and dormers. Lathe-turned and jigsaw cut wooden elements and details are common. In general, the Hubbard Farms District is extremely rich in architectural detail.

RECOMMENDATION

The designation photo shows the repaired wood opening of the middle window on the second story, as well as a triangle shape that could have been previous wood detail. The upper story windows were replaced previous to designation. Two windows on the first story front bay were six over one, while others appear to be one over one. The dark red trim and sash color, and the dark green window hood color meets the *Detroit Historic Districts Style and Color Guide* for Queen Anne, system B. The installation of turned porch columns and a wood rail would also meet the style guide. I recommend the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the painting of the trim and window hoods, the installation of the middle second story window, the installation of the fish scale wood siding as completed and the installation of turned porch supports with railing, the work meets “The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings” standard number 6, “Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.”

The replacement of original wood siding with vinyl siding when it has not been shown that the siding was beyond repair does not meet the standards. The vinyl siding color closely matches B:16, which complies with the *Detroit Historic Districts Style and Color Guide* for Queen Anne, system B. The replacement of original wood windows with vinyl windows, particularly when the windows have muntins, does not meet the standards. The installation of white windows does not meet *Detroit Historic Districts Style and Color Guide* for Queen Anne, system B. The removal of original wood windows with vinyl windows that are smaller in size is not appropriate. I recommend the commission deny the portion of the application for the replacement of windows with smaller windows and deny and order the vinyl siding removed, the windows that were six over one replaced with appropriate windows with an exterior muntin. The work does not meet “The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings” standard number 6, “Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.”