10/19/2023

## NOTICE OF DENIAL

Derrick Gilford 49435 LEHR DR. Macomb, MI

RE: Application Number 23-00054; 400 Fiske; Berry Subdivision Historic District Project Scope: REPLACE SLATE ROOF WITH ASPHALT SHINGLES (WORK PARTIALLY COMPLETE)

Dear Applicant,

At their Regular Meeting that was held on 9/13/2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission ("DHDC") reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on 10/18/2023, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the district's Elements of Design:

• Replace the home's slate shingles with new asphalt shingles (color, brown). The application also proposes to repair damaged areas of the rear flat/mansard roof with the addition of new torch down rubberized roofing. Staff visited the site on 9/28/2023 and noted that much of the slate has been removed from the front, side-gabled portion of the roof. This work was undertaken without HDC approval and/or permit.

The reasons for the denial are the following:

- The existing slate roof is a distinctive character-defining feature of the home
- The current application does not provide sufficient documentation that the slate roof is deteriorated beyond repair
- The current brown asphalt shingle roofing which has been installed without HDC approval and/or permit does not provide an adequate replication of the home's historic slate roof
- The work therefore is not in keeping with the Berry Subdivision Historic District's Elements of Design and fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically, Standards #:
  - 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
  - 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
  - O. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested

2 WOODWARD, SUITE 808 DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226 PHONE 313-224-6536 FAX 313-224-1310

CITY OF DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building 525 West Ottawa Street P.O. Box 30754 Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665

E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:

Jennifer Ross

**Detroit Historic District Commission**