10/6/2023

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Franciso Javier Pario 1405 Chicago Detroit, MI

RE: Application Number 23-8519; 1405 Chicago; Boston Edison Historic District Project Scope: REPLACE WINDOWS, FENCE, LANDSCAPING (WORK COMPLETED WITHOUT APPROVAL)

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on September 13, 2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission ("DHDC") reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on September 20, 2023, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the district's Elements of Design:

• The replacement of the original wood windows at the north (Chicago Boulevard facing) and east (Byron Street facing) elevations with vinyl windows

The reasons for the denial are the following:

- The original wood windows did not appear to be deteriorated beyond repair. Therefore their removal destroyed historic materials and features that characterized the property.
- The current vinyl units include muntins between the glass which is not an adequate replication for the former true divide lite windows as the current muntins portray a flat appearance
- The current vinyl windows and wrapped brickmould offer a plasticity and flat/thick appearance that does not adequately match the profile/dimensionality and appearance of the original historic wood windows and associated trim/brickmould.

Therefore the work does not this work item conform to the district's elements of design, nor does it meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Specifically, Standards #:

- 2.) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided
- 5.) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- 6.) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested

2 WOODWARD, SUITE 808 DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226 PHONE 313-224-6536 FAX 313-224-1310

CITY OF DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building 525 West Ottawa Street P.O. Box 30754 Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665

E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:

Jennifer Ross

Detroit Historic District Commission