May 16, 2023

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Franklin Quider 4071 Leslie Detroit MI 48238

RE: Application Number 23-8331; 4071 Leslie; Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District Project Scope: Replace original windows with aluminum clad wood windows

Dear Applicant,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on May 10, 2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission ("DHDC") reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on May 16, 2023, as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the district's Elements of Design:

Replacement of intact steel windows with aluminum-clad wood windows per the submitted documents, product data, and presentation materials.

Excepting the following items from denial:

• Replacement of non-historic windows and one severely altered historic window with aluminum-clad wood windows, per the submitted documents.

The Commission's reason for the denial is that:

- The multi-operational arrangement of window sash within window openings is a common feature in Russell Woods and is a distinctive character-defining feature of this house.
- The selected replacement windows do not emulate the profile, pattern, and operation of the existing windows and would alter the features that characterize the property.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in

- design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General 2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building 525 West Ottawa Street P.O. Box 30754 Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665

E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:

[signature jpg]
[Staff Name]
Detroit Historic District Commission