

6/21/2023

NOTICE OF DENIAL

Amanda Johnson
15002 Ashton
Detroit, MI

**RE: Application Number 23-8399; 15002 Ashton; Rosedale Park Historic District
Project Scope: REPLACE ALUMINUM WINDOWS WITH VINYL WINDOWS**

Dear Ms. Johnson,

At the Regular Meeting that was held on 6/14/2023, the Detroit Historic District Commission (“DHDC”) reviewed the above-referenced application. Pursuant to Section 5(1) and 9(1) of the Michigan Local Historic District Act, as amended, being MCL 399.205 (1), MCL 399.209 (9) and Sections 21-2-78 and 21-2-80 of the 2019 Detroit City Code; the DHDC hereby issues a Denial for the following work, effective on 6/21/2023 as it will be inappropriate according to the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the district’s Elements of Design:

- Replace four existing, non-historic aluminum windows with new 1/1, single hung vinyl windows. Specifically, the windows proposed for removal include the following:
 - Three 1/1 aluminum windows with aluminum trim at the rear elevation (two at the second story and one at the first story)
 - One 1/1 aluminum window with aluminum trim at the north elevation

The reasons for the denial of the proposed windows are the following:

- It appears that the two proposed products are meant to be installed in new construction vs existing construction. As a result, it is not clear how the project contractor will appropriately install them within the current window openings.
- The window unit casing/brickmould is too flimsy and flat/lacks depth.
- Both proposed window unit types are single hung so that the top, fixed “sash” is integrated with the casing/brickmould. Therefore, a true jamb, sash channel, and blind stop is not visible from the exterior. As a result, the windows display a flat appearance which is wholly inappropriate to an historic property. A compatible replacement window should be double hung/display an independent upper sash, true jamb, sash channel, and blind stop. If single hung, the top sash of the unit should be independent of the brickmould/trim and the brickmould/trim should adequately display a true jamb, sash channel, and blind stop.
- The sill is minimal at both units.
- The sash top, side and bottom rails appear to be too wide/thick (due to strength limitations of the material and each unit’s accommodation of double paned glazing)
- The white finish color of the “American Standard” unit is not consistent with the color of the brick and/or the home’s trim and does not conform to any of the colors outlined in the HDC’s Color Systems.

- The current application does not include specifications for the proposed new windows so the dimensions of the windows at key locations (to include the jambs, head, meeting rail sill, side rails, and bottom rail) are unknown.
- Information re: the manner in which the windows will be trimmed out to fit in each opening has not been included in the current application. It is therefore unclear to staff how the windows will be installed.

The Commission therefore determined that the proposed windows do not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

The application may be resubmitted for the Historic District Commission's review when suggested changes have been made that address the cited reasons for denial, if applicable.

Please be advised that, in accordance with MCL 399. 211 and Section 21-2-81 of the 2019 Detroit City Code, an applicant aggrieved by a decision of the DHDC may file an appeal with the State Historic Preservation Review Board. Within sixty (60) days of your receipt of this notice, an appeal may be filed with:

Jon Stuckey, Michigan Department of Attorney General
2nd Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building
525 West Ottawa Street
P.O. Box 30754
Lansing, MI 48909

Phone: 517-335-0665
E-mail: stuckeyj@michigan.gov

If you have any questions regarding the foregoing, please contact staff at 313-224-1762 or hdc@detroitmi.gov.

For the Commission:



Jennifer Ross
Detroit Historic District Commission