MINUTES
DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING
September 9, 2026
Coleman A. Young Municipal Center, Suite 808

I CALL TO ORDER

Chair Franklin called the meeting to order at 4:40 p.m.

II ROLL CALL

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Tiffany Franklin	Chair	X	
James Hamilton	Commissioner	X	
Marques King	Commissioner	X—arrived at 5:10 PM	
Allan Machielse	Vice Chair	X	
William Marquez	Commissioner	X	
Adrea Simmons	Commissioner	X	
STAFF			
Audra Dye	PDD	X	
Garrick Landsberg (Director)	PDD	X	
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	
Lise St James	PDD	X	
Bilqees Salie	PDD	X	
Ellen Thackery	PDD	X	

III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

ACTION
Commissioner Hamilton moved to place the application for 2900 St Antoine & 670 Wilkins (HDC2026-00492) for the Brewster-Wheeler Recreation Center on the consent agenda.
Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORTED

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 5-0

ACTION
Commissioner Hamilton moved to approve the modified agenda.
Commissioner Simmons: SUPPORTED

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 5-0

IV CLOSED SESSION

None

V APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

ACTION
Commissioner Machielse moved to approve the meeting minutes for May, July, and August.
Commissioner Marquez: SUPPORTED

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: ABSTAIN
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 4 Abstention: 1
MOTION PASSED: 4-0, WITH 1 ABSTENTION

VI REPORTS

None

VII APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA

ACTION
Commissioner Hamilton moved to approve the consent agenda, including application HDC2026-00492 for 2900 St Antoine & 670 Wilkins for the Brewster-Wheeler Recreation Center.
Commissioner Simmons: SUPPORTED

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION PASSED: 5-0

VIII POSTPONED APPLICATIONS

None

IX EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)

None

X SITE PLAN REVIEWS (per Section 50-3-204 of the 2019 Detroit City Code)

3037 E. Grand Boulevard – SLU2026-00075 – Adjacent to Jam Handy/ North End- East Grand Boulevard HD – Construct building

ACTION
Commissioner Marquez moved that the following comments be returned in response to HDC involvement in Site Plan Review for **3037 E. Grand Blvd. (SLU2026-0075)**: The building should be brought to a zero lot line or in contextual coordination with area massings.
Commissioner Machielse : Supported.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 5-0

1663 Bagley – SLU2025-00120 – adjacent to Corktown HD

ACTION
Commissioner Machielse moved that no comments be returned in response to HDC involvement in the Site Plan Review for **1663 Bagley – SLU2025-00120**.

Commissioner Simmons: Supported.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 5-0

XI APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

1120 Seminole – HDC2026-00401 – Indian Village HD – ET **–** Erect greenhouse

Staff report.

Commissioner Hamilton recused himself and left the auditorium.

Applicant Keith Martin attended remotely and was sworn in. He described why he needs the covered space as a temporary workshop for a couple more years.

Public Hearing opened and closed without comment at 5:05 PM.

[Commissioner King arrived at 5:10 PM.]

ACTION:
Commissioner Marquez moved:
Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00401 for 1120 Seminole**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:
The temporary structure will be disassembled and removed by August 1, 2028.

Commissioner Machielse: supported.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: RECUSED
Commissioner King: ABSTAINED
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0, with one recusal and one abstention
MOTION PASSED 4-0

[Commissioner Hamilton returned to the auditorium.]
15067 Warwick – HDC2026-00289 – Rosedale Park HD – AD **–** Demolish garage, erect garage

Staff report.

Rita Ribiat, applicant, property manager, and broker for the owner, attended remotely and was sworn in. Applicant attended in person and were sworn in. Michael Griffin and LaBarran Cole, owner's rep and construction team, attended in person and were sworn in. Applicants agree with staff recommendation from the staff report.

Public Hearing opened and closed without comment at 5:17 PM.

ACTION:
Commissioner Simmons moved:
Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00289 for 15067 Warwick**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

1. The garage floor plan on Page A101 will be corrected to show the accurate east and west wall dimensions as listed on the elevation drawings and site plan.
2. Aluminum-clad wood windows are selected, with casement, double-hung or single-hung operation. Undivided glass will be selected.
3. Cut sheets for all products will correlate with the revised drawings. Finish colors will be noted on the drawings or within the cut sheets. The color palette will be dark brown, matching the color palette of the house. Paint colors submitted for review must include manufacturer name, paint name, paint number, as well as a visual sample.
4. The revised drawings and cut sheets will be submitted to staff for review.

Commissioner Hamilton supported.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 6 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 6-0

105 Delaware – HDC2026-00448 – New Center Area HD – LSJ – Demolish rear enclosed stairs, rehabilitate building

Staff report.

Applicant Hiroki Watarai attended in person and was sworn in. Applicant happy to adjust color as recommended by staff in the staff report.

Public Hearing opened at 5:23 PM and closed with one comment: Jacob Herald, 127 Seward, directly behind the subject house, supports the proposed work.

ACTION:
Commissioner Marquez moved:
Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00448 for 105 Delaware**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

1. The proposed woodwork paint and gutter/downspout colors are to follow the Historic District Commission Color System D, suggesting darker colors.

Commissioner King supported.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 6 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 6-0

347-355 W. Grand Boulevard – HDC2026-00462 – Hubbard Farms HD – JR – Construct parking lot, erect trash enclosure, rehabilitate building

Staff report.

Applicants Joe Hudec and Vince Cataldo attended in person and were sworn in. Agreed with the conditions recommended by the staff report.

Public hearing opened and closed 5:35 PM without comment. Was opened and closed again at approximately 5:40 PM, again without comment.

Commissioner clarified that the application states that there will be aluminum brick mold and commissioner believes that implicit in the staff's recommendations, wood brick mold trim would be used rather than aluminum. Applicant agreed with that implication and condition.

ACTION:
Commissioner Marquez moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00462 for 347-355 W Grand Boulevard**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

1. The trash enclosure doors and the opaque wall at the north edge of the parking lot shall not be constructed of the proposed aluminum panel product. Staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the revised/final plan for these elements to ensure that the product is compatible with the historic character of the building at 347 W. Grand Boulevard and its surrounds.
2. All deteriorated/damaged exterior elements of the building which are proposed to be restored, repaired, or replicated shall be done with in-kind materials, including the wood brick mold that will be used for the windows. The final permit drawings shall be revised to reflect these conditions.
3. The proposed new multiple-pane windows shall either be true divided lite or simulated divided lite units.

Commissioner King supported.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 6 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 6-0

1977 Atkinson – **HDC2026-00290** – **Atkinson Avenue HD** – BS – Erect pre-fab metal building

Staff report.

Applicant Ike Okereke attended in person and was sworn in. Wants a garage and looked at other garages in the area to take cues for appropriateness, happy to amend the application.

Public Hearing opened and closed without comment at 5:42 PM. Commissioner stated that he finds the shape and size appropriate, but he finds the materiality incompatible. Another commissioner stated that the size of the structure, compared to the property and the house, and the neighboring structures, seems large. A decreased scale would be more compatible with the nearby garages. Applicant agreed that bringing the size down to a two-car garage would be more compatible. Commissioner wanted to clarify—would there be overhead doors from both the backyard and the alley and also stated that the other garages in the area are built right along the alley and not set back.

ACTION:
Commissioner Marquez moved:
Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00290 for 1977 Atkinson,** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL,

as the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- *9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

And

Elements of Design # 7, 8, 9 and 20

For the following reasons:

1. The proposed installation of the pre-fabricated metal building is not compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the historic-age house and fails to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Commissioner Hamilton supported.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 6 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 6-0

XII CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

None.

XIII PUBLIC COMMENT

Public comment opened at 5:51 PM.

Resident Matthew Daniels attended by Zoom and requested that the fence with the Brush Park application at St Antione and Wilkins be lowered to a 4-foot height and a setback that is in keeping with the residential neighborhood.

Public comment closed at 5:53 PM.

XIV APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

14597 Artesian – HDC2026-00108 – Rosedale Park HD – LSJ **–** Replace wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows

Applicant Nicole Stowers, present and sworn in. Looking for more energy efficiency and security.

Commissioners clarified whether the contractor is window replacement only; applicant confirmed. Some sills look to be in poor condition, but many of the sashes look to be in good condition. A good window rehabber should be able to repair the frame and sashes and replace the sills. Sees some storm windows and recommends storms for all windows. One commissioner suggests that it appears that some of the windows received new sills and that the gap between the existing trim and the new sill created a problem/hastened the decline of the sills. Commissioners agreed that a window restorer could assess the conditions and provide a quote or explain why the windows can't be repaired, and that would be helpful information to have for a window replacement application as well.

ACTION:
Commissioner Simmons moved, with support from Commissioner Hamilton:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00108 for 14597 Artesian,** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL,

as the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- *2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- *5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved*
- *6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence*

And

Elements of Design # 3, 7, 8, and 15

For the following reasons:

1. The historic wood windows are distinctive, character-defining historic features of the resource.

The submitted application materials do not substantiate that these windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamiltton: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 6 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 6-0

1920 Atkinson – HDC2026-00400 – Atkinson Avenue HD – AD – Replace wood windows with wood windows, other exterior alterations

[Commissioners Hamilton and Marquez recused themselves and left the auditorium.]

Applicant Antonio Luck was present and sworn in. He described the contractor difficulties they had on this project and that they are not happy that the contractor built the windows incorrectly also. Fixing that issue with correct windows would be expensive and difficult. Commission discussed prioritizing various facades and that there wasn't a next-door neighboring building so the building almost has two primary elevations and is commercial. The Commission discussed an estimate for correcting the incorrectly built windows on two facades.

ACTION:
Commissioner Machielse, with support from Commissioner Simmons, moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00400 for 1920 Atkinson,** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the historic wood windows with new wood windows WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL,

as the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- *1) A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*
- *2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- *5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*
- *6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement*

of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

For the following reasons:

1. The historic windows with the 12-over-12 pattern were distinctive, character-defining features. They offered complexity to the elevations and ornamental detailing which was commensurate with the highly detailed masonry walls' Flemish bond and 18th-century revival character of the structure.
2. Per the Commission's previous approval, the historic windows were to be repaired or replaced in-kind, matching the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities, and where possible, materials. The installed windows do not match the historic windows and altered the features and spaces that characterize the property.
3. The reduction from a 12-over-12 glass pattern to an 8-over-8 pattern changed the proportion of glass within the larger windows. It created a more standardized pattern and proportions within the upper and lower sash, and eliminated a detail that related to the overall design of the building, as well as the removing the consistency of proportional pattern amongst the window openings.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: None
MOTION PASSED 4-0 with two recusals

ACTION
Commissioner Machielse moved, supported by Commissioner Simmons:
Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00400 for 1920 Atkinson,** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

1. The utility boxes on the west wall of the structure shall be painted a dark color, and submitted to staff for review.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION PASSED 4-0, with two recusals

[Commissioners Hamilton and Marquez returned to the auditorium.]

1501 Seminole – HDC2026-00435 – Indian Village HD – GL **–** Replace gravel driveway in rear yard with asphalt driveway
Zachary Kolodin, present and sworn in. Described the massive effort they have invested, described that no historic feature or landscape is being proposed to remove. Applicant clarified that the proposed work is entirely behind the house and not seen anywhere except from the alley. Commissioner asked if the applicant had received a concrete estimate. Applicant said yes, and that estimate was $23,000.

ACTION:
Commissioner Marquez, with support from Commissioner Simmons,
Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00435 for 1501 Seminole,** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL,

as the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- *9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

And

Elements of Design # 13

For the following reasons:

1. Asphalt is not a historically compatible pavement material in the Indian Village Historic District

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 6 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 6-0

15403 Artesian – HDC2026-00454 – Rosedale Park HD – ET **–** Replace wood windows with vinyl windows

Homeowners Deborah Tunstull and Wayne Tunstull were present online and sworn in. Contractor Thomas O'Hara was present online and was sworn in.

Contractor described that the homeowners sought new windows to replace the old—only upstairs windows are being considered at this time and he is with a replacement window company (they don't repair windows). Proposed are vinyl windows upstairs to match the configuration of the existing. Seven of the 9 are egress windows and they have rot and air infiltration. The contractor stated that the windows could be repaired but he thinks the problems will return in a short time. The homeowners described that a storm window fell out of the window opening onto the deck. They decided to hire Window Nation but did not know that vinyl would not be allowed. Chair asked whether they received any quotes to repair the windows. The homeowner described that he received a quote from an individual to repair the windows for $75 per window. But the homeowners don't want to repair. They don't understand what's involved and the repair contractor didn't know entirely either, so they want to get the issue entirely addressed.

The chair described that, in the historic district, when reviewing a proposed window replacement, the Commission seeks to understand whether the historic window to be repaired is deteriorated beyond repair. If it is, the Commission may entertain replacing it, but not with a vinyl product.

The homeowner described that they have some vinyl windows that were there when they purchased and so they were trying to match those. And they'd like all the windows to be consistent and not patched and in need of repair again soon. Chair stated that the experience of the commissioners who have had their windows repaired by a window restoration professional is that the repairs have lasted and are expected to last 80 years or more. With a professional window restorer, the restored windows would not fail in a couple years.

Commissioner described that vinyl windows do not match historic windows. The homeowners described that their vinyl windows have held up and that a lot of their neighbors have them. The contractor echoed this—several homes on the street have vinyl windows already.

ACTION:
Commissioner Machielse moved, with support from Commissioner Hamilton:
Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00454 for 15403 Artesian,** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines that the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL,

as the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- *2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- *5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved*
- *6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

And

- *Elements of Design 7, 8, and 15*

For the following reasons:

1. The original wood windows are distinctive, historic character-defining features that date to the resource's Period of Significance.
2. The proposal, which seeks to replace the original wood windows, does not demonstrate that the historically distinctive, character-defining windows are beyond reasonable repair.
3. Should the Commission determine that the existing windows are beyond reasonable repair, the proposed replacements do not match the old in design, color, texture, dimensionality/muntin depth, or materials.
4. Due to their plasticity, flatness, detracting color/sheen, component profiles, and poor material quality, consumer-grade vinyl windows are incompatible with the building's overall historic character and do not exhibit an appearance consistent with the general characteristics of a historic window of the same type and period, as required by National Park Service Guidance.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 6 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 6-0

Chair encouraged the applicants to return with a new application if they have an assessment from a window restoration professional regarding their windows' condition, or an application for windows that are of a more historically compatible material.

2942 and 2952 (AKA 2942-2972) Second – HDC2026-00461 – Cass Park HD – ET – Stabilize and mothball three buildings, remove windows and rear porches/stairs, repair façade elements

Joe Hudec and Vince Cataldo both present and sworn in. Have reviewed the staff report and agree with the recommended conditions for approval. Commissioners had general positive feedback for the proposal.

ACTION:
Commissioner Hamilton, supported by Commissioner King, moved:
Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00461 for 2942 & 2952 (AKA 2942 – 2972) Second**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

1. Any window components (sashes, frames, brick molds, other trim) that remain in the bays at the Altadena and the Manhattan will be carefully documented, photographed, removed, tagged, and safely stored for reuse or replication before the bays are removed from the buildings.
2. No window components (other than those in the bays at the Altadena and the Manhattan) will be removed from the buildings. Complete, thorough documentation and photos of existing windows is needed for Commission review. Boarding of the window openings with existing window components in place is approved.
3. If any historic exterior doors are revealed when boards are removed, the historic door(s) will be documented, photographed, tagged, and safely stored.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: ABSTAIN
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0, Abstention: 1
MOTION PASSED 5-0 with one abstention

1459 Atkinson – HDC2026-00439 – Atkinson Avenue HD – BS – Replace wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows, replace siding at gables

Kirill Dubrovsky attended online and sworn in. Johnny Merehouyias also attended online but was not able to be sworn in due to technical/camera difficulties. Mr. Dubrovsky confirmed that the Commission has their complete documentation and there was a presentation to be entered onto the record. There are nine windows proposed for replacement.

Commissioner noted (and another agreed) that some of the structural damage that is evident would need to be addressed whether the window is repaired or replaced. Commission looked at each of the nine windows, noting that front façade windows are important to the house's architecture, and a commissioner stated that the windows appear to be fixable—a window repair professional should be able to successfully repair these windows. Applicant outlined damage and deterioration, and commissioners commented that at least in some cases trim pieces or framing pieces were missing but that should be easily remedied. Chair noted for the record that the Commission reviewed each window with the applicant so that they could point out to the Commission the issues with each window/ sash.

Applicant stated that regarding siding, they would accept the condition as staff recommended it and could go unfinished or could work with the HDC and the property owner to select an appropriate color. The applicant would request that the siding could get approved, separate from the windows.

ACTION:
Commissioner King, with support from Commissioner Simmons, moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00439 for 1459 Atkinson,** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of historic-age wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL,

as the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- *2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- *5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved*
- *6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

And

- *Elements of Design 7*

For the following reasons:

1. The original wood windows are distinctive, historic character-defining features that date to the resource's Period of Significance.
2. The proposal, which seeks to replace the original wood windows, does not demonstrate that the historically distinctive, character-defining windows are beyond reasonable repair.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 6 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 6-0

ACTION
Commissioner King moved, with support from Commissioner Simmons:
Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application HDC2026-00439 for 1459 Atkinson,** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the remaining proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

1. The cedar shakes, if finished with paint or stain, shall be finished with colors that are compatible within the Historic Districts' Color Chart System, subject to staff approval. An unfinished installation of cedar shakes is acceptable.

ROLL CALL
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner King: AYE
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Marquez: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: AYE

Ayes: 6 Nays: 0
MOTION PASSED 6-0

2900 St Antoine & 670 Wilkins – HDC2026-00492 – Brewster-Wheeler Recreation Center HD – JR **–** Install fence

ACTION:
Approved on the consent agenda. (See Agenda item VII.)

XV CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

None

XVI OLD BUSINESS

None

XVII NEW BUSINESS

Citywide Historic Preservation Plan Presentation—This presentation was scheduled for last month but was postponed until this month. Deputy Director Jennifer Ross presented. The project is expected to wrap up in December of 2026. The Plan's website is https://www.preserve-detroit.com/ and a survey is available there, along with an interactive map. To email with questions or feedback, the email address to use is historicplan@detroitmi.gov . Three public community workshops are scheduled. They will take place 9/30, 10/1, and 10/7.

Commissioners asked how the effort is being promoted. In terms of engagement, the Department of Neighborhoods knows and will publicize, and there will be an eblast ahead of the workshops. The plan will be posted on the city's website and integrated with the master plan.

XVIII ADJOURNMENT

ACTION
Commissioner King, supported by Commissioner Machielse, moved to adjourn, followed by a voice vote. Chair Franklin adjourned the meeting at 7:40 PM.