

DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: March 8, 2023

Coleman A. Young Municipal Center, 13th Floor, Erma Henderson Auditorium

AGENDA (Actual time [audio recording time stamp])

I CALL TO ORDER (5:36 p.m. [00:20:00])

Chairperson Franklin called the meeting to order at 5:36 p.m.

II ROLL CALL (5:38 p.m. [00:22:00])

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION		PRESENT	ABSENT
Najahyia Chinchilla	Commissioner	X	
Tiffany Franklin	Chair	X	
James Hamilton	Commissioner	X	
Roderick Hardamon	Commissioner	X	
Richard Hosey	Commissioner		X
Alan Machielse	Commissioner	X	
Adrea Simmons			X
STAFF			
Timothy Boscarino	PDD		X
Benjamin Buckley	PDD		X
Audra Dye	PDD		X
Garrick Landsberg (Director)	PDD		X
Daniel Rieden	PDD		X
Jennifer Ross	PDD		X

III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA (05:39 p.m. [00:23:00])

ACTION (5:38 p.m. [00:02:15])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that the agenda be approved.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

- Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
 - Commissioner Franklin: AYE
 - Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
 - Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
 - Commissioner Hosey: not present
 - Commissioner Machielse: AYE
 - Commissioner Simmons: not present
- Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES (5:39 p.m. [00:23:30])

ACTION (5:40 p.m. [00:24:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that February 8, 2022 minutes be approved.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: abstain

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

V REPORTS (5:40 p.m. [00:24:30])

Director Landsberg introduced two new commissioners, Najahyia Chinchilla, and Adrea Simmons.

Director Landsberg noted that Chairperson Franklin has been appointed to another term on the Historic District Commission.

VI APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA (5:43 p.m. [00:27:30])

None

VII POSTPONED APPLICATIONS (5:43 p.m. [00:27:45])

None

VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)

(5:44 p.m. [00:28:00])

None

IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (5:44 p.m. [00:28:15])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8197 (5:44 p.m. [00:28:15])

ADDRESS: 15083 Minock

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Rosedale Park HD

APPLICANT: Evan Thomas

OWNER: Evan Thomas

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect garage, demolish addition, erect addition and deck, install aluminum-clad windows

Staff summarized the staff report, noting that this application was at the February 8, 2023, meeting, but was withdrawn. The applicant now submits a revised application addressing concerns expressed at the February meeting.

Howard Bynum and Cheri Bohrn, representing the applicant, described the updates to the proposal.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Commissioners Hardamon, Machielse, and Hamilton noted that the footprint of the proposed new construction was comparable to other buildings nearby.

Commissioner Chinchilla asked about the proposed white paint color. The applicant stated that the proposed paint color comes from the designation photo. Commissioner Machielse opined that white is an appropriate color for Dutch Colonial architecture.

ACTION (6:59 p.m. [00:43:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8197 for 15083 Minock**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the application in its entirety WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work. The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following condition:

- A mock-up photograph of the front porch, showing where the new railing will be installed, and a description stating that the new railing will match the historic railing in material, color, dimension, and design, shall be submitted for staff review.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8230 (6:02 p.m. [00:46:00])

ADDRESS: 2285 Atkinson

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Atkinson Avenue

APPLICANT: Sean Horvath, Lunar Construction Inc.

OWNER: Ian Redmond

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect garage

Staff summarized the staff report.

Sean Horvath with Lunar Construction, the contractor, described the proposed work.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Several commissioners expressed agreement with the staff recommendation.

ACTION (6:09 p.m. [00:51:00])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8230 for 2285 Atkinson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The garage shall be clad with a wood siding or a cement fiber siding which displays a smooth finish. The proposed vinyl siding is incompatible with the neighborhood's historic character because it does not adequately display an appearance, texture and profile of the traditional wood siding which it is seeking to mimic and is a non-historic material that detracts from the historic context. Wood grain is typically not visible on painted historic-age, lapped wood siding. Rather, such siding would display a smooth finish due to application of multiple layers of paint over time.
- The color of the garage's asphalt shingle roofing shall match the color of the home's roof. HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the shingles' final color prior to the issuance of the project's permit.
- The applicant shall select a color for the garage doors, trim, and siding which is compatible with the home's trim color(s). The material for the side elevation door shall out be provided to HDC staff. HDC staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve the final color selections prior to the issuance of the project's permit.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8235 (6:10 p.m. [00:54:30])

ADDRESS: 269 Watson

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Brush Park HD

APPLICANT: Meir Israel and Rose Valencia

OWNER: Arben Gjekaj

SCOPE OF WORK: Demolish garage, reconstruct side porch, install fence.

Staff summarized the staff report.

Commissioner Franklin asked if the work was in progress without approval. Staff confirmed that it was.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Commissioners discussed the relationship between the applicant and owner and asked why the work continued without approval.

Commissioner Chinchilla asked about new construction at the back porch. Staff stated that is not part of the application, and appears to represent a violation.

Commissioner Hamilton said that the porch, as built, is not acceptable, and should more closely represent the historic porch.

Commissioners Hamilton and Franklin agreed with the staff recommendation regarding the fence.

ACTION (ONE) (6:32 p.m. [01:16:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8235 for 269 Watson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the reconstruction of the east porch **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that:

- The east porch railing, the applied detailing to the arches and the altered post design destroys and alters the original features that characterizes the original railing and original square Tuscan capitals of the posts, which are historic character defining features of the building.
- The replacement of the brick piers from the east porch with wood posts that are obscured with skirting that is neither framed nor follows historic standards.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Commissioner Machilese: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (6:34 p.m. [01:18:45])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8235 for 269 Watson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The applicant relocates the east gate of the chain link fence to the brick corner of the house, behind the east porch, painted black.
- The deck be painted a color that matches Color System C color scheme of the HDC color guide.
- The applicant provides HDC staff a review of the above items before installation.
- The downspouts installed on the east side of the house replicated the original location of the downspouts rather than terminating at the roof of the porch.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: NAY

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 4 Nays: 1

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8231 (6:39 p.m. [01:23:00])

ADDRESS: 1427 Randolph

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Madison-Harmonie HD

APPLICANT: Roman Bonislawski
OWNER: Randolph Capital Partners LLC
SCOPE OF WORK: Alter storefront, add patio, add signage

Staff summarized the staff report.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Roman Bonislawski, the architect, described the proposal, stating that all the proposed finishes, including the proposed sign, will be black.

Commissioner Hamilton expressed opposition to the proposed airlock, noting that it interrupts the design of the storefront and would change the look of Harmonie Park.

Commissioner Hardamon expressed support of the proposed airlock, stating that it is within the character and spirit of Harmonie Park.

Commissioner Chinchilla noted that the airlock would interrupt the view of Harmonie Park and asked if it could be made more transparent or if it could be in place only seasonally.

ACTION (ONE) (6:23 p.m. [06:52:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8231 for 1427 Randolph**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The finish and color of the proposed steel rail, the selection of proposed planters, the color of the proposed awning, and the final appearance of the proposed blade sign shall be subject to approval by staff.

MOTION FAILED for lack of support

Commissioner Hardamon stated that there is a City of Detroit initiative to redevelop Harmonie Park with businesses of this type.

Several commissioners and the applicant discussed potential revisions to the design. Director Landsburg suggested that adding additional transparent vinyl would create more reflectivity and that the proposed black material would deemphasize the structure.

Commissioner Franklin expressed support for the design. Commissioner Chinchilla noted that the proposed airlock is reversible.

ACTION (TWO) (6:59 p.m. [01:43:45])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8231 for 1427 Randolph**, , and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The finish and color of the proposed steel rail, the selection of proposed planters, the color of the proposed awning, and the final appearance of the proposed blade sign shall be subject to approval by staff.
- The lettering will be black as noted by the applicant and as approved by staff.

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: NAY

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: NAY

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 3 Nays: 2

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8232 (7:01 p.m. [01:45:30])

ADDRESS: 1407 Randolph

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Madison-Harmonie HD

APPLICANT: Roman Bonislawski

OWNER: Randolph Capital Partners LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Alter storefront, add patio

Commissioner Franklin left the room, assigning Commissioner Machielse to serve as chair.

Staff summarized the staff report.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Roman Bonislawski, the architect, described the proposal, stating that the awnings are proposed to be black canvas, and stating that the fabric projections will not be in place year-round.

Commissioner Chinchilla asked about the structure of the projecting elements and expressed a concern that the insect screen could be too opaque.

Commissioner Franklin returned.

ACTION (6:23 p.m. [00:47:45])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8232 for 1407 Randolph**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following condition:

- The fabric color and material will be subject to approval by staff, with concern for visibility and transparency of the material.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: abstain

Commissioner Hamilton: abstain

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 3 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Franklin resumed as chair.

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8197 (7:18 p.m. [02:02:00])

ADDRESS: 1133 and 1145 Griswold

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Capitol Park HD

APPLICANT: Nate Lyndsey, Kraemer Design Group, architect

OWNER: Richard Karp

SCOPE OF WORK: Renovate façade, construct rooftop addition

Staff summarized the staff report, including a recommendation that the building was noncontributing.

Brian Rebain, the architect and representing the architect, clarified that the proposed addition would be four stories.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Commissioner Chinchilla asked about the architectural style of the proposed façade. Brian Rebain called it “a postmodern take on Art Deco.”

ACTION (7:26 p.m [02:10:00])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8236 and 23-8247 for 1133 and 1145 Griswold**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission

determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: abstain

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (7:27 p.m. [02:12:00])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8237 (7:27 p.m. [02:12:00])

ADDRESS: 2095 Garland

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Ossian Sweet House HD

APPLICANT: Alexander Grabowski, Blue Gate MI LLC

OWNER: Daniel Baxter

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace rear second story porch, install glass block windows

Director Landsberg and staff provided background regarding the project and summarized the staff report, suggesting that this was one of the most important historic properties in the city.

Alex Grabowski, the applicant, expressed support of the staff recommendation.

Commissioner Franklin asked what materials were removed. Alex Grabowski described the condition of the rear porch prior to its removal.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Commissioner Franklin noted that there are letters from members of the public posted on the HDC website.

Commissioner Hamilton opined that the nature of the porch railing suggests it might have been added later on. Brian Rebain, representing the applicant, agreed.

Director Landsberg opined that it is very likely, but not certain, that the removed railing was an original feature. Several commissioners continued to discuss the appropriateness of the proposal.

ACTION (7:45 p.m. [02:29:15])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8237 for 2905 Garland**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The applicant will propose a period and architecturally appropriate painted wood railing for the upper porch as well as the lower porch and stairs. An alternate option for the upper porch would be to rebuild the knee-wall that is heavily documented in pre-demolition photographs.
- The applicant will modify the previously submitted rear elevation drawings to show the location, dimensions, design, materials, and finish of the porch railings and concrete steps; the drawings will be submitted for staff review. Painted wood steps, in lieu of concrete, shall also be appropriate.
- The retention and repair of the existing basement windows on the north and south elevations, the removal of glass block and installation of wood hopper windows (matching existing) at the west elevation, with paint color for sash listed, will be noted on the architectural drawings submitted for permit.

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8238 (7:46 p.m. [02:30:30])

ADDRESS: 2200 (2600) East Atwater

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Aretha Franklin Amphitheater/Chene Park HD

APPLICANT: David M. Zanley, Hamilton Anderson; Brad Gable, WCI Contractors

OWNER: City of Detroit General Services Department

SCOPE OF WORK: Install signage, alter landscape

Commissioner Machielse noted that he is employed by the architect for this application and the next one and recused himself, leaving the room.

Staff summarized the staff report.

David Zanley of Hamilton Anderson, architect for the project, Jake Hamilton of Hamilton Anderson, landscape architect for the project, Marie Haener-Patti of the General Services Department, the project manager, and Barry Burton of the General Services Department spoke and described the application. They explained the reasoning for proposing to remove the four pylons, stating that they are deteriorated

and no longer serve a wayfinding function. They also described the proposed plant removal and discussed other areas of the scope of work.

Several commissioners emphasized the importance of the pylons.

Shahida Mousi president of the Wright Productions, who manages the Aretha Franklin Amphitheater, asked about changing the text on the pylons, as it is no longer accurate.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Commissioner Franklin offered the opinion that changing the text on the pylons would be acceptable.

Commissioner Chinchilla asked if the proposed new pylons could be formed similarly to the historic ones. Director Landsburg responded that replicating the formwork exactly would not be possible, and suggested that the proposed design was acceptably differentiated.

ACTION (ONE) (8:10 p.m. [01:46:15])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8238 for 2200 Atwater**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the removal of the concrete pylons (#2, #5, #7, #11) per the applicant's landscape plan **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that:

- The pylons are integrated elements in the composition of the historic landscape and are contributing to the rhythm of and patterns of distinctive concrete features that are repeated and represented throughout the park, which are evident in from the largest architectural features down to the cylindrical break wall features, which together create a legible pattern language that as a whole is a key site design element.
- The materiality of the striated concrete at each pylon is characteristic of the architecture of this period and is also a distinct character defining feature.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Simmons: not present
Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:
Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8238 for 2200 Atwater**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: not present
Commissioner Simmons: not present
Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8239 (8:14 p.m. [02:57:45])
ADDRESS: 2200 (2600) East Atwater
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Aretha Franklin Amphitheater/Chene Park HD
APPLICANT: David M. Zanley, Hamilton Anderson; Brad Gable, WCI Contractors
OWNER: City of Detroit General Services Department
SCOPE OF WORK: Install signage, alter landscape

Staff summarized the staff report, which states that this is a noncontributing building. Staff stated that the applicant has expressed a desire to use a grey color for the windows.

Marie Haener-Patti of the General Services Department, the project manager, stated that anodized aluminum comes in a grey color; custom coloring would take additional time and expense.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Commissioner Chinchilla agreed that this is a noncontributing building and stated that the blue color and the dimensions of the windows are important elements and should be retained for the sake of compatibility with the broader property.

Commissioner Franklin agreed that the blue color was important, also acknowledging the applicant's desire for cost-effectiveness.

ACTION (8:24 p.m. [03:07:00])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8239 for 2200 Atwater**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work, with the condition that:

- The color closely matches the existing color of the window frame, with staff approval.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: not present

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

XI PUBLIC COMMENT (8:26 p.m. [01:41:00])

None

XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (8:26 p.m. [01:42:00])

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8201 (8:27 p.m. [00:07:00])

ADDRESS: 761 Whitmore

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Palmer Park Apartment Buildings HD

APPLICANT: Kevin Brandon

OWNER: Robert Christoph RCI, 17664 Manderson LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl windows

Commissioner Machielse returned.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Kevin Brandon, the applicant, described having removed some of the aluminum from the windows to uncover historic brick mould beneath. The applicant also noted that paint surrounding the windows can be removed to restore the historic appearance. The applicant also described the proposed aluminum simulated muntins; a requested material sample has not yet arrived. It comes from the factory and is the

same material and adhesive. The applicant stated that nineteen windows that were installed after fire damage do not have the original brick mould.

Commissioner Hamilton suggested that the simulated muntins would potentially be appropriate if applied by professionals.

Commissioners Hamilton, Hardamon, and Machielse noted that the nineteen windows in the fire-damaged area lack brick moulds and are grouped together on a secondary façade, and suggested that creating a mock frame around each of these windows would not be necessary. Director Landsburg agreed that a discrepancy in this area would not be readily noticeable.

ACTION (8:44 p.m. [03:28:00])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8201 for 761 Whitmore**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The cleaning/removal of paint from any painted masonry surface of the painted masonry shall be done using the gentlest means possible and shall follow Secretary of the Interior Standards guidelines. The applicant shall provide HDC staff with the final specifications/proposal for the areas to be cleaned of paint for review and approval prior to the issuance of the permit.
- Cladding around the windows needs to be removed, and the remaining brickmold to be restored or replicated, and paint removed from the window sills.
- Exterior muntins can be applied over the interior muntins in the widths of 5/8 or 7/8 inches, provided they are applied by a Quaker employee or representative. This shall be reviewed and approved by HDC Staff.
- No moldings be applied to the nineteen incorrectly reconstructed windows.

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8204 (8:48 p.m. [03:32:00])

ADDRESS: 7908-7912 St. Paul

HISTORIC DISTRICT: West Village HD

APPLICANT: Renata Polk, Sustainable Village Group

OWNER: Renata Polk

SCOPE OF WORK: Remove wood siding, install synthetic siding, replace windows and doors, rebuild porch

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

The applicant, Renata Polk, described the deterioration of the windows and siding.

Commissioner Franklin asked if any work was done without approval. The applicant answered yes.

Commissioners and staff discussed the condition of the windows. Staff did not see evidence that the windows were beyond repair. Staff also noted that the proposed window is not double hung and will not have an appropriate appearance.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that the siding is currently missing, and suggested that adding new siding would not result in a loss of detail around the window openings. Staff expressed a concern that if a cementitious siding is added, the installation would like require removal of part of the window casings. Staff stated that the historic window trim is an important feature that should be retained.

Commissioner Hamilton noted that synthetic siding would not be able to replicate the three inch reveal on the front façade.

Commissioners Machielse and Chinchilla suggested that any missing window trim should be replicated.

Director Landsburg stated that the wood siding was very distinctive and that this work is one of the most serious violations we have seen.

Director Landsburg and Commissioners Machielse, Hamilton, and Franklin discussed several ways in which contemporary cementitious siding does not adequately replicate the dimensions and appearance of historic siding.

Commissioner Hamilton stated that there was no evidence that the windows were in need of replacement.

ACTION (ONE) (9:05 p.m. [03:49:15])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8204 for 7908 – 7912 St. Paul**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the historic wood siding and wood windows **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that:

- The replacement of the historic wood siding and existing windows is not compatible with the architectural style and age of this house.
- The current application did not provide sufficient documentation outlining the deterioration of the original wood siding that was removed without approval. Therefore, it is not clear to staff that the original wood siding merited wholesale removal, rather than replacement of only those boards that were deteriorated beyond repair.
- There is no indication that the proposed synthetic siding can faithfully reproduce the narrow siding expression at the front elevation, as well as the dimensional window frames. Only true wood siding can restore this historic character.

- Similar documentation of the existing condition of all of windows was not submitted, and the proposed replacement window is not an adequate match to the historic sash.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (TWO) (9:05 p.m. [03:51:15])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8204 for 7908–7912 St. Paul**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The porch corner columns will match the previous interior corner columns in dimension and design,
- The porch and stair railings will have straight spindles, top and bottom rails, and square corner posts.

- The porch components will be left to dry for one to three months before painting; and will be painted C4 Yellowish White.
- Revised plans noting all of the above conditions will be submitted for staff review prior to pulling a permit.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8248 (9:09 p.m. [03:53:00])

ADDRESS: 511 Woodward

HISTORIC DISTRICT: H Detroit Financial D

APPLICANT: Zaid Elia

OWNER: Zaid Elia

SCOPE OF WORK: Install outdoor patio seating and bar

Director Landsburg reminded the commission that this is a change to a previously approved proposal, adding a bar and seating area. Director Landsburg summarized the staff report, which states that the building is noncontributing.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Zaid Elia, the architect and applicant, summarized the proposal.

Commissioner Chinchilla asked for more clarity on what would be visible from the sidewalk. The applicant stated that planters would block much of the bar and seating area.

Commissioner Chinchilla asked if the pattern of the paving seen in the rendering was an intentional component of the application. The applicant described that it was.

ACTION (9:15 p.m. [03:59:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8248 for 511 Woodward**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: not present
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8244 (9:16 p.m. [4:00:45])

ADDRESS: 2475 Chicago

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD

APPLICANT: Martin Leger, Central Dwellings Corp.

OWNER: Martin Leger

SCOPE OF WORK: Replace wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows.

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Martin Leger described the deterioration of the building and the interior work that has been done.

Commissioner Franklin asked if there was a professional opinion regarding the deterioration of the windows.

Commissioner Hamilton said that the windows appear to be repairable. Commissioners Hamilton and Machielse observed that the application lacked an estimate for the repair of the windows.

ACTION (9:33 p.m. [04:17:15])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8244 for 2475 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that:

- The existing wood windows are not deteriorated beyond repair.
- The wood sash retains a level of materiality and dimensionality that offers significant architectural detail to the structure; installing the proposed replacement windows would alter features that characterize the property.

Therefore, this work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: not present
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8423 (9:35 p.m. [04:19:00])
ADDRESS: 1411 and 1425 Chicago
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD
APPLICANT: Meaghan and Jacob Marion
OWNER: Meaghan and Jacob Marion
SCOPE OF WORK: Erect fence

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Staff pointed out that the applicant is not present.

ACTION (9:36 p.m. [04:20:00])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8423 for 1411 and 1425 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The fence shall be painted a color as deemed appropriate by staff.
- The fence height shall be standardized to six feet along its entire length.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: not present
Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8241 (9:38 p.m. [04:21:45])
ADDRESS: 267 E. Grand River
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Madison-Harmonie HD

APPLICANT: Matthew Karr, Lighthouse Immersive
OWNER: Roger Besmaijan
SCOPE OF WORK: Install vinyl film signage at fenestration

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Matthew Karr, the building manager and applicant, expressed agreement with the staff report.

ACTION (9:40 p.m. [04:23:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8241 for 267 E. Grand River**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following condition:

- The owner shall remove all the proposed vinyl film signage from the building's fenestration once the current tenant/Lighthouse Immersive no longer hosts events within the building.
- Clear/transparent glazing at fenestration is typical at primary elevations within the historic district. As 267 E. Grand River's east façade is a primary elevation, any effort which might permanently introduce opacity to windows and/or storefronts at this location is not recommended.

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chinchilla: AYE

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 23-8240 (9:40 p.m. [04:24:45])

ADDRESS: 1652 Edison

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Boston-Edison HD

APPLICANT: Aghogho Edevbie

OWNER: Aghogho Edevbie

SCOPE OF WORK: Alter front porch, remove rear enclosed porch, and install rear deck

COMMISSION AND APPLICANT DISCUSSION

Aghogho Edevbie and Melanie Markowicz stated that Aghogho Edevbie recently purchased the home, unaware of the violations. According to the applicants, it appears that the inappropriate work was completed a few years ago; some of it has been reverted.

Commissioner Hamilton stated that there have been many unapproved alterations made to this house over the years, including some work that had been done despite a Denial from the Historic District

Commission, and that the current appearance of the house is a major improvement over how it once looked.

Staff suggested that if the Commission approved the work, the wood brackets should be painted a uniform color.

Commissioner Machielse suggested that replacing the lost brick would not be feasible as the new work would not match the appearance of the historic brick.

ACTION (9:50 p.m. [04:33:00])

Commissioner Chinchilla moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #23-8240 for 1652 Edison**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the work **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- The plywood door and window infill at the rear elevation shall be painted a neutral/brown color which is in keeping/compatible with the color of the brick.
- The new wood rear deck shall be painted or stained a color which is keeping/compatible with the home's trim color.
- The existing wood brackets will be painted a consistent color as approved by staff.

Commissioner Hamilton: SUPPORT

Commissioner Franklin: AYE

Commissioner Hamilton: AYE

Commissioner Hardamon: AYE

Commissioner Hosey: not present

Commissioner Machielse: AYE

Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

XII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING (9:53 p.m. [04:36:30])

None

XIV OLD BUSINESS (9:53 p.m. [04:36:30])

Commissioner Hamilton asked for a report from the committee that was established at the previous meeting regarding DTE electrical conversion work in historic districts.

Commissioners Franklin, Machielse, and Hardamon are continuing to work with DTE to resolved their concerns. The committee will bring a new draft resolution to the Commission at the next meeting.

XV NEW BUSINESS (9:54 p.m. [04:38:30])

ELECTION OF OFFICERS

ACTION (9:54 p.m. [04:38:45])

Commissioner Hamilton moved that:
Commissioner Franklin be reappointed as chair.
Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chincilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION (9:56 p.m. [04:40:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:
Commissioner Machielse be appointed as vice chair.

Commissioner Chinchilla: SUPPORT

Commissioner Chincilla: AYE
Commissioner Franklin: AYE
Commissioner Hamilton: AYE
Commissioner Hardamon: AYE
Commissioner Hosey: not present
Commissioner Machielse: AYE
Commissioner Simmons: not present

Ayes: 5 Nays: 0

MOTION CARRIED

XVI ADJOURNEMENT (9:57 p.m. (04:41:00))

ACTION (9:57 p.m. [04:41:00])

Commissioner Machielse moved to adjourn the meeting.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

MOTION CARRIED

The Commission adjourned at 9:57 p.m.