

**DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING**

Date: September 14, 2022

**AGENDA** (Actual time [audio recording time stamp])

**I CALL TO ORDER** (5:45 p.m. [00:15:00])

Chair Franklin Johnson called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

**II ROLL CALL** (5:45 p.m. [00:15:15])

<b>HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION</b>		<b>PRESENT</b>	<b>ABSENT</b>
Tiffany Franklin	Chair	X	
Jim Hamilton	Commissioner		X
Roderick Hardamon	Commissioner	X	
Richard Hosey	Commissioner		X
Alan Machielse	Commissioner	X	
Dennis Miriani	Commissioner	X	
<b>STAFF</b>			
Timothy Boscarino	PDD	X	
Benjamin Buckley	PDD	X	
Audra Dye	PDD	X	
Garrick Landsberg	PDD	X	
Daniel Rieden	PDD	X	
Jennifer Ross	PDD	X	
Antoine Bryant	PDD	X	
Katy Trudeau	PDD		X
Rebecca Savage	HDAB		X

**III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA** (05:45 p.m. [00:15:40])

Commissioner Miriani moved to have following cases added to the Consent Agenda:

- 3940-3942 Third

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4            Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

Director Landsberg mentioned that the 3946 W. Lafayette case that has been withdrawn and that case has been struck from the agenda:

Commissioner Miriani moved to approve the agenda.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4            Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES** (5:47 p.m. [00:17:20])

Staff stated that the March 30, 2022 draft minutes are posted on the website for approval.

Commissioner Miriani moved to approve the March minutes.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT  
Ayes: 2 Nays: 0 (Hardamon and Machielse abstained)

**MOTION CARRIED**

**V REPORTS** (5:48 p.m. [00:18:30])

Director Landsberg reminded all that all documents pertaining to this meeting are on the website *detroitmi.gov/hdc*.

**VI APPROVAL OF APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO CONSENT AGENDA** (5:49 p.m. [00:19:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved to approve the Consent Agenda.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**VII POSTPONED APPLICATION** (5:50 p.m. [00:20:00])

None

**VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)** (5:50 p.m. [00:20:15])

None

**IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING** (5:50 p.m. [00:20:30])

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-8015 (5:50 p.m. [00:20:40])

**ADDRESS:** 7650 E Jefferson, AKA R. Thornton Brodhead Armory

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** R. Thornton Brodhead Armory

**APPLICANT:** The Parade Company

**OWNER:** City of Detroit General Services Department (GSD)

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Demolish rear section, salvage certain elements, rehabilitate building and erect rear addition for new use

Staff provided a verbal summary of the proposal and staff report. Today's application is part of a multiyear process to determine a design for the building. Staff reminded that the Commission made an advisory determination at the August 2020 meeting that this project would likely have a beneficial effect on the district, though there was concern around the preservation of character-defining features, including the conservation of WPA artworks. Staff recommends a Notice to Proceed for this proposal.

**APPLICANT COMMENTS** (5:54 p.m. [00:24:00])

Brian Rebain, with Kraemer Design Group, the project architect, introduced team members from the Parade Company, Rosetti, Historic Services LLC, and the Detroit Institute of Arts, and described the project. The building contains important artworks by

Edward Yeagar and Gustav Hildebrand in the south portion of the building. The proposed work will demolish the south portion to allow for an addition, and rehabilitate the central portion. Portions of the artworks will be moved and conserved. Mr. Rebaun stated that the applicant agrees with the conditions suggested in the staff report, but there will be technical challenges regarding their implementation.

Antoine Bryant, Director of the Planning and Development Department, described his department's support of the proposal.

Luke Polcyn, Deputy Group Executive for Jobs and Economy, described support of the proposal by the Mayor's Office. The proposed project will conserve elements of the historic building and make them available for public view.

Katherine Fraser, Associate Director of Real Estate for the Detroit Economic Growth Corporation stated that her organization has underwritten the project, and they are in support.

**PUBLIC COMMENT: (6:28 p.m. [00:58:45])**

Sheila Jones, who lives within walking distance at River Towers, stated that the vacant building had become an eyesore and a hazard, and supports the proposal.

Richard Chatman, of the Metropolitan Detroit Veteran's Coalition, described his organization's support of the proposal.

Mark Wallace, CEO of the Detroit Riverfront Conservancy, supported the proposal. The proposed work will complement Gabriel Richard Park, which his organization manages.

James Semerad, on the board of several veterans organizations, including the Navy League, and founder of the Brodhead Association, stated that the entire building can be saved, and that moving the murals would likely damage them.

Devan Anderson, President of Preservation Detroit, supported the sale of the building to the Parade Company, but opposed the proposal.

Steve Brodhead, grandson of Richard Thornton Brodhead and a commercial real estate broker, opposed the sale of the building and the proposal, stating that this is not the highest and best use of the building.

**COMMISSION COMMENTS**

Commissioner Miriani stated that he is familiar with the building from his service in the Marine Corps, and said that the application is a solution to preserve the artworks in the building. Commissioner Miriani said that he viewed the murals today. Although the Parade Company proposes to preserve one section, he says that the entirety of the murals should be preserved.

Chairperson Franklin said that she visited the site and was in awe of the murals, and agreed that the murals should be preserved.

Commissioner Machielse stated that he visited the building and observed that rehabilitation of the south portion will be difficult, and if this proposal doesn't go through, the artwork will deteriorate further.

Commissioner Hardamon stated that he also had a chance to view the building interior, and is concerned that if the building isn't saved now, there will be nothing left.

Brian Reba of the Parade Company will be able to provide more details regarding the conservation of the artworks once they complete due diligence and close on the building.

**ACTION ONE (7:20 p.m. [01:50:00])**

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8015 for 7650 E. Jefferson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, but without substantial detriment to the public welfare and without substantial derogation from the intents and purposes of the city's historic ordinance, and therefore ISSUES a NOTICE TO PROCEED for the proposed work, contingent upon satisfaction of the conditions identified in prong 2 of Section 21-2-78 as such:

*The resource is a deterrent to a major improvement program that will be of substantial benefit to the community. Substantial benefit shall be found only if the applicant proposing the work has obtained all necessary planning and zoning approvals, financing and environmental clearances, and the improvement program is otherwise feasible.*

The Notice to Proceed is issued with the following conditions concerning the artwork in the south section:

- (1) That the canvas mural by Edgar Yeagar in the south section of the dining room shall be salvaged, removed, and preserved in its entirety or as close to it as possible, not merely one section; and,*
- (2) That the plaster relief mural by Gustav Hildebrand in the area of the first-floor corridor, shall be salvaged, specifically panels 1 through 7 and 9 through 17, and shall be molded in its entirety to allow future reproduction; and,*
- (3) That all salvaged artwork and intact woodwork such as crown molding and pilasters shall be preserved and re-displayed in a permanent exhibit established in publicly accessible areas within the completed development project, excepting occasional loans to the Detroit Institute of Arts or other similar institutions for exhibition; and,*
- (4) The applicant shall immediately notify HDC staff if they determine that any of the above conditions cannot be fulfilled. Staff shall forward any modifications to the approved scope of work concerning the artwork to the Commission so that they may re-hear and review for approval or denial such modifications at their sole discretion.*

And with the following general conditions concerning the entire project:

- (5) *HDC and PDD staff shall be afforded design review of the complete construction documents prior to their submission for permit. Exterior or interior scope that staff finds to be inconsistent with the intention of the Commission's NTP approval, and satisfaction of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for those portions to be rehabilitated or newly erected, shall be referred back to the Commission for adjudication; and,*
- (6) *Regular and unencumbered public access to the WPA artwork exhibits, and proposed riverwalk plaza, shall be maintained during normal operating hours of the Parade Company building.*

And a final additional set of conditions concerning staff issue of the NTP:

- (7) *The NTP be suspended, and shall not be issued, until all necessary planning/zoning approvals and financial and environmental clearances identified in Section 21-2-78 and conditions 5 and 6 above, have been satisfied, as determined by the Planning Director and/or his/her deputy; and,*
- (8) *The suspended NTP shall be issued only to the developer/architect team identified in this application for this specific scope of work; and,*
- (9) *The suspended NTP, if not issued by staff subject to the conditions outlined above by a date no more than two (2) years after closing of this property, at that point this approval shall expire.*

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4            Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-8001 (7:22 p.m. [01:52:45])

**ADDRESS:** 2001 Chicago

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Boston-Edison

**APPLICANT:** Anita Gary

**OWNER:** Anita Gary

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Erect garage

Staff provided a verbal summary of the proposal. A garage at this location was demolished in 2013 with a Notice to Proceed. This proposal for a new garage with vinyl siding and vinyl windows.

**APPLICANT COMMENTS** (7:25 p.m. [01:55:30])

The applicant, Anita Gary, and Dan Cooper, the contractor, spoke, noting they would like to use vinyl windows on the garage since there are already vinyl windows on the house.

Staff noted that the Commission issued a Notice to Proceed for vinyl windows on the house in 2012.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** (7:28 p.m. [01:58:00])

None

**COMMISSION COMMENTS:** (7:29 p.m. [01:59:10])

Commissioner Machielse discussed the design of the garage.

Commissioner Hardamon discussed the relative appropriateness and price difference between vinyl and wood.

Commissioners Franklin and Machielse stated that vinyl windows might be acceptable, but vinyl siding is not.

**ACTION ONE** (7:32 p.m. [02:02:50])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8011 for 2001 Chicago**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- All vinyl products, with the exception of the windows, are removed from the design.
- The clapboard siding shall be wood or cementitious with a smooth finish, a matching product will be selected for the soffit and fascia. The selected products will be submitted for staff review.
- Exterior siding paint color shall be submitted to staff for review.
- Revised drawings are submitted for staff review.

Commissioner Miriani :SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-8002 (7:34 p.m. [02:04:30])

**ADDRESS:** 1830 Church

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Corktown

**APPLICANT:** Mario Dewberry

**OWNER:** Mario Dewberry

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Demolish garage

Staff described the report. Staff noted that the property received a Certificate of Appropriateness for other work at the March 2022 meeting, but staff observed at that time that the garage had been demolished without approval. The current owner had said that the garage was no longer extant when they purchased the property in 2021. Staff recommends that the garage was a noncontributing building due to advanced deterioration and recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition. The application is also for the installation of an air conditioning condenser in the back yard.

**APPLICANT COMMENTS** (7:39 p.m. [02:09:30])

Mario Dewberry, the applicant and property owner, had no additional comments.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** (7:41 p.m. [02:11:00])

Mark Crowley, a neighbor, supported the proposal.

**COMMISSION COMMENTS** (7:43 p.m. [02:13:20])

**ACTION** (7:43 p.m. [02:13:20])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8002 for 1830 Church**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- The applicant allows HDC staff the opportunity to review and approve the location of the proposed new air-conditioning condenser unit prior to the issuance of the project permit. Should staff determine that the work does not meet the SOI Standards, the work will be added to the next available commission meeting agenda for consideration/review.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-8027 (7:44 p.m. [02:14:55])

**ADDRESS:** 2843-2863 Brush (286 Edmund)

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Brush Park

**APPLICANT:** City Modern D3 LLC

**OWNER:** Brush Park Development Co Ph 1 LLC

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Erect Multi-family building

Staff described the project, including a city-sponsored RFP process that led to this development, and a Planning and Development design review process, which is ongoing. Sixteen buildings have already been built in response to the RFP and based on a prior Certificate of Appropriateness for the entire project.

Commissioner Franklin noted that there is a letter of support posted on the website.

**APPLICANT COMMENTS** (7:49 p.m. [02:19:00])

Jonathan Mueller and Andrew Bodley, of Bedrock described the project. After completing sixteen City Modern buildings, two undeveloped sites remain.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** (7:50 p.m. [02:20:40])

None

**COMMISSION COMMENTS (7:51 p.m. [02:21:00])**

Commissioner Miriani asked about the prior approval. The applicant noted that although there was a prior Certificate of Appropriateness for a building at this location, changes in the business environment prompted this new design.

Commissioner Miriani suggested that the proposed design did not fit with the existing City Modern buildings. The applicant provided more information on the rationale for the design and compared the proposed building with the other City Modern buildings.

Commissioners Miriani and Franklin continued to discuss the design.

Commissioner Machielse suggested that the design was compatible with the surroundings.

**ACTION (7:50 p.m. [02:20:35])**

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8027 for 2843-63 Brush**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8004 (8:01 p.m. [02:31:15])**

**ADDRESS:** 2827 John R and 105 Alfred

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Brush Park

**APPLICANT:** Michael Van Overbeke

**OWNER:** Michael Van Overbeke

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Demolish buildings, erect mixed-use building

Staff provided a summary of the project. The proposal is to demolish a building, with additions on the John R Parcel. The Alfred parcel is currently vacant. The applicant in 2018 received a Certificate of Appropriateness to rehabilitate the John R building, and in 2020 received approval to demolish adjacent twentieth century storefronts. However, the John R building has since been damaged by a fire, and the applicant proposes to demolish it and erect a new building with comparable massing. Staff noted that the existing building is hazardous and may warrant a Notice to Proceed.

**APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:06 p.m. [02:36:30])**



Michael Van Overbeke, the applicant and owner, described the condition of the existing building as well as the design of the proposed building.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** (8:10 p.m. [02:40:10])

None

**COMMISSION COMMENTS:** (8:10 p.m. [02:40:45])

Commissioner Machielse observed that the building is in danger of collapse.

Commissioners Miriani and Franklin and the applicant discussed the design of the proposed building.

**ACTION** (8:14 p.m. [02:44:35])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8004 for 2827 John R**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, but without substantial detriment to the public welfare and without substantial derogation from the intents and purposes of the city's historic ordinance, and therefore ISSUES a NOTICE TO PROCEED for the proposed work, contingent upon satisfaction of the conditions identified in prong 1 of Section 21-2-78 as such:

- *The resource constitutes a hazard to the safety of the public or its occupants.*

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-8001 (8:15 p.m. [02:45:00])

**ADDRESS:** 601 Lodge

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Berry Subdivision

**APPLICANT:** Paul Mulier (Mulier Construction) and Kathleen Schultz

**OWNER:** Kathleen and Thomas Schultz

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Demolish garage (work completed without approval), erect garage

Staff provided a summary of the proposal. The garage was demolished without approval by a previous owner. The current owners propose to build a new garage of similar style and massing to the demolished garage. Staff noted that the neighborhood association supports the proposal

**APPLICANT COMMENTS** (8:20 p.m. [02:50:00])

Katie Schultz, the applicant, stated that they would prefer to use the vinyl window shown in the proposal.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** (8:20 p.m. [02:50:50])

None

**COMMISSION COMMENTS** (8:21 p.m. [02:51:10])

Several commissioners stated that they agreed with the staff report.

**ACTION** (8:22 p.m. [02:52:00])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8001 for 601 Lodge**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the demolition of the garage, erection of the new garage, and resurfacing of the driveway WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- Update the proposed the drawings to reflect the changes of the siding material to wood, lap-siding and the colors noted per Color System D of the HDC color package.
- The vinyl window replaced with a more appropriate material, such as wood or aluminum-clad wood and reflected in the updated drawings.
- Downspouts and gutters added to the garage and reflected in the updated drawings.
- Staff receive a final plan showing product and detail description of the above work before installation.

Commissioner Machierlse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**X CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING** (8:22 p.m. [02:52:20])

None

**XI PUBLIC COMMENT** (8:22 p.m. [02:52:30])

Dorothy Bennick, present of the East End Corktown Block Club, stated that the community wishes to save the historic storage building at 1567 Church.

**XII APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING** (8:28 p.m. [02:58:00])

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-7946 (8:28 p.m. [02:58:30])

**ADDRESS:** 1427 Edison

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Boston-Edison

**APPLICANT:** Natasha McClure

**OWNER:** Natasha McClure

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Install porcelain tiles at front porch

**COMMISSIONER AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:28 p.m. [02:58:45])**

**Chairperson Franklin left the room.**

The applicant, Natasha McClure, asked what other options there were if the proposal is not approved.

Commissioner Miriani stated that the concrete porch is an important feature with respect to the Elements of Design for the neighborhood, and should be repaired. Commissioners Miriani and Machielse provided suggestions.

The applicant asked if a more appropriate type of tile could be approved. Commissioner Miriani and Director Landsburg said that a more appropriate tile could be staff approved.

**Chairperson Franklin returned.**

**ACTION (8:34 p.m. [3:04:30])**

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7946 for 1427 Edison**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 10) *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Ayes: 3 Nays: 0 (Commissioner Franklin abstained)

**MOTION FAILED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8005 (8:36 p.m. [03:06:15])**

**ADDRESS:** 2648 W. Grand Boulevard

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** West Grand Boulevard African-American Arts and Business

**APPLICANT:** John Skok, Mcintosh Poris Associates

**OWNER:** Ahmend Beasley, Gordy Co.

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Replace porch railing

**COMMISSIONER AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (8:36 p.m. [03:06:40])**

Ahmend Beasley, from Mcintosh Poris, and Malcolm Davis, from Perkins and Will, provided context to explain the rationale for changing the railing. Code and accessibility issues suggest that the new railing will have a different appearance from the historic railing, including a greater height.

Commissioner Franklin asked if the current railing was historic or original. Staff suggested that it was. Commissioner Miriani opined that a more important concern was that the proposed railing would significantly change the appearance of the building. Commissioners Franklin and Machielse agreed.

Commissioner Hardamon pointed out that a higher railing is important for safety concerns.

Commissioners continued to discuss the design of the proposed railing.

**ACTION** (8:52 p.m. [03:22:20])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8005 for 2648 W. Grand Blvd.**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 3 Nays: 1 (Hardamon voted nay)

**MOTION FAILED**

The applicant expressed that they would like to withdraw the application.

Commissioner Miriani moved that the applicant be allowed to withdraw the application.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION PASSES**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-7946 (7:48 p.m. [09:04:30])

**ADDRESS:** 1427 Edison

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Boston-Edison

**APPLICANT:** Natasha McClure

**OWNER:** Natasha McClure

Director Landsberg reminded the Commission that the earlier vote on this proposal did not result in the issuance of a Denial, because Section 5.01 of the Rules of Procedure requires that a majority of members serving is required to issue a Denial.

**ACTION** (9:06 p.m. [3:36:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

The Historic District Commission suspend 5.01 of the Rules of Procedure with regards to Application 22-7946, specifically, the requirement that a majority of members serving is needed for a Denial.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION PASSES**

**ACTION** (9:09 p.m. [3:39:20])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7946 for 1427 Edison**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 10) *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 3 Nays: 0 (Commissioner Franklin abstained)

**MOTION PASSES**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-8012 (9:11 p.m. [03:41:00])

**ADDRESS:** 1556 Bagley

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Corktown

**APPLICANT:** Brooke Schwartz

**OWNER:** Brooke Schwartz

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Rehabilitate dwelling, erect rear deck

**COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS** (9:11 p.m. [03:41:30])

Steve Elwin, co-owner, described the proposal, pointing out missing, deteriorated, and mismatched windows.

Commissioners commented on the proposal.

Brooke Schwartz, co-owner, described that the owners would like to replace the existing windows with historically appropriate windows.

Commissioners and the applicant discussed the design of the rear door.

**ACTION (ONE)** (9:31 p.m. [04:01:45])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8012 for 1556 Bagley**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed Hardie board siding installation and replacement of the rear wood door WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION PASSES**

**ACTION (TWO)** (9:33 p.m. [4:03:00])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8012 for 1556 Bagley**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- The rear elevation sliding door shall be wood, aluminum-clad wood or fiberglass frame; the cut sheet confirming all details, dimensions and finishes will be submitted for staff review.
- A site plan confirming the footprint of the deck, and a dimensioned detail of the railing to be constructed at the deck's west edge, will be submitted for staff review.

- Elevation drawings that detail the proposed extended wall at the second floor, as well as the enclosure of the second-floor door and related roof work, will be submitted to staff for review.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION PASSES**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-8016 (9:34 p.m. [4:04:30])

**ADDRESS:** 1773 Parker

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** West Village

**APPLICANT:** Jennifer Lyon

**OWNER:** Jennifer Lyon

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Replace windows on attic dormers, south elevation bay window, and rear porch

**COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS** (9:34 p.m. [04:04:45])

Kalissa Maxwell, speaking on behalf of the property owner, described the proposal, including the rationale for seeking to replace the dormer windows.

Commissioners discussed denying the attic dormer item, noting that restoration of the existing windows could be approved by staff. Commissioners discussed approving the remaining work items.

**ACTION (ONE)** (9:42 p.m. [04:12:00])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8016 for 1773 Parker**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence*

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**ACTION (ONE)** (9:44 p.m. [04:14:30])

Commissioner Machielse moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8016 for 1773 Parker**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- The replacement window on the south-facing dormer be identical in materials and profile to the windows on the front-facing (east) dormer, subject to approval by staff;
- The dimensions of the projecting bay’s “picture window” will be subject to approval by staff; and
- The dimensions of the projecting bay’s “custom opening wood casements” or “fixed windows” will replicate the appearance of sash windows elsewhere on the building, subject to approval by staff.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-7951 (9:47p.m. [04:17:30])

**ADDRESS:** 73 W. Elizabeth

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Park Avenue Local

**APPLICANT:** Paul Howard, Selden Gardens, LLC

**OWNER:** Selden Gardens, LLC

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Replace non-historic storefronts with stucco walls and windows, install new entry doors, canopy, establish outdoor seating

**COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS** (9:47 p.m. [04:17:45])

Mike McCleer, the architect, and Paul Howard, the property owner and applicant, suggested that the proposed storefront work follows the guidance of Preservation Brief 11 on historic storefronts, and described other aspects of the proposal.

Commissioner Miriani noted that the existing storefront windows existed when the historic district was established in 2007, and their design is appropriate for the building. Commissioner Miriani suggested that the proposed design has no relationship to the rest of the façade and is not appropriate.

**ACTION (ONE)** (10:07 p.m. [04:37:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8014 for 73 W. Elizabeth**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed installation of recessed walls, windows and affixed bench seating WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE



according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 1) *A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*
- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**ACTION (TWO) (10:08 p.m. [04:38:50])**

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8014 for 73 W. Elizabeth**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER: 22-8006 (10:10 p.m. [04:40:30])**

**ADDRESS:** 1725 West Boston

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Boston Edison

**APPLICANT:** Olivier Lecanu

**OWNER:** Olivier Lecanu

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Remove clay tile roof, install temporary asphalt shingles, install metal roofing

Taylor Leonard, attorney from the Law Department, described a Denial issued by the Commission earlier this year, which was appealed by the applicant. At the direction of the administrative law judge, staff and the applicant reached an agreement about the roof, which constitutes the current proposal. If this proposal is approved, the appeal will be withdrawn.

Staff noted that a material sample is available in the auditorium. Staff noted that they had not seen the material at the time of the staff recommendation, and that they believe a different product might be a better choice.

**COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (10:11 p.m. [04:41:20])**

Commissioners Miriani and Machielse expressed support of the proposal.

**ACTION** (10:17 p.m. [04:47:10])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8006 for 1725 W. Boston**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the metal barrel roofing tile, gutters and downspouts WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- Asphalt shingles will be installed as a temporary measure for not more than 5 years.
- Metal shingles shall be barrel-shaped and match in similar design and color as the original tiles.
- HDC staff shall review the final details of the metal roof specifications and requests the authority to review and approve the final roofing color and shape.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-8018 (10:18 p.m. [04:48:00])

**ADDRESS:** 2523 Atkinson

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Atkinson Avenue

**APPLICANT:** George O'Ree

**OWNER:** George O'Ree

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Replace ten (10) wood windows with eight (8) vinyl windows

Staff noted that the applicant was not present.

**COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS** (10:19 p.m. [04:49:40])

Commissioner Miriani opined that replacing wood windows with vinyl windows is not appropriate.

**ACTION** (10:19 p.m. [04:49:50])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8018 for 2523 Atkinson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-7905 (9:27 p.m. [04:51:00])

**ADDRESS:** 1567 Church

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Corktown

**APPLICANT:** Lilian Candela, Kraemer Design Group

**OWNER:** Oxford Perennial Corktown Propco II, LLC

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Rehabilitate building for multi-family use

**COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS** (10:21 p.m. [04:51:30])

Seth Hurkowicz, a co-developer, and Brian Rebain and Lilian Candela, architects, introduced the proposal. The rehabilitation of this building is part of a Community Benefits Agreement.

**ACTION** (10:23 p.m. [04:53:30])

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-7904 for 1567 Church**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed application WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- Product specifications, cut sheets, glazing types, and window/door schedule for the proposed new windows and storefront entrance systems shall be reviewed and approved by staff prior to issue of permit. Should the proposed windows/entrances not be satisfactory to staff under the Standards and consistent with the intent of the Commission's approval, the design will be returned to the Commission for additional review.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-7809 (10:25 p.m. [04:55:30])

**ADDRESS:** 269 Watson

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Brush Park

**APPLICANT:** Meir Israel, Rose Valencia

**OWNER:** Arben Gjekaj

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Replace exterior wall and doors, install rear decks, enclosed basement stairwell and balcony

**COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (10:26 p.m. [04:56:20])**

Rose Valencia, the applicant, described the project, and stated that the applicant was able to accept the conditions recommended by staff.

**ACTION (10:29 p.m. [04:59:15])**

Commissioner Hardamon moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8009 for 269 Watson**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of the west wall and tuckpointing of the exterior walls, the replacement of the rear and east doors, the restoration of the front door, the installation of a new basement door with an enclosed stairwell, and the erection of two rear decks and a balcony **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES** a **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

*Staff recommends the COA be issued with following conditions:*

- The applicant provides a sketch and detail on the reconstruction of the west wall that demonstrates how it will replicate the existing brick pattern of the wall and provide a sample/photo of proposed matching brick to blend in with the existing brick, should the original bricks not be enough.
- The applicant changes the vinyl siding to wood lap siding or cementitious board siding with a dimension, color, and smooth surface to match the design of the house.
- The doors be painted a color that matches Color System C color scheme of the HDC color guide.
- Deck and balcony stain or paint provided for review and approval.
- Staff receives a final plan showing product and detail description of the above work.
- The applicant provides HDC staff a review of the above items before installation.

Commissioner Miriani: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION/STAFF REPORT NUMBER:** 22-8010 (10:31 p.m. [05:01:45])

**ADDRESS:** 4700 Third

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** Warren-Prentis

**APPLICANT:** Tanya Yono

**OWNER:** Tanya Yono

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Replace pilasters and entrance

**COMMISSION AND APPLICANT COMMENTS (10:31 p.m. [05:01:50])**

Paul A. Garrison, consultant and attorney for the applicant, and Tanya Yono, the property owner, described the history of the business and damage caused by recent storms. The applicant described challenges encountered in making appropriate repairs.

Commissioner Miriani opined that this proposal includes several appropriate work items, but that the pilaster replacement was not appropriate. Commissioner Miriani suggested that a Denial would allow the applicant an opportunity to propose a more appropriate pilaster treatment at a future meeting.

**ACTION (ONE) (10:52 p.m. [05:22:30])**

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8010 for 4700 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the replacement of limestone pilasters with rough cut limestone pilasters **WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a DENIAL** for the proposed work.

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5) *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Commissioner Hardamon: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**ACTION (TWO) (10:54 p.m. [05:24:10])**

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #22-8010 for 4700 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determines the proposed installation of brick walls, replacement of entry doors and the installation of security shutters **WILL BE APPROPRIATE** according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore **ISSUES a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS** for the proposed work.

*Staff recommends the COA be issued with following conditions:*

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**XIII CITY PROJECTS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING** (11:02 p.m. (05:32:00])

None

**XIV OLD BUSINESS** (11:02 p.m. (05:32:00])

None

**XV NEW BUSINESS** (11:02 p.m. (05:32:00])

**ADDRESS:** 411 Piquette (11:02 p.m. (05:32:00])

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** adjacent to the Ford Piquette Avenue HD

**SPONSORING CITY AGENCY:** Detroit Economic Growth Corporation

**OWNER:** 411 Piquette LLC/The Platform

**SCOPE OF WORK:** Rehabilitate building

Staff indicated that Nevin Shokar of DEGC had to leave the meeting early, but left a written statement that this proposal creates jobs and affordable housing, and meets the criteria for several tax abatements.

**ACTION** (11:06 p.m. [05:36:30])

Commissioner Miriani moved that:

The Commission find that the proposed project at 411 Piquette will have a demonstrable effect on the Ford Piquette Avenue Historic District, and that the demonstrable effect is likely to be beneficial due to reasons of improving the neighborhood, access to affordable housing, and rehabilitation of a historic structure. This determination from the Commission shall be forwarded to the Mayor and City Council for their consideration.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes: 4 Nays: 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**XVI ADJOURNEMENT** (11:07 p.m. (05:37:50])

Commissioner Miriani moved to adjourn the meeting at 11:07 p.m.

Commissioner Machielse: SUPPORT

Ayes 4 Nay 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

## LIST OF ACRONYMS

- Building Safety Engineering, and Environmental Department (BSEED)
- Historic District (HD)
- Historic District Advisory Board (HDAB)
- Historic District Commission (HDC)
- HDC Staff
  - AD: Audra Dye
  - TB: Timothy Boscarino
  - BB: Benjamin Buckley
  - DR: Dan Rieden
  - GL: Garrick Landsberg
  - JR: Jennifer Ross
- Planning & Development Department (PDD)