Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners Date of Meeting: Thursday, March 4, 2021 – 3:00 PM Location: Zoom Virtual Meeting Platform

- I. Chairperson Annie Holt called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.
- II. Invocation. Chaplain Yolanda Stinson provided the invocation.
- III. Introduction of Police Commissioners. A roll call was held, and a quorum was declared.

Detroit Board of Police Commissioners' Membership / Attendance		
	Attend	Not- Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson		Excused
Annie Mae Holt, Vice-Chairperson	Yes	
Linda D. Bernard	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Yes	
Lisa Carter	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jesus Hernandez	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Martin Jones	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	10	

IV.	The Board	approved the	Agenda fo	r Thursday.	March 4.	. 2021

Motion: Commissioner Bernard **Second:** Commissioner Hernandez **Discussion:** Commissioner Davis indicated that the agenda does not adhere to the Bylaws, also the agenda is in conflict with the presentation schedule and requested necessary corrections.

VOTE: Yes = 9 $N_0 = 0$ **Motion: ADOPTED**

V. Chairperson Holt called for any corrections to the Meeting Minutes for February 25, 2021. After no corrections were submitted, the minutes were approved.

Motion: Commissioner Holley **Second**: Commissioner Carter **Discussion**: None

Yes: Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Bernard, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Carter, Commissioner Davis, Commissioner Hernandez, and Commissioner Holley.

No: Commissioner Burton.

VOTE: Yes =8 No = 1 Motion: ADOPTED

- VI. Introductions of Board administrative and investigative staff, Chief of Police, Elected Officials or Representatives.
- VII. Chair's Report. Chairperson Annie Holt acknowledged her fellow Board members for supporting the Roundtable and especially Commissioner Holley for his constant voice and guidance to discuss the issue of deadly violence in a meaningful way. Chair Holt especially thanked the panelist as leaders, hands on experts and community champions for participating in the Roundtable on Criminal Homicide and Non-Fatal shootings. As a Board we focus on public safety and the police department. Poverty, poor education and racism are key factors of the criminal justice system in America. Our Roundtable Panelists' focus today is specific to share information, provide insights, and their experience on actions that will make a difference.

Commissioner Holley thanked all of the panel guests and shared how much respect he has for each and every one

of panelists. **Commissioner Holley** also shared his position that the Board and the Special Invited Guests owed it to the community to address how we can turn around the violent crime and criminal homicide statistics.

VIII. Public Safety Roundtable Discussion Panelists.

- Chief of Police James E. Craig, Detroit Police Department
- Wayne County Prosecuting Attorney Kym Worthy
- O Chief Judge Timothy Kenny, 3rd Judicial Circuit Court
- Wayne County Sheriff Raphael Washington
- o Pastor Louis Forsythe, Pleasant Grove Baptist Church
- o Mr. Toson Knight, Western High School Dean of Students
- o Sergeant Kyla Williams, Domestic Violence
- Bishop Daryl Harris, CeaseFire, (Moderator)

Bishop Daryl Harris expressed to all of the Commissioners, law enforcement and everyone who is so deeply involved in such meaningful work in the city of Detroit. It has been an honor serving with you and, hopefully, there is a continuation of that service as we move forward. We care about the city and the community. Bishop Harris expressed he is very grateful to be a part of such a prestigious opportunity and event that's taking place today. Bishop Harris began by asking each panelist to provide a brief introduction, scope of their expertise, and an overview of their role in law enforcement and the criminal justice system.

All Esteemed Dignitaries welcomed guests, colleagues and the Honorable Board and shared their background and experience as law enforcement, criminal justice system, education, religious, and community leaders and subject-matter experts.

Esteemed Panelists discussed their background and experience noting their extensive longevity in their respective fields and highlighting the following: Chief of Police Craig shared his background and experience as Chief of Police for the Detroit Police Department for close to eight years, noting his posts as Chief of Police in both Portland, Maine and Cincinnati, Ohio and the majority share of his career was in Los Angeles where he served and rose through the ranks for 28 years. Chief Craig started in the Detroit Police Department in 1977. Wayne County Prosecutor Attorney Kym Worthy introduced herself and stated she had been involved in the criminal justice arena for her entire career, After law school, she started in the Juvenile Division of the Wayne County Prosecutor's Office, then rose through the ranks for almost 12 years, spending the last six years of her career doing exclusively homicides, high profile cases and serial killers and serial rapists. Then she ran and won a seat on the Detroit Recorders Court, which was merged in 1997 into the Wayne County Circuit Court. She stayed on the bench for almost nine years, then ran for Wayne County Prosecutor and was appointed Prosecutor in January 2004. Chief Judge Timothy Kenny shared that he had spent 20 years as an Assistant Wayne County Prosecuting Attorney and spent three years assigned to be the prosecutor for the Felony Murder Squad of the Detroit Homicide Department. Chief Judge Kenny has spent 24 years on Wayne County Circuit Court Bench, and is very proud of the fact that he was the founding judge. For 10 years, he was the judge who coordinated and ran the Mental Health Court Program and for 12 years he also served as a Drug Court Judge. Wayne County Sheriff Raphael Washington shared that he has 38 years in law enforcement, started his law enforcement career in 1983. In 1985, he went to the Detroit Police Department, where he served for 24 years. When the late Wayne County Sheriff Benny Napoleon was appointed sheriff in 2009, he asked Sheriff Washington to retire and come to the Wayne County Sheriff Office with him to help lead that agency, which was approximately 12 years ago. Pastor Louis Forsythe, senior pastor of Pleasant Grove Baptist Church, shared that for 18 years has served as the Chairman of the Board of the Juvenile Assessment Center for Wayne County. He was the first Chairman working with other board members to help shape some of the policies and practices to help deter juveniles from furthering themselves into crime and other areas. As a Pastor, he is known to care about the welfare of the souls of men and women and also concerned about the welfare of our communities. Mr. Toson Knight, Dean of Student Affairs at Western International High School, attended Oakwood University, which is a HBCU (Historically Black College and University) in Alabama. With a passion to come back to Detroit to work with young people to help change the trajectory of their lives, Dean Knight started a mentoring program called Caught Up. The program now has over 100 kids that participate in the program each year. Dean Knight also connects the program with a juvenile detention center in Highland Park, Michigan where they help kids transition back into the community. Last year, Dean Knight had an opportunity to work in District Four for the Mayor's office, and there they worked closely with law enforcement on different issues in trying to keep the youth out of trouble. Sergeant Kyla Williams, assigned to the Detroit Police Department's Domestic Violence Unit since 2010, serves in the capacity as Officer in Charge since 2013, with 24 ½ years with the department. Since the Fall of 2013, the Domestic Violence Unit is the investigative hub for the police department intimate partner violence.

Bishop Harris moderated the discussion requesting feedback on various areas including but not limited to the following areas:

The Roundtable provided key information during the discussion that included but was not limited to the following:

- (1) Evidence-based information on arrest, charges, bail bond, sentences, jail releases and other core factors related to instances and trends of criminal homicides and non-fatal shootings in 2017, 2018, 2019, 2020 and so far, 2021. Specifically, the following key data was shared:
 - Crime trends dating back to 2016 where the criminal homicides saw a steady decline from 305 homicides in 2016; 267 homicides in 2017; 261 homicides in 2018; 275 homicides in 2019; and 327 homicides in 2020;
 - Case backlog of criminal cases citing the huge uptick in drag racing and criminal fatal crashes were over 150, leaving persons serious injured or deceased;
 - Case statistics associated with the incoming cases at the Wayne County Prosecutor's Office, noting 6000 8000 cases
 of domestic violence, where in 2019, WCPO reached 8,880 cases in Wayne County. In 2020, the WCPO reached over
 10,000; there is a tendency to see 8 10 domestic violence homicides, and there were 24 last year;
 - Challenges and difficulties based on backlog of criminal cases due to not being able to hold in-person court hearings
 due to the COVID-19 public health restrictions and other legal requirements associated with the national pandemic,
 resulting in offenders being free awaiting trial hearings;
 - Approximately 40% of our domestic violence victims that have been waiting for them to go to court are not going to
 participate due to the long delays associated with the COVID regulations and restrictions.
- (2) The major item that panelists see as possible to help our community make a reduction in homicides and non-fatal shootings including:
 - Detroit Police Department's Partnership with the Detroit Wayne Integrated Health Network (DWIHN);
 - Wayne County Circuit Court is now working on a plan targeting the cases of those who have been charged with carrying a
 gun illegally, that will start the week of March 22;
 - Partnership between the Wayne County Prosecutor's Office, Detroit Police Department, and the Wayne County Sheriff's Department to combat mental illness issues, drug and/or alcohol issues.
 - 2018 Study that found that driving while license suspended was a charge for most jail inmates, reducing most of the jail space for those who are charged with violent criminal offenses.
- (3) Social Services Programs that assist in reshaping the prosecution, justice, and law enforcement systems toward public safety and (4) the challenges, key lessons learned, and best practices as a result of experiencing COVID-19:
 - Wayne County Sheriff's Ministry Initiative, creating a pathway for those that are being released to make sure that they
 are getting social services, clothing, medical treatment, and resources to ensure proper social services;
 - Church and Mentoring Programs that assist with meeting the needs of victims and violent offenders to ensure proper resources are shared and provided;
 - School Mentoring Programs and Initiatives such as "Caught Up" Mentoring Program at Western International High School:
 - Joint Department Task Force Initiatives that address the drag racing and quality of life issues within the City of Detroit;
 - Drive to Thrive Youth Violence Prevention Initiative founded in 2019.
 - Addressing Domestic Violence issues, the Victim Assistance Program within the Detroit Police Department, embedded
 Social Workers and Advocates within the precincts and Domestic Violence Units to address to provide resources and
 services for the victim as well as children concerned, and the Detroit Police Department and Wayne County Prosecutor's
 Office Partnership involving the Domestic Violence Unit, addressing the needs of the offender and providing necessary
 resources to the offender to prevent reoffending.

Commissioner Jones thanked panelists and requested to hold a future forum to discuss solutions to reduce violent crime in the City of Detroit. Sheriff Washington indicated there is information on the Wayne County Sheriff's website regarding solution-based actions and provided their website and telephone number. Prosecutor Worthy shared information regarding the Wayne Prosecutor's Diversion Programs or Specialty Courts, Mental Health Court, Homeless Court, Sobriety Court, Mental Health Court in the Juvenile Detention Center, noting there are 24 specialty courts in Wayne County which are solution based. Commissioner Burch called for effective communication, proper sentencing and adjudication for offenders who commit crimes. Commissioner Davis requested additional information on the Mental Health Court. Chief Judge Kenny will provide that information. Commissioner

Bernard stated the focus has been on the law enforcement perspective, but there is a defense perspective. She highlighted that we have all heard of people that were incarcerated or charged with things that proved to be false, and requested that perspective be considered. Commissioner Brown questioned the validity of the Department issuing citations on COVID violations, given the later dismissal of those tickets. Commissioner Brown also discussed the number of squatter issues, landlord and tenant issues, and requested the Wayne County Sheriff's Office plans to engage bailiffs and sheriffs to be more active with assisting with these evictions or landlord tenant issues. Chief Judge Kenny clarified the judiciary would respond by directing the questions to Chief Judge William McConico who is the Chief Judge of the 36th District Court given the latter issues presented not within the Third Circuit Court's jurisdiction. Commissioner Carter asked the panelist to explain the Bond system, and to share insight into any misperceptions or misnomers. Prosecutor Worthy replied there are a number of bond measures in the legislature now. It has been worked on for over two years, noting that her position has always been very clear. Prosecutor Worthy believes that there should be no cash bail for civil infractions, for most traffic offenses exempting drunk driving, for some lower level misdemeanors, notwithstanding violent misdemeanors like stalking or domestic violence and for some lower level felonies. It was clarified that generally, when discussions are held about this issue, they are not talking about violent felons. Prosecutor Worthy noted her support of cash bail for violent felonies. However, she expressed that no one should be in the jail because they cannot afford it, they should be treated the same. One consideration should be whether they can afford to pay, but not the only consideration. Chief Judge Kenny added contributed to this discussion noting that back in 2018 through the assistance of the Wayne County Sheriff's Department, the Court conducted research and analysis into the demographics of the jail system. A review of the calendar year of 2018 showed the number one offense that brought people to the Wayne County Jail was driving while license suspended, noting to a great extent, if one is poor, they are likely to be sentenced to jail. The two-year study that has taken place regarding pretrial release led by the Chief Justice of the Michigan Supreme Court and the lieutenant governor is attempting to address those inequality issues. Sheriff Washington added that oftentimes those in our facilities for driving without a license and license suspended originate out of county enforcement.

Commissioner Burton inquired whether police officers were known to have repeatedly falsified testimony in court and are still called as witnesses by the Wayne County Prosecutor's Office. Commissioner Burton also asked whether Prosecutor Worthy believed in a one-person grand jury for fairness and transparency. Lastly, when it comes to "racist technology like facial recognition and ShotSpotter," Commissioner Burton asked whether law enforcement should be using facial recognition or "should they pull the plug on it, knowing that two (2) Black males from the Detroit Metropolitan area were misidentified?" Prosecutor Worthy responded first that Brady / Giglio is the law, the WCPO's recently began releasing the list of officers who fell under that particular rule. It is important to realize that the Brady / Giglio list has to do with untruthfulness like perjury and bribery (i.e. if you are convicted of stealing from a drug dealer). Prosecutor Worthy noted that there are a number of police officers who have been convicted for false affidavits and similar offenses, and this information is on their website for public information. The Wayne County Prosecutor's Office has released two (2) separate lists, which is released quarterly. The WCPO's contacts each and every law enforcement official chief that is in our 43 communities, the Federal Government, the Sheriff's Department, and the Michigan State Police. The WCPO's asks for a list of officers that have been disciplined in any way, analyze that list and according to the law, the WCPO creates the list, and releases it to the public. The WCPO's also informs police chiefs prior to releasing the list. As to the Facial Recognition Technology, Prosecutor Worthy stated that she would never be in a position to say that no facial recognition technology should ever be used. That technology has been used very well, in many cases we've identified murders of children. But it's important to realize it is an investigative tool, it is not evidence. It is an investigative tool, just like a DNA or any forensic evidence or like the polygraph, for example, that we may use as an investigative tool, it is not evidence. Prosecutor Worthy also noted her awareness of the multiple studies that have been done, and the issues with technology with people of color. Prosecutor Worthy also discussed her belief that a one-man grand jury, is a useful tool, discussing the high number of homicides and non-fatal shootings that we have been able to close in certain areas of the city very successfully, and bring down non-fatal shootings and homicides percentages. Using the oneman grand jury, the WCPO used to use it when they had witnesses that had been intimidated and did not want to come forward. Commissioner Holley thanked everyone again for having this important discussion and encouraged another future forum to talk about solutions.

Chair Holt extended a most hearty thank you to panelists Chief of Police James E. Craig, Detroit Police Department, Chief Judge Timothy Kenny, 3rd Judicial Circuit Court, Wayne County Prosecutor Attorney Kym Worthy, Wayne County Sheriff Raphael Washington, Pastor Louis Forsythe, Pleasant Grove Baptist Church, Mr. Toson Knight, Western International High School Dean of Students, Sergeant Kyla Williams, Domestic Violence, and Bishop Daryl Harris, Cease Fire, (Moderator). Chair Holt also noted that a future discussion that would take place would be on the topic of implicit bias.

XI. Announcements:

Commissioner Burch thanked all the panelists and spoke about the Senior Drive By at Lomax Temple which prepares food boxes. The 9th and 11th Precincts utilize this initiative to establish community relations. **Commissioner Davis** expressed that everyone that joins attends the Board Meetings requesting to speak should be able to speak. It is wrong for people not to be able to speak and that is a violation of the Open Meetings Act.

Mr. Robert Brown announced the following:

- 1. Next Meeting: Thursday, March 11, 2021, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting
- 2. Next Meeting: Thursday, March 18, 2021, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting

XIV. Oral Communications/Public Comments:

Ms. Bernice Smith, Ms. Sharon Panell, Minister Eric Blount, Ms. Jeanetta Hope, Kaytea Moreno Elst, Mr. Rhuben Crowley, Ms. Alicia Renea, Mr. Mac Farr, Ms. Yolanda Craft, Ms. Michelle George and Ms. Tawana Petty offered public comments.

XV. Chair Holt adjourned the meeting at 5:18 p.m.

Motion: Commissioner Carter Second: Commissioner Bernard. Discussion. None: Motion Adopted.

VOTE: Yes = 10 No = 0 Motion: ADOPTED