### DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

Date: December 9, 2020

Due to COVID-19 restrictions, this meeting was held electronically via Zoom Meeting Link

## I CALL TO ORDER

Commissioner McCall called the meeting to order at 5:37 p.m.

II ROLL CALL	ABSENT	PRESENT		ABSENT	PRESENT
Jessica McCall, Chair		X	Richard Hosey		X
Katie Johnson, Vice-Chair		X	Alease Johnson		X
Tiffany Franklin		X	Dennis Miriani		X
Jim Hamilton		X			
Staff					
Brendan Cagney, PDD		X	Taylor Leonard, Law Dept. present until 8:00 pm X		
Audra Dye, PDD		X	Pamela Parrish, Law Dept.		
Garrick Landsberg, PDD		X	Logan Patmon, Law De	ept. present after 8:0	00 pm X
Ann Phillips, PDD		X	Jennifer Reinhardt, HD	ÂB X	
Jennifer Ross, PDD		X	Rebecca Savage, HDA	В	X
Dan Riedan		X			

### III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Mr. Landsberg said "Revision of Application Requirements for Certain Alterations" has been moved to next week's agenda.

Commissioner Katie Johnson made a motion to move 8122 Kercheval to the Consent Agenda.

Commissioner Hamilton - SUPPORT

Ayes -7 Nay -0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Hamilton made a motion to APPROVE the agenda as modified.

Commissioner Katie Johnson - SUPPORT

Ayes -7 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

# IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

Commissioner Miriani made a motion to approve the October 14<sup>th</sup> and November 12<sup>th</sup> meeting minutes.

Commissioner Hosey - SUPPORT

Ayes -7 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

# **V REPORTS**

Mr. Landsberg said he would defer reports to the end of the meeting.

# VI APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AGENDA

Commissioner Hosey made a motion to APPROVE the following project, with staff recommendations and conditions (if present):

#20-6970 8122 Kercheval (8116 Kercheval) West Village HD Neon Sign

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes -7 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

# **VII POSTPONED APPLICATION**

None

# VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)

ADDRESS: 440 MARTIN LUTHER KING, JR. BOULEVARD

HISTORIC DISTRICT: WILLIS-SELDEN AND CASS-DAVENPORT

**PROPERTY OWNER: CITY OF DETROIT** 

SPONSORING CITY AGENCY/AUTHORITY: HRD (CITY OF DETROIT HOUSING AND

REVITALIZATION DEPARTMENT) **DATE OF STAFF SITE VISI**T: 12/4/20

**PROPOSED SCOPE:** ERECT NEW BUILDING ADJACENT TO HISTORIC DISTRICTS (ADVISORY OPINION PER SECTION 21-2-5)

Commissioner Miriani moved:

The Commission finds the proposed project at 440 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard **will** have a demonstrable effect on the Willis-Selden and Cass-Davenport Historic Districts, and that such demonstrable effect is likely to be **beneficial.** 

Commissioner Hamilton - SUPPORT

Ayes -7 Nay -0

### MOTION CARRIED

This determination of the Commission shall be reported to the Mayor and City Council for their consideration.

Commissioner Hosey left the meeting.

# IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

**APPLICATION NUMBER:** 20-6957 **ADDRESS:** 19331 CANTERBURY

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: SHERWOOD FOREST** 

**APPLICANT: BETH PACIFICO** 

**OWNER:** ANDREW STEIN & BETH PACIFICO

SCOPE OF WORK: NEW ONE-CAR GARAGE, DRIVEWAY, SPORTCOURT/PATIO, FENCE AND

LANDSCAPE

### **PROPOSAL**

The current owner purchased the house in June 2015 and has compiled the following scope of work, in their own words:

Our house was built in 1955. The swimming pool in the side yard was part of the original house. We purchased the house in July 2015 and opened the swimming pool that same month. This was the first time the pool had been used in several years. The years of neglect prior to our ownership created many problems with the swimming pool, most notably a main drain that no longer worked, as well as cracks in the foundation that led to water constantly draining from the pool. We recently decided to remove the pool and received a COA from this commission to do so. The pool is scheduled for removal in late-November/early-December 2020.

Like the original owner, we would like to make use of this large area of our property. We worked with a local historic architect on a plan to construct a one-car garage that matches

the existing house and carport, as well as implement a comprehensive landscaping plan that includes a sport court and a section of fence on one side.

We solicited feedback from our neighbors on this plan and worked closely with the Sherwood Forest Association historic committee and board, who approved this plan in-full in October.

Our goals for this project are to create something that: (1) is compatible with the unique mid-century character of our house; (2) is compatible with the Sherwood Forest neighborhood and is an aesthetically pleasing and welcoming sight as people enter the heart of our neighborhood (where our property sits); and (3) makes use of the space in a way similar to the original intent of the owners.

We feel we have accomplished these three goals. The one-car garage designed to match the shape, style, and color of the existing house and carport. It is slightly separate from the carport and set lower than the house and carport, which will allow the new structure to blend into the property and give it a feel as though it has been there all along. The landscaping and fence are designed to match the character of the house and existing pieces in other parts of the yard. And finally, a sport court/patio will allow us to still make use of this space for recreation, however in a way that is more subtle way than the existing swimming pool.

Thank you for your consideration.

Andrew Stein & Beth Pacifico, Homeowners

See attached site plan drawings and signed letter from the Sherwood Forest Association.

# **Detailed Scope of Work**

### A. Construction: One-car garage and arbor

- Install concrete slab 15' x 20' foundation on 2' reinforced concrete perimeter footing
- Construct 15' x 20' one car wood frame garage with class "a" shingle over plywood roof
- Install copper gutters to match existing house gutters
- Exterior stucco to match existing structure with cedar trim and eave/soffit
- Attach Rutherford Sconce exterior lighting with bronze finish outside garage door and porch
- Install 100 series Awning windows 47½" x 23½" with dark bronze trim
- Install 100 series Awning windows 23½" x 23½" with dark bronze trim
- Install Canyon Ridge series garage door 9'x 7'
- Install Andrew Stein Classic-Craft American Style Collection entry door 3'x 6'8" wildflower honey door and frame finish
- Construct 8' x 10' hipped roof over porch with 6"x6" posts and 6"x12" beams, stained cedar

# B. Construction: Paving

- Install asphalt 10' wide drive to garage
- Install concrete with exposed aggregate concrete 10' x 15' porch adjacent to garage
- Install asphalt 2' 4 ½" sidewalk to porch
- Install asphalt 28' x 18'6" sport court/patio

### C. Site Work:

- Install 30' long, 4' high wood privacy fence to match existing back yard privacy fence
- Install 5' fence around trash container storage adjacent to garage 8' 5 ½" x 5'area.
- Install landscape plantings as shown in site plans and planting schedule

### **PUBLIC COMMENT:**

None

### **ACTION**

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6957 for 19331 Canterbury**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- A grading plan with tree protection identifying all trees at 6" DBH or greater be identified with surrounding tree protection at the dripline.
- A landscape plan that achieves Historic District and code guidelines, as referenced in the recommendations as 3' in height at the corner, planting variety and maintains sightlines, particularly along Cambridge and Canterbury.
- The applicant will submit these items to staff for review.

Commissioner Franklin - SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

MOTION CARRIED

**APPLICATION NUMBER: #20-6933** 

**ADDRESS: 290 EDMUND** 

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** BRUSH PARK

APPLICANT: SAM ROUSE, BEDROCK DETROIT; ANDREW BODLEY, BEDROCK DETROIT;

ELIZABETH WHITTAKER, MERGE ARCHITECTS; SOOJIN YOO, MERGE ARCHITECTS

**OWNERS:** BEDROCK

SCOPE OF WORK: ERECT A NEW BUILDING (REVISION TO PREVIOUSLY-APPROVED

PROPOSAL)

### **PROPOSAL**

The applicant initially appeared in front of this Body at the February 17, 2016 special meeting with a proposal to establish a new mixed-use, multiple-building development (to include commercial and multiple family) within the area bounded by John R, Brush Street, Alfred, and Edmund Place. The development included several building typologies to include apartments, duplexes, townhomes, and carriage homes. The Commission issued a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposal as presented. The following is the design which the Commission approved for erection at 290 Edmund Place. Specifically, this building type, labeled in the below plan as "D-2," proposed the erection of a series of 4 duplexes known as "duplettes."

The applicant attended the HDC's November 11, 2020 regular meeting to seek an approval to revise the design for the D-2 Building which the Commission had approved in 2016. The proposed revision was based upon the applicant's desire to alter the building's program from market-rate, for-sale, duplexes to a multi-unit apartment building. The Commission reviewed the below revised apartment building design and denied the project. Please see the following image and the attached document which the Commission reviewed and denied at the November 2020 meeting.

Specifically, the Commission noted that the original D-2 design approved in 2016 presented an aesthetic which was cohesive with the design of the new structures that were proposed for erection directly adjacent to the D-2/within the 200 and 300 block of Edmund Place. In re: to the revised design which was denied at the November 2020, the Commission noted issues with the following:

- Massing: The building should read more as multiple buildings with pass-throughs, reflecting the broken streetscape of the historical homes and serving as tradeoffs to the bookend buildings.
- Materiality: Material strategies should create more "softness" and "rhythm".
- Street Front: The concrete base should contrast less with building body.
- Openings: The building openings should respond more to the openings on the adjacent Townhomes

The applicant has therefore revised the design of the D-2 building (to be located at 290 Edmund Place) that the Commission denied in November 2020 and is seeking this body's approval of their new proposal. Please see the following image of the new revised design which the property owner has presented with the current application.

As per the submitted proposal, the new building/design is proposed as a 4-story building and shall be erected according to the following:

- The new apartment building design measures 46'-6" to the top of the parapet wall whereas the previously-approved duplette building measured 47'-6". In re: to the building footprint, proposed new building measures 184'x 50', which is generally consistent with the dimensions of the previously-approved design (which measured 185'x 47').
- The proposed apartment building design features a materiality and color palette which is in keeping with the design that the Commission approved in 2016. The base/foundation of the building is a grey concrete.
- A concrete accessibility ramp will be located at the building's front elevation and will extend from the sidewalk to the primary entrance
- Windows are aluminum fixed and casement units and doors are aluminum.
- The landscaping and hardscaping (concrete walkways and rear parking lot) will remain as per the proposal which the Commission approved in 2016

Also, as per the applicant, the following revisions were made to the current proposal in order to address the concerns which the Commission expressed with the November 2020 denial:

- Massing: A staggered setback and varied brick tones break down the massing into more vertically oriented proportions. Addresses Brush Park Elements of Design #2, #16, and #19.
- Materiality: A revised material palette, composition, and texture adds variety, softness, and scale. Addresses Brush Park Elements of Design #7, #8, and #9.
- Street Front: Ground floor stoops and landscaping engages the pedestrian scale along the street. Addresses Brush Park Elements of Design #6, #17, and #20.
- Openings: Windows, varied in size, bridge the two scales of the Townhomes and the LOHA bookend buildings. Addresses Brush Park Elements of Design #3 and #4.

### **PUBLIC COMMENT:**

None

### **ACTION**

Commissioner Miriani moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **for 290 Edmund**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

### MOTION CARRIED

**APPLICATION NUMBER:** 20-6965 **ADDRESS:** 1627 LEVERETTE

HISTORIC DISTRICT: CORKTOWN

**APPLICANT: SCOTT TURNBELL, KEN MOODY** 

**PROPERTY OWNER:** KEN MOODY

SCOPE OF WORK: ERECT NEW CARPORTS; REPLACE ORIGINAL WOOD WINDOWS (WORK

COMPLETED)

### **PROPOSAL**

The applicant attended the Commission's 8/8/2018 regular meeting with a proposal to rehabilitate the building. Specifically, the project included a number of relatively "minor" work items which involved the in-kind repair of the building's existing historic material, to include the repair of the building's historic wood windows. The applicant also sought the Commission's approval of work which they had already undertaken without permit and HDC approval. Specifically, the violation involved the applicant's unapproved removal of the distinctive historic metal cornice at the front elevation parapet and the proposed installation of an FRP cornice in its place. After a review of the submitted application, the Commission approved the project with a condition that the new cornice exactly replicate the historic cornice that was removed without HDC approval and/or permit. Please see the attached Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) which outlines the Commission approval.

The applicant contacted HDC staff in July 2020 with information re: his desire to install new carports at the site and replace the existing wood windows (which the Commission had previously approved for repair). Staff outlined the application materials which the applicant needed to submit in order for the Commission to review his case. In November 2020, the applicant contacted staff with their completed application materials for the windows replacements and the new carports. However, staff was made aware that the historic wood windows had already been replaced without approval by that point. Also, after a review of the attached final construction drawings, which the applicant submitted to the Detroit Building, Safety, Engineering, and Environmental Department (BSEED) and to HDC staff with the current application, staff has identified a number of new exterior work items which have been proposed for the building. A site visit revealed that a number of these work items had also been completed (in addition to the installation of the new windows) or were in the process of completion.

Therefore, with the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval of the exterior work as proposed within the submitted drawings. Specific work items included within the current proposal include the following:

- At the rear yard of each of the seven units, erect a wood, shed-roof new carport as per the attached with a footprint of 15'-8"x23'-4," 14-10'x23'-4" or 13'-0"x23'-4" concrete footprint.
- At rear yard, install a new concrete walkway which leads from each new porch to proposed new carport (work completed)
- At rear yard, erect a new unpainted wood (with horizontal slats) fence which measure 4'- 0" high at the side yards and 6-0" high at rear yard. Also, erect a horizontal unpainted wood slat wall at each unit (to define each rear yard). Height has not been specified (work completed)
- At rear elevation, at each unit, replace existing concrete porch with new 8'-6"x14'-10" wood porch (see photos, work completed at some units)
- At rear elevation, at each unit, remove the wood transom and trim from doorway and replace with new wood, aluminum clad unit (work completed)
- At rear elevation, at each unit, partially enclose one window opening with brick and install a new fixed aluminum-clad window; fully enclose one window opening with brick (work completed)
- At rear elevation lightwells, partially enclose window openings with brick
- At rear elevation, at each unit, remove wood awning overhang over exterior door (work completed)
- At rear elevation, replace existing gabled-roof basement stair enclosure with a new gabledroof, stair enclosure (work completed). Exterior walls at each enclosure is clad with lapped siding (material not specified) Remove

all existing historic wood windows and wood trim/brickmould with the current new wood, aluminum-clad units (work completed) according to the following:

- o At rear elevation, side elevations, and lightwells original windows appeared to be wood, 1/1, double-hung units. These windows were largely replaced with new wood, aluminum-clad 1/1 units
- o At front elevation, second story bay windows original sash were wood, 1/1, double-hung units. These windows were replaced with wood, 1/1, double-hung units, each which is topped with a fixed wood transom window.
- o At front elevation, first story windows each opening originally included a set of paired fixed wood windows which were topped with fixed wood transom. The sash were set into wood trim. A fluted wood pilaster served as each window opening's mullion. The new windows are currently 1/1, double-hung, wood-sash units with aluminum-clad trim. The original fluted wood pilaster mullions appear to have been retained.
- Replace existing flat roof; repair parapet as per the attached drawing; install new brown aluminum gutters and downspouts (work completed)
- At front elevation, at each unit, replace existing porches (to include brick wingwalls with stone caps and concrete steps) with new porches (buff brick wingwalls with stone caps and concrete steps, work completed). Note that a review of Google Street view images indicate that the brick porch wingwalls removed without approval and permit were not original/not historic age
- At front elevation, paint wood trim (around windows, doors, and at the cornice) brown (work completed)
- At side and rear elevations, repaint the existing painted brick red (work completed)
- At front yard, install new shrubs and hedges at each unit (work completed)
- Please note that the submitted drawings indicated that the new/replacement cornice which was removed without Commission approval in 2018 was to be replicated, down to the "decorative leaf" detailing (ie, the swag detailing). However, the current cornice does not include that decorative detailing.

### **PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Public comment was made.

### **ACTION**

Commissioner Miriani moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6965 for 1627 Leverette**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined that parts of the proposed scope of work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Denial for the application.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work items fail to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

#### MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Franklin moved to grant authority to HDC staff to contact BSEED to issue notice against title with respect to #20-6965/1627 Leverette.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

## MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Franklin moved to grant authority to HDC staff and/or BSEED staff to issue notice against title regarding #20-6965/1627 Leverette.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

# **MOTION CARRIED**

Commissioner Miriani moved to give HDC staff authority to inform BSEED that no additional exterior work should proceed at this property until a proper application is approved by the Commission.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

### MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Miriani moved to waive the Commission's three-day waiting period for notification of Commission decisions.

Commissioner Hamilton - SUPPORT

Ayes - 6 Nay - 0

MOTION CARRIED

**APPLICATION NUMBER:** 20-6968 **ADDRESS:** 691 W. ALEXANDRINE

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: WILLIS-SELDEN** 

APPLICANT: DAVID BALFOUR, RED SHEPARD INVESTMENTS, LLC PROPERTY; LARS

**GRAEBNAR** 

PROPERTY OWNER: DAVID BALFOUR, RED SHEPARD INVESTMENTS, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: REHABILITATE EXISTING BUILDING; ERECT NEW BUILDING

### **PROPOSAL**

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to rehabilitate the existing building located at the rear of the property and erect a new building at the front of the property per the attached drawings and application. Included in the proposal are the following scope items:

### • General rehabilitation of existing duplex (687-689 W. Alexandrine)

- o Porches and Stoops
  - Disassemble existing brick porches, sandstone steps and wing walls; clean brick and stone and rebuild porches. Mortar to match the mortar of the existing brick façade.
  - Northern porch and stair is to be rebuilt to its existing configuration.
  - Southern porch and stair (closest to alley) is to be rebuilt in a modified configuration from what currently exists. Stair currently runs north/south off of the porch toward West Alexandrine street but are proposed to be rebuilt running east/west toward the adjacent apartment building to the west.
  - Remove existing wood elements of the porches including columns, railings, floor, ceiling, and trim. Replace with weather treated wood columns. Cedar planks will be used as finish for the columns, façade panels and trim. Trim board to be installed to match existing. All wood to be painted in either Grayish Brown (B:8) or Light Yellow (B:3).
  - Install 4 new wall-mounted up/downlight exterior lights at the base of the porch of the west unit to illuminate the walking surface.
- Windows and Doors
  - Remove and replace all existing historic wood windows and two existing replacement windows with new aluminum clad wood windows to match operation, design, profiles,

- and light configuration.
- Repair and paint existing historic wood entry door at west unit.
- Replace east unit entry door with new wood doors to match existing historic wood door at west unit.
- Replace rear (south) entry door.
- At west elevation, create new window opening and window well for egress purposes.
- o Repoint brick at exterior walls as needed. New mortar to match existing.
- o Install new wood cornice at existing cornice line. Cornice to be painted to Grayish Brown (B8) to match porches.
- o Repave the alley from West Alexandrine to the rear (south) property line. The alley is currently paved but in disrepair.
- o Install two A/C condensers at the southeast (rear) corner of the building
- O Construct new roof deck with handrail/railing wall to be set back 5' from north, east, and west facades. Railing wall to be constructed with wood on the interior and Core 10 on the exterior with a metal cap at the top to match the railing wall of the proposed new building.

# • New Construction (691 W. Alexandrine)

- o Construct new three-story, three-unit, multi-family residential building situated at the front northwest corner of the lot and aligned with the property line along West Alexandrine.
- O Simple and rectilinear in form with an overall footprint of 50' x 36'.
- O Secure parking located within the building footprint, below-grade. Steel garage doors are to be painted black to match window frames.
- O Cladding is be vertically oriented weathered steel panels (18" W flat panel) in a regular pattern.
- Main building entrance is located at the far west end of front (north) façade and is accentuated with a ½" steel plate "portal" (painted dark gray) which protrudes beyond the face of the building. The entrance door and frame is to be a narrow stile flat panel aluminum door and frame painted dark gray.
- o The rear (south) entrance door is to be a narrow stile flat panel aluminum door and frame.
- A balcony constructed of black anodized steel is proposed at second floor of the east façade.
- Windows are to include aluminum fixed units with tilt-and-turn operating sashes (color: black anodized)
- Rooftop terrace (accessed via stair at west edge of building) proposed at rear (southern) half of
  roof with an angled screen wall running east/west separating the rooftop terrace from the front
  portion of the roof which will house A/C condenser units.
- Proposed site design includes:
  - Concrete pavement in alley and driveway with rectilinear pattern
  - 5' high x 18' long concrete screen wall directly adjacent to the rear of the building to prevent headlights impacting the neighboring apartment building.
  - 2 columnar sweet gum trees at the front of the building along with a row of decorative sumac shrubs planted along the entire width of the front of the lot.
  - 1 Ginkgo tree will be planted in the rear of the lot near the existing duplex
  - Ground cover, lawn and low shrubs in the "garden area" around to the west and south of the existing duplex as well as a small grill terrace and paved seating area.
  - At the rear of the existing duplex is proposed a small paved area for refuse containers and A/C condenser units. This rear area will be fenced off from the alley with a small segment of wrought-iron style, black aluminum, fence and gate.

### **PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Public comment made.

### **ACTION**

Commissioner Miriani moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6968 for 691 W. Alexandrine**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City

Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work (no staff conditions are attached to this motion).

 $\begin{array}{ll} Commissioner \ Alease \ Johnson-SUPPORT \\ Ayes-5 & Nay-1, Commissioner \ Hamilton \end{array}$ 

**MOTION CARRIED** 

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6969** 

**ADDRESS:** 3839 LESLIE **HISTORIC DISTRICT:** 

APPLICANT: INA ORUBIBI, SINGRID DIXON, BRYON DIXON

**PROPERTY OWNER: MABLE DIXON** 

SCOPE OF WORK: ERECT NEW GARAGE AND DRIVEWAY

### **PROPOSAL**

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to construct a new 2-car garage and concrete driveway, as proposed in the following scope of work:

- Construct a new, 20'x22' garage, with 4" concrete pad, set back (3') three feet from the rear (north) property line, with the following features:
  - An 8" wide, reinforced concrete foundation, extending 42" below grade. The concrete foundation is connected CMU with continuous rebar above grade. Full construction details are provided in a section drawing.
  - The applicant proposes to install horizontal wood or vinyl siding on the garage with 1"x4" vertical trim at the corners.
    - The applicant has included information about Paulownia wood. The applicant has stated that the wood siding will be 4" exposed and 1" lap.
    - The applicant proposes to paint the exterior in "Tawny Birch."
    - The applicant has also included information about *Ply Gem* "Mastic" vinyl siding, although the exact selection, including color, dimensions of reveal, profile and installation method / style were not specifically selected.
  - o The proposed roof of the garage is hipped with 1' overhangs on all sides.
    - The roof will be clad in "Rustic Green" Dimensional shingles by *Timko*.
    - The roof features metal gutters, although the exact specifications have not been provided.
  - The proposed overhead garage door is a typical, 4-panel metal door, with wood grain finish, located on the west side (Holmur Street). The elevation drawings indicate that the garage door is 7' and is wide enough for two cars, although the width and manufacturer have not been specified.
  - o The proposed driveway is 18' long x 22' wide concrete driveway, inside of sidewalk (4" slab).
    - Driveway flares out to 28' at the right of way (6" slab).
  - The applicant has proposed to install "lantern style" mounted lighting, in a dark bronze color.
    - The quantity and location of these elements have not been specified in the application.
  - o A 3'x6-8" metal pedestrian door is proposed on the north elevation of the garage, the applicant states that it will be a 6- panel wood door, painted white (exact product not specified).

# **ACTION**

Commissioner Franklin moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6969 for 3839 Leslie and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work items WILL

BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:* 

- The applicant clarify how the fence will be reinstalled, including cut sheets and reconfiguration of the fence to staff prior to reinstallation.
- Prior to any work beginning, the applicant will submit the wood selection to staff for review.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

# IX CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

None

# X APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6960** 

**ADDRESS: 2108 BURNS** 

HISTORIC DISTRICT: INDIAN VILLAGE

**APPLICANT: GARY BROWNWELL** 

**PROPERTY OWNER: GARY BROWNWELL** 

SCOPE OF WORK: INSTALL SKYLIGHTS ON ROOF: WORK COMPLETED WITHOUT PERMIT:

PAINT HOME, REMOVAL OF OAK TREE

#### PROPOSAL

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to install four skylights on the rear side of the home. The applicant is also seeking retroactive approval for the removal of a mature tree in the rear yard, behind the garage, and the painting of the home as it is exists currently.

- Install (4) four 21" x 45.75" skylights on the rear side of the roof to accommodate a redesign of the interior spaces.
- Retroactive approval for the current paint scheme: Painting the body of the home, including the shake and the stucco Sherwin Williams 7006 "Extra White" and painting selected areas of trim Sherwin Williams 6258 "Tricorn Black."
- Removal of mature Oak tree at rear yard, next to garage.
  - The applicant has provided a note from an arborist stating that the health of the tree was in decline and "planted in a restricted root zone," and has "outlived it's environment."

### **ACTION**

# Recommendation One

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6960 for 2108 Burns**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined that part of the proposed scope of work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Denial for the proposed work item:

• Repainting of house as completed

The Commission's reason for denial is that the proposed work item fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

#### MOTION CARRIED

# Recommendation Two

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6960 for 2108 Burns** and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the remaining work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

• A new shade tree is planted on the property within one year, positioned to re-establish the tree canopy at this prominent location along Kercheval.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes - 6 Nay - 0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6961** 

**ADDRESS: 701 CANFIELD** 

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** WEST CANFIELD

APPLICANT: SCOTT LOWELL; MARC GRASSI; KRISTINE KIDORF

**PROPERTY OWNER: SCOTT LOWELL** 

SCOPE OF WORK: NEW REAR BALCONY, POOL, PARKING, DOORS, FENCE AND GENERAL

**REHAB** 

### **PROPOSAL**

The applicant is looking for permission to replace existing vinyl and wood windows with aluminum clad wood windows as outlined in the attached drawings and detailed scope of work listed below:

### **Detailed Scope of Work**

## D. North Elevation (Front):

- Replace (8) existing vinyl double-hung windows with aluminum clad wood double-hung insert windows
- Replace (8) existing wood double-hung windows with aluminum clad wood double-hung insert windows
- Replace (2) existing vinyl casement windows with (1) French inswing casement aluminum clad wood window
- Replace (1) existing wood French inswing casement window with (1) French inswing casement aluminum clad wood window
- Replace (1) existing vinyl sliding windows with (1) casement aluminum clad wood window at basement
- Replace (2) existing wood casement windows with (2) casement aluminum clad wood windows at basement

### E. East Elevation:

- Replace (7) existing vinyl sliding windows with (7) aluminum clad wood casement windows at basement. Remove metal grills at each window.
- Replace (12) existing vinyl double-hung windows with (12) aluminum clad wood double-hung insert windows
- Replace (2) existing vinyl casement windows with (2) aluminum clad wood double-hung insert windows
- Replace (1) existing vinyl casement windows with (1) aluminum clad wood casement insert window

### F. West Elevation:

- Replace (6) existing wood casement windows with (6) aluminum clad wood casement windows at basement.
- Replace (12) existing wood double-hung windows with (12) aluminum clad wood double-hung insert windows
- Replace (2) existing wood casement windows with (2) aluminum clad wood casement insert windows
- Replace (1) existing wood casement windows with (1) aluminum clad wood casement window

### G. South (Rear) Elevation:

• No work proposed in this application

### **ACTION**

Commissioner Miriani moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6961 for 701 W. Canfield**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the remaining work items as stated in this report and outlined in the submitted drawings WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Katie Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

MOTION CARRIED

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6962** 

**ADDRESS:** 2200 ATWATER

HISTORIC DISTRICT: ARETHA FRANKLIN AMPHITHEATRE / CHENE PARK

**APPLICANT:** THOMAS MALISZEWSKI, WCI CONTRACTORS; MARIE HAENER-PATTI, CONSTRUCTION PROJECT MANAGER, CITY OF DETROIT GENERAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT; RHEA BAUTISTA, CAPITAL PLAN MANAGER, CITY OF DETROIT GENERAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT; KARLA PAREJA, HAMILTON ANDERSON ARCHITECTS

**PROPERTY OWNER: CITY OF DETROIT** 

**SCOPE OF WORK:** REPLACE CONCESSION COUNTERS AND CABINETS; REHABILITATE CONCESSION AREAS

### **PROPOSAL**

The scope of work within this application focuses on renovations of the concessions areas.

- 1. Replace existing cabinets and countertops.
  - Existing cabinets and countertops are wood laminate construction.
  - Proposed cabinets will be wood construction (epoxy coating on marine grade plywood) with a tile border.
  - Proposed countertops will be stone or composite material.

- 2. Add ADA compliant service areas.
- 3. Replace soffits over service areas.
  - New soffits will be 3/4-inch plaster over metal lath (to match existing).
- 4. Update lighting to LED light fixtures.
  - Replace recessed lighting to match existing (existing wiring to be reused).
  - Existing surface mounted lights to be replaced to match existing.
- 5. Paint walls and steel gates.
- 6. Epoxy floor coatings.

Staff offers the following comparison of the existing finishes and proposed finishes for each concession area.

### **EXISTING**

<u>Pavilion 1, Level 3 – Main Concession</u> Counters: Front-Red and Yellow; Back-Gray

Posts: Yellow

Walls: Yellow, Purple, Gray Soffit: Seafoam Green

Gate: Medium Green (possibly original metal finish)

# Pavilion 2, Level 3 – VIP Concession

Counters: Front-Black (painted laminate); Back-Gray

Walls: Black Soffit: Black Gate: Black

Pavilion 2, Level 4 – Upper Concession

Counters: Front-Gray; Back-Gray

Walls: Red, Yellow, Gray Soffit: Seafoam Green Gate: Deep Lagoon

# **PROPOSED**

<u>Pavilion 1, Level 3 – Main Concession</u> Counters (front and back): Gray/Black/Tile

Posts: Black

Walls: PT1 (Deep Lagoon) Soffit: PT2 (Seafoam Green) Gate: PT1 (Deep Lagoon)

<u>Pavilion 2, Level 3 – VIP Concession</u>

Counters (front and back): Gray/Black/Tile

Walls: PT3 (Black) Soffit: PT3 (Black) Gate: PT3 (Black)

<u>Pavilion 2, Level 4 – Upper Concession</u> Counters (front and back): Gray/Black/Tile

Walls: PT1 (Deep Lagoon) Soffit: PT2 (Seafoam Green) Gate: PT1 (Deep Lagoon)

#### **ACTION**

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6962 for 2200 Atwater**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:* 

- Counters: If an alternative material such as stone (or composite) is used, it should be a solid gray or another color that compliments the range of colors called out in the Elements of Design. A sample will be provided to staff for review.
- Cabinets: The cabinets will be painted a solid color to match the selected counter color; a sample will be submitted for staff review. Staff believes an alternative material, solid in color and texture that matches the cabinet and counter color, be selected for the "rub rail" (as defined by the applicant).
- Photographs clearly showing the recessed and surface-mounted lights, as well as catalog cuts confirming the design and finish color of the replacement lamps will be submitted to staff for review.
- Note # 2 on Pages 5 & 6 (Pavilion 1, Level 3), 7 & 8 (VIP Pavilion 2, Level 3), and 9 & 10 (Pavilion 2, Level 4) will be corrected to state: "paint colors per the Finishes Palette, Page 16".
- The color of the epoxy coating will be submitted for staff review prior to application.

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 MOTION CARRIED

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6964** 

**ADDRESS:** 2857 E. GRAND BOULEVARD **HISTORIC DISTRICT:** JAM HANDY

**APPLICANT:** ROCKY LALA; AJ REILLY, OOMBRA ARCHITECTS

**OWNER:** ROCKY LALA

**SCOPE OF WORK:** PAINT THE UNPAINTED MASONRY CORNICE

### **PROPOSAL**

The applicant attended the Commission's 9/11/2019 HDC meeting with a proposal to rehabilitate the building, to include the painting of the building a yellowish/off-white color. After a review, the Commission approved all scope items, with the exception of their proposal to paint the unpainted stone cornice, while is located at the roof/wall function at the front and side elevation. Specifically, the Commission determined that the painting of unpainted stone did not meet the Secretary of the interior Standards for Rehabilitation.

Because a year has now passed the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to paint the unpainted stone cornice "Sherwin Williams 7636 Origami White" to match the color which the building's front, side, and rear walls, below the cornice. Please note that the Commission did not approve the current white color which has been applied to the exterior walls. Rather, they Body approved the walls (below the cornice) be repainted a yellowish/off white at the 9/11/2019 HDC meeting, as noted above. The applicant has stated that they desire to paint the cornice because it "... is also in poor condition, despite extensive efforts to clean and repair. Paint and stains remain and have a negative visual effect on the finished look of this rehabbed building. It is our opinion that the cornice should be painted to match the look of the rest of the building - the historical character, texture, and profile will remain, but without the staining and inconsistencies."

### **ACTION**

Commissioner Hamilton moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6964 for 2857 E. Grand Boulevard**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Denial for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial are that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 **MOTION CARRIED** 

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6972** 

**ADDRESS:** 2863 E. GRAND BOULEVARD **HISTORIC DISTRICT:** JAM HANDY

APPLICANT: ROCKY LALA; AJ REILLY, OOMBRA ARCHITECTS

**OWNER:** ROCKY LALA

### **SCOPE OF WORK:** PAINT EXTERIOR WALLS

### **PROPOSAL**

As per the submitted proposal the applicant is seeking this body's approval to rehabilitate the building, to include the following work items:

### Rooftop

- Replace existing roof membrane with a new rubberized membrane
- Install new rooftop mechanical units (will not be visible from the public right-of-way)
- Establish a new rooftop terrace area with wood paver system and enclosed with metal railing
- Erect a new elevator lobby enclosure
- Install a new green roof tray system to be enclosed by a 6'-0"-tall green screen enclosure
- At the existing elevator penthouse, erect a small brick clad overrun enclosure and add a new entry door opening (single steel door)

#### **Rear Elevation**

- Paint walls black
- At first story:
  - o Remove all existing overhead doors and fully enclose two openings with CMU; partially infill one opening with CMU and install a single metal door
  - o Replace one existing single metal door with a new single metal door at the new residence entry
  - Install new black light fixtures
  - o Install a new neon sign over the new residence entry
  - o Clean and repair/tuckpoint brick as necessary
- At the second and third stories:
  - o Replace existing windows with new aluminum, multiple-light (simulated divided lite), combo fixed and awning windows
  - Clean and repair/tuckpoint brick as necessary
- At the elevator penthouse, replace the existing window with new aluminum, multiple-light (simulated divided lite), fixed window

### Front/North Elevation

- Paint walls black
- Clean and repair/tuckpoint brick as necessary
- Replace existing windows with new aluminum, multiple-light (simulated divided lite), combo fixed and awning windows
- Remove non-historic storefront infill at first story and install new aluminum storefronts
- At primary entrance, remove non-historic granite infill and awning and install a new channel glass wall system, entry door, neon signage, and light fixture
- Install in-ground up lights

### West/Side Elevation

- Paint walls black
- Clean and repair/tuckpoint brick as necessary
- Replace existing windows with new aluminum, multiple-light (simulated divided lite), combo fixed and awning windows
- At first story, install new gas meters and double metal doors

### **East/Side Elevation**

• Paint walls black

- Clean and repair/tuckpoint brick as necessary
- Replace existing windows with new aluminum, multiple-light (simulated divided lite), combo fixed and awning windows
- At third story, punch in three new window openings; install new new aluminum, multiple-light (simulated divided lite), combo fixed and awning windows in each new opening

# **ACTION**

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6972 for 2863 E. Grand Boulevard**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Denial for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work item fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6981** 

**ADDRESS:** 489 HENRY

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: CASS-HENRY** 

APPLICANT: BRIAN REBAIN, KRAEMER DESIGN GROUP, LLC and MIKE KIRK, NEUMANN/SMITH

ARCHITECTURE

OWNER: CASS VILLAGE APARTMENTS, LLC/OLYMPIA DEVELOPMENT OF MICHIGAN, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: REHABILITATE APARTMENT BUILDING

#### PROPOSAL

The proposed scope of work required to rehabilitate the exterior of the building is depicted in the attached schematic drawings\* for this Body's review and, per the applicant, specifically includes:

### **Brick and stone**

- Inspected for damage
- Brown paint to be removed [process not provided]
- Masonry cleaned with a light duty detergent and low pressure water rinse
- Brick and stone will be repointed, and loose or displaced units will be reset
- Repointed mortar will match the color, texture, compressive strength, joint width, and joint profile of the existing historic mortar
- Damaged brick and stone will be repaired as necessary
- Any units too badly deteriorated to repair will be replaced, with salvaged brick to be reused where replacements are needed before new units are used
- If new units are necessary, they will be selected to match the existing in size, profile, color, and finish
- The stone surround at the main entry will be cleaned to remove all paint and return to bare stone [process not provided]

### Metal cornice

- Cornice cleaned and repaired where possible
- Where pieces are beyond repair or missing, a new piece made of compatible metal will be installed to match the existing
- Cornice paint will be investigated to determine the original historic color (TBD) Main entrance and doors
- Main entrance doors will be will be inspected for damage and repaired as necessary
- Basement doors will be replaced with new doors to match the appearance of the eastern door (without the chute)
- Balconette doors at north façade will be inspected for damage/condition and repaired as necessary. Doors found to be deteriorated beyond repair will be installed which match the existing. Aluminum storm doors will be added in front of the balconette double doors on the second through fourth floors. The storm doors will be compatible with the historic nature of the building without appearing falsely historic and will not obstruct vision to the original double doors. The metal guardrails at these doors will be reconstructed to match the original in style, profile, material, and color.
- At the rear elevation, the ground floor steel door and the furniture loading doors will be inspected for damage and repaired as necessary. The metal guardrails at the furniture loading doors will be replaced with a new metal guardrail system.
- ADA lift and new entrance door will be installed on the east façade of the building, convenient to the adjacent parking lot

### Windows

• New historic replica aluminum-clad wood windows throughout: Marvin Ultimate Double Hung G2 per attached data sheet (no extant historic windows, color TBD)

### Lighting

- Exterior building lighting will be provided and designed to highlight building features
- Lighting locations may include up-lights on the west (Cass) façade and wall-mounted fixtures flanking the entrance 9

## Signage

- Future signage is proposed to be reinstated in the same location as the stone-inscribed "BERWIN" above the main entry door
- Final signage drawings (including size, color, and design) will be submitted for staff approval before installation

# Roof, rooftop mechanicals, and penthouses

- Current poor condition membrane roof to be removed and replaced with a new EPDM roof
- Small condenser farm will be added to the rear center of the roof and screened with an approximately 5' tall metal roof screen in a "Dove Grey" color

# Landscaping/Site

• Proposed landscaping and site interventions for all buildings and areas will be incorporated into the staff reports for the site parcels (i.e., 2457 Cass and 467-469, 481 Henry Street), and formally reviewed as part of those applications \*specifically, drawings 1A101, 1A102 (floor/roof plans) and 1A401, 1A401.1, 1A402, 1A402.1 (elevations) Additional photographs, renderings, presentation materials, and narrative provided by the applicant in support of this application is appended to this report and posted on the public website for the meeting.

### ACTION

Commissioner Hamilton moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6981 for 489 Henry**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings will include the identification of specific standards concerning repair and/or replacement of deteriorated character-defining features, and related standards concerning the qualifications of historic preservation contractors retained to perform the work.
- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings to specifically include review of specifications/cut sheets for lighting, windows, doors, ADA lifts, signage, paint removal, color choices, and other exterior elements/selections not yet finalized, with staff authority to approve if per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the district's Elements of Design, and otherwise consistent with Commission intent and guidelines.
- The historic name of the building, set in stone above the entryway, be preserved and remain visible.

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6982** 

**ADDRESS: 459 HENRY** 

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** CASS-HENRY

APPLICANT: BRIAN REBAIN, KRAEMER DESIGN GROUP, LLC and MIKE KIRK, NEUMANN/SMITH

ARCHITECTURE

OWNER: CASS VILLAGE APARTMENTS, LLC/OLYMPIA DEVELOPMENT OF MICHIGAN, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: REHABILITATE APARTMENT BUILDING

### **PROPOSAL**

The proposed scope of work required to rehabilitate the exterior of the building is depicted in the attached schematic drawings\* for this Body's review and, per the applicant, specifically includes: **Brick and stone** 

- Inspected for damage
- Brown paint to be removed [process not provided]
- Masonry cleaned with a light duty detergent and low pressure water rinse
- Brick and stone will be repointed, and loose or displaced units will be reset
- Repointed mortar will match the color, texture, compressive strength, joint width, and joint profile of the existing historic mortar
- Damaged brick and stone will be repaired as necessary
- Any units too badly deteriorated to repair will be replaced, with salvaged brick to be reused where replacements are needed before new units are used
- If new units are necessary, they will be selected to match the existing in size, profile, color, and finish
- The stone elements at the main entry porch will be cleaned to remove all paint and return to bare stone [process not provided]

# Cornice

• A new fiberglass or GFRC cornice will be fabricated using the existing cornices at 439 and 489 Henry as design intent. Cornice color to match historic color found at reference locations (TBD).

### Main entrance and doors

- Main entrance doors will be inspected for damage and repaired as necessary with new hardware to match existing
- Basement doors will be inspected for damage and repaired as necessary with new hardware or replaced with compatible doors
- At the center bay balconettes, the anachronistic windows will be removed, along with the infill brick knee wall. Openings will be replaced with wood double doors, using the balconette doors at 439 Henry (Bretton Hall) as design intent. Aluminum storm doors will also be added in front of the double doors. The storm doors will be compatible with the historic nature of the building without appearing falsely historic.

- At the rear elevation, the ground floor steel door and the furniture loading doors will be inspected for damage and repaired as necessary with new hardware or replaced with compatible doors.
- ADA lift and new entrance door will be installed on the west façade of the building convenient to the adjacent parking lot

### Windows

• New historic replica aluminum-clad wood windows throughout: Marvin Ultimate Double Hung G2 per attached data sheet (no extant historic windows, color TBD)

## Lighting

- Exterior building lighting will be provided and designed to highlight building features
- Lighting locations may include up-lights on the west (Cass) façade and wall-mounted fixtures flanking the entrance

## Signage

- $\bullet$  Future signage is proposed to be reinstated in the same location as the stone-inscribed "CLARIDGE" above the main entry door 9
- Final signage drawings (including size, color, and design) will be submitted for staff approval before installation

### Roof, rooftop mechanicals, and penthouses

- Current poor condition membrane roof to be removed and replaced with a new EPDM roof
- Small condenser farm will be added to the rear center of the roof and screened with an approximately 5' tall metal roof screen in a "Dove Grey" color

# Landscaping/Site

• Proposed landscaping and site interventions for all buildings and areas will be incorporated into the staff reports for the site parcels (i.e., 2457 Cass and 467-469, 481 Henry Street), and formally reviewed as part of those applications

\*specifically, drawings 2A101, 2A102 (floor/roof plans) and 2A401, 2A401.1, 2A402, 2A402.1 (elevations)

#### **ACTION**

Commissioner Alease Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6982 for 459 Henry**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:* 

- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings will include the identification of specific standards concerning repair and/or replacement of deteriorated character-defining features, and related standards concerning the qualifications of historic preservation contractors retained to perform the work.
- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings to specifically include review of specifications/cut sheets for lighting, windows, doors, ADA lifts, signage, and other exterior elements/color selections not yet finalized, with staff authority to approve if per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the district's Elements of Design, and otherwise consistent with Commission intent and guidelines.
- The historic name of the building, set in stone above the entryway, be preserved and remain visible.

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT Ayes – 6 Nay – 0 MOTION CARRIED

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6983** 

**ADDRESS: 447 HENRY** 

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** CASS-HENRY

**APPLICANT**: BRIAN REBAIN, KRAEMER DESIGN GROUP, LLC and MIKE KIRK, NEUMANN/SMITH ARCHITECTURE

OWNER: CASS VILLAGE APARTMENTS, LLC/OLYMPIA DEVELOPMENT OF MICHIGAN, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: REHABILITATE COMMERCIAL STOREFRONT/GARAGE BUILDING

#### **PROPOSAL**

The proposed scope of work required to rehabilitate the exterior of the building is depicted in the attached schematic drawings\* for this Body's review and, per the applicant, specifically includes: **Brick and stone** 

- Inspected for damage
- Black paint to be removed [process not provided]
- Masonry cleaned with a light duty detergent and low pressure water rinse
- Brick and stone will be repointed, and loose or displaced units will be reset
- Repointed mortar will match the color, texture, compressive strength, joint width, and joint profile of the existing historic mortar
- Damaged brick and stone will be repaired as necessary
- Any units too badly deteriorated to repair will be replaced, with salvaged brick to be reused where replacements are needed before new units are used
- If new units are necessary, they will be selected to match the existing in size, profile, color, and finish

#### Main entrance and doors

- A new aluminum storefront system will be installed in the existing storefront openings, painted a historically appropriate color (TBD "dark anodized" per drawings)
- Current design depicts the eastern-most bay as maintaining its current configuration but with the possibility of adding or relocating door openings once a tenant is secured
- Western-most storefront bay will be reconfigured to include two sets of double doors, one recessed and the second (westernmost) not. The installation of the new double-door would require cutting through the stone base
- The center bay will incorporate a new entry door, cutting through the stone base [per 3A401 but not 3A401.1 or the floor plan, 3A101]
- All three bays will restore the glass transoms
- At east elevation, two new doors will be added to provide access to the "alley" which runs along the building. This "alley" will be paved. [paving material not provided; note also that this space appears to be part of the parcel on which Bretton Hall is built, not this building]
- At the rear (public alley) elevation, the central metal coiling door will be replaced with a new insulated overhead door to match the existing in size and appearance. [material not provided] Pedestrian doors will be replaced with solid hollow metal doors and frames.

### Windows

• At the east and west elevations, the existing windows [no existing windows are apparent, openings are blocked with CMU] will be replaced with new aluminum clad wood fixed windows

#### Lighting

- Exterior building lighting will be provided and designed to highlight building features
- Lighting locations may include up-lights in the east alley courtyard and wall-mounted fixtures on the front facade

### Signage

- Future signage is proposed to be reinstated in the storefront signage band(s).
- Final signage drawings (including size, color, and design) will be submitted for staff approval before installation

### Roof, rooftop mechanicals, and penthouses 9

- Current poor condition membrane roof to be removed and replaced with a new EPDM roof
- Rooftop condensers surrounded by an approximately 5' tall metal screen will be located on the roof toward the rear of the building so as to not be visible from the sidewalk. Metal screen will be a "Dove Grey" color.

### Landscaping/Site

• Proposed landscaping and site interventions for all buildings and areas will be incorporated into the staff reports for the site parcels (i.e., 2457 Cass and 467-469, 481 Henry Street), and formally reviewed as part of those applications

\*specifically, drawings 3A101, 3A102 (floor/roof plans) and 3A401, 3A401.1 (elevations)

Additional photographs, renderings, presentation materials, and narrative provided by the applicant in support of this application is appended to this report and posted on the public website for the meeting.

### **ACTION**

Commissioner Miriani moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6983 for 447 Henry**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:* 

- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings will include the identification of specific standards concerning repair and/or replacement of deteriorated character-defining features, and related standards concerning the qualifications of historic preservation contractors retained to perform the work.
- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings to specifically include review of specifications/cut sheets for lighting, windows, doors, ADA lifts, signage, paint removal, color choices, and other exterior elements/selections not yet finalized, with staff authority to approve if per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the district's Elements of Design, and otherwise consistent with Commission intent and guidelines
- The design be modified to choose a different window type/configuration for the openings at the east and west elevations consistent with an industrial steel window style appropriate to the utilitarian historic context, subject to staff approval
- The design be modified to prioritize the retention of historic materials across all three bays as revealed by further field investigation, to include the denticulated entablature at the westernmost bay, and that staff be given authority to review/approve a revision to the storefront design.
- HDC will allow coordination between HDC staff and SHPO on the location of the doors on the building.

Commissioner Hamilton - SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6984** 

**ADDRESS: 439 HENRY** 

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** CASS-HENRY

APPLICANT: BRIAN REBAIN, KRAEMER DESIGN GROUP, LLC and MIKE KIRK, NEUMANN/SMITH

ARCHITECTURE

OWNER: CASS VILLAGE APARTMENTS, LLC/OLYMPIA DEVELOPMENT OF MICHIGAN, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: REHABILITATE APARTMENT BUILDING

### **PROPOSAL**

The proposed scope of work required to rehabilitate the exterior of the building is depicted in the attached schematic drawings\* for this Body's review and, per the applicant, specifically includes: **Brick and stone** 

- Inspected for damage
- Brown paint to be removed [process not provided]
- Masonry cleaned with a light duty detergent and low pressure water rinse
- Brick and stone will be repointed, and loose or displaced units will be reset

- Repointed mortar will match the color, texture, compressive strength, joint width, and joint profile of the existing historic mortar Damaged brick and stone will be repaired as necessary
- Any units too badly deteriorated to repair will be replaced, with salvaged brick to be reused where replacements are needed before new units are used
- If new units are necessary, they will be selected to match the existing in size, profile, color, and finish
- The stone surround at the main entry will be cleaned to remove all paint and return to bare stone [process not provided]

### **Metal cornice**

- Cornice cleaned and repaired where possible
- Where pieces are beyond repair or missing, a new piece made of compatible metal will be installed to match the existing
- Cornice paint will be investigated to determine the original historic color (TBD)

### Main entrance and doors

- Main entrance door will be replaced with a new door to match the existing historic door, with new hardware
- Basement doors will be replaced with new doors to match the appearance of the eastern door (without the chute)
- Balconette doors at north façade will be inspected for damage/condition and repaired as necessary. Doors found to be deteriorated beyond repair will be installed which match the existing. Aluminum storm doors will be added in front of the balconette double doors on the second through fourth floors. The storm doors will be compatible with the historic nature of the building without appearing falsely historic and will not obstruct vision to the original double doors. The metal guardrails at these doors will be reconstructed to match the original in style, profile, material, and color.
- At the rear elevation, the ground floor steel door and the furniture loading doors will be inspected for damage and repaired as necessary. The metal guardrails at the furniture loading doors will be replaced with a new metal guardrail system.
- Per drawing 4A401, an ADA lift and new entrance door will be installed towards the rear of the building at the west elevation

#### Windows

• New historic replica aluminum-clad wood windows throughout: Marvin Ultimate Double Hung G2 per attached data sheet (no extant historic windows, color TBD)

### Lighting

- Exterior building lighting will be provided and designed to highlight building features
- Lighting locations may include up-lights on the west (Cass) façade and wall-mounted fixtures flanking the entrance 9

## Signage

- Future signage is proposed to be reinstated in the same location as the stone-inscribed "BRETTON HALL" above the main entry door
- Final signage drawings (including size, color, and design) will be submitted for staff approval before installation Roof, rooftop mechanicals, and penthouses
- Current poor condition membrane roof to be removed and replaced with a new EPDM roof
- Small condenser farm will be added to the rear center of the roof and screened with an approximately 5' tall metal roof screen in a "Dove Grey" color

# Landscaping/Site

• Proposed landscaping and site interventions for all buildings and areas will be incorporated into the staff reports for the site parcels (i.e., 2457 Cass and 467-469, 481 Henry Street), and formally reviewed as part of those applications

\*specifically, drawings 4A101, 4A102 (floor/roof plans) and 4A401, 4A401.1, 4A402, 4A402.1 (elevations)

#### **ACTION**

Commissioner Miriani moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6984 for 439 Henry and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings will include the identification of specific standards concerning repair and/or replacement of deteriorated character-defining features, and related standards concerning the qualifications of historic preservation contractors retained to perform the work.
- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings to specifically include review of specifications/cut sheets for lighting, windows, doors, ADA lifts, signage, paint removal, color choice, and other exterior elements not yet finalized, with staff authority to approve if per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the district's Elements of Design, and otherwise consistent with Commission intent and guidelines
- The historic name of the building, set in stone above the entryway, be preserved and remain visible.
- The historic double entry doors at the main entrance be preserved.

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6985** 

**ADDRESS: 427 HENRY** 

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** CASS-HENRY

APPLICANT: BRIAN REBAIN, KRAEMER DESIGN GROUP, LLC and MIKE KIRK, NEUMANN/SMITH

ARCHITECTURE

OWNER: CASS VILLAGE APARTMENTS, LLC/OLYMPIA DEVELOPMENT OF MICHIGAN, LLC

**SCOPE OF WORK:** REHABILITATE APARTMENT BUILDING

#### **PROPOSAL**

The proposed scope of work required to rehabilitate the exterior of the building is depicted in the attached schematic drawings\* for this Body's review and, per the applicant, specifically includes: **Brick and stone** 

- Inspected for damage
- Brown paint to be removed (process not provided)
- Masonry cleaned with a light duty detergent and low pressure water rinse
- Brick and stone will be repointed, and loose or displaced units will be reset
- Repointed mortar will match the color, texture, compressive strength, joint width, and joint profile of the existing historic mortar
- Damaged brick and stone will be repaired as necessary
- Any units too badly deteriorated to repair will be replaced, with salvaged brick to be reused where replacements are needed before new units are used
- If new units are necessary, they will be selected to match the existing in size, profile, color, and finish Rear balconies/fire escape
- Balcony structure rebuilt in each end bay, with steel structure and a composite decking surface Cornice
- A new cornice made of GFRP or fiberglass, supported by paired brackets and based upon the existing cornices on 439 and 489 Henry, as referenced in (revised) drawing 5A401 received 11-25-20

### Main entrance and doors

- Remove existing concrete masonry units (CMU) and rudimentary plywood door
- Install a new glazed panel door compatible with the historic nature of the building (color TBD) (material not provided)
- Create a defined entrance area in front of the door with new concrete porch, and a raised concrete curb to enclose ornamental trees and plants

- New glazed panel doors at balconies installed within existing frames
- ADA lift to be installed at grade in between the balconies on the south (rear) façade to provide access to the first floor porches

### Windows

- New historic replica aluminum-clad wood windows throughout: Marvin Ultimate Double Hung G2 per attached data sheet (color TBD)
- On the north (primary) façade, two 1/1 windows will replace the existing (non-historic) 1/1 windows in the center bay. At the two end bays, 6/1 windows will be installed at the first and third floors. The bay windows will receive new 8/1 and 6/1 windows, some of them replacing historic-age windows.
- The existing fixed historic-age wood windows flanking the entrance (with diagonal wood muntins) will be replaced with units that match existing profiles and sight lines.
- At the west (alley) elevation, the bay window structure will be reclad with new wood (and first floor reconstructed) with the existing sightlines and applied wood trim maintained or rebuilt if too deteriorated. 6/1 windows will be installed at the bays
- Remaining openings at secondary elevations (east, west and south) will receive 1/1 single hung units Basement windows will be fixed pane aluminum-clad wood units with no dividing mullion

### Lighting

- Exterior building lighting will be provided and designed to highlight building features 9
- Lighting locations may include up-lights on the east façade (presumably north?) and wall-mounted fixtures flanking the entrance

## Signage

- Future signage is proposed to be reinstated on the building at the entrance (exact location TBD)
- Final signage drawings (including size, color, and design) will be submitted for staff approval before installation Roof, rooftop mechanicals, and penthouses
- Current poor condition membrane roof to be removed and replaced with a new EPDM roof
- Small condensers will be added to the center and western side of the roof with painted metal panel mechanical screens to obscure the condensers
- Existing rooftop penthouses will be rehabilitated and retained

# Landscaping/Site

• Proposed landscaping and site interventions for all buildings and areas will be incorporated into the staff reports for the site parcels (i.e., 2457 Cass and 467-469, 481 Henry Street), and formally reviewed as part of those applications

\*specifically, drawings 5A101 (floor/roof plans), 5A401, 5A401.1 (elevations), 5A421 (window details) Additional photographs, renderings, presentation materials, and narrative provided by the applicant in support of this application is appended to this report and posted on the public website for the meeting.

### **ACTION**

### Commissioner Miriani moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6985 for 427 Henry and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings will include the identification of specific standards concerning repair and/or replacement of deteriorated character-defining features, and related standards concerning the qualifications of historic preservation contractors retained to perform the work.
- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings to specifically include review of specifications/cut sheets for lighting, windows, doors, ADA lifts, signage, and other exterior elements/color selections not yet finalized, with staff authority to approve if per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the district's Elements of Design, and otherwise consistent with Commission intent and guidelines.

• The historic name of the building, set in stone above the entryway, be preserved and remain visible.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6986** 

**ADDRESS: 2467 CASS** 

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** CASS-HENRY

APPLICANT: BRIAN REBAIN, KRAEMER DESIGN GROUP, LLC and MIKE KIRK, NEUMANN/SMITH

ARCHITECTURE

OWNER: CASS VILLAGE APARTMENTS, LLC/OLYMPIA DEVELOPMENT OF MICHIGAN, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: REHABILITATE APARTMENT BUILDING

### **PROPOSAL**

The proposed scope of work required to rehabilitate the exterior of the building is depicted in the attached schematic drawings\* for this Body's review and, per the applicant, specifically includes:

#### **Brick and stone**

- Inspected for damage
- Brown paint to be removed
- Masonry cleaned with a light duty detergent and low pressure water rinse
- Brick and stone will be repointed, and loose or displaced units will be reset
- Repointed mortar will match the color, texture, compressive strength, joint width, and joint profile of the existing historic mortar Damaged brick and stone will be repaired as necessary
- Any units too badly deteriorated to repair will be replaced, with salvaged brick to be reused where replacements are needed before new units are used
- If new units are necessary, they will be selected to match the existing in size, profile, color, and finish

## Metal cornice, metal bay window hoods, and pressed metal spandrels

- All pressed tin metal work will be retained and repaired and repainted (color TBD)
- If any tin work is too damaged to repair, new compatible metal will be used and will be painted to match the adjacent historic material

## Main entrance and doors

- Remove existing concrete masonry units (CMU)
- Install a new glazed panel door compatible with the historic nature of the building (color TBD)
- New glazed panel doors at balconies
- ADA lift and new entrance door installed in the eastern-most inlet on the north (Henry Street) façade of the building

### Windows

- New historic replica aluminum-clad wood windows throughout: Marvin Ultimate Double Hung G2 per attached data sheet (no extant historic windows, color TBD)
- On east and north (primary, Cass and Henry) facades, 8/1 and 6/1 multiple-light windows to be used in the bay windows
- At east (Cass) façade, all window openings with exception of 8/1 windows in bays will receive 6/1 windows
- Basement windows will be 1/1 single hung units
- On the north (Henry) façade, excepting the bays described above, remainder of windows to be 1/1
- Secondary facades (east and south) will receive 1/1 single hung units

## Lighting

- Exterior building lighting will be provided and designed to highlight building features
- Lighting locations may include up-lights on the west (Cass) façade and wall-mounted fixtures flanking the entrance

### Signage

- Future signage is proposed to be reinstated in the same location as the stone-inscribed "ATLANTA" above the main entry door
- Final signage drawings (including size, color, and design) will be submitted for staff approval before installation 9 Roof, rooftop mechanicals, and penthouses
- Current poor condition membrane roof to be removed and replaced with a new EPDM roof
- Small condensers will be added to the center and western side of the roof with painted metal panel mechanical screens to obscure the condensers
- Existing rooftop penthouses will be rehabilitated and retained

# Landscaping/Site

• Proposed landscaping and site interventions for all buildings and areas will be incorporated into the staff reports for the site parcels (i.e., 2457 Cass and 467-469, 481 Henry Street), and formally reviewed as part of those applications

\*specifically, drawings 6A101, 6A102 (floor/roof plans) and 6A401, 6A401.1 (elevations)

### **ACTION**

Commissioner Franklin moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6986 for 2467 Cass and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings will include the identification of specific standards concerning repair and/or replacement of deteriorated character-defining features, and related standards concerning the qualifications of historic preservation contractors retained to perform the work.
- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings to specifically include review of specifications/cut sheets for lighting, windows, doors, ADA lifts, signage, paint removal, paint color, and other exterior elements/selections not yet finalized, with staff authority to approve if per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the district's Elements of Design, and otherwise consistent with Commission intent and guidelines.
- The proposed design for 8/1 and 6/1 windows may be replaced by 1/1 windows at the architect's discretion, subject to staff review.
- The historic name of the building, set in stone above the entryway, be preserved and remain visible.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

MOTION CARRIED

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6987** 

**ADDRESS:** 2447 CASS

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** CASS-HENRY

APPLICANT: BRIAN REBAIN, KRAEMER DESIGN GROUP, LLC and MIKE KIRK, NEUMANN/SMITH

ARCHITECTURE

OWNER: CASS VILLAGE APARTMENTS, LLC/OLYMPIA DEVELOPMENT OF MICHIGAN, LLC

SCOPE OF WORK: REHABILITATE APARTMENT BUILDING

## **PROPOSAL**

The proposed scope of work required to rehabilitate the exterior of the building is depicted in the attached schematic drawings\* for this Body's review and, per the applicant, specifically includes: **Brick and stone** 

- Inspected for damage
- Brown paint to be removed (process not provided)
- Masonry cleaned with a light duty detergent and low pressure water rinse

- Brick and stone will be repointed, and loose or displaced units will be reset
- Repointed mortar will match the color, texture, compressive strength, joint width, and joint profile of the existing historic mortar
- Damaged brick and stone will be repaired as necessary
- Any units too badly deteriorated to repair will be replaced, with salvaged brick to be reused where replacements are needed before new units are used
- If new units are necessary, they will be selected to match the existing in size, profile, color, and finish

### Main entrance and doors

- Remove existing concrete masonry units (CMU)
- Install a new glazed wood double door compatible with the historic nature of the building (color TBD)
- New solid doors in the west elevation at the fire escape (material/design TBD)
- ADA lift to be installed on the back of the building to access the first floor fire escape to provide ADA access to the first floor units

### Windows

- New historic replica aluminum-clad wood windows throughout: Marvin Ultimate Double Hung G2 per attached data sheet (no extant historic windows, dark color TBD)
- On primary (east) façade, first floor, windows will be 2/1 except the two windows flanking the entrance which will be further researched to determine their design
- On primary (east) façade, upper floors, windows will be 6/1 on the outer bay window openings and in the two central bays of the building. The center bay window openings will have 8/1 units.
- 1/1 single hung units will be used on the remaining windows

## Fire Escape and ADA Lift

• Wood components of existing fire escape to be removed and replaced with new composite wood material. Connections to the building repaired as necessary to ensure structural stability

### Lighting

- Exterior building lighting will be provided and designed to highlight building features
- Lighting locations may include up-lights or soffit fixture on the west (Cass) façade

#### Signage

- Future signage is proposed to be reinstated on either a ground sign or an appropriate location on the front façade. (not specified) Roof, rooftop mechanicals, and penthouses
- Current EPDM roof to be removed and replaced with a new EPDM roof
- Small condensers will be added to the center and western side of the roof with painted metal panel mechanical screens to obscure the condensers 8
- Small skylight in center of roof to be removed and replaced with a contemporary low-profile skylight structure **Landscaping/Site**
- Proposed landscaping and site interventions for all buildings and areas will be incorporated into the staff reports for the site parcels (i.e., 2457 Cass and 467-469, 481 Henry Street), and formally reviewed as part of those applications
- \*specifically, drawings 7A101 (floor/roof plans) and 7A401, 7A401.1 (elevations) Additional photographs, renderings, presentation materials, and narrative provided by the applicant in support of this application is appended to this report and posted on the public website for the meeting

### **ACTION**

### Commissioner Hamilton moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6987 for 2447 Cass and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work items WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings will include the identification of specific standards concerning repair and/or replacement of deteriorated character-defining features, and related standards concerning the qualifications of historic preservation contractors retained to perform the work.
- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings to specifically include review of specifications/cut sheets for lighting, windows, doors, ADA lifts, signage, paint removal, paint colors, and other exterior elements/selections not yet finalized, with staff authority to approve if per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the district's Elements of Design, and otherwise consistent with Commission intent and guidelines.

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

**APPLICATION NUMBER:** 20-6980, 20-6978, 20-6979, and portions of 20-6987, 20-6986, 20-6985, 20-6984, 20-6983, and 20-6981

**ADDRESS:** 2457 Cass (vacant lot); 467-469, 481 Henry (parking lots); Outdoor Areas of 2447 Cass, 2467 Cass, 427 Henry, 439 Henry, 447 Henry, 459 Henry & 489 Henry (parcels with buildings); and Public Alleys/Sidewalks/Rights-of-Way to include the entire historic district

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** CASS-HENRY

**APPLICANT:** BRIAN REBAIN, KRAEMER DESIGN GROUP, LLC and MIKE KIRK, NEUMANN/SMITH ARCHITECTURE

**OWNER:** SORIN ENTERPRISES, LLC/CASS HENRY VILLAGE APARTMENTS, LLC/OLYMPIA DEVELOPMENT OF MICHIGAN, LLC/CITY OF DETROIT (FOR PUBLIC ALLEYS/SIDEWALKS/ROW)

**SCOPE OF WORK:** DISTRICT-WIDE SITE IMPROVEMENTS INCLUDING PARKING LOTS, OUTDOOR SPACES, STREET FURNITURE, LIGHTING, LANDSCAPING, TREE-PLANTING, PAVING, RESURFACING, FENCING, AND PLAYGROUND EQUIPMENT

### **PROPOSAL**

The proposed scope of work for the district-wide site improvements is depicted in the attached schematic site drawings\* for this Body's review and, per the applicant, specifically includes:

- The streetscape on Henry Street will be redesigned to eliminate most of the curb cuts, as access to the parking area will be relocated to the alley
- Existing parking lots at 467-469 Henry and 481 Henry will be redesigned with a wide landscape buffer to shield the occupants of 489 Henry (Berwin) and 459 Henry (Claridge) from noise and headlight glare
- Per the landscape plan L101, twelve Honey Locust trees, six at each side, will frame the parking lot. Ground surface treatment in this landscape buffer is not specified
- A tot lot [playground with equipment] will be added to the area directly adjacent to the parking lot and 459 Henry (Claridge)
- The sidewalk along the southern side of Henry Street will be retained, a wide greenbelt will be planted, and a decorative hardscape and patterned concrete will be used directly in front of 447 Henry for the anticipated retail/dining tenant.
- At each residential building, a forecourt will be created by construction of a 12" concrete planter curb with ornamental plantings found within the forecourt
- For the buildings along Cass Avenue (2447 and 2467 Cass) and 18" aluminum garden fence will be placed in front of each building.
- The landscaping in front of each building will have a slightly different arrangement of landscaping and trees to provide greenery and visual interest to the buildings

# North-south alley between Bretton Hall (439 Henry) and The Henry (427 Henry)

• The north-south alley between 439 Henry (Bretton Hall) and 427 Henry (The Henry) will be recreated into additional outdoor gathering spaces as well as parking for residents.

- The northern end of the alley will become a seating area with a granite chip [decomposed granite, or DG] surface; it will be surrounded by plantings [yew shrubs] and accessed through an aluminum fence and gate [6' high, see landscape details sheet L201], set back from Henry Street
- Per the landscape plan L101, a wide east-west sidewalk ending in a bike rack alongside Bretton Hall intersects at this point
- A short row of three (3) small 'Kindred Spirit' Oaks are planted adjacent to the sidewalk, followed by a bed of pachysandra at the northwest corner of the parking lot adjacent to the electrical infrastructure
- The southern end of the alley will form a portion of a surface parking lot with 15 parking spaces [overlapping onto private property at the rear of 2447 and 2457 Cass]. Drive aisle will be accessed from West Fisher Service Drive.
- New concrete paving will be installed along the parking lot and provide access to 2447 Cass, 2467 Cass, 427 Henry, and 439 Henry. The concrete paving will also extend between 427 Henry and 2467 Cass. This area will have lawn furniture and will also be accessible via an aluminum fence and gate facing Henry Street.

### East-west alley south of 439 Henry, 447 Henry, 459 Henry, and 489 Henry

- Alley to be repaved with asphalt
- Alley to remain accessible to vehicular traffic and barrier free entry to 439 Henry
- A consolidated site refuse enclosure will be located along this alley and will be screened from the West Fisher Service Drive with both plantings and a masonry screen wall. [outside of historic district] Along the service drive a staggered 6' tall ornamental aluminum fence will be built just south of 2447 Cass Avenue and the open green space south of 427 Henry to provide privacy from the service drive [outside of historic district] 11

## 2457 Cass (current vacant lot between 2447 Cass and 2467 Cass)

- A public/private gathering space will be created with ornamental plantings [framed by an allee of ten (10) Gingko trees extending west for the full depth of the adjacent buildings] and lawn furniture located closer to Cass Avenue, while a larger outdoor park for residents will be nestled further into the site, between the buildings, and will be accessed by an aluminum fence and gate off Cass Avenue
- Per the landscape plan L101, the entryway to the public gathering space will be flanked by historic reproduction light poles (cut sheets provided)
- The public gathering space has an unspecified ground surface flanking the central walk, and will be symmetrically framed with perimeter yews and holly
- The residents' park includes a sidewalk along the two rows of Gingko trees and an unspecified ground surface in the center. The park terminates at its west end with a row of three (3) 'Kindred Spirit' oaks

### 427 Henry

- Per the landscape plan L101, a sidewalk running north-south will be established immediately west of the residents' park discussed above. The southern half of this sidewalk services the 15-space parking area, while the northern extension traverses the interstitial space between 2467 Cass and 427 Henry and connects with the public sidewalk at the Henry via a 6' ornamental fence/gate.
- Immediately behind 427 Henry, a quartet of Eastern Redbud trees will frame the sidewalk approach to the ADA porch lift

# Fronts of buildings: Cass Avenue

- At 2447 Cass (Hotel Ansonia), two crabapple trees will flank the entry approach, set in beds of pachysandra surrounded by holly and yew shrubs. The composition is symmetrical across the entry.
- At 2467 Cass (Atlanta Apartments), the planting bed behind the above-mentioned 18" garden fence will feature a row of lilac shrubs arranged symmetrically about the entrance
- Towards the corner with Henry, additional shrubs are integrated into the composition

### **Fronts of building: Henry Street**

A row of sugar maples is proposed for the street trees. Status of existing trees, some quite large, is unclear.

- At 2467 Cass, a formal planting area with a perimeter of inkberry and Oakleaf hydrangea, with crabapple trees at either end, enclosing a lawn bisected by a sidewalk to access the ADA lift
- At 427 Henry, a similarly formal composition of hornbeams flanking the approach, with a perimeter of weigela shrubs
- At Bretton Hall (439 Henry), flanking Dogwood trees are juxtaposed with an azalea border behind At 447 Henry, scored concrete paving with paver inlay and border

- At Claridge Apartments (459 Henry) flanking Dogwood trees set in pachysandra, with inkberry borders
- At the landscape buffer in front of the parking area (467-469 Henry, 481 Henry), a double row of Tuliptrees with symmetrically arranged inkberry shrubs forming perimeter borders flanking sidewalks accessing the area
- At Berwin Apartments (489 Henry), flanking crabapple trees with a symmetrical yew perimeter and a border of hydrangea Historic reproduction light poles ("acorn lamps") in public and private areas throughout the district, per the landscape/site plan 12

### **PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Public Comment made.

#### **ACTION**

# Section 21-2-5, Effects of projects on districts

Commissioner Hamilton moved:

The Commission finds that the proposed site improvements to public areas in and adjacent to the Cass-Henry Historic District, including public alleys and sidewalks, will have a demonstrable effect on the Cass-Henry Historic District, and that such demonstrable effect is likely to be beneficial.

The determination of the Commission shall be reported to the Mayor and City Council for their consideration Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Ayes - 6 Nay - 0

### MOTION CARRIED

# Section 21-2-73, Certificate of Appropriateness

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope for the site improvements and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:

- Staff review of the submitted construction drawings to specifically include review of specifications/cut sheets for lighting, signage, plantings, other exterior elements/selections not yet finalized, with staff authority to approve if per the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the district's Elements of Design, and otherwise consistent with Commission intent and guidelines.
- Trees with diameter larger than 6" DBH at the front (street side) of the various buildings (including street trees) to be retained and incorporated into the landscape plan. Staff authority for removal of diseased trees, per established procedures requiring the inspection of an arborist, is continued.
- The brick alley pavers will be salvaged and repurposed on the site.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes - 6 Nay - 0 **MOTION CARRIED** 

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6971** 

**ADDRESS: 22 EDISON** 

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** BOSTON EDISON

**APPLICANT:** JACK RAAB **OWNER:** JACK RAAB

**SCOPE OF WORK:** ERECT A NEW FENCE

**PROPOSAL** 

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to erect a new 3' high "wrought iron" – style aluminum fence at the front and side (west) property lines per the attached drawings and application. Included in the proposal are the following scope items:

- At the south (front) and west (side), install 3' high aluminum fencing of a "wrought-iron" design to match the fence along the east (side Woodward) property line which was already approved by HDC staff in November 2020 but has not yet been installed.
- Fencing will include a 6' wide double swing arched front entrance gate located at the south (front) walkway off Edison Street.

#### **ACTION**

Commissioner Franklin moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of **Application #20-6971 for 22 Edison**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a DENIAL for the proposed work.

The Commission's reasons for denial is that the proposed work fails to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Commissioner Hamilton - SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

That a Notice to Proceed be issued for Application #20-6971 at 22 Edison based on Condition #1.

Commissioner McCall – SUPPORT

Ayes – 2 Nay – 0 Miriani, Hamilton Abstain – Alease Johnson, Franklin

MOTION DOES NOT CARRY

Commissioner Miriani moved:

The commission issue a Notice to Proceed, under Reason #1, with the following conditions:

- Iron fence be replaced with shrubbery, type of which approved by staff
- Applicant be allowed to install a gate in-between, and in line with, the two hedges (where the walkway leads up to the house).
- The face of the shrubbery (not the base of the plants) shall be set back 6 8" from the sidewalk; the hedge shall be maintained at 36-inch height.

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Aves -6 Nay -0

MOTION CARRIED

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6970** 

ADDRESS: 8122 KERCHEVAL (8116 KERCHEVAL)

**HISTORIC DISTRICT:** WEST VILLAGE

APPLICANT: DONNA HOLKE, INNERCITY NEON/CARL GIORDANO, MUMMA MARIA'S HOUSE

OWNER: KERCHEVAL 3 LLC SCOPE OF WORK: NEON SIGN

**PROPOSAL** 

The applicant is currently proposing to install a 26" x 30" clear acrylic panel neon sign (neon color: red). It is proposed to be placed in the upper sash of the center bay window.

### **ACTION**

### APPROVED VIA CONSENT AGENDA

### XI OLD BUSINESS

**318 Edmund Place – Brush Park HD** – Revision to previously-approved application, install metal siding at secondary elevations.

### Commissioner Miriani moved:

Having duly reviewed complete proposed scope of **318 Edmund Place**, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed scope of work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore issues a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for the proposed work.

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

## XII NEW BUSINESS

2021 HDC Regular Meeting Schedule

Commissioner Franklin moved to approve the 2021 meeting schedule.

Commissioner Miriani – SUPPORT

Aves -6 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

# **ADJOURNMENT**

Commissioner Miriani motioned to adjourn the meeting at 11:40 p.m.

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes -6 Nay -0

**MOTION CARRIED** 

**MEETING ADJOURNED**