

**DETROIT HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING**

**Date: November 12, 2020**

**Due to COVID-19 restrictions, this meeting was held electronically via Zoom Meeting Link**

**I CALL TO ORDER**

Commissioner McCall called the meeting to order at 5:33 p.m.

**II ROLL CALL**

	ABSENT	PRESENT		ABSENT	PRESENT
Jessica McCall, Chair ...		X	Richard Hosey		X
Katie Johnson, Vice-Chair		X	Alease Johnson	.....	X
Tiffany Franklin		X*	Dennis Miriani	.....X	
Jim Hamilton		X	.....		
Staff					
Brendan Cagney, PDD		X	Taylor Leonard, Law Dept.		X
Audra Dye, PDD		X	Pamela Parrish, Law Dept.		X
Garrick Landsberg, PDD		X	Logan Patmon, Law Dept.		X
Ann Phillips, PDD		X	Jennifer Reinhardt, HDAB	X	
Jennifer Ross, PDD		X	Rebecca Savage, HDAB		X

*\*Commissioner Franklin joined the meeting at 7:05 (2254 Atkinson), but did not join with audio until 7:51(14621 Warwick).*

**III APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

Commissioner Hosey made a motion to APPROVE the agenda.

Commissioner Alease Johnson - SUPPORT

Ayes – 4      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**IV APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES**

Commissioner Hamilton made a motion to table the review and approve the October 14<sup>th</sup> meeting minutes until the next meeting.

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 4      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**V REPORTS**

Mr. Landsberg said he would defer reports to the end of the meeting.

**VI APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AGENDA**

None

**VII POSTPONED APPLICATION**

None

**VIII EFFECTS OF CITY OR CITY-ASSISTED PROJECTS (ADVISORY DETERMINATIONS)**

None

**IX APPLICATIONS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6300**

**ADDRESS: 2221 WABASH**

DRAFT

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: CORKTOWN**

**APPLICANT: TIMOTHY FLINTOFF, JR., 4545 ARCHITECTURE**

**OWNER: ZIEGER PROPERTIES, LLC**

**SCOPE OF WORK: REVISION OF PREVIOUSLY APPROVED APPLICATION; DEMOLISH AND REBUILD HOUSE, REPRODUCING HISTORIC FRONT FAÇADE**

**PROPOSAL**

The applicant proposes a new scope of work, as per below:

Demolition Work:

- Demolish existing Structure complete; including foundations
- Remove existing fence and site debris
- Remove existing rear deck and concrete pads in rear of property

New Construction of Single Family residence

- New electrical service and wiring in house complete\*
- New interior finishes: including kitchen and two bathrooms \*
- New hot water heater\*
- New plumbing/sanitary complete from incoming services\*
- New HVAC forced air system with central air\*
- New 2x6 wood construction with R-38 in ceiling and R-19 in walls and new Tyvek house wrap\*
- New Standing seam metal roof
- New Shingle roof part of structure as indicated on plans
- New windows: Pella wood clad double hung windows
- New brick and ship lap siding • New gutters and down spouts

Site:

- New wood fence in rear and sides of property
- New landscape area and planter beds in front of property
- Replace sod as required due to construction damage
- New concrete walkway from front on house to rear of property

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Public comment was given.

**COMMISSIONER COMMENT:**

- Commissioner Katie Johnson said the staff report states demolition, but the demolition drawings indicate remove and salvage siding for reuse, remove support posts for reinstallation, etc., but then the elevation drawings don't show these notes for install. She asked the applicant for clarification on whether these items will be reused.
  - *Mr. Flintoff's reply: They are committed that the front façade finishes, siding/trim work/detailing that provides historic character and expression, will be salvaged and reinstalled. He said HDC staff had suggested the front façade remain in erect during construction. However, the bones of the front façade are part of the elements that need to be replaced. They would like to reframe the front façade and reinstall the historic materials to the frame. But their question is what is the value of the existing structural elements remaining in place if they are to be replaced and recovered by the finish materials. He continued to say the siding is the best part of the house.*
- Commissioner Hosey expressed concern over the continued creep of the scope of work, and how it may continue to change in the field during construction after the house was taken apart.
  - *Mr. Flintoff: There was a tenant in the property until this past June, so not a lot of exploratory demo was completed prior to the construction process. The deterioration is more substantial than you typically find and was unexpected. The foundation system is a pier and beam system, but the piers are simple 8" deep stones set in the ground 4-6", not below a frost line.*

**DRAFT**

- Commissioner Katie Johnson stated the Standards are very clear; you retain historic materials as much as possible and if they need to be replaced, they be replaced in-kind. She would like the proposal that does that to the greatest extent possible.

**ACTION**

Commissioner Hosey moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6300 for 2221 Wabash, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore DOES NOT ISSUE a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is DENIED for the project as proposed as it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

*(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

*(3) Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.*

*(5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*

*(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

Mr. Landsberg reminded the Commissioners that their actions tonight do not override the previous approval, and an issued permit last year.

**APPLICATION NUMBER: #20-6933**

**ADDRESS: 1335 VINEWOOD**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: HUBBARD FARMS**

**APPLICANT: DEVON CALDWELL, LOUISA HOWARD**

**OWNERS: DEVON CALDWELL**

**SCOPE OF WORK: DEMOLISH EXISTING REAR PORCH; REHABILITATE AND CONSTRUCT AN ADDITION AT THE EXISTING TWO-STORY REAR WING; CONSTRUCT NEW ROOF DORMER AT REAR ELEVATION; RESTORE AND REPAINT WOOD WINDOWS AND TRIM ON ENTIRE HOUSE**

**PROPOSAL**

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to demolish the existing rear porch in its entirety, rehabilitate existing rear two-story wing including an addition at the north elevation spanning the width of the rear facade; construct new dormer at roof of rear elevation per the attached drawings and application. Included in the proposal are the following scope items:

- **General Exterior Modifications**
  - Remove existing rear entry door located under existing rear porch roof

**DRAFT**

- Relocate existing electrical equipment currently located at the rear façade adjacent to the existing two-story wing.
- Restore all existing windows and wood trim (including the repainting of the windows and trim)
- **Rear Porch**
  - Demolish existing rear porch in its entirety including columns, floor, roof, railing, foundation, stair
- **Two-Story Rear Wing Rehabilitation and Addition**
  - **Rehabilitation**
    - Remove all existing cladding down to the substrate and structural elements of the existing two-story wing. Roof structure is to remain.
    - At the second floor, remove and restore wood railing and reinstall at same location.
    - Remove, restore, and reinstall existing historic/original windows at second floor.
    - Modify the existing window opening at the north elevation to accommodate a new French door.
    - At the first floor, create 3 new window openings at the south elevation and 2 new window openings at the west elevation. The windows in the new openings are proposed to be (1) 4'-4" x 5'-0" aluminum clad wood windows (basis of design - Andersen 200/400 Series) to match the existing window style of the house (drawings note to use a painted wood window as an alternate) and (4) 1'-0" x 1'-4" fixed windows.
    - Install new composite panel cladding and trim to match detailing at bay window on south façade of existing house, paint finish.
    - Install thin masonry veneer on existing masonry foundation wall
  - **Addition (off north elevation of existing structure)**
    - Pour new concrete trench foundation directly adjacent to and aligned with foundation of existing two-story wing
    - Erect single-story enclosed addition off the north elevation of the existing two-story wing and spanning the width of the rear elevation of the existing house. An unenclosed and uncovered deck is proposed at the second story and is proposed to connect to the enclosed portion of the existing two-story wing by French doors. The deck will include a wood railing at the periphery of the addition. Railing design to match the railing design at the existing two-story wing.
    - A new rear entry is to be located at the far north end of the addition and will be accessed via a new wood-framed stair, small deck/porch, and railing.
    - Windows at the addition are proposed to be aluminum clad wood windows (basis of design - Andersen 200/400 Series) to match the existing window style of the house. Drawings note to use a painted wood window as an alternate.
- **Roof Dormer (located at rear elevation)**
  - Erect a new hipped roof attic dormer to match roof pitch, height, style, cladding material, fenestration and detailing of existing dormers.
  - The (3) proposed windows at the dormer are to aluminum clad wood windows (basis of design - Andersen 200/400 Series) to match the existing window style existing dormers.
- **Paint**
  - The existing two-story wing (with its proposed addition) and all other trim on the existing house are to be painted Grayish Olive Green (B:11). Accents as well as sash and storm are to be painted Yellowish White (C:4).
- **Site**
  - Demolish existing concrete walking path between the driveway and the existing rear porch steps
  - Pour new concrete walking path between driveway and new stairs leading up to first floor of the addition.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

No public comment was given.

DRAFT

**COMMISSIONER COMMENT:**

None.

**ACTION**

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6933 for 1135 Vinewood, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**IX CITY PROJECTS SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING**

None

**X APPLICATIONS NOT SUBJECT TO PUBLIC HEARING**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: #20-6947**

**ADDRESS: 2254 ATKINSON**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: ATKINSON AVENUE**

**APPLICANT: FARIS FAKHOURI (CITY OF DETROIT, HOUSING REVITALIZATION DEPARTMENT)**

**PROPERTY OWNER: TULIKA SHANT**

**SCOPE OF WORK: REPLACE ORIGINAL WINDOWS (UNITS ARE WOOD 1/1 AND WOOD WITH LEAD CAMING/MUNTINS) WITH NEW WINDOWS**

**PROPOSAL**

The applicant represents the City of Detroit, housing Revitalization Department and is proposing to the replace all of the historic windows at the home and garage under the City's Lead Remediation Program. Specifically, the applicant submitted the application to HDC staff in late October 2020. At that time, they revealed that they were seeking to replace the windows due to their lead content and that the windows were in poor condition. They further stated that an emergency situation existed at the home as one child was suffering from an extremely high level of lead poisoning to the extent that he was hospitalized and the family had to vacate the home. The child had been diagnosed with a high level of lead poisoning in early 2020 and the case had been referred to the City by the Detroit Health Department. However, the City was unable to address the case until the current time due to the COVID 19 pandemic. Please see the submitted documents which outline the project's history and lead testing results. The applicant has further stated that they did research the possibility of repair, but that the local contractors which have experience repairing such windows are booked well into the next couple of months, which poses an issue to the residents as they cannot move back to their property until the high lead levels at the home are abated. Also, it appears that the project's contractor has already purchased the new windows.

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking this body's approval to replace the all of the existing historic-age window sash (wood sash with lead coming/muntins and wood sash) at the home and garage with new wood-sash windows as per the following:

- Remove the existing original sash at the house and garage, to include 15/15, wood-sash units with wood trim and lead coming/muntins; 9-lite, wood casement windows with wood trim and lead coming/muntins; 1/1 wood sash units with wood trim; 18/18, wood-sash units with wood trim and lead coming/muntins; and 12 lite fixed windows with wood trim and lead coming/muntins.

**DRAFT**

- Retain the existing historic trim/brick mould; scrape and paint
- Install new wood, double-hung sash which will be clad with aluminum that will be finished a white color at the exterior. The new sash will be 1/1, 20/20, and 12/12 double-hung units. All muntins will be applied to the exterior surface of the glass/simulated divided lites.

**ACTION**

Commissioner Hosey moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6947 for 2254 Atkinson, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore DOES NOT ISSUE a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is DENIED for the project as proposed as it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standard:

*2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

Commissioner Hosey moved:

The Commission issue a Notice to Proceed for Application #20-6947 under Condition #1:

*1. The resource constitutes a hazard to the safety of the public or the occupants.*

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: #20-6858**

**ADDRESS: 500 TEMPLE**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: CASS PARK**

**APPLICANT: GREG MORGAN, PHILLIPS SIGN & LIGHTING**

**PROPERTY OWNER: MASONIC TEMPLE**

**SCOPE OF WORK: REPLACE AND SLIGHTLY MODIFY SIGNAGE AT (3) EXISTING LOCATIONS**

**PROPOSAL**

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to replace and slightly modify signage at (3) existing locations per the attached drawings and application. Included in the proposal are the following scope items:

- **Sign #1-B – “RECEIVING” Sign** (SGN2020-00425)
  - This sign was issued a sign permit without HDC review on 9/20/2020. Since a permit has already been issued, HDC review at this time is unnecessary. It was included in this package for reference so the Commission can understand the full signage scheme of this package.
- **Sign #2-B – “STAGE DOOR” Sign**
  - Remove existing sign in its entirety and replace with a new sign of approximately the same size (12”H x 76”W) mounted into the existing masonry in the same location. Sign details:
    - Aluminum sign pan (color/finish: bright clear anodized) that is 1½” deep
    - Vinyl Graphics (color/finish: Gloss Black)
- **Sign #3-B – “WELCOME TO THE MASONIC TEMPLE” Sign**

**DRAFT**

- The existing sign at this location is painted directly on the masonry. The existing paint is failing and spalling off of the brick.
- The proposed sign will be mounted into the existing masonry over the existing painted sign. The proposed sign is approximately the same size as the existing (40”H x 24’ – 4”W). Sign details:
  - Aluminum media frame
  - Sign will be digitally printed on flex media (color/finish: PMS Process Blue, Black)
  - Non-illuminated
- **Sign #4 – “THE MASONIC TEMPLE” Rear Entrance Sign**
  - The existing signage at this location includes an existing marquee/box sign which is internally illuminated. There is no other existing signage at this location. This sign requires review by the Commission as it does not meet the Historic District Commission’s Sign & Awning Guidelines – specifically the lighting method of internal illumination and the 3/8” depth of the proposed metal letters (Guidelines list a minimum of ½” deep metal dimensional letters).
  - The proposed signage is to include the reuse of the existing box sign cabinet. Sign details:
    - Reuse existing cabinet and retainers of the exiting box sign
    - Removing the existing acrylic marquee panel and replace with a new acrylic face with a digitally printed graphic of the Masonic Temple with a protective overlaminated.
    - The sign will be internally illuminate with L.E.D.s.
  - Additionally, above the existing box sign, the applicant is proposing to install the following:
    - 3/8” deep flat cut metal letters with stand off and stud mounted.
    - The letters will read “The Masonic Temple.” (See rendering attached)

**ACTION**

Commissioner Alease Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6858 for 500 Temple, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following condition:*

- The existing box sign above the rear entrance is to either be removed in its entirety or modified so that it is not internally lit.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: #20-6932**

**ADDRESS: 208 MACK**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: BRUSH PARK**

**APPLICANT: JEFF GAINES, ALBERT KAHN ASSOCIATES**

**PROPERTY OWNER: DETROIT URBAN LEAGUE**

**SCOPE OF WORK: REPLACE EXISTING LUDOWICI CLAY TILE WITH NEW LUDOWICI CLAY TILES OF DIFFERENT DIMENSIONS**

**PROPOSAL**

Submitted by the original architect’s firm, Albert Kahn Associates, the current proposal before the Commission involves wholesale replacement of the deteriorated and century-old tile roof, including replacement of downspouts and gutters “as existing conditions require”.

Per the applicant, the proposed scope of work (applicant words in italics) is:



DRAFT

### Roof and Gutter Replacement

- Miscellaneous repairs to roof frame/structure
- Flashing replacement/repairs
- Ice & weather shield underlayment membrane
- New clay tile roof tile system (appropriate for Michigan climate)
- Replace copper valleys
- Replace flat/low slope roofs
- Miscellaneous roof accessories
- Horizontal gutters
- Vertical down spouts
- Accessories/collector boxes

There is some ambiguity concerning the exact treatment of some of the above items, explored below under Issues.

### ACTION

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6832 for 208 Mack, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- The existing gutters, collector boxes, downspouts, connections, downspout brackets, and other character defining elements of the rain system be retained, or if beyond feasible repair in certain locations, be rebuilt with appropriate matching materials (not aluminum).
- The applicant work with HDC staff to identify an appropriate darker paint color for the gutters and vertical rain elements (downspouts, brackets, collector boxes).

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6928**

**ADDRESS: 19331 CANTERBURY**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: SHERWOOD FOREST**

**APPLICANT: HEATHER ANDREWS, POOL BUSTERS**

**PROPERTY OWNER: ANDREW STEIN**

**SCOPE OF WORK: REMOVE IN-GROUND POOL; INSTALL LANDSCAPING**

### PROPOSAL

The current owner purchased the house in June 2015 and has a consultant who compiled the following scope of work, in the consultant's words:

*At the above address, we are only doing a complete removal of the in ground pool and surrounding fence.*

*(The applicant states in a follow up phone call with HDC Staff that removal of the existing shed is also in this scope of work.)*

*We will be backfilling the pool with Class 2 sand. There are other contractors who will be doing work on this site and obtaining their own permits after our work is complete.*

See attached site plan drawing.



DRAFT

**Detailed Scope of Work**

**A. Demo: Inground Pool**

- Demolish inground, approximately 18' x 36' gunite pool
- Fill with class 2, compactible sand, level surface.
- No topsoil nor any ground cover seeding is included.

**B. Demo: Chain-link Fence**

- Remove 4' chain-link fence from perimeter of pool.

**C. Demo: Woodframe Shed**

- Remove woodframe shed

**ACTION**

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6928 for 19331 Canterbury and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following condition:*

- Topsoil and ground cover be installed within six months of this motion, if construction for new work is not underway.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

*Commissioner Franklin, while previously visually present at the meeting, joined with audio at this time.*

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6929**

**ADDRESS: 14621 WARWICK**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: ROSEDALE PARK**

**APPLICANT: ARIE BOURGEOIS, POWER HOME SOLAR**

**PROPERTY OWNER: JERMEELE WILSON**

**SCOPE OF WORK:**

**PROPOSAL**

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to install two new, multi-panel solar arrays at the building's east facing front roof and west facing rear roof. Specifically, the new installations are proposed as per the submitted documents and the following description:

- On the East facing / front elevation roof plane, install (10) ten, 320 BL, modular solar panels as proposed.
- On the West facing / rear elevation roof plane, install (10) ten, 320 BL, modular solar panels as proposed.
  - Each panel is described as 1000 x 1700 (assuming millimeters) or approximately 3.2' x 5.6'.
- Install service panel and power inverter at rear of home near existing utility meter

**ACTION**

Commissioner Franklin moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6929 for 14621 Warwick, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL NOT

**DRAFT**

BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore DOES NOT ISSUE a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is DENIED for the project as proposed as it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standard:

*2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

Commissioner Alease Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6930**

**ADDRESS: 4288 TYLER**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: RUSSELL WOODS**

**APPLICANT: VINCENT SHEFFIELD / PINE VALLEY CONSTRUCTION**

**PROPERTY OWNER: JERMEELE WILSON**

**SCOPE OF WORK: REPLACEMENT OF WOOD WINDOWS WITH VINYL WINDOWS, INSTALLATION OF SECURITY DOORS (WORK COMPLETED); GENERAL REHABILITATION**

### **PROPOSAL**

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's retroactive approval to install (28) vinyl windows on the sides and rear of the home along with other general rehabilitation work throughout the home has been completed. Additionally, the applicant seeks approval for the following additional work to be completed as proposed in the following scope of work:

#### **Work Completed without COA:**

- Remove old porch awning frame
- Remove vegetation from sides and rear of home
- Seal driveway to house bond with rubber sealant, both sides of house
- Remove (3) three non-historic front entry doors and replace with (3) three *Jeld-wen* steel entry doors & locksets
- Remove and replace (non-historic) 2nd floor front porch screen door (replacement not specified)
- Scrape, seal, paint 1st & 2nd floor front windows (6)
- Remove/replace wooden windows and install new vinyl windows (28)
- Install (2) steel security doors w/locks

#### **Proposed exterior work seeking COA:**

- Repair front porch steps
  - Remove all vegetation from steps, clean and prep steps
  - Apply concrete bonding agent, fill in and smooth all damaged areas with new concrete, mix to match existing
- Repair front porch wings & caps
  - Replace missing brick to match existing brick, use like color mortar to match existing mortar, match mortar joint thickness and depth, replace missing cement cap to match existing cap
- Remove/replace old fascia boards throughout, cover with aluminum trim
- Remove and replace existing gutter and downspout system throughout
- Remove and replace 2nd floor porch decking
  - Remove and replace existing roofing material with modified bitumen rubberized surface
    - Applied and sealed with torch
- Install aluminum trim window casing
- Install (6) aluminum storm windows to 1st & 2nd floor front windows
- Scrape, seal, paint attic windows front (3), trim wood casing in aluminum
- Install (3) aluminum storm windows attic windows

**DRAFT**

- Install handrails throughout, repair loose handrails –
  - Handrail not specified
- 2nd Floor Entry Door Trim to Close Properly (Drags Floor)

**ACTION**

**Replacement of (26) twenty-six wood windows with vinyl windows and the wrapping of fascia in aluminum trim:**

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6930 for 4288 Tyler, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore DOES NOT ISSUE a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is DENIED for the project as proposed as it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, specifically Standards:

2) *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

6) *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence:*

Commissioner Franklin – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved that:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6930 for 4288 Tyler and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work as stated under “Issues” within the staff report WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6931**

**ADDRESS: 2071 LONGFELLOW**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: BOSTON EDISON**

**APPLICANT: DELIA WELLS**

**OWNER: DELIA WELLS**

**SCOPE OF WORK: PAINT HOUSE AND GARAGE (WORK DONE WITHOUT PERMIT)**

**PROPOSAL**

The current owner purchased the house in July 1986 and has compiled the following scope of work, in the applicant’s words:

*I request to paint the property 2071 Longfellow Street, Detroit, MI 48206. I was made aware on Friday, October 9, 2020 that I need to request a permit to paint the exterior of the property. I would like to finish painting the exterior wood mainly black, and the concrete red. In the following pages below I detail where I propose the black and red paint be applied. I will note that part of the house*

**DRAFT**

was painted black years ago, however that paint job was not completed. The areas already painted black were part of the rear left side of the house where the kitchen and back porch are (1<sup>st</sup> floor only), the rear of the house (1<sup>st</sup> floor only), and part of the garage and garage doors.

In about approximately a three-week period from the middle of September to the first week of October, the left side (1<sup>st</sup> floor only) and the front of the house was painted black and red. The coming pages include pictures for your review that show the current appearance of the house. I have included both the black and red paint colors in my upload. These are both semi-gloss paint made by the company PPG. The black color is Onyx PPG1011-7 and the red color is Red Gumball PPG1187-7. For both the black Onyx and Red Gumball colors the code is the Ultra Deep Semi-Gloss, CodePPG73-540.

Specifically, the applicant seeks the Commission's approval of the following work items, which were completed without permit and/or COA:

**Detailed Scope of Work**

**A. General**

- a. All paints are proposed to be PPG's Ultra Deep Semi-Gloss (Code PPG73-540), in either of 3 colors: "red" (*Red Gumball PPG1187-7*), "black" (*Onyx PPG1011-7*) or white.
- b. Replace existing pendant porch light with black farmhouse pendant chandelier.
- c. The applicant provided images that show locations of the proposed work included in this report.

**B. Front Elevation – Paint**

- Elements that are planned or already painted red (*Red Gumball*) include the following:
  - Address numbers and eagle on the entrance pediment
  - Porch brick pillar cast stone bases and capstones
  - Cast planters
  - Cast-stone belt course on second floor
  - Window panels are planned to be repainted from red to white on the second story
  - Brick relief corners surrounding central windows on second floor
- Elements that are planned or already painted black (*Black Onyx*) include the following:
  - Entablature (Eave, Cornice, Frieze) of the porch, house, and dormer roofs
  - Entrance pediment
  - Window lintel, mullions, sills and panel trims
  - Window panels under the dormers are planned to be repainted from red to white
  - Porch wall capstone and ceiling
  - Front entrance steps and cheek walls
- Elements that are planned to be painted white, include the following:
  - Window panel interiors (currently painted red), shall be repainted white

**C. Side Elevations - Paint**

- Elements that are planned or already painted red (*Red Gumball*) include the following:
  - Cast-stone belt course on second floor
  - Chimney capstones at second floor
- Elements that are planned or already painted black (*Black Onyx*) include the following:
  - Entablature of the roof
  - Window lintel, mullions, and sills

**D. Rear Elevation - Paint**

- Elements that are planned or already painted red (*Red Gumball*) include the following:
  - Cast-stone belt course on second floor
  - Cast planters
- Elements that are planned or already painted black (*Black Onyx*) include the following:
  - Entablature of the roof
  - Back entrance trim, paneling and pilaster

DRAFT

- Window lintel, mullions, sills and trims
- Porch surface and steps
- Back entrance steps

**E. Garage - Paint**

- The garage was painted black years ago. Elements that are planned or already painted black (*Black Onyx*) include the following:
  - Entablature and soffit of the roof
  - Architrave trim and garage doors

**ACTION**

**Painting of masonry surfaces as well as painting with colors not within the identified color systems**

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6931 for 2071 Longfellow, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL NOT BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore DOES NOT ISSUE a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as proposed.

The Certificate of Appropriateness is DENIED for the project as proposed as it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically Standards:

- 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**Replacement of front porch light fixture; application of black paint at the porch ceiling/cornice; window trim; rear door trim; garage doors/trim/entablature/soffit.**

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6931 for 2071 Longfellow and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL BE APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- The cleaning/removal of paint from any painted masonry surface Cleaning of the painted masonry is to shall be done using the gentlest means possible. In areas where repointing is necessary, mortar should match existing historic mortar in color, texture, strength, and joint tooling as proposed. If replacement of masonry is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement masonry shall match the existing in material, size, color, and texture.
- The applicant shall provide HDC with the final paint specifications/proposal for the areas to be painted, cleaned of paint, replaced due to deterioration, or repointing as approved by the Commission via the issuance of this COA. Staff shall be afforded the opportunity to review and approve this submission prior to the issuance of the permit.

**DRAFT**

Commissioner Hamilton – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

Commissioner Hamilton moved to request BSEED to withhold enforcement at 2071 Longfellow until October 31, 2021.

Commissioner Katie Johnson – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**APPLICATION NUMBER: 20-6934**

**ADDRESS: 1773 PARKER**

**HISTORIC DISTRICT: WEST VILLAGE**

**APPLICANT: ELISE DECHARD, END STUDIO**

**OWNER: JENNIFER LYON**

**SCOPE OF WORK: REPLACE MASONRY FRONT PORCH AND CONSTRUCT WOOD FRONT PORCH; DEMOLISH REAR LANDING AND STAIRS (completed) AND ERECT NEW WOOD LANDING AND STAIRS; REMOVE INSUL BRICK SIDING (completed); PAINT EXTERIOR; REMOVE GLASS BLOCK AND VINYL WINDOWS AND INSTALL WOOD, EXTERIOR CLAD DOUBLE-HUNG WINDOWS**

**PROPOSAL**

Front Porch

Remove existing brick piers, porch decking, iron railings and columns, wood stairs and wood lattice. The rock face block was previously removed.

Retain existing roof, beams and fascia.

Erect new wood-framed porch with wood corner posts, perimeter railing, stairs and wood lattice skirt.

Back Porch

Demolish existing landing and stair (completed).

Erect small wood deck landing and stair.

Partial Window Replacement

Remove glass block and double-hung vinyl windows from rear porch openings.

Remove glass block and double-hung vinyl windows from side elevation bay window.

Install Pella, Architect Series, wood aluminum-clad double hung windows (one-over-one) within existing openings; color: White

Exterior Siding/Painting

Remove “Insulbrick” siding (completed)

Repair wood siding as needed

Paint exterior:

    Wood siding: A9 Moderate Reddish Brown

    Trim (incl. porch columns and railings) E4 Grayish Yellow Green

    Masonry Foundation: B:19 Black

**ACTION**

Commissioner Katie Johnson moved:

Having duly reviewed the complete proposed scope of Application #20-6934 for 1773 Parker, and having duly considered the appropriateness thereof pursuant to Chapter 21 Article II of the 2019 Detroit City Code, and MCL 399.205 of the Local Historic Districts Act, the Commission determined the proposed work WILL BE

**DRAFT**

APPROPRIATE according to the standards of review set forth in the state and local legislation, and therefore ISSUES a Certificate of Appropriateness for work as proposed.

*The Certificate of Appropriateness is issued with the following conditions:*

- The applicant shall provide the final paint specifications for the areas to be repainted for HDC staff review and approval prior to a permit be issued. Additionally, an alternative to the black color will be replaced with a more neutral color.
- The pressure-treated wood used on the rear porch landing and deck shall be left exposed for a minimum of six months prior to painting.
- The applicant will confirm the new windows will be field-painted to match the proposed color scheme.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**XI OLD BUSINESS**

Commissioner Franklin moved to waive the Commission’s three-day waiting period for Application #20-6947, 2254 Atkinson, with respect to the Notice to Proceed, allowing the applicant to move forward immediately.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 5      Nay – 1 – Commissioner Hamilton

**MOTION CARRIED**

**XII NEW BUSINESS**

None

**ADJOURNMENT**

Commissioner Franklin motioned to adjourn the meeting at 9:19 p.m.

Commissioner Hosey – SUPPORT

Ayes – 6      Nay – 0

**MOTION CARRIED**

**MEETING ADJOURNED**