

STAFF REPORT: 10-9-2019 MEETING
APPLICATION NUMBER: 19-6490
ADDRESS: 791 SEMINOLE
HISTORIC DISTRICT: INDIAN VILLAGE
APPLICANT: YURI DADO
DATE OF COMPLETE APPLICATION: 11/13/2019
DATE OF STAFF SITE VISIT: 12/4/2019

PREPARED BY: J. ROSS

SCOPE: INSTALL NEW WINDOWS

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The building located at 791 Seminole, sits at a prominent location, at the northeast corner of Seminole Street and E. Lafayette Street, within the Indian Village historic district. The 2 ½ story, Dutch Colonial Revival-style home displays a gambrel-roof main mass with a rear, lower intersecting gambrel-roof wing. Asphalt shingles were recently added to the roof surface. Decorative detailing includes dentils at the soffit, the fluted Ionic columns at the first-story front porch, and the Ionic pilasters at the second story story's brick mould. Exterior walls are primarily clad with stucco, although large portions of the stucco at the south, north, and west elevations have been removed and replaced with unpainted/unfished plywood/oriented strand board (OSB). Unpainted OSB is also visible at the fascia and soffit. Windows are currently wood, double-hung units with grids between the glass. Note that a number of the windows have been improperly installed/are smaller than their respective openings and plywood has been installed to enclose the gap. A hipped-roof garage with cedar-shake clad exterior wall is to the rear of the home.

791 Seminole, current conditions



PROPOSAL

In 9/2019, the applicant removed the majority of the original windows and replaced them with the current wood units without HDC approval and/or permit. With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the

following:

- Approval of the current wood windows (with the grids between the glass) which were installed in violation of the ordinance
- Commission approval to replace all remaining wood windows with the proposed new wood window (with the grids between the glass)
- Commission approval to install new wood windows (with the grids between the glass) in openings where window currently do not exist

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- Please note that this property caught fire on 2/22/2018. As reported by the Detroit Building, Safety, Engineering, and Environmental Department (BSEED), the fire was concentrated in the rear wing of the property, led to extensive damage to the interior and the roof at that location. A review of the photos of the property which were submitted to staff immediately after the fire indicates that the owner boarded up the windows.
- A concerned resident alerted HDC of the fire on 2/28/2018
- In October 2018, representatives of new owner of the home contacted HDC staff to inquire re: the restoration of the property. The project architects later visited HDC offices to meet with HDC to discuss the project
- On 1/8/2019, HDC staff issued a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of asphalt shingles at the roof. This approval was conditioned on the applicants submitting a proposal to HDC staff for the installation of new gutters and downspouts.
- On 4/30/2019, staff forwarded a report to BSEED that the following work had been completed without HDC approval OR permit:
 - The installation of unfinished plywood fascia boards The addition of the plywood/OSB siding at the front, rear, and side elevations
 - Rebuilding of the rear porch
 - The installation of a plywood board at the rear garage fascia
- On 4/30/2019, HDC staff contacted one of the property owners (Yuri Dado) and discussed the ongoing violations at the property. Specifically, staff offered to help them through the process, but noted that they should stop by asap so that HDC staff could get them the approval they needed in order to undertake any exterior work outside of the approved and permitted asphalt shingle installation.
- On 9/13/2019, HDC staff were made aware that the original windows at the property were being removed and replaced. This work was undertaken without permit and/or HDC approval. Please see the **attached photos** of the unapproved windows. Please see the attached photos
- On 9/17/2019, BSEED issued a **stop work order** for the unapproved window replacement

ISSUES

- A COA was acquired for the installation of asphalt shingles at the roof in 1/2019. However the current owners undertook unapproved exterior work at the work at the home in 4/2019 and 9/2019. At both occasions, representatives of the property owners interacted with HDC staff and were made aware of the HDC approval processes and requirements
- It is HDC staff's opinion that the window replacement is inappropriate to the historic appearance/character of this home. A review of the photos of the windows which were removed

without approval reveal that they did not appear to be deteriorated beyond repair. Also, the following issues exist with the current windows:

- The light configuration of the new windows do not match the old/original
 - The grids at the new windows are between the glass
 - Many of the windows are improperly fitted within their opening. Plywood has been used to infill the gaps in the opening.
 - The new windows are not properly recessed with their openings
 - HDC field investigations revealed that leaded glass windows were removed from the building.
- HDC staff consulted Google Earth images in order to gain an understanding of the window materiality, operation, and light configuration before the unapproved work. A review of these images revealed that the windows were wood-sash, double-hung, true-divide lite units. Windows at the front and side elevations were 6/1. The rear elevation light configuration is unclear due to the heavy vegetation at the property prior to the 2/2018 fire. Because the property process was not followed in re: to the window replacement, staff is not 100% clear of the window configuration throughout.

RECOMMENDATION

As noted above, it is staff's opinion that the unapproved windows are not appropriate to the building's historic appearance. Also, it does appear that the windows which were removed without HDC approval did not appear to be deteriorated beyond repair. Staff therefore recommends that the Commission deny the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the work as proposed because it does not meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular, Standard #6), which requires the following:

Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

HDC staff further recommends that the Commission request that BSEED, Property Maintenance Division, issue a Correction Order to return the property to its original appearance, prior to the unapproved work. Specifically, staff recommends that the order require the following:

- The fascia at the home and garage roofs shall be and restored to their historic appearance using new wood to match the historic in detailing, dimension, and profile
- All existing plywood from the home's exterior walls shall be removed and new stucco added to match the historic appearance
- Replace all existing non-historic wood windows and replace with new wood windows, to match the original in dimension, profile, operation and light configuration. The new windows must be true divided light or simulated divided lite (grid applied to the exterior surface of the glass).
- Where windows are missing, new wood windows, to match the original in dimension, profile, operation and light configuration. The new windows must be true divided light or simulated divided lite (grid applied to the exterior surface of the glass). The existing window trim./brickmould must be retained and repaired (where necessary) with new wood to exactly replicate the original.
- Where windows are remaining, they must be retained and repaired

- The existing window trim./brickmould must be retained and repaired (where necessary) with new wood to exactly replicate the original. Where trim is missing, new trim/ brickmould is missing new wood trim must be installed to exactly replicate the original in dimension, profile, and detailing
- The owner shall submit a detailed work plan to HDC staff to outline the manner in which they shall restore the home and garage to their historic appearance. This plan must provide an accurate account/photo documentation of the appearance of the windows, exterior cladding, window trim, fascia, and rear porch prior to the unapproved work. On or before 2/1/2020, the applicant shall submit the completed work plan to HDC staff for review. If HDC staff determines that the work plan does not adequately outline the manner in which the owner/applicant intends to address the inappropriate work, staff shall forward the case to the Commission at the next available meeting for further review.