STAFF REPORT 10-09-2019 REGULAR MEETING APPLICATION NUMBER: 19-6453 ADDRESS: 2085 ATKINSON STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT: ATKINSON AVENUE APPLICANT: BRECK CRANDELL, BRECK CRANDELL LLC DATE OF COMPLETE APPLICATION: 09-16-2019 STAFF SITE VISIT: 09-25-2019

SCOPE: DEMOLISH EXISTING SUN PORCH, CONSTRUCT NEW PORCH

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The building located at 2085 Atkinson Street is a 2 ½-story single-family residence constructed in 1924. The structure is clad in variegated red brick and features cast stone details as well as stucco and decorative half-timbering in the roof gables. The massing of the house is L-shaped with the front entrance located at the intersection of the two wings. The original wood double hung windows are remaining. The multi-gabled roof is covered in what appears to be clay tile. Situated on the southeast corner of Atkinson Street and 14th street, the front, side, and rear yards are all visible from the right-of-way. The rear of the structure currently includes an enclosed addition at the west side of the rear elevation and a two-story porch structure at the east side of the elevation. The rear yard is enclosed with a chain link fence.



PROPOSAL

With the current proposal, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval to demolish the existing addition and covered porch at the rear elevation and erect a new porch across the rear elevation per the attached drawings and application. Included in the proposal are the following scope items:

- Demolish existing addition in its entirety. Existing exterior windows and door at the rear brick wall of the house are to remain.
- Demolish existing two-story porch structure in its entirety
- Construct new 8' deep raised wood porch (1'-9" above grade) across entire rear elevation including:
 - o New two-story portion in the same location as the existing two-story porch structure
 - New 15'W pergola structure over the portion of deck where the secondary door is located (west end of elevation)
 - \circ 42" guardrails around second-story platform as well as around the perimeter of the proposed raised deck
 - \circ (3) new steps at the east end of the elevation to navigate from the raised porch down to grade and the existing sidewalk
 - All wood to be stained a natural color to match the proposed replacement fence and complement the existing brick and green roof of the house

• Replace existing chain link fence around the rear yard with a new 6' tall treated natural pine wood fence with column caps at each post. Fence is proposed to be painted white.

STAFF OBSERVATIONS & RESEARCH

- The rear of the house is visible from the right-of-way
- The rear structures proposed for demolition are not historically significant features of the property

ISSUES

• The proposed finish for the porch (natural stain) is different than the proposed finish for the fence (painted white)

RECOMMENDATION

It is staff's opinion that the work, as proposed, retains and preserves the historic character of the building, its site, and setting. Staff therefore recommends that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness as the proposed work meets the following Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

However, staff recommends that the Commission issue this Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

• The porch be painted rather than stained. Paint color to complement the house.



ISDA Farm Service Agency, Map data ©2019

2085 Atkinson Street

Google

SUBBORNES .

9039SI



DESIGNATION SLIDE 1984

.

ONE WAY

DESIGNATION SLIDE 1984

KK AA

all and the second

Conception of the local division of the loca





STAFF SITE VISIT 9/25/2019







Atkinson Historic District Proposal 9/14/2019

Demolition of add-on "Sunroom"

- Existing conditions:
 - Late 70s/80s addition by amateur contractor
 - Does not fit into historical context of home
 - Faux stone and wood paneling exterior cladding does not match house
 - Shoddy installation, not properly sealed from weather damage and is beginning to pull away from the house, leaving large gaps for insects and pests to enter.
 - Includes a large, gaudy antenna which is no longer in use.



- Scope of work:
 - Deconstruct add-on room entirely including large antennae, exposing the original brick of the house exterior and original metal gate/door
 - Properly dispose of all waste materials by renting 30 yard dumpster for 1-3 days.

Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/2019



After: (see deck proposal for full scope of work) Windows and door depicted are existing, just covered by the current sunroom condition



Before:

Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.



Photos of window and door from inside the house (looking into "sunroom")

DIAGRAM OF EXISTING CONDITIONS::



Atkinson Historic District Proposal 9/14/2019

2085 Atkinson Ave.



Atkinson Historic District Proposal 9/14/2019 2085 Atkinson Ave.

Replacement of Fence around Rear Yard

- Existing conditions: 0
 - Metal chain link fence in poor condition
 - Corner pole at driveway severely dented by collision at an unknown time
 - Nearly all fence panels unsecure / disconnected at base
 - Several unsightly areas where repairs attempted .
 - Berm along fence line makes the fence less than four feet high in some places



Does not provide any sense of security or privacy.

- Scope of work: 0
 - Remove chain link fence
 - Properly dispose of all waste materials by renting 30 yard dumpster for 1-3 days (at the same time as removal of sunroom addition, if approved)
 - Install new fence,
 - 6'-0" tall treated natural pine w/ white painted finish
 - 4x4 wood posts embedded in concrete Sonotube bases
 - 8'-0" long sections hung from brackets at each post
 - Column caps at each post

Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.

Before:



After:



Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.



Proposed Fence Location:

DIAGRAM PROPOSED FENCE LOCATION:



Atkinson Historic District Proposal 9/14/2019 2085 Atkinson Ave.

Replacement of Existing Rear Deck

- 0 Existing conditions:
 - Decomposing wood structure
 - Not properly sealed from weather conditions for years, some areas are . damaged beyond repair
 - No stairs with a 24" drop to rear yard is unsafe
 - Second (upper) level is completely rotted and is unsafe for people to stand on.
 - Lower portion has not been properly enclosed so rodents/pests have been entering the house below.





Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.



Atkinson Historic District Proposal 9/14/2019



- Scope of work:
 - Deconstruction of rear porch entirely down to structural connection to house
 - Properly dispose of all waste materials by renting 30 yard dumpster for 1-3 days (at the same time as removal of sunroom addition and existing fence, if approved)
 - Install new deck in place of old, removed deck
 - Replace existing wood posts with treated 4x4 posts embedded in concrete Sonotube forms
 - Construct wood framing for porch using 4x4 posts to support upper level (2x8 16" o.c. with simpson strong ties at each intersection with ledger)
 - Install guardrails 42" high with vertical 2x2 members spaced no more than 4" apart the length of the guarail around upper level
 - Install new steps (3 steps w/ 11" deep treads, 7" risers) down to existing backyard sidewalk
 - Stain a rich natural color to match fence and compliment existing brick and green roof of house

Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.

Before:



After:





Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.

DIAGRAM OF PROPOSED DECK:



Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.

DIARAGM ELEVATION FROM REAR YARD



Repaint front porch

- Existing conditions: 0
 - Garish, bright green existing color
 - Concrete is breaking apart due to freeze/thaw cycle and rain damage
- Scope of work: 0
 - Remove broken concrete and rubble
 - Patch potholes and damaged areas from removed aggregates with QuickCrete patch mix with trowelled finish
 - Repaint porch using
 - Exterior floor grade paint
 - 50% grey color
 - toning down the currently vibrant porch that detracts from the home's overall curb appeal and historical character
 - using a color that will not show future deterioration of existing • porch

Before:

After:



Before:

Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.



After:



Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.

2085 Atkinson Avenue Elevations:

Rear Elevation:



Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.



East Elevation:

Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.





Atkinson Historic District Proposal9/14/20192085 Atkinson Ave.



West Elevation:

Sec. 21-2-139. - Atkinson Avenue Historic District.

- (a) An historic district to be known as the Atkinson Avenue Historic District is hereby established in accordance with the provisions of this article.
- (b) This historic district designation is hereby certified as being consistent with the Detroit Master Plan of Policies.
- (c) The boundaries of the Atkinson Avenue Historic District, as shown on the map on file in the Office of the City Clerk, are as follows:

On the north, the alley between Atkinson and Edison; on the east, the center line of the John C. Lodge service drive; on the south, the alley between Atkinson and Clairmount; and on the west, the center line of Linwood. (These boundaries include Lots 561 to 682, Joy Farm Sub (L32/P39 and 40); Lots 1—16, Lewis Park Sub (L30/P96); Lots 1—16, Jackson Park Sub (L30/P95); Lots 1—72, Boston Boulevard Sub (L29/P23); and Lots 1—16, Guerold's Sub (L29/P87).)

- (d) The elements of design, as defined in <u>Section 21-2-2</u> of this Code, shall be as follows:
 - (1) Height. Virtually all the houses in the district have two full stories plus an attic or finished third floor within the roof; these are generally called "two-and-a-half" story houses. Some two-story two-flat buildings on the 1600 block of Atkinson between Woodrow Wilson and Rosa Parks Boulevard are slightly taller in height than the singlefamily residences. The commercial row on Rosa Parks is two stories tall with a flat roof; the church building on Rosa Parks is also two stories in height.
 - (2) *Proportion of buildings' front façades.* Proportion varies in the district, depending on age, style, and location within a specific subdivision. Most houses are slightly wider than tall or as wide as tall, excluding the roof. Exceptions occur primarily on corner lots where the houses that face the north-south street are wider than tall. The commercial row on the southeast corner of Rosa Parks is wider than tall.
 - (3) Proportion of openings within the façades. Window openings are almost always taller than wide; several windows are sometimes grouped into combinations wider than tall. Window openings are always subdivided, the most common window type being doublehung sash, whose area is sometimes further subdivided by muntins. Façades have approximately 15 to 35 percent of their area glazed. Dormer windows exist in a variety of shapes and sizes.
 - (4) Rhythm of solids to voids in front façades. In buildings derived from Classical traditions, voids are usually arranged in a symmetrical and evenly-spaced manner within the façades. In examples of other styles, particularly those of English Medieval inspiration, voids are arranged with more freedom but usually result in balanced compositions.
 - (5) *Rhythm of spacing of buildings on street.* The spacing of buildings on Atkinson Avenue is generally determined by the setback from the side lot lines. There is little variance in

the size of lots on Atkinson between the Lodge Freeway Service Drive and Linwood; lots average 35 to 40 feet wide. Most buildings are centered on their lots and are at least four feet from the side lot lines as required by subdivision restrictions, with little or no side yards. Many properties have narrow driveways along the side lot line.

- (6) Rhythm of entrance and/or porch projections. Most buildings in the district have entrance and/or porch projections facing the street, creating a rhythm where they exist in numbers. In those buildings of classical inspiration, porches and entrances tend to be centered on the front façades. Other stylistic examples display more freedom in entrance and front-porch placement. A few houses have front porches extending to the sides of the building; some houses have their major entrances on the side of the building. The multi-unit buildings between Woodrow Wilson and Rosa Parks Boulevard frequently have second-story porches above the first-story porches. Many porches, particularly those in the western half of the district have metal or cloth awnings.
- (7) Relationship of materials. The major building materials in the district are brick and stucco, sometimes used in combination, wooden functional trim and window frames and sash are common, and wood is used in many examples as decorative trim as well. Wood sheathing is occasionally used on the attic story and/or dormers. Stone is occasionally used as a material for window sills, porch trim, and other functional trim. Rough-cut stone is the main material used on a rustic porch in the district. Roofing materials include asphalt shingles, slate, and Mediterranean tiles, asphalt shingles being by far the primary roofing material in the district.
- (8) Relationship of textures. The most common relationship of textures in the district is that of low-relief pattern of mortar joints in brick contrasted with the smooth surface of wood or stone trim. Stuccoed surfaces contrast with brick when used in combination and with wood or stone trim. Half-timbering on Neo-Tudor buildings creates textural interest. Tile and slate roofs have particular textural interest where they exist, whereas asphalt shingles generally do not.
- (9) Relationship of colors. Natural brick colors (red, yellow, brown, buff) predominate on wall surfaces. Where stucco and concrete exists, it is usually left in its natural state or painted in a shade of cream. Asphalt-shingled roofs are predominantly in natural colors (tile and slate colors), and in appropriate lighter colors. Paint colors often relate to style; the Classically-inspired buildings generally have woodwork painted in the white and cream range. Doors and shutters feature an array of colors, usually harmonizing with the main body of the house. Colors known to have been in use on buildings of this type in the 18th Century or early 19th Century on similar buildings may be considered for suitability. Buildings of Medieval or Craftsman inspiration generally have painted woodwork and window frames of dark brown, cream, or other natural tones. Original

color schemes for any given building may be determined by professional paint analysis and, when so determined, are always appropriate for that building and may provide suggestion for similar houses.

- (10) Relationship of architectural detail. These generally relate to style; Neo-Georgian and Colonial Revival buildings display classical details, mostly in wood. Areas commonly, but not always, treated are porches, shutters, window frames, cornices, and dormer windows. Details on Mediterranean style or vernacular buildings include arched windows, door openings, and porches. Buildings of Medieval inspiration tend to have details in the form of half-timbering and leaded windows. In general, the various houses on Atkinson Avenue range from scarce to rich in architectural detail.
- (11) Relationship of roof shapes. A variety of roof shapes exist in the district, often relating to style. Hipped roofs with dormers and pitched roofs with either frontal or side-facing gables predominate. Flat roofs are present only as subsidiary roofs on residential structures and on the commercial row at the southeast corner of Rosa Parks at Atkinson.
- (12) *Walls of continuity.* The major wall of continuity is created by the buildings with their uniform setbacks within blocks. New buildings should contribute to this wall of continuity. Where rows of trees have survived in sufficient numbers or new trees are planted in rows, minor walls of continuity are created.
- Relationship of significant landscape features and surface treatments. The typical (13) treatment of individual properties is a flat or slightly graded front lawn area in grass turf, subdivided by a walk, usually straight but sometimes curving, leading from the curb to the steps of the front entrance. There is sometimes a sidewalk beginning at the public sidewalk leading to the rear when a driveway does not exist. Materials for such walks are primarily concrete. Plantings of a deciduous character are also present. Hedges between properties are occasional; few extend along the side yard to the front lot line. The most prominent type of fences in the district are the chain-linked fence and wire mesh with wooden posts. Fences extending to the front yard are rare; most back yards are fenced. Some large American elm trees remain on the tree lawns in the district, although they are virtually extinct. Replacement trees should be characteristic of the era and period in which the houses were built (1915-1930); if elm, only a disease resistant cultivar would be a practical choice. Many straight side driveways from the street to the rear yard are present; a common treatment of the surface of the driveway is two concrete strips with grass in between or all concrete. On corner lots, garages and driveways face the side streets. Tree lawns along Atkinson are uniformly wide, about eight feet. Street pavements are asphalt; curbs are concrete. Alleys are also paved in concrete. Lighting poles on Atkinson are of the wood telephone pole variety.
- (14) Relationship of open space to structures. Open space in the district occurs in the form

of a small amount of vacant land between a few houses due to housing demolition. A City playground on the southwest corner of Atkinson and Rosa Parks Boulevard and an empty parcel on the northeast corner of Rosa Parks Boulevard and Atkinson Avenue are present. The John C. Lodge Freeway on the east end of the district is depressed and not visible although it results in a strong boundary to the neighborhood. All houses have rear yards as well as front yards.

- (15) Scale of façades and façade elements. The scale of houses remains fairly constant throughout Atkinson Avenue due to the consistency of the lot sizes. Houses are modest in scale; houses facing the north-south streets appear more substantial in character. The size and complexity of façade elements and details either accentuate or subdue the scale of the façades. Façade elements have been determined by what is appropriate for the style. Window sashes are usually subdivided by the muntins or leaded glass, which effects the apparent scale of the windows within the façades.
- (16) Directional expression of front elevations. The expression of direction on residential blocks is generally neutral, although individual houses, particularly those on corner lots, may emphasize horizontality or verticality according to style. Some two-flat buildings on Atkinson between Woodrow Wilson and Rosa Parks Boulevard are slightly vertical in expression.
- (17) *Rhythm of building setbacks.* Setbacks from front-lot lines are fairly consistent throughout the district. The varying designs of the buildings, frequently with projecting porches of different designs, cause the buildings to relate to the front setback line in different ways; this creates a light variation in setback appearance. Corner houses facing the north-south streets are set back approximately 20 feet from the north-south street.
- (18) *Relationship of lot coverages.* Lot coverage averages approximately 20 to 30 percent in the district.
- (19) *Degree of complexity within the façade.* The degree of complexity has been determined by what is typical and appropriate for a given style. The classically-inspired buildings usually have simple, rectangular façades with varying amounts of ornamentation. Other styles, such as those of Medieval inspiration, frequently have façades complicated by gables, bays, and slight setbacks. In general, the houses in the district are of varying complexity.
- (20) Orientation, vistas, overviews. Most of the houses in the district have front entrances oriented towards Atkinson Avenue. Houses on LaSalle Boulevard at Atkinson face LaSalle. At 14th and Atkinson, the house on the southeast corner faces towards the corner and the house on the northeast corner is oriented towards Atkinson. Garages

are frequently oriented towards the alley and the front drive, or side street in the case of corner lots where driveways exist. Almost all garages are detached and at the rear of the lot. A few houses have side or corner entrances as their major entrance.

- (21) *Symmetric or asymmetric appearance.* Classically-inspired buildings are generally symmetrical. Other styles, including the Neo-Tudor, are generally asymmetric but result in balanced compositions.
- (22) *General environmental character.* Atkinson Avenue, from the John C. Lodge Freeway Service Drive to Linwood, with its long straight street, wide tree lawns, and moderate size single-family and two four-family homes, has an urban, substantial low-density residential character.

(Code 1964, § 28A-1-41; Code 1984, § 25-2-97; Ord. No. 582-H, § 1(28A-1-41), eff. 3-26-1984)