NEW BUSINESS





CITY CLERK 2018 AUG 30 FM4/53

CITY COUNCIL

MARY SHEFFIELD COUNCIL PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE DISTRICT 5

M EMORANDUM

TO:

David Whitaker, Director, Legislative Policy Division

FROM:

Council President Pro Tempore Mary Sheffield, Chair, Neighborhoods and

Community Services Committee

THRU:

James Tate, Chair, Planning and Economic Development Committee

DATE:

August 30, 2018

RE:

Community Benefits Ordinance Amendments

More than one year has passed since a Community Benefits Ordinance was approved by voter referendum for the City of Detroit. I have participated in multiple Community Benefit Agreements, and while I applaud the effort of the community to hold developers accountable, the process has produced few real benefits for the local communities.

I am requesting that the following amendments be incorporated into the Community Benefits Ordinance:

- The title of the ordinance be changed to "Community Engagement Ordinance."
- In Section 14-12-3(a)(1), the number of required community meetings be changed to "no fewer than five (5), unless a majority of the NAC deems otherwise."
- Section 14-12-3(c)(1) should read: "At the first meeting of the NAC, the developer shall provide an overview of the community engagement process, and the details of the proposed development. At the second meeting of the NAC, any proposed NAC member(s) nominated by residents shall be permitted to present their ideas and suggestions regarding the community engagement process and the proposed development, before the members of the NAC are elected."
- Add language to subsection 14-12-3(b)(5) stating: Attendance at all NAC meetings by all elected and appointed NAC members shall be mandatory. If a

member fails to attend an NAC meeting, an alternative may be appointed by the NAC as a permanent replacement member."

- Subsection 14-12-3(c)(2) should read: "At the first meeting of the NAC, the developer shall provide a specific explanation of how the proposed development qualifies for public support of investment, the total amount of private investment involved, and the statutory authorizations and amounts of all tax abatements or incentives sought for the proposed development."
- Add a new section 14-12-3(7) that should read: "If the proposed development includes residential housing, then at least 20% of the units for a single site shall be designated as affordable housing, defined as affordable by those earning at least 80% of Area Median Income."
- Add a new section 14-12-3(c)(5) that should read: "The Planning and Development Department shall create and maintain a page on the City's web site detailing the specifics of the development, along with a projected timeline, for each development project subject to this article. The webpage shall also contain the contact information for the PDD project manager and general contact information for the developer."
- The public notice area should be expanded to include the entire project census tract(s) area. This would increase awareness of projects.
- The developer shall provide a list to the NAC of examples of legally binding community benefits agreements that have been created by communities and developers in other cities.
- Under Section 14-12-2, lower the investment threshold from the current \$75,000,000 to \$50,000,000.

Please contact Ari Ruttenberg at 313-224-4505 if you have any questions.





CITY COUNCIL

MARY SHEFFIELD COUNCIL PRESIDENT PRO TEM DISTRICT 5

M EMORANDUM

TO:

Lawrence Garcia, Corporation Counsel, Law Department

David Whitaker, Director, Legislative Policy Division

FROM:

Council President Pro Tem Mary Sheffield

THRU:

Council Member Janee Ayers, Chair, Budget Finance and Audit Committee

DATE:

August 30, 2018

RE:

Poverty Tax Exemption Ordinance

In January, my office, requested that the Law Dept. draft an ordinance to codify certain rules and increase Detroiters' access to the Homeowners Property Tax Assistance Program. Due to pending litigation regarding the Morningside v City of Detroit case, the original memo was removed from the BFA agenda on May 2, 2018.

The Morningside v City of Detroit case has concluded and the settlement was approved by City Council. Thus, I am requesting that the Law Dept. reassign the task of drafting an ordinance. See the attached document for recommendations that have been outlined by my office and the Coalition to End Unconstitutional Tax Foreclosures, for input into the ordinance.

Please contact Paris Blessman at 313-224-9471 if you have any questions.

MEMORANDUM

TO:

Mary Sheffield, Council Member Pro Tempore

FROM:

Coalition to End Unconstitutional Tax Foreclosures

SUBJECT: Poverty Tax Exemption (PTE) Ordinance

DATE:

August 16, 2018

The purpose of this memo is to propose an ordinance, which ensures that Detroit homeowners have access to the City's Homeowners Property Tax Assistance Program (HPTAP), also known as the Poverty Tax Exemption (PTE)1. The Michigan Constitution states that no property should be assessed at more than 50 percent of its market value. From 2009 and 2015, between 55 and 85 percent of Detroit homes have been unconstitutionally assessed. As a result, approximately 1 in 4 Detroit properties were foreclosed from 2011 to 2015, which resulted in massive displacement of residents, an increase in blighted properties, and vastly reduced home values. In 2016, nearly 40,000 owner-occupied households - or 32% of all Detroit homeowners - qualified for the HPTAP, but the vast majority did not receive it either because they were not aware it existed or because the process was too burdensome. This ordinance aims to codify the requirements stipulated by the 2018 Morningside v. Sabree settlement order (hereafter referred to as the settlement), and propose additional changes that will prevent further hardship to Detroit homeowners by ensuring the HPTAP is readily available, easily obtainable, and equitably provided to all who qualify.

Part I: HPTAP Application Requirements

Below is the documentation the state of Michigan requires localities to collect in order to grant an exemption under MCL 211.7u, the actual requirements currently present in the HPTAP application, the changes introduced by the settlement, and the Coalition's recommendation for how to revise the requirements to ensure the application's integrity is upheld without overly burdening applicants.

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
1.	principal residence -Legally mandated by the Michigan Tax Act.	Property Transfer Affidavit (PTA) and a	Not addressed in settlement.	None.

¹ Mich. Comp. Laws § 211.7(u)

² MICH. CONST. art. IX, § 3; Mich. Comp. Laws § 211.27(a)(1) (2013).

³ Bernadette Atuahene & Timothy R. Hodge, Stategraft, 91 S. CAL. L. Rev. 263 (2018)

⁴ U.S. Census Bureau; American Community Survey (ACS), Five-Year Estimates (2012-2016), Tables B25118 and B25010

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
2.	Identification— Discretionary under the Michigan Tax Act.	requires an applicant to submit a copy of his or her driver's license or state-issued	as it includes applicant's picture and address. This must be	application should list specific examples of accepted IDs (e.g.
3.	Deed production— Discretionary under the Michigan Tax Act.	requires the applicant to submit a copy of the recorded deed or other evidence of ownership (including land contracts).	judgment). The application must explicitly state that any recorded proof is acceptable – Settlement Order, section 2,i,(2).	The ordinance should state that as long as the Chief Assessor requires a deed to file a PTA, the applicant does not need to produce a deed. In anomalous cases where additional proof of ownership may be necessary, the Board of Review can access it internally from the Wayne County Register of Deeds. Similarly, if the Assessor stops requiring a deed as part of the PTA, then the BOR can access it internally.
4.		Page 7 of the HPTAP application requires an applicant to provide a copy of water, gas, and electric bills "to support [the claim of] occupancy of the subject property."	Not addressed in settlement.	The applicant should only provide a DTE bill that is under the applicant's name. If the DTE bill is under any other person's name, then the applicant must provide an explanatory statement."

⁵ To apply for HPTAP, an applicant must have a PTA on file. While a deed is not legally mandated when filing a PTA, Chief Assessors have routinely required a recorded deed to accompany the filing. It is therefore redundant to require an applicant produce a deed again when filing for HPTAP.

⁶ If the Board of Review finds the PRE insufficient to demonstrate occupancy, it can access the applicant's water bill internally.

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
5.	ID for all residents— Not legally required.	Page 8 of the HPTAP application requires the resident to provide a current Driver's License or State ID for all adults over 18 in the home.	as it includes applicant's picture and address. This must be	This should be codified in the ordinance with explicit examples of acceptable ID listed.
6.	Minors in household— Not legally required.	the resident to provide a report card, transcript, or other	cannot ask for any specific type of proof. Instead, it may list a non-exhaustive list of	an applicant's household
	unless the party is not required to file—Legally mandated by the Michigan Tax Act.	requires an applicant to submit a copy of complete Federal and State Tax Returns. For all applicants or		None.

contra	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
8.	Poverty guidelines—An applicant must meet federal poverty guidelines or whatever guidelines the local governing body adopts, so long as the alternative guidelines do not preclude anyone who meets the federal poverty guidelines — Legally mandated by the Michigan Tax Act.	establishes maximum income eligibility guidelines, beginning at \$16,660 for a single-person household. The whole table is found on page	Not addressed in settlement.	The Board currently adopts income guidelines that are more generous than the federal poverty guidelines. The ordinance should codify the current standards (i.e. the current guideline as percentage of the federal guidelines) so that this relief remains accessible to those living near, and not just below, the federal poverty line.
	There must be an asset	application requires an applicant to list all assets and all debts.	simply make an affirmative statement attesting to this fact. –	The settlement change should be codified in the ordinance. Also, to avoid confusion, the asterisks (*) should be removed from the asset section of the application.
10.	<u>Listing debts</u> – Only an asset test and not a listing of debts–legally	application requires an applicant to list all debts.	The Board shall not require applicants whose income falls below the eligible threshold to document their expenses or debts. – Settlement Order, section 2,i,(5).	The settlement change should be codified in the ordinance.

⁷ For example: for a single-person household, the guideline for a full exemption is 137% of FPL and 158% for a partial exemption. For a four-person household the respective guidelines are 102% and 112%, respectively.

⁸ State Tax Commission Bulletin 6 of 2017 states that the local unit must include an asset test, and that it "should require claimants provide a list of assets" [emphasis added]. The permissive language allows the 'affirmative statement' provision in the settlement to satisfy the asset test requirement.

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
11.	Providing past year's	Page 6 of the HPTAP application, the applicant is required to provide all sources of income for the past year with documentation.	The Board may continue to require that applicants provide proof of income for the prior year. While an applicant may fulfil this requirement by submitting their tax return, the Board retains the right to request additional documentation if they have a reasonable basis to believe certain income is not reflected in the return. For applicants who were not required to file a tax return, the Board shall accept W2 forms, Social Security statements, or any other reasonable proof—Settlement Order, section 2,i,(6).	For applicants who are not required to file tax return, the Board shall allow applicants to submit documentation that shows they are currently part of any government program that has the same or lower income requirements (e.g. the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program, Temporary Assistance for Needy Families, recent State Emergency Relief (SER) approval, Medicaid or Supplemental Security Income statement). No additional documentation should be necessary. For applicants who file a tax return, the ordinance should stipulate that the Board shall not request any additional documentation.
12.	Listing Credits and Rebates—Legally mandated under the Michigan Tax Act.	Page 8 of the HPTAP application requires an applicant to list all tax rebates and credits.	not required to file tax returns list all tax rebates and credits in the prior year. Applicants who submit their tax return shall not	request that applicants list all

⁹ This method to determine eligibility—known as 'adjunctive eligibility'—is common practice in various means tested government programs, including WIC.

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
13.	Reference—Not legally required.	application requires an applicant to list a Detroit resident that	The Board must not require applicants to list a reference, but may request an optional 'alternative contact person' – Settlement Order, section 2,k	The settlement change should
14.	Notarization—Not legally required.	application contains a notarization requirement.	The Board may require the HPTAP application be notarized, but if so shall allow applicants to fulfil the requirement in two ways: 1) having the application notarized; or 2) declaring, under penalty of perjury, that having the application notarized presents a hardship due to their advanced age, their limited physical mobility, or because they are a caretaker for a dependent, a person of advanced of age, or a person with limited mobility — Settlement Order, section 2,m	The ordinance should remove the notarization requirement from the application. Instead, the application will contain explicit language listing the maximum penalty for fraudulent misrepresentations.

¹⁰ Section 2,n, along with the permissive language in section 2,m, indicates that the settlement order poses no barrier for removing the notarization requirement. There is no other legal obligation requiring notarization. For a comprehensive legal argument for the removal of the notarization requirement, see the Coalition's Memorandum re: Notarization Requirement on PTE (https://tinyurl.com/y77agoay)

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
15.		applicant to disclose his or her marital status and submit a Judgment of Divorce or Separation Agreement if the spouse is no longer	The Board may continue to require applicants provide proof of divorce, legal separation, or desertion, but must explicitly state that acceptable forms of proof include: a divorce judgement, order of separation, order of desertion, or a statement by the applicant — Settlement Order, section 2,i,(8)	

Part II: HPTAP Administration

Below are changes to HPTAP administration procedures that should be required by the ordinance. These changes include those introduced by the settlement, as well as additional requirements that will ensure broader program access.

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
16.	Extent of Relief Offered—It is legally required that an exemption be made available to owner-occupants who meet federal guidelines, but the law allows the chief assessor and board of review discretion over the extent of the relief it offers.	offers a full (100%) and partial (50%) exemptions, according to income guidelines specified on Page 4 of the HPTAP. The solid	Not addressed in settlement.	The ordinance should codify the availability of a full (100%) and partial (50%) exemptions, according to the poverty guidelines addressed in recommendation #8 of this memo.

¹¹ Mich. Comp. Laws § 211.7(u)(1) states "The principal residence of persons who, in the judgment of the supervisor and board of review, by reason of poverty, are unable to contribute toward the public charges is eligible for exemption in whole or in part from taxation under this act."

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
17.	Homeowner Outreach—Not legally required.	In 2018 the City mailed a flyer describing the HPTAP to each delinquent homeowner in the City.	assessment roll to every taxpayer with a residential homestead ("homeowner"), whose taxable value is \$95,000 or below, describing the HPTAP	be codified in the ordinance. If the statement provided as Exhibit A of the settlement must be changed, the ordinance should require that the revised statement be reviewed by community members prior to mailing so that it the language is clear
18.	 	gov/How-Do-I/Appeal/Property-Assessment-FAQs there is no page that describes the HPTAP program and the process to apply.	within 28 days of the order, the City shall create and maintain a separate page on the City's website that describes the HPTAP, the program guidelines, and the process to apply. The page should include links to download the current year's HPTAP application, as well as a list of free services that are available to assist homeowners in completing the HPTAP application such as, but not limited to, the United Community Housing Coalition	the page is easily located on the City's website. Under the http://www.detroitmi.gov/Ho w-Do-I/ domain, there should be a link on the left-hand side specifically for "Property Tax

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
19.	Application Accessible at Office of the Assessor, Online & at District Centers—Not legally required.	HPTAP application can be requested by mail, by phone, or in-person at the Assessor's office. The HPTAP application is also available online at http://www.detroitmi.gov/How-Do-I/Property-Assessment-Documents.	The settlement requires that HPTAP applications must be available to the public for pick up in the Office of the Assessor with no prerequisites or requirements and that the City shall post a sign near the HPTAP applications that encourages homeowners to speak with a representative of the Assessor's office if they have questions about the application. It also dictates that the application continues to be available online under the Property Assessment Documents portion of the city's website or other similarly located page.	The settlement change should be codified in the ordinance. Additionally, it should require that the application be made available at each of the seven neighborhood District Centers.
20.	Application Assistance Available at District Centers—Not legally required.	The City does not currently advertise or offer direct assistance to residents with the application. In the absence of these services, non-profit organizations throughout city take on this responsibility.	+3	The ordinance should require that the Department of Neighborhoods promote the HPTAP and offer designated office hours for regular application assistance at each District Manager's office.

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
21.	HPTAP Application Mailed to Previous Applicants and Delinquent Homeowners—Not legally required.	HPTAP applications are automatically mailed to individuals who received a poverty exemption in the previous year.	The settlement requires that the HPTAP application is automatically mailed to individuals who applied for a poverty exemption in the previous year, whether or not they were granted the exemption, on or before February 15th of each year. It also requires that the application be mailed to homeowners that are delinquent for the tax roll in a given tax year.	The settlement changes should be codified in the ordinance, which should also specify that the application be mailed to delinquent owners on or before September 15th.
22.	Trained Officials Available for Assistance—Not legally required.		involved in the exemption process, and requires that no new hires be permitted to interact with customers until they have been trained.	

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
23.	legally required, but the application for an exemption shall be filed after January 1 but before the last day	HPTAP application request that the application be returned by a specified date that is before the next BOR sitting but after the application is issued.	include a deadline, and shall state that all applications will be considered if postmarked or submitted in person prior to the last day of the December BOR.	The settlement change should be codified in the ordinance, which should also require that the specific dates of each review period are provided in the application, including the latest possible date the application may be received.
24.	Document checklist included with application— Not legally required.	The "HPTAP Application Guide and Document Requirements," specifies necessary supporting paperwork but is not in the format of a checklist.	Not addressed in settlement.	The ordinance should require that the application includes a clear "document checklist" of the items needed for the application to be considered. This can allow applicants to keep track of their progress, reduce the number of incomplete applications that are submitted, and facilitate more efficient processing of applications.
25.	Space in the Application to Explain Personal Circumstances— Not legally required.	The "HPTAP Statement Form" allows a space for individuals to document extraordinary circumstances and explain why they are seeking an exemption.	Not addressed in settlement.	The ordinance should codify the Board's current practice.

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
26.	Application Tracking	Standards for the	Exhibit B of the settlement	The settlement change should
20.	and Review Procedures—No legal requirement.	Board's internal procedures are not publicly available.	specifies procedures and timelines for tracking when and for whom applications are requested, mailed, returned, and assigned to a BOR committee for review and decision. It dictates standards for contacting residents if information is missing or follow-up is needed. It requires that review be limited to whether the applicant has submitted all of the required documentation and meets the relevant income threshold for a partial or complete exemption, and, if not, whether any extenuating circumstances exist to support a decision to deviate from the guidelines and grant an exemption. It also dictates timelines and tracking procedures for submitting recommendations to the full	be codified in the ordinance. Timelines and procedures for requesting and reviewing additional information should be specified (i.e. number of attempts to contact resident, letter used to request information, how to track information that is received).
			BOR, recording BOR decisions, and printing and mailing decision letters.	<
	Used for Qualifying Residents— Not legally required, but applicants must file a claim on a form provided by the local assessing unit for each year the exemption is sought.	exemption for three consecutive years may complete a "Short	Not addressed in settlement.	The ordinance should codify the Board's current practice but also extend the opportunity for a Short Form Affidavit to all taxpayers who are on a fixed income and have been approved for three consecutive years. Current paperwork and notarization requirements should be removed.

	Legal Requirement	Current HPTAP	Settlement Changes	Recommendation
28.	THE RESERVE TO A STREET THE PARTY OF THE PAR	Persons with exemptions granted at the March BOR receive a March Board of Review Decision Letter, and persons with exemptions granted after July are communicated to residents by a numerical code issued on the City's "Correction of Affidavit" form, which can be difficult for residents to read	The settlement requires that individuals who apply for the exemption receive a written notification of the Board's decision by mail within ten days after the close of the BOR. If the BOR denies a homeowner's application, this notice will include the reasons for denial and provide the process and timeline for appeal.	The settlement change should be codified in the ordinance. In addition, the ordinance should require that approval letters be easy for residents to comprehend. In instances where no decision is rendered, this must also be communicated to residents in writing.
•	A T D'II	and understand.	The gottlement requires that	The cottlement shorter should
29.	Accurate Tax Bills Reflecting Exemption—Not legally required.	the March BOR receive an accurate summer tax bill that reflects the exemption. Persons with exemptions granted in after July receive tax bills that do not reflect the exemption.	receive a tax bill for that year that reflects the exemption. This bill will have the amount of the reduced solid waste fee on it (unless the taxpayer is issued a partial exemption). Taxpayers who are granted an exemption	The settlement change should be codified in the ordinance. In addition, the ordinance should require that updated tax bills be issued within two weeks from when the exemption was granted. This will clarify that their tax bills have been officially reduced, eliminating confusion and delinquent tax payments.

CITY COUNCIL



CITY CLERK 2018 AUG 30 FH4137

MARY SHEFFIELD

M EMORANDUM

TO:

COUNCIL MEMBER

DISTRICT 5

Portia Roberson, Director, CRIO

THROUGH: Council President Brenda Jones

FROM:

Council Member Mary Sheffield

DATE:

August 27, 2018

RE:

Request for the Civil Rights and Inclusion Office (CRIO) to Provide a Report Detailing

Activity Covered by Executive 2016-1

It has come to my attention that some or all contractors are either not being required to report the total number of hours worked by bona-fide Detroiters on their projects and/or that the City of Detroit is not verifying the information submitted by contractors. Thus I am requesting a report from the Civil Rights and Inclusion Office detailing the following information regarding "public funded construction projects:"

- The number of projects since the inception of E.O. 2016-1 that have qualified as "publicly funded construction projects"
- The total hours worked on each project by bona-fide Detroiters and its percentage to total hours worked on each project
- The number of contractors and corresponding projects that have failed to meet the goals and the specifics of the non-compliance
- The method and frequency of verification of the information provided by contractors/projects
- The amount paid into the Workforce Training Fund for non-compliance and the current balance in the fund
- The number of HUD Section 3 federally and City-certified contractors performing work on "publicly funded construction projects" since the inception of E.O. 2016-1

Thank you.

Cc:

Honorable Colleagues

Hon. Janice Winfrey, City Clerk

Stephanie Grimes Washington, Liaison to City Council, Mayor's Office