David Whitaker, Esq. Director

Irvin Corley, Jr. Executive Policy Manager Marcell R. Todd, Jr. Director, City Planning Commission Janese Chapman Director, Historic Designation Advisory Board

City of Detroit **CITY COUNCIL**

LEGISLATIVE POLICY DIVISION 208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center

Detroit, Michigan 48226 Phone: (313) 224-4946 Fax: (313) 224-4336

March 8, 2024

Kimani Jeffrey Anthony W. L. Johnson Phillip Keller, Esq. **Edward King Kelsey Maas** Jamie Murphy Latawn Oden **Dolores Perales** Analine Powers, Ph.D. W. Akilah Redmond Rebecca Savage Sabrina Shockley **Renee Short Floyd Stanley** Thomas Stephens, Esq. **Timarie Szwed Theresa Thomas** Ian Tomashik Ashley A. Wilson

John Alexander

LaKisha Barclift, Esq.

Paige Blessman

M. Rory Bolger, Ph.D., FAICP

Lisa DiChiera

Eric Fazzini, AICP

Willene Green

Christopher Gulock, AICP

Derrick Headd Marcel Hurt, Esq.

> TO: Keith Hutchings, Director

> > Municipal Parking Department

David Whitaker, Director FROM:

Legislative Policy Division

SUBJECT: 2024-2025 Budget Analysis

Attached is our budget analysis regarding the Municipal Parking Department's budget for the 2024-2025 Fiscal Year.

Please be prepared to respond to the issues/questions raised in our analysis during your scheduled hearing on Monday, March 11, 2024, at 11:00 am. We would then appreciate a written response to the issues/questions at your earliest convenience before or after your budget hearing. Please forward a copy of your response to the Council Members, the City Clerk's Office. and the Legislative Policy Division.

Please contact us if you have any questions regarding our budget analysis

Thank you for your cooperation in this matter.

Attachments

Council Members CC:

Auditor General's Office

Jay Rising, Chief Financial Officer

Tanya Stoudemire, Chief Deputy Chief Financial Officer

Steve Watson, Budget Director

Brad Dick, Group Executive-COO

James George, Agency OCFO

Malcolm Walker, Budget Analyst

Municipal Parking Department (34)

FY 2024-2025 Budget Analysis by the Legislative Policy Division

Issues and Questions

- Please briefly explain the new expense initiatives the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2025. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiatives will affect in FY 2025.
- 2. Please briefly explain the new capital funding requests the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2025. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new requests will affect in FY 2025.
- 3. Please briefly explain the operational reform and savings proposals the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2025. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new reforms/proposals will affect in FY 2025.
- 4. Please briefly explain the new revenue initiatives/proposals the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2025. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiatives/proposals will affect in FY 2025.
- 5. What are your projected performance metrics for each division/operational program in the current fiscal year? What are your target metrics for each division/operational program for fiscal year 2025?
- 6. The Municipal Parking Department had a goal for FY24 (July 2023-June 2024) to improve the efficiency of the on-street parking programs to expand the ParkDetroit app and add residential parking zones.
 - a. As of March 8, 2024, have the residential zones been established?
 - b. How many zones have been implemented?
- 7. According to the Office of the Chief Financial Officer (OCFO), the Municipal Parking Department had 17 vacancies through **February 9, 2024**.
 - a. Please indicate your number of vacancies as of March 11, 2025.
 - b. What are the titles of the vacant positions?
 - c. What is the difficulty of filling the vacancies?
 - d. Please briefly explain the Municipal Parking Department's strategy to fill the vacant positions or why they will remain vacant.
- 8. For FY25, Professional & Contractual Services has decreased by \$873,301 or (16%). Please explain the cause for the decrease and the impact this will have an impact on services.
- 9. For FY25, Operating Services expenditure decreased by \$143,405 (30%). Please explain the cause of the decrease.

- 10. For FY25, expenditures for Parking Violation Bureau—Processing & Collection (cost center #340085) for appropriation 27340 (Code Enforcement—Parking) decreased by \$500,000 (19%). Please explain the cause for the decrease and the impact this will have on services.
- 11. For FY25, expenditures for Parking Violations Bureau Towing & Storage, (cost center #340083) for appropriation 27340 (Code Enforcement Parking) has decreased by \$237,336 or (36%). Please explain the cause for the decrease. Are any towing and storage operations being shifted to another agency or contractor?
- 12. For FY25, revenues for Parking Violation Bureau Towing & Storage (cost center #340083) for appropriation 27340 have increased by \$271,000 or (49%); what will account for the increase in revenue?
- 13. For FY25, expenditures for Parking Garage Operations (cost enter #340030) for appropriation 27341 (Parking Garages) decreased by \$221,014 or (25%). Please explain the cause for the decrease. Will the funding for FY25 ensure coverage for the parking garage operations?
- 14. For FY25, revenues for Parking Violation Bureau Administration (cost center #340080) for appropriation 29340 (MPD Administration) has increased by \$1,674,000 or (22%); please explain this increase as the number of FTEs has remained the same as FY24.
- 15. For FY25, revenues for appropriation 27341-Parking Garages have increase by \$1,880,000, a 30% increase. Please explain.
 - a. Will there be additional meters installed on the streets of Detroit?
 - b. Do you expect the revenue to increase due to increased usage of the parking meter and the parking app?

MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT (34)

Mission

The Municipal Parking Department (MPD) provides economical on and off-street public parking services; enforces the City's parking ordinance; reduces parking-related congestion and pollution and improves residential quality of life; and develops parking plans to support development projects. This includes support for creative competitive strategies for the parking kiosk (meters) system, customer loyalty plans, enhanced parking experience through capital efforts, upgraded technology to maximize deployment of parking enforcement officers, better managed Citywide towing operations and coordinated use of City parking systems.

Operating Programs

- The **Auto Parking System**, pursuant to City ordinance, operates and maintains two garages one of which is downtown and one which is in the Eastern Market District. These garages, as well as the city-owned lots, contain approximately 1,254 parking spaces. The department operates 835 parking meter kiosks that include three parking zones with thirteen subzones that manage on-street parking.
- The **Parking Violations Bureau**, pursuant to City ordinance, manages the City's parking ticket processing and fine collection program and supervises parking regulations through its civilian ticket writing personnel (Parking Enforcement Officers). Enforcement efforts focus on ensuring public safety, creating parking availability, protecting the residential quality of life, and improving parking program compliance.

MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT (34)

Goals, Strategic Priorities and Related City Outcomes

Goals / Strategic Priorities	Timeframe	Related City Outcome
The ParkDetroit app will expand services to include multi-mobility trip planning options and merchant rewards programming.	October 2024 - March 2025	Efficient and Innovative Operations
2. Influence the overall public/private parking system to maximize usage, reduce congestion, limit environmental impact, and facilitate economic development - MPD will market the expansion of ParkDetroit participation within the City of Detroit, Detroit Metropolitan Airport, Ann Arbor, and additional strategic cities in southeastern Michigan.	November 2024 – June 2025	Economic Equity and Opportunity
3. Improve the efficiency of the on-street and off-street parking programs - MPD will market the expansion of the ParkDetroit app usages and add 15 to 20 residential parking zones to improve quality of life.	September 2023 – November 2024	Safer Neighborhoods
4. Improve existing parking assets and expand parking opportunities in the commercial corridors	October 2023 – January 2025	Economic Equity and Opportunity
5. Optimize the effectiveness of the on-street parking enforcement program and deployment of parking, with enforcement resources for all violations (including restricted time zone violations) - MPD will conduct a curbside parking study in FY23 to assess the ability to reduce curbside congestion, create a real-time flexible usage, and investigate a commercial parking monetization model. The goal will be to implement a permanent program in FY24.	December 2024 – June 2025	Efficient and Innovative Operations
6. Support the City's law enforcement strategies in parking related concerns - Explore the potential of automated optimized enforcement routing, maintain filled PEO positions and Sr. PEO positions support 7-day enforcement. MPD will continue to support DPD activities through late night overtime strategic enforcement coverage.	July 2024 – June 2025	Safer Neighborhoods

MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT (34)

Budget By Service

Services	FY 2025 Mayor Proposed	FY 2025 Mayor Proposed FTE
Admin / Overhead	\$1,019,570	11.00
Parking Enforcement	\$6,069,649	58.00
Parking Garage Operation & On-Street Parking	\$3,150,700	27.00
Total:	\$10,239,919	96.00

Metrics and Data

Metrics	Data	Related Goal #
Filled Parking Enforcement Officer (PEO) positions	42 PEO & 7 Sr. PEO	1
PEO attendance	95% attendance outside of paid leave	1
Parking occupancy	To be collected	2
Maintenance of parking on/off street stock	To be collected	4
Filled Parking Enforcement Officer (PEO) positions	42 PEO & 7 Sr. PEO	1
Launch ParkDetroit Trip Planning function to support daily park and ride services to reduce congestions and pollution and drive usage of unused parking in the CBD and Midtown area in FY 24	FY24 Total: Anticipated launch December 2023	1
Grow private/public participation to 120 parking locations	FY24 Total: 90 locations	2
Add 20 Residential Parking Zones	FY24 Total: 7 zones approved	3

Department 34 - Municipal Parking Department

Budget Summary

	FY2023 Actual		FY2024 A	dopted	FY2025 Mayor Proposed		
	General Fund	All Funds	nds General Fund All Funds		General Fund	All Funds	
Total Revenues	17,731,217	17,731,217	14,615,000	14,615,000	18,440,000	18,440,000	
Total Expenditures	9,074,505	10,862,968	11,283,565	11,283,565	10,239,919	10,239,919	
Net Tax Cost	(8,656,711)	(6,868,249)	(3,331,435)	(3,331,435)	(8,200,081)	(8,200,081)	

	FY2026 Forecast		FY2027 F	orecast	FY2028 Forecast		
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	
Total Revenues	18,809,000	18,809,000	19,185,380	19,185,380	19,569,288	19,569,288	
Total Expenditures	10,383,458	10,383,458	10,529,362	10,529,362	10,677,677	10,677,677	
Net Tax Cost	(8,425,542)	(8,425,542)	(8,656,018)	(8,656,018)	(8,891,611)	(8,891,611)	

General Fund Recurring vs One-Time Expenditures

	FY2024	FY2025
	Adopted	Mayor Proposed
Recurring Expenditures	11,283,565	10,239,919
One-Time Expenditures	-	-
Total Expenditures	11,283,565	10,239,919

Positions (by FTE)

	2/9/2024	FY2024	FY2025 FY2026		FY2027	FY2028
	Actual	Adopted	Mayor Proposed	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
General Fund	79.00	96.00	96.00	96.00	96.00	96.00
Non-General Fund	-	-	-	-	-	-
ARPA	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total Positions	79.00	96.00	96.00	96.00	96.00	96.00

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2024 Adopted	FY2025 Mayor Proposed	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast	FY2028 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	11,283,565	10,239,919	10,383,458	10,529,362	10,677,677
Salaries & Wages	4,064,012	4,023,363	4,098,983	4,176,112	4,254,785
Employee Benefits	1,217,410	1,200,618	1,218,379	1,236,493	1,254,969
Professional & Contractual Services	5,425,154	4,552,053	4,597,573	4,643,548	4,689,984
Operating Supplies	79,848	112,149	113,271	114,403	115,546
Operating Services	476,231	332,826	336,153	339,515	342,909
Other Expenses	20,910	18,910	19,099	19,291	19,484
Grand Total	11,283,565	10,239,919	10,383,458	10,529,362	10,677,677

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2024 Adopted	FY2025 Mayor Proposed	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast	FY2028 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	14,615,000	18,440,000	18,809,000	19,185,380	19,569,288
Revenues from Use of Assets	6,360,000	8,240,000	8,404,800	8,572,896	8,744,354
Fines, Forfeits, & Penalties	8,255,000	10,200,000	10,404,200	10,612,484	10,824,934
Grand Total	14,615,000	18,440,000	18,809,000	19,185,380	19,569,288

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2024 Adopted	FY2025 Mayor Proposed	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast	FY2028 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	11,283,565	10,239,919	10,383,458	10,529,362	10,677,677
1000 - General Fund	11,283,565	10,239,919	10,383,458	10,529,362	10,677,677
Salaries & Wages	4,064,012	4,023,363	4,098,983	4,176,112	4,254,785
Employee Benefits	1,217,410	1,200,618	1,218,379	1,236,493	1,254,969
Professional & Contractual Services	5,425,154	4,552,053	4,597,573	4,643,548	4,689,984
Operating Supplies	79,848	112,149	113,271	114,403	115,546
Operating Services	476,231	332,826	336,153	339,515	342,909
Other Expenses	20,910	18,910	19,099	19,291	19,484
Grand Total	11,283,565	10,239,919	10,383,458	10,529,362	10,677,677

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2024 Adopted	FY2025 Mayor Proposed	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast	FY2028 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	14,615,000	18,440,000	18,809,000	19,185,380	19,569,288
1000 - General Fund	14,615,000	18,440,000	18,809,000	19,185,380	19,569,288
Revenues from Use of Assets	6,360,000	8,240,000	8,404,800	8,572,896	8,744,354
Fines, Forfeits, & Penalties	8,255,000	10,200,000	10,404,200	10,612,484	10,824,934
Grand Total	14,615,000	18,440,000	18,809,000	19,185,380	19,569,288

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - EXPENDITURES DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026	FY2027	FY2028
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	Adopted	Mayor Proposed	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name					
34 - Municipal Parking Department	11,283,565	10,239,919	10,383,458	10,529,362	10,677,677
1000 - General Fund	11,283,565	10,239,919	10,383,458	10,529,362	10,677,677
27340 - Code Enforcement - Parking	5,483,079	4,712,868	4,765,657	4,819,093	4,873,187
340040 - Parking Meter Maintenance	1,906,320	1,864,145	1,885,687	1,907,505	1,929,606
340050 - Parking Meter Collection	326,453	335,753	341,871	348,109	354,468
340083 - Parking Violation Bureau - Towing & Storage	652,862	415,526	419,681	423,877	428,115
340085 - Parking Violation Bureau - Processing & Collection	2,597,444	2,097,444	2,118,418	2,139,602	2,160,998
27341 - Parking Garages	1,514,469	1,330,420	1,350,164	1,370,242	1,390,660
340020 - Parking Maintenance	622,301	659,266	671,263	683,496	695,968
340030 - Parking Operations	892,168	671,154	678,901	686,746	694,692
29340 - MPD Administration	4,286,017	4,196,631	4,267,637	4,340,027	4,413,830
340010 - Parking Administration	1,182,792	1,139,952	1,160,325	1,181,092	1,202,262
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	3,103,225	3,056,679	3,107,312	3,158,935	3,211,568
Grand Total	11,283,565	10,239,919	10,383,458	10,529,362	10,677,677

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - REVENUES DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Fund # - Fund Name	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026	FY2027	FY2028
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	Adopted	Mayor Proposed	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
1000 - General Fund	14,615,000	18,440,000	18,809,000	19,185,380	19,569,288
27340 - Code Enforcement - Parking	555,000	826,000	842,520	859,370	876,558
340083 - Parking Violation Bureau - Towing & Storage	555,000	826,000	842,520	859,370	876,558
27341 - Parking Garages	6,360,000	8,240,000	8,404,800	8,572,896	8,744,354
340330 - Revenue Fund Trustee	1,260,000	1,508,000	1,538,160	1,568,923	1,600,302
340331 - On Street Meter Collections	5,100,000	6,732,000	6,866,640	7,003,973	7,144,052
29340 - MPD Administration	7,700,000	9,374,000	9,561,680	9,753,114	9,948,376
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	7,700,000	9,374,000	9,561,680	9,753,114	9,948,376
rand Total	14,615,000	18,440,000	18,809,000	19,185,380	19,569,288

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name Job Code - Job Title	FY2024 Adopted	FY2025 Mayor Proposed	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast	FY2028 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	96	96	96	96	96
1000 - General Fund	96	96	96	96	96
27340 - Code Enforcement - Parking	13	13	13	13	13
340040 - Parking Meter Maintenance	7	7	7	7	7
712331.Parking Meter Repair Worker	6	6	6	6	6
712341.Parking Meter Service Foreman	1	1	1	1	1
340050 - Parking Meter Collection	6	6	6	6	6
012017.Principal Clerk Parking Violations	1	0	0	0	0
012041.Principal Clerk	0	1	1	1	1
012078.Head Clerk Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
047342.Parking Meter Revenue Collector	4	4	4	4	4
27341 - Parking Garages	13	14	14	14	14
340020 - Parking Maintenance	11	12	12	12	12
619121.General Environmental Technician 1	3	0	0	0	0
619142.General Environmental Technician 1 MPD	0	3	3	3	3
621031.Building Trades Worker General	1	0	0	0	0
622031.Building Operator 1	0	1	1	1	1
641041.Building Operations Supervisor Grade 1	1	1	1	1	1
641045. Building Maintenance Operations Supervisor	1	1	1	1	1
712011.Mechanical Helper	1	1	1	1	1
721523. Vehicle Operator 1	4	4	4	4	4
8621031.Building Trades Worker General	0	1	1	1	1
340030 - Parking Operations	2	2	2	2	2

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

ind # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name Job Code - Job Title	FY2024 Adopted	FY2025 Mayor Proposed	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast	FY2028 Forecast
081001.Customer Service Representative I	1	0	0	0	0
081004.Customer Service Supervisor	0	1	1	1	1
081007.Customer Service Supervisor Municipal Parking	1	0	0	0	0
501029.Customer Service Specialist 1	0	1	1	1	1
29340 - MPD Administration	70	69	69	69	69
340010 - Parking Administration	12	11	11	11	11
010152.Director Municipal Parking Department	1	1	1	1	1
010153.Deputy Director Municipal Parking Department	1	1	1	1	1
010729.General Manager Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
010838.Manager 2 Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
010944.Manager 1 Municipal Parking	2	2	2	2	2
012017.Principal Clerk Parking Violations	1	0	0	0	0
012041.Principal Clerk	0	1	1	1	1
013131.Office Assistant 3	2	3	3	3	3
013373.Executive Administrative Assistant 1	1	1	1	1	1
339210.Parking Enforcement Control Specialist	2	0	0	0	0
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	58	58	58	58	58
012089. Assistant Administrative Supervisor Parking Violat	1	1	1	1	1
041543. Principal Governmental Analyst Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
099168.Parking Enforcement Investigator	1	1	1	1	1
099170. Supervising Parking Enforcement Investigator	1	1	1	1	1
339220.Parking Enforcement Officer	42	42	42	42	42
339230.Senior Parking Enforcement Officer	7	7	7	7	7

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name Job Code - Job Title	FY2024 Adopted	FY2025 Mayor Proposed	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast	FY2028 Forecast
339245.Head Parking Enforcement Officer	1	1	1	1	1
929101.Administrative Special Services Staff 1	2	2	2	2	2
929103. Administrative Special Services Staff 3	1	1	1	1	1
929102.Administrative Special Services Staff 2	1	1	1	1	1
Grand Total	96	96	96	96	96