


David Whitaker, Esq.
Director
Irvin Corley, Jr.
Executive Policy Manager
Marcell R. Todd, Jr.
Director, City Planning
Commission
Janese Chapman
Director, Historic Designation
Advisory Board

John Alexander
LaKisha Barclift, Esq.
Paige Blessman
M. Rory Bolger, Ph.D., FAICP
Lisa DiChiera
Eric Fazzini, AICP
Willene Green
Christopher Gulock, AICP
Derrick Headd
Marcel Hurt, Esq.

City of Detroit
CITY COUNCIL
LEGISLATIVE POLICY DIVISION
208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Phone: (313) 224-4946 Fax: (313) 224-4336

Kimani Jeffrey
Anthony W. L. Johnson
Phillip Keller, Esq.
Edward King
Kelsey Maas
Jamie Murphy
Latawn Oden
Dolores Perales
Analine Powers, Ph.D.
W. Akilah Redmond
Rebecca Savage
Sabrina Shockley
Renee Short
Floyd Stanley
Thomas Stephens, Esq.
Timarie Szwed
Theresa Thomas
Ian Tomashik
Ashley A. Wilson

TO: Christal Phillips, Executive Director
Board of Ethics

FROM: David Whitaker, Director 
Legislative Policy Division

DATE: March 20, 2024

RE: 2024-2025 Budget Analysis

Attached is our budget analysis regarding your department's budget for the 2024-2025 Fiscal Year.

Please be prepared to respond to the issues/questions raised in our analysis during your scheduled hearing on **Thursday, March 21, 2024, at 11:00 a.m.** We would then appreciate a written response to the issues/questions at your earliest convenience before or after your budget hearing. Please forward a copy of your responses to the Council members, the City Clerk's Office, and the Legislative Policy Division.

Please contact us if you have any questions regarding our budget analysis.

Thank you for your cooperation in this matter.

Attachments:
Issues and Questions
Agency Plan: Mission, Goals and Activity Summary

cc: Councilmembers
Auditor General's Office
Jay Rising, CFO
Tanya Stoudemire, Chief Deputy CFO-Policy & Administration Director
Steven Watson, Deputy CFO/Budget Director
Andrea Ringer, Budget Analyst
James George, Agency CFO for Governmental Operation Departments
Malik Washington, Mayor's Office

Board of Ethics
FY 2024-25 Budget Analysis by the Legislative Policy Division

Board of Ethics 2024-25 Budget

The Board of Ethics is an independent Charter created entity established by the 1997 City Charter. The Ethics Ordinance was enacted by the City Council in 2000 and amended in 2012. The Ordinance established disclosure requirements and standards of conduct applicable to all City of Detroit Public Servants. The Board is charged with the responsibility for the implementation and administration of the Ordinance, which includes receiving complaint alleging violations of the Ordinance and issuing Advisory Opinions.

The integrity of City government and public trust and confidence in public officers and employees require that public servants be independent, impartial and responsible to the People; that government decisions and policy be made within the proper channels of the governmental system; and that public servants be prohibited from participating in matters that affect their personal or financial interests. The purpose of the Ethics Ordinance is to establish guidelines for ethical standards of conduct for all City government officials and employees by defining those acts or actions that are incompatible with the best interests of the City and by mandating disclosure by public servants of private financial or other interests in matters affecting the City.

The Board of Ethics role is to investigate and resolve complaints regarding alleged violations of the Ethics Ordinance by public servants, and to issue advisory opinions regarding the meaning and application of provisions of the Charter, City Ordinances, other laws, or regulations establishing standards of conduct for public servants.

Advisory opinions are rendered upon written request by a public servant. Advisory opinions are published by the Board annually in a report to the Mayor and City Council. The Board is charged with monitoring and recommending improvements in the disclosure requirements, and in the standards of conduct under the Ethics Ordinance, in order "to promote an ethical environment within City government, and to ensure the ethical behavior of public servants."

All meetings of the Board are open to the public unless an individual involved in the matter to be addressed requests in writing that the meeting be closed or unless otherwise provided by Ordinance or by statute.

Issues and Questions

1. Please briefly explain the Board of Ethic's new expense initiatives, new capital funding requests, operational reform and savings proposals, and new revenue initiatives/proposals to be implemented in FY 2025.
2. What are the Board of Ethic's number of vacancies as of February 29, 2024? Also, please briefly explain the department's strategy to fill any vacant positions.
3. The M\$ FY 2025 recommended total appropriations for the Board of Ethics is \$557,960 a \$12,682 increase from the \$545,278 in FY 2024. Increase is due to expenditure increase in salaries and wages, \$29,520. The increase is offset by modest decreases in operating services. Please explain the expenditure increases in salaries and wages.
4. What are your projected performance metrics for the current fiscal year? What are your target metrics for the fiscal year 2025?
5. How many ethics investigations were conducted and completed in fiscal year 2024? How many complaints were received in FY 2024 (through January 31, 2024)?
6. B35-4: Does the Board of Ethics have an adequate Learning Management System in place to provide robust online training to the 9,000 City employees?
7. B35-5: 1,041 public servants completed ethics training in 2023. How many City employees completed ethics training in 2024 through March 19, 2024? At what year does the department anticipate the 9,000 City employees would have receive the ethics training?

8. B35-5: Please explain the benefit of the proposed \$6,500 cost of the expansion of ethics training system in Ultipro.
9. Please provide a copy of the Board of Ethics 2024 Annual report when it is released in April 2024.

Non-Departmental (35)

Mission

The Non-Departmental budget provides funds for activities which are not the responsibility of any one single agency. Non-Departmental is also the depository agency for General Fund contributions for enterprise activities and for a wide variety of General Fund revenues, including four of the five major revenues (casino revenues/wagering taxes; income taxes; property taxes; state revenue sharing) and revenues from reimbursements from enterprise/non-General Fund agencies of personal services costs, transfers from other City funds, and use of prior year surplus.

Operating Programs and Services

The Non-Departmental budget includes the following independent boards, commissions, and/or agencies with citywide operations:

- **Board of Ethics** investigates and resolves complaints alleging violations of the Ethics Ordinance by public servants, and issues advisory opinions regarding Charter, City ordinances or other laws and regulations establishing standards of conduct and disclosure requirements for public servants. Opinions are rendered upon request by a public servant and published annually in a report to the Mayor and City Council. These actions are “to promote an ethical environment within City government, and to ensure the ethical behavior of public servants.”
- **Board of Police Commissioners** (BOPC) is a civilian agency that exercises supervisory control and oversight of the Detroit Police Department (DPD) as set forth in the Charter. The Board has 11 members, 7 elected by District and 4 appointed by the Mayor with City Council consent. The Board meets every week including (12) community/evening meetings in the districts. Internal organization includes fiscal, policy, administrative, legal advisor, community outreach, and the Office of the Chief Investigator, which processes and investigates 1,500 - 1,700 complaints annually. Responsibilities include: in consultation with the Chief of Police and the Mayor, establishes policies, rules and regulations for the DPD; subpoena power for investigative purposes; review and approval of the DPD budget; investigation of non-criminal citizens’ complaints against members of the Detroit Police Department; final authority in imposing or reviewing discipline of employees of the department; and disqualification appeals from police recruits hoping to enter the Detroit Police Academy.

Non-Departmental (35)

Operating Programs and Services Details

Board of Ethics

Goals, Strategic Priorities and Related City Outcomes

Goals / Strategic Priorities	Timeframe	Related City Outcome
1. Creation of an Independent Learning Management System - An independent Learning Management System will allow the BOE to build robust online training that will assist in handling the workload of educating 9,000 public servants solely on the Ethics Ordinance.	July 2024 - June 2028	Effective Governance
2. Outreach and Advertising - Public outreach is necessary to ensure transparency and education on what services the BOE provides to City of Detroit public servants and citizens.	July 2024 - June 2028	Effective Governance
3. Board Training and Development - Training and professional development opportunities allow the BOE Board members and staff to serve the City of Detroit effectively and run efficient meetings that abide by state law. This includes providing annual training to Board members, benchmarking trips to other Ethics offices for staff, and annual attendance and leadership opportunities at the Council on Governmental Ethics Laws (COGEL) conference.	July 2024 - June 2028	Effective Governance
4. Maintaining Investigative Resources - WingSwept and CLEAR are best practice systems that assist the BOE in its investigations and to organize investigative findings in a unified report.	July 2024 - June 2028	Efficient and Innovative Operations

Budget By Service

Services	FY 2025 Mayor Proposed	FY 2025 Mayor Proposed FTE
Administrative Operations	\$ 244,455	2.00
Board & Staff Professional Development	\$ 35,384	-
Ethics Training	\$ 85,623	1.00

Non-Departmental (35)

Maintaining Investigative Resources	\$ 150,998	1.00
Overall Public Outreach	\$ 15,500	-
Public Servant Outreach	\$ 26,000	-
Total	\$ 557,960	4.00

Metrics and Data

Metrics	Data	Related Goal #
# of public servants who complete ethics training (2023)	1041 public servants trained in 2023	1
# of Requests for an Advisory Opinion (RAOs) (2023)	18 RAOs received in 2023	2
# of disclosures (2023)	13 disclosures received in 2023	2
# of Q&As attended (2023)	7 Q&As	2
# of community meetings attended (2023)	9 community meetings	2
# of benchmarking trips and conference presentations (2023)	12 total trips & presentations	3
# of vacancies (in FY24)	0 vacancies	4

Operating Budget Highlights

Initiative	FY 2025 Mayor Proposed	FY 2025 Mayor Proposed FTE
Expansion of ethics training system in Ultipro	\$6,500	-

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - EXPENDITURES
DEPARTMENT 35 - NON-DEPARTMENTAL**

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026	FY2027	FY2028
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	Adopted	Mayor Proposed	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name					
27352 - Community Programs Support	2,963,716	500,000	500,000	500,000	500,000
350230 - Childhood Education & Enrichment Support*	2,750,000	500,000	500,000	500,000	500,000
350240 - EITC Support	213,716	-	-	-	-
28351 - Board of Ethics	545,278	557,960	565,912	574,011	582,258
350165 - Board of Ethics	545,278	557,960	565,912	574,011	582,258
28352 - Media Services & Communications	1,751,094	1,509,418	1,537,034	1,565,194	1,593,907
350325 - Communications Services	601,760	736,132	749,792	763,723	777,928
350326 - Media Services*	1,149,334	773,286	787,242	801,471	815,979
28354 - Elected Officials Compensation	1,600,000	1,645,427	1,697,362	1,751,069	1,806,607
350007 - Elected Officials' Compensation	1,600,000	1,645,427	1,697,362	1,751,069	1,806,607
29350 - Citywide Overhead	50,970,761	61,658,882	63,486,556	64,106,352	66,086,446
350020 - Dues & Memberships	386,235	400,660	440,660	440,660	440,660
350220 - Claims Fund (Insurance Premiums)	12,100,000	12,100,000	12,100,000	12,100,000	12,100,000
350310 - Detroit Building Authority	1,207,113	1,284,075	1,307,303	1,330,984	1,355,127
350800 - Centralized Payments	30,528,075	30,411,327	30,715,440	31,022,594	31,332,820
350980 - Workforce Investments	6,749,338	17,462,820	18,923,153	19,212,114	20,857,839
29351 - Pension-Related Payments	-	-	-	-	-
350015 - Pension Benefits Administration	-	-	-	-	-
3921 - Other Special Revenue Fund	2,164,363	3,321,541	3,363,161	3,596,041	3,639,342
21243 - Opioid Settlement Proceeds	-	1,240,541	1,240,541	1,430,969	1,430,969
350030 - Other Operations Services	-	1,240,541	1,240,541	1,430,969	1,430,969
28353 - Cable TV	2,164,363	2,081,000	2,122,620	2,165,072	2,208,373
350324 - P.E.G. Fees	2,164,363	2,081,000	2,122,620	2,165,072	2,208,373

*FY 2024 included one-time funding for these programs

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER
DEPARTMENT 35 - NON-DEPARTMENTAL**

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name					
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026	FY2027	FY2028
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	Adopted	Mayor Proposed	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Job Code - Job Title					
932507.Supervising Investigator Police Commission Citizen	1	1	1	1	1
932508.Supervising Investigator Police Commission	1	1	1	1	1
932509.Supervising Investigator Police Commission Quality	1	1	1	1	1
932510.Senior Investigator Police Commission	5	5	5	5	5
932512.Attorney To The Board Of Police Commissioners	1	1	1	1	1
27350 - Special Services	8	12	12	12	12
350370 - Project Clean Slate Operations	8	11	11	11	11
013376.Executive Administrative Assistant 2	0	1	1	1	1
091157.Supervising Assistant Corporation Counsel	1	1	1	1	1
111003.Project Manager Analytics Specialist 3	0	1	1	1	1
13111002.Project Manager Analytics Specialist 2	1	0	0	0	0
43601103.Administrative Assistant 3	1	1	1	1	1
43601104.Administrative Assistant 4	2	3	3	3	3
929102.Administrative Special Services Staff 2	0	2	2	2	2
929107.Administrative Special Services Staff 2 Exempt	2	1	1	1	1
929108.Administrative Special Services Staff 3 Exempt	1	1	1	1	1
350372 - Reparations Task Force	0	1	1	1	1
010200.Project Manager	0	1	1	1	1
28351 - Board of Ethics	4	4	4	4	4
350165 - Board of Ethics	4	4	4	4	4
010126.Executive Director Board Of Ethics	1	1	1	1	1
011726.Investigator Board Of Ethics	1	1	1	1	1
929107.Administrative Special Services Staff 2 Exempt	1	1	1	1	1

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER
DEPARTMENT 35 - NON-DEPARTMENTAL**

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name					
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026	FY2027	FY2028
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	Adopted	Mayor Proposed	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Job Code - Job Title					
931628.Administrative Assistant Grade 2 Board of Ethnics	1	1	1	1	1
28352 - Media Services & Communications	16	16	16	16	16
350325 - Communications Services	8	9	9	9	9
010918.Manager 1 Communications	1	1	1	1	1
193025.Graphic Designer	2	2	2	2	2
193035.Principal Graphic Designer	1	1	1	1	1
43309904.Clerk 4	1	1	1	1	1
439131.Photographer General	1	1	1	1	1
439142.Supervising Photographer	1	1	1	1	1
81037161.Supervisor Of Printing	1	1	1	1	1
931525.Communications Specialist 2 Media Services	0	1	1	1	1
350326 - Media Services	8	7	7	7	7
931501.Director Detroit Cable Communications Commission	1	1	1	1	1
931512.Chief Engineer Detroit Cable Communications Comm	0	1	1	1	1
931524.Communications Specialist 3 Media Services	4	3	3	3	3
931525.Communications Specialist 2 Media Services	2	2	2	2	2
931531.Manager of Media Production	1	0	0	0	0
28354 - Elected Officials Compensation	11	11	11	11	11
350007 - Elected Officials' Compensation	11	11	11	11	11
010010.City Clerk Election Commission Chairperson \$2000	1	1	1	1	1
010030.City Council Member	8	8	8	8	8
010031.City Council President Election Commissioner \$2000	1	1	1	1	1
010040.Mayor	1	1	1	1	1