


David Whitaker, Esq.
Director
Irvin Corley, Jr.
Executive Policy Manager
Marcell R. Todd, Jr.
Director, City Planning
Commission
Janese Chapman
Director, Historic Designation
Advisory Board

John Alexander
Roland Amarteifio
Megha Bamola
LaKisha Barclift, Esq.
Paige Blessman
M. Rory Bolger, Ph.D., FAICP
Eric Fazzini, AICP
Willene Green
Christopher Gulock, AICP

City of Detroit
CITY COUNCIL
LEGISLATIVE POLICY DIVISION
208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Phone: (313) 224-4946 Fax: (313) 224-4336

Derrick Headd
Marcel Hurt, Esq.
Kimani Jeffrey
Phillip Keller, Esq.
Edward King
Kelsey Maas
Jamie Murphy
Analine Powers, Ph.D.
W. Akilah Redmond
Laurie Anne Sabatini
Rebecca Savage
Sabrina Shockley
Renee Short
Floyd Stanley
Thomas Stephens, Esq.
Timarie Szwed
Theresa Thomas
Ashley A. Wilson

TO: COUNCIL MEMBERS

FROM: David Whitaker, Director 
Legislative Policy Division Staff

DATE: July 18, 2023

RE: **10:05 Public Hearing Avanath North End Parcel Owner 1, LLC PA 210 Certificate Request (312 Smith) Petition # 2023-100-D**

The Commercial Rehabilitation Act, PA 210 of 2005, is a tax incentive for the rehabilitation of commercial property for the primary purpose and use of a commercial business or a multi-family residential facility. The property must be located within an established Commercial Rehabilitation District. Exemptions are approved for a term of 1-10 years, as determined by the local unit of government. The property taxes are based upon the prior year's taxable value.

Avanath North End Parcel Owner 1, LLC, is the project developer of the properties that covers six (6) parcels, inclusive of **312 Smith**,¹ which are included in the current PA 210 certificate request. The developer intends to redevelop the site, currently consisting of a 2 story single family house & adjacent vacant lots covering a 0.474 acre area, into a multi-family building with 10 apartment units. The building will have 20% of the units available at affordable rental rates at 80% AMI. This is a single element of the larger **North End Landings**² project. The developers have also requested approvals of both a Brownfield TIF and Neighborhood Enterprise Zone tax abatement.³

¹ Property Addresses: 282, 290, 296, 302, 306 & 312 Smith

² **North End Landings**: Avanath North End Parcel Owner 1, LLC, joined by Civic Tekton North End LLC, each propose to construct residential units on the property. Civic Tekton North End LLC proposes to construct a total of eight (8) affordable for-sale attached townhomes on the property (incentivized via the NEZ). The new development proposed to be constructed on the property is expected to create a total of eight (8) affordable for-sale townhomes and one hundred seventy seven (177) apartments of which ninety five (95) are proposed to be intended for occupancy by senior citizens. Overall, the North End project is expected to create 185 new households. The overall project is expected to create 200 temporary construction job and 4 FTE's. The property consists of twenty-five (25) tax parcels.

³ The NEZ is related to the eight (8) affordable for-sale townhomes.

Building Use (Multi-Family)

Total Residential Square Footage	7,980 SF
Total Residential Units	10 units (20% affordable @ 80% AMI)
Studio	N/A
1 Bedroom	4 units; 608 avg. SF; \$1,252-\$1,670/mo. rent
2 Bedroom	6 units; 898 avg. SF; \$1,501-\$2,200/mo. rent

DEGC Project Evaluation Checklist**North End Landings**

Developer: Avanath North End Parcel Owner I, LLC & Civic Tekton North End LLC

Principals: Daryl Carter, CEO of Avanath; Everett Stone, Vanguard Community Development; Jason Jones, Tekton

Commercial Rehabilitation Act, **PA 210 of 2005 as amended** – Current taxes frozen at pre-rehab construction values, local taxes abated for up to 10 years

Request Type	PA 210 Certificate
DEGC Recommendation	10-Year Approval of PA 210 Certificate
Location	
Address	282-312 Smith
City Council District	District 5
Neighborhood	North End
Building Use	
Total Residential Square Footage	7,980 SF
Total Residential Units	10 units (20% affordable @ 80% AMI)
Studio	N/A
1 Bedroom	4 units; 608 avg. SF; \$1,252-\$1,670/mo rent
2 Bedroom	6 units; 898 avg. SF; \$1,501-\$2,200/mo rent
Project Description	
<p>North End Landings (the “Project”) is a proposed mixed income (market rate and affordable) multifamily development in the historic North End, which is located just north of Downtown Detroit and near Wayne State University. The full project is new construction that will consist of 177 multifamily units across a scattered site in an area generally bound by John R, E. Bethune, Chandler, and St. Antoine streets, to be delivered starting in September of 2024 with construction expected to be complete in early 2025.</p> <p>For the purpose of economic impact reporting, the investment and tax incentive have been broken out per site. The overall project investment is \$42.2M; total acquisition \$1.7M, total hard costs \$33.5M, total soft costs \$7M. The total value of the PA 210 abatement from the city is estimated at \$1,881,671. The total net benefit to the city is estimated at \$1,491,737 over the life of the abatement.</p>	
Sources and Uses	
Total Investment	\$3.1M
Sources	\$3.1M Equity (100%)
Uses	\$128K Acquisition (4%); \$2.5M Hard Costs (79%); \$516K Soft Costs (17%)

Project Benefits	
Estimated Jobs	4 FTE (Overall Project) / 15 Construction
Estimated City benefits before tax abatement	\$295,624
Total estimated City value of PA 210 abatement	\$138,561
Less cost of services & utility deductions	\$57,637
Net Benefit to City	\$99,426

City of Detroit: Benefits, Costs, and Net Benefits over the Next 10 Years

	Amount
Real Property Taxes, before abatement	\$152,381
Personal Property Taxes, before abatement	\$0
New Residential Property Taxes	\$0
Municipal Income Taxes - Direct Workers	\$2,661
Municipal Income Taxes - Indirect Workers	\$702
Municipal Income Taxes - Corporate Income	\$1,232
Municipal Income Taxes - Construction Period	\$14,984
Municipal Income Taxes - New Res. Inhabitants	\$49,619
Utility Revenue	\$56,884
Utility Users' Excise Taxes	\$5,102
State Revenue Sharing - Sales Tax	\$298
Building Permits and Fees	\$11,046
Miscellaneous Taxes & User Fees	\$716
<u>Subtotal Benefits</u>	<u>\$295,624</u>
Cost of Providing Municipal Services	(\$753)
Cost of Providing Utility Services	(\$56,884)
<u>Subtotal Costs</u>	<u>(\$57,637)</u>
Net Benefits	\$237,987

Impacted Taxing Units: Incentive Summary over the First 10 Years ⁴

	Additional Benefits Before Tax Abatements	Additional Costs	Real Property Tax Abatement	Business Personal Property Tax Abatement	Utility Users Tax & Corporation Income Tax Exemption	Net Benefits After Tax Abatements & Incentives
City of Detroit	\$295,624	(\$57,637)	(\$138,561)	\$0	\$0	\$99,426
Wayne County	\$36,438	(\$230)	(\$32,924)	\$0	\$0	\$3,284
Detroit Public Schools	\$136,320	\$0	(\$53,638)	\$0	\$0	\$82,682
State Education	\$27,225	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$27,225
Wayne RESA	\$24,627	\$0	(\$22,394)	\$0	\$0	\$2,233
Wayne County Comm. College	\$14,612	\$0	(\$13,286)	\$0	\$0	\$1,325
Wayne County Zoo	\$450	\$0	(\$409)	\$0	\$0	\$41
Detroit Institute of Arts	\$901	\$0	(\$819)	\$0	\$0	\$82
Total	\$536,197	(\$57,867)	(\$262,032)	\$0	\$0	\$216,298

DEGC Chart of Taxes Before, During & After the Incentive⁵

	Existing Taxes	New Taxes <i>With</i> Incentive(s)	New Taxes <i>Without</i> Incentive
City of Detroit	\$379	\$2,568	\$13,536
Library	\$61	\$411	\$2,165
Wayne County	\$105	\$708	\$3,731
Detroit Public Schools	\$394	\$9,121	\$14,046
State Education	\$79	\$2,805	\$2,805
Wayne RESA	\$71	\$481	\$2,538
Wayne County Comm. College	\$42	\$286	\$1,506
Wayne County Zoo	\$1	\$9	\$46
Detroit Institute of Arts	\$3	\$18	\$93
Total	\$1,134	\$16,406	\$40,466

⁴ Charts courtesy of the DEGC

⁵ Existing Annual Taxes: \$1,134 - New Annual Taxes DURING the Incentive: \$16,406 & Taxes after the Incentive EXPIRES: \$40,466

Conclusion

The estimated total capital investment for this project is **\$3.1 million**. It is also estimated that the completed project will create 15 temporary construction jobs.⁶ The total value of the 10-year Commercial Rehabilitation tax savings is estimated at **\$262,032**.

Based on the investment and jobs, this project is estimated to provide the City of Detroit a net benefit of **\$99,426**, and all of the impacted taxing units, a net benefit of **\$216,298** over the 10 years of the Commercial Rehabilitation tax abatement.

However, if the developer does not proceed in good faith to complete the project, pursuant to Act, the City Council may revoke the certificate: *“The legislative body of the qualified local governmental unit may, by resolution, revoke the commercial rehabilitation exemption certificate of a facility if it finds that the completion of rehabilitation of the qualified facility has not occurred within the time authorized by the legislative body in the exemption certificate, or a duly authorized extension of that time, or that the holder of the commercial rehabilitation exemption certificate has not proceeded in good faith with the operation of the qualified facility in a manner consistent with the purposes of this act and in the absence of circumstances that are beyond the control of the holder of the exemption certificate.”*⁷

Please contact us if we can be of any further assistance.

Attachments: May 10, 2023 - Letter from Finance Assessors
March 23, 2023 - CRIO⁸ Employment Clearance

cc: Auditor General’s Office
Donald Rencher, Chief of Services and Infrastructure
Antoine Bryant, Planning and Development Department
Julie Schneider, HRD
Veronica Farley, HRD
Stephanie Grimes Washington, Mayor’s Office
Gail Fulton, Mayor’s Office
Malik Washington, Mayor’s Office
Kenyetta Bridges, DEGC
Jennifer Kanalos, DEGC
Brian Vosburg, DEGC

⁶ 4 FTE’s (Overall Project)

⁷ COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION ACT (Act 210) MCL. 207.852(1)

⁸ CRIO- Civil Rights, Inclusion & Opportunity Department



Rendering of North End Landings



Location Map⁹

⁹ Rendering of North End Landings & Location Map courtesy of DEGC



CITY OF DETROIT
 OFFICE OF THE CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER
 OFFICE OF THE ASSESSOR

COLEMAN A. YOUNG MUNICIPAL CENTER
 2 WOODWARD AVE., SUITE 824
 DETROIT, MI 48226
 PHONE: 313•224•3011
 FAX: 313•224•9400

May 10, 2023

Katharine G. Trudeau, Deputy Director
 Planning & Development Department
 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center
 2 Woodward Ave, Suite 808
 Detroit, MI 48226

RE: Commercial Rehabilitation Certificate – **Avanath North End Parcel Owner I, LLC**
 Property Address: 282, 290, 296, 302, 306 & 312 Smith
 Parcel Number: 01002170, 01002171, 01002172, 01002173, 01002174, 01002175

Dear Ms. Trudeau:

The Office of the Chief Financial Officer, Office of the Assessor, has reviewed the Commercial Rehabilitation certificate application for the properties located at **282, 290, 296, 302, 306 & 312 Smith** in the **North End** area in the City of Detroit.

The rationale for issuing Commercial Rehabilitation certificates under PA 210 of 2005, as amended, is based on the anticipation of increased market value upon completion of new construction and /or significant rehabilitation of existing commercial property and commercial housing property. Normal repair and maintenance are not assessed and do not necessarily generate additional market value.

The developer intends to redevelop the site, currently consisting of a 2 story single family house & adjacent vacant lots covering together a 0.474 acre area, into a multi-family building, made up of 10 apartment units, including 20% of the units available at affordable rental rates.

The 2023 values are as follows:

Parcel #	Address	Building Assessed Value (SEV)	Building Taxable Value	Land Assessed Value (SEV)	Land Taxable Value
01002170	312 Smith	\$0	\$0	\$24,600	\$24,600
01002171	306 Smith	\$0	\$0	\$24,600	\$24,600
01002172	302 Smith	\$0	\$0	\$300	\$300
01002173	296 Smith	\$26,200	\$12,546	\$300	\$144
01002174	290 Smith	\$0	\$0	\$300	\$114
01002175	282 Smith	\$0	\$0	\$24,600	\$24,600

This property meets the criteria set forth under PA 210 of 2005, as amended. It applies to a building or a group of contiguous buildings, a portion of a building or group of contiguous buildings previously used for commercial or industrial purposes, obsolete industrial property, and vacant property which, within the immediately preceding 15 years, was operating as a commercial business enterprise.

The property is currently owned by Avanath North End Parcel Owner I, LLC. The State Tax Commission (STC) has determined that applicants may proceed with obtaining local approval of the issuance of the certificate prior to acquiring title to the property, but that the certificate would be held in abeyance by the STC pending submission of proof of ownership.



CITY OF DETROIT
OFFICE OF THE CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER
OFFICE OF THE ASSESSOR

COLEMAN A. YOUNG MUNICIPAL CENTER
2 WOODWARD AVE., SUITE 824
DETROIT, MI 48226
PHONE: 313•224•3011
FAX: 313•224•9400

Commercial Rehabilitation Certificate
Avanath North End Parcel Owner I, LLC
Page 2

A review of the general plans, along with the criteria set forth under the Commercial Rehabilitation Act, indicated that the proposed project located at **282, 290, 296, 302, 306 & 312 Smith** is eligible as it pertains to the Commercial Rehabilitation certificate criteria under P.A. 210 of 2005, as amended. Please note that while the project is eligible, the State tax Commission will hold this certificate in abeyance until the Detroit Land Bank Authority issues the 5/50 waiver for these properties.

Sincerely,

Charles Ericson, MMAO
Assessor, Board of Assessors



Commercial Rehabilitation Certificate
Avanath North End Parcel Owner I, LLC
Page 3

Parcel: 01002170
Owner: Avanath North End Landing Parcel Owner I, LLC
Property Address: 312 Smith
Legal Description: S SMITH 126 WM Y HAMLIN & S J BROWNS L8, P72, PLATS, W C R 1/103 30 X 115

Parcel: 01002171
Owner: Avanath North End Landing Parcel Owner I, LLC
Property Address: 306 Smith
Legal Description: S SMITH 127 WM Y HAMLIN & S J BROWNS L8, P72, PLATS, W C R 1/103 30 X 115

Parcel: 01002172
Owner: Avanath North End Landing Parcel Owner I, LLC
Property Address: 302 Smith
Legal Description: S SMITH 128 WM Y HAMLIN & S J BROWNS L8, P72, PLATS, W C R 1/103 30 X 115

Parcel: 01002173
Owner: Avanath North End Landing Parcel Owner I, LLC
Property Address: 296 Smith
Legal Description: S SMITH 129 WM Y HAMLIN & S J BROWNS L8, P72, PLATS, W C R 1/103 30 X 115

Parcel: 01002174
Owner: Avanath North End Landing Parcel Owner I, LLC
Property Address: 290 Smith
Legal Description: S SMITH 130 WM Y HAMLIN & S J BROWNS L8, P72, PLATS, W C R 1/103 30 X 115

Parcel: 01002175
Owner: Avanath North End Landing Parcel Owner I, LLC
Property Address: 282 Smith
Legal Description: S SMITH 131 WM Y HAMLIN & S J BROWNS L8, P72, PLATS, W C R 1/103 30 X 115



Commercial Rehabilitation Certificate
Avanath North End Parcel Owner I, LLC
Page 4





COLEMAN A. YOUNG MUNICIPAL CENTER
2 WOODWARD AVENUE, SUITE 1240
DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226
PHONE: 313.224.4950
FAX: 313.224.3434

Decision Regarding Employment Clearance for Tax Abatement Employment Commitment <5 Full-time Employees

Date: May 23, 2023

Tax Abatement Type: PA 210

New Renewal

Duration of Abatement: 10 years

Development Name: North End Landing

Development: A total of 177 new apartments in multiple buildings on adjacent or nearby vacant parcels on several blocks in the North End Neighborhood

Parcel/Facility Address: 36 parcels in area of 202 – 325 Smith, 309-331 and 501-561 E. Bethune

Applicant/Recipient: Richard Barr

Applicant Contact: rbarr@honigman.com 248-465-7308

Post-Construction Employment Commitments

If Developer Occupied is selected, the Developer will be responsible for both Developer and Tenant requirements listed below.

Developer Occupied Tenant Occupied

Total Employment: 4

Developer commits to

- 1) Report to CRIO annually;
 - a. Developer’s efforts regarding tenants
 - b. Tenant’s compliance with commitments stated below (3)
 - c. Total number of employees at the facility
 - d. Number of employees at the facility who are Detroit residents
- 2) Provide Detroit at Work (DAW) information to any/all tenant(s) for life of abatement
- 3) Work with Commercial Tenant(s) to do the following;
 - a. **Post all Detroit job openings through the DAW website;**
 - b. **Report to Developer annually;**
 - i. Tenant’s compliance with requirements
 - ii. The number of individuals employed by Tenant
 - iii. The number of employees who are Detroit residents

The Applicant/Recipient has provided the Civil Rights, Inclusion and Opportunity Department (CRIO) required information in accordance with specific current and future employment data and commitments as part of a tax abatement agreement with the City of Detroit.

Therefore my signature below grants **Approval** of the above tax abatement application/renewal based upon annual reports to and appraisals by this agency of the recipient’s employment measures projected and achieved for the duration of the abatement.



COLEMAN A. YOUNG MUNICIPAL CENTER
2 WOODWARD AVENUE, SUITE 1240
DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226
PHONE: 313.224.4950
FAX: 313.224.3434

**Decision Regarding Employment Clearance for Tax Abatement
Employment Commitment <5 Full-time Employees**

Tenika R. Griggs, Esq. _____

CRIO Deputy Director Name

DocuSigned by:

Tenika R. Griggs, Esq.

FF584CDB98E941A...

CRIO Deputy Director Signature

5/24/2023

Date