David Whitaker, Esq.
Director
Irvin Corley, Jr.
Executive Policy Manager
Marcell R. Todd, Jr.
Director, City Planning
Commission
Janese Chapman
Director, Historic Designation
Advisory Board

City of Metroit
CITY COUNCIL

LEGISLATIVE POLICY DIVISION

208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center Detroit, Michigan 48226

Phone: (313) 224-4946 Fax: (313) 224-4336

Derrick Headd Marcel Hurt, Esq. Kimani Jeffrey Phillip Keller, Esq. **Edward King Kelsey Maas Jamie Murphy** Analine Powers, Ph.D. W. Akilah Redmond Laurie Anne Sabatini Rebecca Savage Sabrina Shockley **Renee Short Floyd Stanley** Thomas Stephens, Esq. **Timarie Szwed Theresa Thomas** Ashley A. Wilson

John Alexander
Roland Amarteifio
Megha Bamola
LaKisha Barclift, Esq.
Paige Blessman
M. Rory Bolger, Ph.D., FAICP
Eric Fazzini, AICP
Willene Green

Christopher Gulock, AICP

TO: Keith Hutchings, Director

Municipal Parking Department

FROM: David Whitaker, Director

Legislative Policy Division

DATE: March 8, 2023

SUBJECT: 2023-2024 Budget Analysis

Attached is our budget analysis regarding the Municipal Parking Department's budget for the 2023-2024 Fiscal Year.

Please be prepared to respond to the issues/questions raised in our analysis during your scheduled hearing on Monday, March 13, 2023, at 2:00 pm. We would then appreciate a written response to the issues/questions at your earliest convenience before or after your budget hearing. Please forward a copy of your response to the Council Members, the City Clerk's Office, and the Legislative Policy Division.

Please contact us if you have any questions regarding our budget analysis.

Thank you for your cooperation in this matter.

Attachments

cc: Council Members

Auditor General's Office

Jay Rising, Chief Financial Officer

Tanya Stoudemire, Chief Deputy Chief Financial Officer

Steve Watson, Budget Director John Wallace, Agency OCFO Brad Dick, Group Executive/COO Malcolm Walker, Budget Analyst Malik Washington, Mayor's Office

Municipal Parking Department (34)

FY 2023-2024 Budget Analysis by the Legislative Policy Division

Issues and Questions

- 1) Please briefly explain the new expense initiatives the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2024. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiatives will affect in FY 2024.
- 2) Please briefly explain the new capital funding requests the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2024. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new requests will affect in FY 2024.
- 3) Please briefly explain the operational reform and savings proposals the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2024. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new reforms/proposals will affect in FY 2024.
- 4) Please briefly explain the new revenue initiatives/proposals the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2024. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiatives/proposals will affect in FY 2024.
- 5) What are your projected performance metrics for the current fiscal year? What are your target metrics for fiscal year 2024?
- 6) According to the Office of the Chief Financial Officer (OCFO), the Municipal Parking Department had twenty-eight vacancies through December 31, 2022. As of February 28, 2023, the department had 19 vacancies.
 - a) What are the titles of the vacant positions?
 - b) Please briefly describe the difficulty in filling the vacancies.
 - c) Please briefly explain the Municipal Parking Department's strategy to fill the vacant positions or why they are remaining vacant.
- 7) According to the OCFO, the Municipal Parking Department has recommended one additional position for FY 2024, while the expenditures for Employee Benefits for FY2024 have decreased by \$52,538 or 4%. Please explain the cause for the decrease.
- 8) For FY 2024, expenditures for Operating Services have decreased by \$510,777 or 52%. Please explain the cause for the decrease.
- 9) For FY 2024, expenditures for Parking Meter Collection (cost center #340050), for Appropriation 27340 Code Enforcement-Parking, have decreased by \$129,437 or 28%.
 - a) Please explain the cause for the decrease.
 - b) Please describe any new technologies/tools implemented to reduce the Parking Meter Collection costs.
- 10) For FY 2024, expenditures for Parking Garages Maintenance (cost center #340020), for Appropriation 27341 –Parking Garages, have increased by \$71,355 or 13%. Please explain the cause for the increase.
- 11) For FY 2024, expenditures for Parking Garages Operations (cost center #340030), for Appropriation 27341 –Parking Garages, have decreased by \$353,581 or 28%. Please explain the cause for the decrease. Would the funding be sufficient to cover the parking garages' operations and maintenance?

- 12) For FY 2024, expenditures for Parking Administration (cost center #340010), for Appropriation 29340 MPD Administration, have decreased by \$154,281 or 12%. Please explain the cause for the decrease.
- 13) For FY 2024, expenditures for Parking Violation Bureau Administration (cost center #340080), for Appropriation 29340 –MPD Administration, have increased by \$193,031 or 7%. Please explain the cause for the increase.
- 14) For FY2024, how much funds are budgeted for capital improvement at Ford Underground Garage?
- 15) For FY 2024, revenues from Fines, Forfeits, and Penalties, for Appropriation 27340 Code Enforcement Parking, have decreased by \$60,000 or 10%.
 - a) Please explain the cause for the decrease.
 - b) How much revenue has been collected from the electronic meter system and parking app?
 - c) What is the return meter revenue per meter?
 - d) Do you expect the collection of revenues from meters and the parking app to increase back to prepandemic levels by the end of FY2024 and why?
- 16) For FY 2024, revenues from Fines, Forfeits, and Penalties, for Appropriation 29340 MPD Administration, Parking Violation Bureau, have decreased by \$2,700,000 or 26%.
 - a) Please explain the cause for the decrease.
 - b) What is the YTD collection rate of enforcement parking fines and penalties for current fiscal year?
 - c) Please explain the enforcement collection trend for FY2024.
 - d) What is the MPD's strategy to enhance the parking fines and penalties collection?
- 17) For FY 2024, revenues for Appropriation 27341 Parking Garages, specifically for revenues from Use of Assets, have decreased by \$1,290,000 or 17%, including \$660,000 or 11% revenue reduction from on street meter collections and \$630,000 or 33% revenue reduction from revenue fund trustee.
 - a) Please explain the cause of the decrease.
 - b) What is the MPD's strategy to maximize usage of the overall public/private parking system in the city?
- 18) For FY 2024, are there enough maintenance funds in the budget to ensure that we are complying with ADA regulations at all our parking structures? Are there any plans to increase parking areas for people with disabilities?
- 19) Please explain the expanded services of the ParkDetroit app. What is MPD's strategy for promoting the usage of ParkDetroit app?
- 20) One of the MPD's goals is to reduce curbside congestion, capture real-time data and potential flexible curbside usage. A curbside parking study is helping MPD to assess the ability to achieve this goal.
 - a) Please describe the progress of the curbside parking study MPD has conducted in current fiscal year.
 - b) How would the study be considered in deploying MPD's master parking plans within the city?
 - c) When does MPD think they will achieve this goal?
- 21) One of the MPD's goals is to implement 15 to 20 new residential parking zones by July 2023.
 - a) As of February 28, 2023, how many new parking zones have been implemented within the city?
 - b) How many new parking zones will be implemented for FY2024?
 - c) How will MPD make the public aware of these new parking zones?

MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT (34)

Mission

The Municipal Parking Department (MPD) provides economical on and off-street public parking services; enforces the City's parking ordinance; reduces parking-related congestion and pollution and improves residential quality of life; and develops parking plans to support development projects. This includes support for creative competitive strategies for the parking kiosk (meters) system, customer loyalty plans, enhanced parking experience through capital efforts, upgraded technology to maximize deployment of parking enforcement officers, better managed Citywide towing operations and coordinated use of City parking systems.

Operating Programs

- The **Auto Parking System**, pursuant to City ordinance, operates and maintains two garages one of which is downtown and one which is in the Eastern Market District. These garages, as well as the city-owned lots, contain approximately 1,254 parking spaces. The department operates 500 parking meter kiosks that include three parking zones with thirteen subzones that manage on-street parking.
- The **Parking Violations Bureau**, pursuant to City ordinance, manages the City's parking ticket processing and fine collection program and supervises parking regulations through its civilian ticket writing personnel (Parking Enforcement Officers). Enforcement efforts focus on ensuring public safety, creating parking availability, protecting the residential quality of life, and improving parking program compliance.

MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT (34)

Goals, Strategic Priorities and Related City Outcomes

Goals / Strategic Priorities	Timeframe	Related City Outcome
1. Optimize the effectiveness of the on-street parking enforcement program and deployment of parking, with enforcement resources for all violations (including restricted time zone violations) - MPD will conduct a curbside parking study in FY 23 to assess the ability to reduce curbside congestion, create a real-time flexible usage, and investigate a commercial parking monetization model. The goal will be to implement a permanent program in FY 24.	July 2022 – June 2023	Efficient & Innovative Operations
2. Improve the efficiency of the on-street and off-street parking programs - MPD will market the expansion of the ParkDetroit app usages and add 15 to 20 residential parking zones to improve quality of life.	July 2022 – July 2023	Economic Equity & Opportunity
3. Improve existing parking assets and expand parking opportunities in the commercial corridors.	July 2023 - June 2024	Economic Equity & Opportunity
4. Support the City's law enforcement strategies in parking related concerns - Explore the potential of automated optimized enforcement routing, maintain filled PEO positions and Sr. PEO positions support 7-day enforcement. MPD will continue to support DPD activities through late night overtime strategic enforcement coverage.	July 2022 – July 2023	Safer Neighborhoods
5. Influence the overall public/private parking system to maximize usage, reduce congestion, limit environmental impact, and facilitate economic development - MPD will market the expansion of ParkDetroit participation within the City of Detroit, Detroit Metropolitan Airport, Ann Arbor, and additional strategic cities in southeastern Michigan.	June 2022 – September 2023	Efficient & Innovative Operations
6. The ParkDetroit app will expand services to include multi-mobility trip planning options and merchant rewards programming.	July 2022 - December 2023	Efficient & Innovative Operations

MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT (34)

7. MPD is working with the State of Michigan on a statewide mobility wallet and the merchant rewards program will promote an additional economic transaction from an initial transaction by offering discounts and rewards for cross merchandised services and goods.

July 2022 - December 2023

Efficient & Innovative Operations

Budget By Service

Services	FY 2024 Mayor Proposed	FY 2024 Mayor Proposed FTE
Admin / Overhead	\$1,458,628	12.0
Parking Enforcement	\$8,310,472	71.0
Parking Garage Operation	\$1,514,465	13.0
Total:	\$11,283,565	96.0

Metrics and Data

Metrics	Data	Related Goal #
Filled Parking Enforcement Officer (PEO) positions	42 PEO & 7 Sr. PEO	1
PEO attendance	95% attendance outside of paid leave	1
Parking occupancy	To be collected	2
Maintenance of parking on/off street stock	To be collected	4

Department Name: Municipal Parking Department

Department #: 34

Budget Summary:

	FY2	022	FY2023		FY2	024
	Actual		Adopted		Mayor Proposed	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund All Funds		General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	14,119,436	14,119,436	18,665,000	18,665,000	14,615,000	14,615,000
Total Expenditures	7,458,468	7,520,593	11,622,782	11,622,782	11,283,565	11,283,565
Net Tax Cost	(6,660,968)	(6,598,844)	(7,042,218)	(7,042,218)	(3,331,435)	(3,331,435)

	FY2	025	FY20	26	FY2	2027	
	Forecast		Forecast		Forecast		
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund All Funds		General Fund	All Funds	
Total Revenues	14,826,138	14,826,138	15,046,018	15,046,018	15,275,000	15,275,000	
Total Expenditures	11,492,877	11,492,877	11,616,028	11,616,028	11,749,247	11,749,247	
Net Tax Cost	(3,333,261)	(3,333,261)	(3,429,990)	(3,429,990)	(3,525,753)	(3,525,753)	

Positions (by FTE):	2/10/2023 Actual	FY2023 Adopted	FY2024 Mayor Proposed	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast
General Fund	76	95	96	96	96	96
Non-General Fund	ı	ı	-	ı	-	-
ARPA	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total Positions	76	95	96	96	96	96

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2023 Adopted	FY2024 Mayor Proposed	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	11,622,782	11,283,565	11,492,877	11,616,028	11,749,247
Salaries & Wages	3,893,812	4,064,012	4,127,273	4,169,742	4,223,809
Employee Benefits	1,269,948	1,217,410	1,243,416	1,262,875	1,280,192
Professional & Contractual Services	5,362,166	5,425,154	5,533,658	5,588,996	5,644,885
Operating Supplies	89,848	79,848	81,445	82,259	83,082
Operating Services	987,008	476,231	485,757	490,615	495,522
Other Expenses	20,000	20,910	21,328	21,541	21,757
Grand Total	11,622,782	11,283,565	11,492,877	11,616,028	11,749,247

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2023 Adopted	FY2024 Mayor Proposed	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	18,665,000	14,615,000	14,826,138	15,046,018	15,275,000
Revenues from Use of Assets	7,650,000	6,360,000	6,571,138	6,791,018	7,020,000
Fines, Forfeits, & Penalties	11,015,000	8,255,000	8,255,000	8,255,000	8,255,000
Grand Total	18,665,000	14,615,000	14,826,138	15,046,018	15,275,000

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2023 Adopted	FY2024 Mayor Proposed	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	11,622,782	11,283,565	11,492,877	11,616,028	11,749,247
1000 - General Fund	11,622,782	11,283,565	11,492,877	11,616,028	11,749,247
Salaries & Wages	3,893,812	4,064,012	4,127,273	4,169,742	4,223,809
Employee Benefits	1,269,948	1,217,410	1,243,416	1,262,875	1,280,192
Professional & Contractual Services	5,362,166	5,425,154	5,533,658	5,588,996	5,644,885
Operating Supplies	89,848	79,848	81,445	82,259	83,082
Operating Services	987,008	476,231	485,757	490,615	495,522
Other Expenses	20,000	20,910	21,328	21,541	21,757
Grand Total	11,622,782	11,283,565	11,492,877	11,616,028	11,749,247

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2023 Adopted	FY2024 Mayor Proposed	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	18,665,000	14,615,000	14,826,138	15,046,018	15,275,000
1000 - General Fund	18,665,000	14,615,000	14,826,138	15,046,018	15,275,000
Revenues from Use of Assets	7,650,000	6,360,000	6,571,138	6,791,018	7,020,000
Fines, Forfeits, & Penalties	11,015,000	8,255,000	8,255,000	8,255,000	8,255,000
Grand Total	18,665,000	14,615,000	14,826,138	15,046,018	15,275,000

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - EXPENDITURES DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name	FY2023	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026	FY2027
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	Adopted	Mayor Proposed	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name					
34 - Municipal Parking Department	11,622,782	11,283,565	11,492,877	11,616,028	11,749,247
1000 - General Fund	11,622,782	11,283,565	11,492,877	11,616,028	11,749,247
27340 - Code Enforcement - Parking	5,578,820	5,483,079	5,591,214	5,648,663	5,707,472
340040 - Parking Meter Maintenance	1,897,061	1,906,320	1,943,982	1,964,633	1,985,698
340050 - Parking Meter Collection	455,890	326,453	331,919	335,563	339,822
340083 - Parking Violation Bureau - Towing & Storage	628,425	652,862	665,920	672,580	679,306
340085 - Parking Violation Bureau - Processing & Collection	2,597,444	2,597,444	2,649,393	2,675,887	2,702,646
27341 - Parking Garages	1,796,695	1,514,469	1,542,371	1,558,555	1,576,199
340020 - Parking Maintenance	550,946	622,301	634,069	642,499	651,303
340030 - Parking Operations	1,245,749	892,168	908,302	916,056	924,896
29340 - MPD Administration	4,247,267	4,286,017	4,359,292	4,408,810	4,465,576
340010 - Parking Administration	1,337,073	1,182,792	1,206,224	1,223,296	1,240,448
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	2,910,194	3,103,225	3,153,068	3,185,514	3,225,128
Grand Total	11,622,782	11,283,565	11,492,877	11,616,028	11,749,247

CITY OF DETROIT

BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - REVENUES DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Fund # - Fund Name	FY2023	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026	FY2027
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	Adopted	Mayor Proposed	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name					
34 - Municipal Parking Department	18,665,000	14,615,000	14,826,138	15,046,018	15,275,000
1000 - General Fund	18,665,000	14,615,000	14,826,138	15,046,018	15,275,000
27340 - Code Enforcement - Parking	615,000	555,000	555,000	555,000	555,000
340083 - Parking Violation Bureau - Towing & Storage	615,000	555,000	555,000	555,000	555,000
27341 - Parking Garages	7,650,000	6,360,000	6,571,138	6,791,018	7,020,000
340330 - Revenue Fund Trustee	1,890,000	1,260,000	1,260,000	1,260,000	1,260,000
340331 - On Street Meter Collections	5,760,000	5,100,000	5,311,138	5,531,018	5,760,000
29340 - MPD Administration	10,400,000	7,700,000	7,700,000	7,700,000	7,700,000
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	10,400,000	7,700,000	7,700,000	7,700,000	7,700,000
Grand Total	18,665,000	14,615,000	14,826,138	15,046,018	15,275,000

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER

DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name Job Code - Job Title	FY2023 Adopted	FY2024 Mayor Proposed	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	95	96	96	96	96
1000 - General Fund	95	96	96	96	96
27340 - Code Enforcement - Parking	16	13	13	13	13
340040 - Parking Meter Maintenance	7	7	7	7	7
712331.Parking Meter Repair Worker	6	6	6	6	6
712341.Parking Meter Service Foreman	1	1	1	1	1
340050 - Parking Meter Collection	9	6	6	6	6
012017.Principal Clerk Parking Violations	2	1	1	1	1
012078.Head Clerk Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
047342.Parking Meter Revenue Collector	6	4	4	4	4
27341 - Parking Garages	11	13	13	13	13
340020 - Parking Maintenance	9	11	11	11	11
619107.Laborer A	2	0	0	0	0
619121.General Environmental Technician I	0	3	3	3	3
621031.Building Trades Worker General	1	1	1	1	1
622031.Building Operator I	1	0	0	0	0
641041.Building Operations Supervisor Grade I	0	1	1	1	1
641045.Building Maintenance Operations Supervisor	1	1	1	1	1
712011.Mechanical Helper	1	1	1	1	1
721523.Vehicle Operator I	3	4	4	4	4
340030 - Parking Operations	2	2	2	2	2
081001.Customer Service Representative I	0	1	1	1	1
081007.Customer Service Supervisor Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

artment # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name Job Code - Job Title	FY2023 Adopted	FY2024 Mayor Proposed	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast
929101.Administrative Special Services Staff I	1	0	0	0	0
29340 - MPD Administration	68	70	70	70	70
340010 - Parking Administration	13	12	12	12	12
010152.Director Municipal Parking Department	1	1	1	1	1
010153.Deputy Director Municipal Parking Department	1	1	1	1	1
010729.General Manager Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
010838.Manager II Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
010944.Manager I Municipal Parking	1	2	2	2	2
012017.Principal Clerk Parking Violations	0	1	1	1	1
012261.Administrative Assistant - Grade II - Municipal Parkin	1	0	0	0	0
013131.Office Assistant III	1	2	2	2	2
013373.Executive Administrative Assistant I	1	1	1	1	1
339210.Parking Enforcement Control Specialist	4	2	2	2	2
929107.Administrative Special Services Staff II Exempt	1	0	0	0	0
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	55	58	58	58	58
012089. Assistant Administrative Supervisor - Parking Violatic	1	1	1	1	1
041543. Principal Governmental Analyst Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
099168.Parking Enforcement Investigator	1	1	1	1	1
099170.Supervising Parking Enforcement Investigator	1	1	1	1	1
339220.Parking Enforcement Officer	40	42	42	42	42
339230.Senior Parking Enforcement Officer	5	7	7	7	7
339245.Head Parking Enforcement Officer	1	1	1	1	1
929101.Administrative Special Services Staff I	3	2	2	2	2

CITY OF DETROIT

BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	FY2023 Adopted	FY2024 Mayor Proposed	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast	FY2027 Forecast
929102.Administrative Special Services Staff II	1	1	1	1	1
929103.Administrative Special Services Staff III	1	1	1	1	1
Grand Total	95	96	96	96	96