

David Whitaker, Esq.  
Director  
Irvin Corley, Jr.  
Executive Policy Manager  
Marcell R. Todd, Jr.  
Director, City Planning Commission  
Janese Chapman  
Director, Historic Designation  
Advisory Board

John Alexander  
Megha Bamola  
LaKisha Barclift, Esq.  
Nur Barre  
Paige Blessman  
M. Rory Bolger, Ph.D., FAICP  
Christopher Gulock, AICP

**City of Detroit**  
**CITY COUNCIL**  
**LEGISLATIVE POLICY DIVISION**  
208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center  
Detroit, Michigan 48226  
Phone: (313) 224-4946 Fax: (313) 224-4336

Derrick Headd  
Marcel Hurt, Esq.  
Kimani Jeffrey  
Edward King  
Jamie Murphy  
Kim Newby  
Analine Powers, Ph.D.  
Laurie Anne Sabatini  
Rebecca Savage  
Ryan Schumaker  
Sabrina Shockley  
Renee Short  
Thomas Stephens, Esq.  
Dr. Sheryl Theriot  
Theresa Thomas  
Ashley A. Wilson

March 10, 2022

TO: Keith Hutchings, Director  
Municipal Parking Department

FROM: David Whitaker, Director   
Legislative Policy Division

SUBJECT: 2022-2023 Budget Analysis

Attached is our budget analysis regarding the Municipal Parking Department's budget for the 2022-2023 Fiscal Year.

Please be prepared to respond to the issues/questions raised in our analysis during your scheduled hearing on **Monday, March 14, 2022 at 2:00 pm**. We would then appreciate a written response to the issues/questions at your earliest convenience before or after your budget hearing. Please forward a copy of your response to the Council Members, the City Clerk's Office, and the Legislative Policy Division.

Please contact us if you have any questions regarding our budget analysis

Thank you for your cooperation in this matter.

Attachments

cc: Council Members  
Auditor General's Office  
Jay Rising, Chief Financial Officer  
Tanya Stoudemire, Chief Deputy Chief Financial Officer  
Steve Watson, Budget Director  
John Wallace, Agency OCFO  
Anita Hoskins, Budget Analyst

## Municipal Parking Department (34)

FY 2022-2023 Budget Analysis by the Legislative Policy Division

### Issues and Questions

- 1) Please briefly explain the new expense initiatives the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2023. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiatives will affect in FY 2023.
- 2) Please briefly explain the new capital funding requests the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2023. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new requests will affect in FY 2023.
- 3) Please briefly explain the operational reform and savings proposals the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2023. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new reforms/proposals will affect in FY 2023.
- 4) Please briefly explain the new revenue initiatives/proposals the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2023. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiatives/proposals will affect in FY 2023.
- 5) What are your projected performance metrics for the current fiscal year? What are your target metrics for fiscal year 2023?
- 6) According to the Office of the Chief Financial Officer (OCFO), the Municipal Parking Department had thirty-three vacancies through January 2022
  - a) Please indicate your number of vacancies as of February 28, 2022.
  - b) What are the titles of the vacant positions?
  - c) Please briefly describe the difficulty in filling the vacancies.
  - d) Please briefly explain the Municipal Parking Department's strategy to fill the vacant positions or why they are remaining vacant.
- 7) According to the Office of the Chief Financial Officer (OCFO), the Municipal Parking Department has recommended an additional six positions for fiscal year 2023, please explain how these additional positions will assist in the achievement of the department's operational objectives?
- 8) For FY 2023, expenditures for Salaries & Wages have increased by \$422,269 or 11.8%. Please explain the cause for the increase.
- 9) For FY 2023, expenditures for Professional & Contractual Services have increased by \$1,396,833 or 33.3%. Please explain the cause for the increase.

- 10) For FY 2023, expenditures for Appropriation 27340 – Code Enforcement-Parking have increased by \$1,255,913 or 28%. Please explain the cause for the increase.
- 11) For FY 2023, expenditures for Appropriation 27341 – Parking Garages have increased by \$123,052 or 7.2%. Please explain the cause for the increase.
- 12) For FY 2023, expenditures for Appropriation 29340 –MPD Administration have increased by \$123,052 or 13.3%. Please explain the cause for the increase.
- 13) For FY 2023, the budget does not include capital project expenditures for the Municipal Parking Department. Please explain the reason for not including these expenditures and their effect on the capital agenda for MPD.
- 14) For FY 2023, revenues for Appropriation 27340 – Code Enforcement-Parking have decreased by \$370,000 or 37.5%. Please explain the cause for the decrease. Is the increase in remote work or resident discount program a cause for the decrease?
- 15) For FY 2023, revenues for Appropriation 27341 – Parking Garages have increased by \$585,000 or 8.2%. Please explain the cause for the increase.
- 16) For FY 2023, revenues for Appropriation 29340 – MPD Administration-Parking Violation Bureau have increased by \$1,500,000 or 16.8%. Please explain the cause for the increase.
- 17) The budget information in the **Fiscal Year 2023-2026 Four Year Financial Plan - Section B** does not reflect the numbers posted in the city's legal budget. Will the information be revised on the city's website? Will it be included in the Administration's Errata Letter?
- 18) Are there enough maintenance funds in the budget to ensure that we are in compliance with ADA regulations at all our parking structures? Are there any plans to increase parking areas for people with disabilities?
- 19) How much revenue has been collected from the electronic meter system and parking app since the start of the pandemic? Do you expect the collection of revenues from meters and the parking app to increase back to pre-pandemic levels by the end of fiscal year 2023?
- 20) Is there a plan to implement new parking zones within the city? If so, how will you make the public aware of new meters?

# MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT (34)

## Department Overview

### MISSION:

The Municipal Parking Department (MPD) provides economical on and off-street public parking services; enforces the City's parking ordinance; reduces parking-related congestion and pollution and improves residential quality of life; and develops parking plans to support development projects. This includes support for creative competitive strategies for the parking kiosk (meters) system, customer loyalty plans, enhanced parking experience through capital efforts, upgraded technology to maximize deployment of parking enforcement officers, better managed Citywide towing operations and coordinated use of City parking systems.

### STRATEGIC PRIORITIES:

1. Optimize the effectiveness of the on-street parking enforcement program and deployment of parking, with enforcement resources for all violations (including restricted time zone violations).
2. Improve the efficiency of the on-street and off-street parking programs.
3. Support the City's law enforcement strategies in parking related concerns.
4. Influence the overall public/private parking system to maximize usage, reduce congestion, limit environmental impact, and facilitate economic development.

## Operating Programs

- The **Auto Parking System**, pursuant to City ordinance, operates and maintains two garages one of which is downtown and one which is in the Eastern Market District. These garages, as well as the City-owned lots, contain approximately 1,254 parking spaces. The department operates 500 parking meter kiosks that include three parking zones with thirteen subzones that manage on-street parking.
- The **Parking Violations Bureau**, pursuant to City ordinance, manages the City's parking ticket processing and fine collection program and supervises parking regulations through its civilian ticket writing personnel (Parking Enforcement Officers). Enforcement efforts focus on ensuring public safety, creating parking availability, protecting the residential quality of life, and improving parking program compliance.

**Department Name:** Municipal Parking Department

**Department #:** 34

**Budget Summary:**

	FY2021 Actual		FY2022 Adopted		FY2023 Mayor Recommend	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	9,586,419	9,586,419	16,950,000	16,950,000	18,665,000	18,665,000
Total Expenditures	5,205,377	8,555,681	10,060,637	10,060,637	11,952,900	11,952,900
<b>Net Tax Cost</b>	<b>(4,381,041)</b>	<b>(1,030,738)</b>	<b>(6,889,363)</b>	<b>(6,889,363)</b>	<b>(6,712,100)</b>	<b>(6,712,100)</b>

	FY2024 Forecast		FY2025 Forecast		FY2026 Forecast	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	18,965,000	18,965,000	18,965,000	18,965,000	18,965,000	18,965,000
Total Expenditures	12,201,160	12,201,160	12,467,418	12,467,418	12,665,561	12,665,561
<b>Net Tax Cost</b>	<b>(6,763,840)</b>	<b>(6,763,840)</b>	<b>(6,497,582)</b>	<b>(6,497,582)</b>	<b>(6,299,439)</b>	<b>(6,299,439)</b>

Positions (by FTE):	1/1/2022 Actual	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
General Fund	58	91	97	97	97	97
Non-General Fund	-	-	-	-	-	-
<b>Total Positions</b>	<b>58</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>

**CITY OF DETROIT  
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS  
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
<b>34 - Municipal Parking Department</b>	<b>10,060,637</b>	<b>11,952,900</b>	<b>12,201,160</b>	<b>12,467,418</b>	<b>12,665,561</b>
Salaries & Wages	3,576,543	3,998,812	4,078,789	4,160,365	4,201,968
Employee Benefits	1,191,808	1,269,969	1,199,270	1,217,794	1,232,545
Professional & Contractual Services	4,190,430	5,587,263	5,773,295	5,911,854	6,030,092
Operating Supplies	94,848	89,848	97,125	99,457	101,448
Operating Services	987,008	987,008	1,032,201	1,056,976	1,078,116
Other Expenses	20,000	20,000	20,480	20,972	21,392
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>10,060,637</b>	<b>11,952,900</b>	<b>12,201,160</b>	<b>12,467,418</b>	<b>12,665,561</b>

**CITY OF DETROIT  
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS  
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
<b>34 - Municipal Parking Department</b>	<b>16,950,000</b>	<b>18,665,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>
Revenues from Use of Assets	7,065,000	7,650,000	7,650,000	7,650,000	7,650,000
Fines, Forfeits, & Penalties	9,885,000	11,015,000	11,315,000	11,315,000	11,315,000
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>16,950,000</b>	<b>18,665,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>

**CITY OF DETROIT  
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL  
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
<b>34 - Municipal Parking Department</b>	<b>10,060,637</b>	<b>11,952,900</b>	<b>12,201,160</b>	<b>12,467,418</b>	<b>12,665,561</b>
<b>1000 - General Fund</b>	<b>10,060,637</b>	<b>11,952,900</b>	<b>12,201,160</b>	<b>12,467,418</b>	<b>12,665,561</b>
Salaries & Wages	3,576,543	3,998,812	4,078,789	4,160,365	4,201,968
Employee Benefits	1,191,808	1,269,969	1,199,270	1,217,794	1,232,545
Professional & Contractual Services	4,190,430	5,587,263	5,773,295	5,911,854	6,030,092
Operating Supplies	94,848	89,848	97,125	99,457	101,448
Operating Services	987,008	987,008	1,032,201	1,056,976	1,078,116
Other Expenses	20,000	20,000	20,480	20,972	21,392
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>10,060,637</b>	<b>11,952,900</b>	<b>12,201,160</b>	<b>12,467,418</b>	<b>12,665,561</b>



**CITY OF DETROIT  
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL  
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
<b>34 - Municipal Parking Department</b>	<b>16,950,000</b>	<b>18,665,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>
<b>1000 - General Fund</b>	<b>16,950,000</b>	<b>18,665,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>
Revenues from Use of Assets	7,065,000	7,650,000	7,650,000	7,650,000	7,650,000
Fines, Forfeits, & Penalties	9,885,000	11,015,000	11,315,000	11,315,000	11,315,000
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>16,950,000</b>	<b>18,665,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>

**CITY OF DETROIT  
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - EXPENDITURES  
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name	FY2022	FY2023	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	Adopted	Mayor	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name		Recommend			
<b>34 - Municipal Parking Department</b>	<b>10,060,637</b>	<b>11,952,900</b>	<b>12,201,160</b>	<b>12,467,418</b>	<b>12,665,561</b>
<b>1000 - General Fund</b>	<b>10,060,637</b>	<b>11,952,900</b>	<b>12,201,160</b>	<b>12,467,418</b>	<b>12,665,561</b>
<b>27340 - Code Enforcement - Parking</b>	<b>4,523,025</b>	<b>5,778,938</b>	<b>5,899,417</b>	<b>6,037,072</b>	<b>6,150,401</b>
340040 - Parking Meter Maintenance	1,530,335	1,897,061	1,934,576	1,979,277	2,015,602
340050 - Parking Meter Collection	388,535	455,890	456,630	465,387	470,543
340083 - Parking Violation Bureau - Towing & Storage	804,155	628,425	643,508	658,952	672,131
340085 - Parking Violation Bureau - Processing & Collection	1,800,000	2,797,562	2,864,703	2,933,456	2,992,125
<b>27341 - Parking Garages</b>	<b>1,698,643</b>	<b>1,821,695</b>	<b>1,931,588</b>	<b>1,975,181</b>	<b>2,009,383</b>
340020 - Parking Maintenance	457,790	550,946	573,791	585,221	592,508
340030 - Parking Operations	1,240,853	1,270,749	1,357,797	1,389,960	1,416,875
<b>29340 - MPD Administration</b>	<b>3,838,969</b>	<b>4,352,267</b>	<b>4,370,155</b>	<b>4,455,165</b>	<b>4,505,777</b>
340010 - Parking Administration	935,225	1,337,071	1,343,271	1,369,715	1,386,004
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	2,903,744	3,015,196	3,026,884	3,085,450	3,119,773
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>10,060,637</b>	<b>11,952,900</b>	<b>12,201,160</b>	<b>12,467,418</b>	<b>12,665,561</b>

**CITY OF DETROIT  
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - REVENUES  
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name	FY2022	FY2023	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	Adopted	Mayor	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name		Recommend			
<b>34 - Municipal Parking Department</b>	<b>16,950,000</b>	<b>18,665,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>
<b>1000 - General Fund</b>	<b>16,950,000</b>	<b>18,665,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>
<b>27340 - Code Enforcement - Parking</b>	<b>985,000</b>	<b>615,000</b>	<b>615,000</b>	<b>615,000</b>	<b>615,000</b>
340083 - Parking Violation Bureau - Towing & Storage	985,000	615,000	615,000	615,000	615,000
<b>27341 - Parking Garages</b>	<b>7,065,000</b>	<b>7,650,000</b>	<b>7,650,000</b>	<b>7,650,000</b>	<b>7,650,000</b>
340330 - Revenue Fund Trustee	1,785,000	1,890,000	1,890,000	1,890,000	1,890,000
340331 - On Street Meter Collections	5,280,000	5,760,000	5,760,000	5,760,000	5,760,000
<b>29340 - MPD Administration</b>	<b>8,900,000</b>	<b>10,400,000</b>	<b>10,700,000</b>	<b>10,700,000</b>	<b>10,700,000</b>
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	8,900,000	10,400,000	10,700,000	10,700,000	10,700,000
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>16,950,000</b>	<b>18,665,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>	<b>18,965,000</b>

**CITY OF DETROIT  
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER  
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name					
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	FY2022	FY2023	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	Adopted	Mayor	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Job Code - Job Title		Recommend			
<b>34 - Municipal Parking Department</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>
<b>1000 - General Fund</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>
<b>27340 - Code Enforcement - Parking</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>340040 - Parking Meter Maintenance</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>
712331 - Parking Meter Repair Worker	6	6	6	6	6
712341 - Parking Meter Service Foreman	1	1	1	1	1
<b>340050 - Parking Meter Collection</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>
012017 - Principal Clerk - Parking Violations	1	2	2	2	2
012078 - Head Clerk - Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
047342 - Parking Meter Revenue Collector	6	6	6	6	6
<b>27341 - Parking Garages</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>340020 - Parking Maintenance</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9</b>
619107 - Laborer A	2	2	2	2	2
621031 - Building Trades Worker - General	1	1	1	1	1
622031 - Building Operator I	1	1	1	1	1
641045 - Building Maintenance Operations Supervisor	1	1	1	1	1
712011 - Mechanical Helper	2	1	1	1	1
721523 - Vehicle Operator I	3	3	3	3	3
<b>340030 - Parking Operations</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>
081007 - Customer Service Supervisor - Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
929101 - Administrative Special Services Staff I	0	1	1	1	1
<b>29340 - MPD Administration</b>	<b>65</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>340010 - Parking Administration</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>13</b>

**CITY OF DETROIT  
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER  
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name					
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name					
Job Code - Job Title					
010152 - Director - Municipal Parking Department	1	1	1	1	1
010153 - Deputy Director - Municipal Parking Department	1	1	1	1	1
010729 - General Manager - Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
010838 - Manager II - Municipal Parking	0	1	1	1	1
010944 - Manager I - Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
012261 - Administrative Assistant - Grade II - Municipal Parki	1	1	1	1	1
013131 - Office Assistant III	0	1	1	1	1
013373 - Executive Administrative Assistant I	1	1	1	1	1
339210 - Parking Enforcement Control Specialist	0	4	4	4	4
929107 - Administrative Special Services Staff II - Exempt	0	1	1	1	1
<b>340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration</b>	<b>59</b>	<b>57</b>	<b>57</b>	<b>57</b>	<b>57</b>
010838 - Manager II - Municipal Parking	1	0	0	0	0
012017 - Principal Clerk - Parking Violations	1	0	0	0	0
012089 - Assistant Administrative Supervisor - Parking Violat	1	1	1	1	1
013131 - Office Assistant III	1	0	0	0	0
041543 - Principal Governmental Analyst - Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
099168 - Parking Enforcement Investigator	1	1	1	1	1
099170 - Supervising Parking Enforcement Investigator	1	1	1	1	1
339210 - Parking Enforcement Control Specialist	4	0	0	0	0
339220 - Parking Enforcement Officer	42	42	42	42	42
339230 - Senior Parking Enforcement Officer	5	5	5	5	5
339245 - Head Parking Enforcement Officer	1	1	1	1	1
929101 - Administrative Special Services Staff I	0	3	3	3	3
929102 - Administrative Special Services Staff II	0	1	1	1	1

**CITY OF DETROIT  
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER  
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name					
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	FY2022	FY2023	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	Adopted	Mayor	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Job Code - Job Title		Recommend			
929103 - Administrative Special Services Staff III	0	1	1	1	1
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>97</b>