David Whitaker, Esq.
Director
Irvin Corley, Jr.
Executive Policy Manager
Marcell R. Todd, Jr.
Director, City Planning Commission

Janese Chapman
Director, Historic Designation

Advisory Board

Eric Fazzini

John Alexander Roland Armarteifio Megha Bamola LaKisha Barclift, Esq. Nur Barre Paige Blessman M. Rory Bolger, Ph.D., FAICP City of Detroit
CITY COUNCIL

LEGISLATIVE POLICY DIVISION

208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center Detroit, Michigan 48226

Phone: (313) 224-4946 Fax: (313) 224-4336

March 15, 2022

Christopher Gulock, AICP Derrick Headd Marcel Hurt, Esq. Kimani Jeffrey **Edward King** Jamie Murphy Kim Newby Analine Powers, Ph.D. Laurie Anne Sabatini Rebecca Savage **Ryan Schumaker** Sabrina Shockley Renee Short **Timarie Szwed** Thomas Stephens, Esq. Dr. Sheryl Theriot **Theresa Thomas** Ashley A. Wilson

TO: Kimberly Rustem, Director

Civil Rights, Inclusion & Opportunity (CRIO) Department

FROM: David Whitaker, Director

Legislative Policy Division

SUBJECT: 2022-2023 Budget Analysis

Attached is our budget analysis regarding the Civil Rights, Inclusion & Opportunity's budget for the 2022-2023 Fiscal Year.

Please be prepared to respond to the issues/questions raised in our analysis during your scheduled hearing on **Friday, March 18, 2022 at 1:00 pm**. We would then appreciate a written response to the issues/questions at your earliest convenience before or after your budget hearing. Please forward a copy of your response to the Council Members, the City Clerk's Office, and the Legislative Policy Division.

Please contact us if you have any questions regarding our budget analysis.

Thank you for your cooperation in this matter.

Attachments

cc: Council Members

Auditor General's Office

Jay Rising, Chief Financial Officer

Tanya Stoudemire, Chief Deputy Chief Financial Officer

Steve Watson, Budget Director

Conrad Mallett, Deputy Mayor-Group Executive

Gail Fulton, Mayor's Office Felix O'Aku, Agency OCFO Tisha Tyson, Budget Analyst

Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity (29)

FY 2022-2023 Budget Analysis by the Legislative Policy Division

Issues and Questions

- 1) Please briefly explain the new expense initiatives CRIO is planning to implement in FY 2023. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiatives will affect in FY 2023.
- 2) Please briefly explain the new capital funding requests CRIO is planning to implement in FY 2023. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new requests will affect in FY 2023.
- 3) Please briefly explain the operational reform and savings proposals CRIO is planning to implement in FY 2023. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new reforms/proposals will affect in FY 2023.
- 4) Please briefly explain the new revenue initiatives/proposals CRIO is planning to implement in FY 2023. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiatives/proposals will affect in FY 2023.
- 5) What are your projected performance metrics for each division/operational program for the current fiscal year? What are your target metrics for each division/operational program for fiscal year 2023?

Please review chart below:

	FY 2022 Adopted		FY 2023 Increase/	FY 2023 Increase/
	Budget	Budget	(Decrease) \$	(Decrease) %
General Fund Expenditures				
Salaries & Wages	\$1,330,698.00	\$1,962,520.00	\$631,822.00	47%
Employee Benefits	\$232,898.00	\$644,060.00	\$411,162.00	177%
Professional & Contractual	\$1,240,000.00	\$843,235.00		
Services			\$ (396,765.00)	-32%
Operating Supplies	\$10,255.00	\$58,090.00	\$47,835.00	466%
Operating Services	\$81,856.00	\$73,184.00	\$ (8,672.00)	-11%
Other Expenses	\$15,453.00	\$82,500.00	\$ 67,047.00	434%

	FY 2022 Adopted Budget	FY 2023 Recommended Budget	FY 2023 Increase/ (Decrease) \$	FY 2023 Increase/ (Decrease) %
Non-Compliance Fee Expenditures				
Salaries & Wages				
	\$517,971.0		\$131,708.0	
	0	\$649,679.00	0	25%
Employee Benefits	\$0.00	\$222,456.00	\$222,456.00	100%
Professional & Contractual Services	\$497,529.00	\$172,014.00	\$ (325,515.00)	-65%

Expenditures have increased and decreased significantly in the appropriations above. Is this change due to the status change of TASS employees to city employees? If not, please explain the increases and decreases.

- 6) The Mayor has proposed an increase of the number of CRIO's budgeted positions from seven (7) to thirty-five (35) in FY 2023 by increasing the number of General Fund positions from seven (7) to twenty-five (25) and adding ten (10) Non-General Fund positions. However, the department already has increased its budgeted FTEs to twenty-four (24) as of January 2022.
 - a. How was the current year increase in FTE's funded (i.e. Did City Council approve a budget amendment, and if yes, when?) What is the breakdown of the additional 17 FTE's added in FY22 (i.e. Temporary Administrative Special Service (TASS) vs full time City employees?)
 - b. The Mayor's recommendation, will increase CRIO's headcount from currently 24 to 35 FTEs. What is the breakdown between, Temporary Administrative Special Service (TASS) and full time City employees? If not, please explain the department's organizational plans for FY 2022 and 2023.
- 7) Explain how this increase in staff will allow the department to adequately perform its increasing responsibilities.
- 8) CRIO is responsible for enforcing the American Disabilities Act. How many FTEs are responsible for this assignment? What are their titles?
- 9) CRIO is tasked to monitor the employment performance of developers who receive tax abatements and other various development incentives from the city. How many FTEs are responsible for this assignment? What are their titles?
- 10)When will CRIO provide City Council a report on the monitoring of the employment performance of developers who receive tax abatements and other various development incentives from the City?
- 11)CRIO is tasked with monitoring compliance with the Executive Order 2021-02 on major construction projects and demolitions and collecting non-compliance fees from contractors. How many FTEs are responsible for this assignment? What are their titles?
- 12)CRIO revenues for FY 2023 are anticipated to increase by \$180,000 (5%) due to a corresponding \$120,000 increase in General Fund revenues and \$60,000 increase 3217 Non-Compliance Fees. What is the rationale for the revenue increase for CRIO?
- 13)How much has CRIO has captured in non-compliance fees to date, in the current fiscal year?

- 14)How much in non-compliance fees has CRIO transferred to the Workforce Development Fund?
- 15)Are the collections of non-compliance fees sufficient to cover the necessary amounts to fund DESC so they can provide adequate training to fufill the requirements of the Workforce Training Agreement under the current Executive Order? If not, how much general fund dollars are transferred to DESC for workforce training?

CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, AND OPPORTUNITY DEPARTMENT (29)

Department Overview

MISSION:

The Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity Department ("Civil Rights or CRIO") removes discriminatory barriers through innovative and high quality customer-driven programs that foster economic opportunity and empowerment, which will benefit Detroit residents, visitors and the entrepreneurial sector of the local economy.

CRIO is tasked with investigating complaints of discrimination for the protected class, sexual harassment and workplace violence. CRIO is also responsible for maintaining the Limited English Proficiency (LEP) Plan and enforcing the American Disabilities Act. CRIO certifies Detroit-Headquartered, Detroit-Based, and Small Businesses; Certifications for Women; Minority and Start-Up businesses, and Section 3 Certification and monitoring. Additional duties include monitoring inclusion of Detroit-Based Contractors and Detroit residents on development projects in the City.

STRATEGIC PRIORITIES:

- 1. Recognize the need for basic civil rights protection for all Detroit residents, employees and visitors. Ensure that all citizens and those desiring to live and/or work in Detroit are afforded an opportunity to grow and participate in Detroit's economic, educational and social processes
- 2. Ensure equal opportunity and fair treatment of all citizens and take positive action to address discriminatory practices
- 3. Certify Detroit-Headquartered, Detroit-Based, Small, Women and Minority Owned Businesses
- 4. Produce a monthly City of Detroit Certified Business Registry to be used as a procurement reference for city departments, businesses, public and non-profit organizations
- 5. Monitor vendor workforces for companies seeking contract awards or tax abatement relief to ensure equitable representation of minorities and females consistent with local, state and federal equal employment opportunity policies
- 6. Monitor economic development and diversity goals between the City and private developers and those developers that receive tax abatements to ensure inclusion
- 7. Secure the rights of citizens to obtain service from City government without discrimination, and mediate related complaints
- 8. Increase mutual understanding among the residents of the community; promote good will; and work cooperatively with other agencies of government, community groups and organizations to eliminate discrimination and future problems
- 9. Implement processes and programs to educate and promote equal opportunity and fair treatment of all citizens, visitors and employees

CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, AND OPPORTUNITY DEPARTMENT (29)

- 10. Enhance existing processes to remedy and prevent discriminatory treatment in education, employment, medical facilities, public accommodations, public service, and commercial space
- 11. Administer and maintain a zero tolerance policy for any form of violence in the workplace, against customers or visitors of the city of Detroit

Operating Programs

- Policy and Performance Monitor and improve program performance, lead policy initiatives, and coordinate with City Council.
- Incentives/Compliance Monitor compliance with EO2021-2, the CBO ordinance, and the affordable housing ordinance.
- Office of Disability Affairs Improve accessibility within city departments.
- Civil Rights & Language Access Investigate civil rights, sexual harassment and workplace violence complaints, and provide citywide trainings to departments and employees. Coordinate ASL, Spanish and Arabic translation and interpretation services for all city departments.
- Office of Early Learning Improve access to GSRP pre-k for Detroit families.
- Detroit Business Opportunity Certify Detroit based, headquartered, small, microbusiness, resident, mentor and joint venture businesses
- Construction Outreach Connect regulated developers, contractors, and unions to Detroit at Works skilled trades employment pool.
- Office of Marijuana Ventures and Entrepreneurship Certify Detroit Legacy Marijuana business owners, provide technical and financial assistance to potential entrepreneurs, and oversee medical and recreational marijuana licensing.

Operating Budget Highlights:

- Grant funding will support 2 FTE in the new Office of Early Learning.
- Includes increases for Civil Rights Investigation and Office of Disability Affairs for staffing and services.

Department Name: Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity

Department #: 29

Budget Summary:

	FY2021		FY20)22	FY2023		
	Actual		Adopted		Mayor Red	commend	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund All Funds		General Fund	All Funds	
Total Revenues	512,046	2,880,140	402,000	3,402,000	522,000	3,582,000	
Total Expenditures	1,399,380	3,356,772	2,911,160	5,911,160	3,663,589	6,723,589	
Net Tax Cost	887,334	476,632	2,509,160	2,509,160	3,141,589	3,141,589	

	FY2024		FY2025		FY2026	
	Forecast		Forecast		Fore	cast
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund All Funds		General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	522,000	3,643,000	522,000	3,706,000	522,000	3,770,272
Total Expenditures	3,691,851	6,812,851	3,767,222	6,951,222	3,817,299	7,065,571
Net Tax Cost	3,169,851	3,169,851	3,245,222	3,245,222	3,295,299	3,295,299

Positions (by FTE):	1/1/2022 Actual	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
General Fund	18	7	25	25	25	25
Non-General Fund	6	-	10	10	10	10
Total Positions	24	7	35	35	35	35

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	5,911,160	6,723,589	6,812,851	6,951,222	7,065,571
Salaries & Wages	1,848,669	2,612,199	2,664,443	2,717,731	2,744,909
Employee Benefits	232,898	866,516	817,390	829,961	840,041
Professional & Contractual Services	1,737,529	1,015,249	1,039,614	1,064,566	1,085,857
Operating Supplies	32,755	80,590	82,524	84,505	86,195
Operating Services	843,856	868,764	889,614	910,965	929,183
Other Expenses	1,215,453	1,280,271	1,319,266	1,343,494	1,379,386
Grand Total	5,911,160	6,723,589	6,812,851	6,951,222	7,065,571

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS

DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	3,402,000	3,582,000	3,643,000	3,706,000	3,770,272
Sales & Charges for Services	3,402,000	3,462,000	3,523,000	3,586,000	3,650,272
Licenses, Permits, & Inspection Charges	-	120,000	120,000	120,000	120,000
Grand Total	3,402,000	3,582,000	3,643,000	3,706,000	3,770,272

DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	5,911,160	6,723,589	6,812,851	6,951,222	7,065,571
1000 - General Fund	2,911,160	3,663,589	3,691,851	3,767,222	3,817,299
Salaries & Wages	1,330,698	1,962,520	2,001,770	2,041,805	2,062,224
Employee Benefits	232,898	644,060	607,705	617,061	624,552
Professional & Contractual Services	1,240,000	843,235	863,472	884,197	901,881
Operating Supplies	10,255	58,090	59,484	60,912	62,130
Operating Services	81,856	73,184	74,940	76,739	78,273
Other Expenses	15,453	82,500	84,480	86,508	88,239
3217 - Non-Compliance Fees	3,000,000	3,060,000	3,121,000	3,184,000	3,248,272
Salaries & Wages	517,971	649,679	662,673	675,926	682,685
Employee Benefits	-	222,456	209,685	212,900	215,489
Professional & Contractual Services	497,529	172,014	176,142	180,369	183,976
Operating Supplies	22,500	22,500	23,040	23,593	24,065
Operating Services	762,000	795,580	814,674	834,226	850,910
Other Expenses	1,200,000	1,197,771	1,234,786	1,256,986	1,291,147
Grand Total	5,911,160	6,723,589	6,812,851	6,951,222	7,065,571

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	3,402,000	3,582,000	3,643,000	3,706,000	3,770,272
1000 - General Fund	402,000	522,000	522,000	522,000	522,000
Sales & Charges for Services	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000
Licenses, Permits, & Inspection Charges	-	120,000	120,000	120,000	120,000
3217 - Non-Compliance Fees	3,000,000	3,060,000	3,121,000	3,184,000	3,248,272
Sales & Charges for Services	3,000,000	3,060,000	3,121,000	3,184,000	3,248,272
Grand Total	3,402,000	3,582,000	3,643,000	3,706,000	3,770,272

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - EXPENDITURES DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	5,911,160	6,723,589	6,812,851	6,951,222	7,065,571
1000 - General Fund	2,911,160	3,663,589	3,691,851	3,767,222	3,817,299
27292 - Homegrown Detroit	1,000,000	1,120,954	1,138,551	1,163,504	1,181,997
290011 - Detroit Opportunity Certification	-	60,000	61,440	62,915	64,173
290012 - Detroit Opportunity Monitoring	-	60,000	61,440	62,915	64,173
290040 - Homegrown Detroit	1,000,000	1,000,954	1,015,671	1,037,674	1,053,651
28290 - Human Rights Advocacy	1,911,160	2,542,635	2,553,300	2,603,718	2,635,302
290010 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	1,791,160	2,542,635	2,553,300	2,603,718	2,635,302
290011 - Detroit Opportunity Certification	60,000	-	-	-	-
290012 - Detroit Opportunity Monitoring	60,000	-	-	-	-
3217 - Non-Compliance Fees	3,000,000	3,060,000	3,121,000	3,184,000	3,248,272
27290 - Development Support - CRIO	2,000,000	3,060,000	3,121,000	3,184,000	3,248,272
290030 - Compliance Fees	2,000,000	2,060,000	2,097,000	2,135,424	2,178,725
290060 - Skilled Trade Readiness - Basic Skills Contextualized Pr	-	240,000	245,760	251,658	256,691
290070 - Skilled Trade Readiness - Barrier Removal & Gender D	-	60,000	61,440	62,915	64,173
290080 - Skilled Trade Readiness - Detroit Opportunity Training	-	700,000	716,800	734,003	748,683
27291 - Development Support - Skilled Trade Readiness - CRIO	1,000,000	-	-	-	-
290060 - Skilled Trade Readiness - Basic Skills Contextualized Pr	240,000	-	-		
290070 - Skilled Trade Readiness - Barrier Removal & Gender D	60,000	-	-	-	-
290080 - Skilled Trade Readiness - Detroit Opportunity Training	700,000	-		-	-
Grand Total	5,911,160	6,723,589	6,812,851	6,951,222	7,065,571

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - REVENUES DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	3,402,000	3,582,000	3,643,000	3,706,000	3,770,272
1000 - General Fund	402,000	522,000	522,000	522,000	522,000
00250 - CRIO Department Administration	-	120,000	120,000	120,000	120,000
290010 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	-	120,000	120,000	120,000	120,000
28290 - Human Rights Advocacy	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000
290010 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000
3217 - Non-Compliance Fees	3,000,000	3,060,000	3,121,000	3,184,000	3,248,272
27290 - Development Support - CRIO	3,000,000	3,060,000	3,121,000	3,184,000	3,248,272
290030 - Compliance Fees	3,000,000	3,060,000	3,121,000	3,184,000	3,248,272
Grand Total	3,402,000	3,582,000	3,643,000	3,706,000	3,770,272

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name Job Code - Job Title	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	7	35	35	35	35
1000 - General Fund	7	25	25	25	25
27292 - Homegrown Detroit	0	6	6	6	6
290040 - Homegrown Detroit	0	6	6	6	6
111003 - Project Manager & Analytics Specialist III	0	1	1	1	1
11919909 - Associate Director of Public-Private Partnership	0	1	1	1	1
413050 - Human Rights Specialist	0	1	1	1	1
929101 - Administrative Special Services Staff I	0	3	3	3	3
28290 - Human Rights Advocacy	7	19	19	19	19
290010 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	7	19	19	19	19
010180 - Director of Human Rights Department	1	1	1	1	1
010722 - General Manager - Human Rights	0	1	1	1	1
010826 - Manager II - Human Rights	1	4	4	4	4
111003 - Project Manager & Analytics Specialist III	1	1	1	1	1
11919909 - Associate Director of Public-Private Partnership	1	0	0	0	0
11919911 - Associate Director of Strategic Affairs	1	3	3	3	3
11919912 - Deputy Associate Director of Strategic Affairs	0	1	1	1	1
222040 - Data Analyst	1	1	1	1	1
413050 - Human Rights Specialist	0	6	6	6	6
81012061 - Administrative Assistant Grade II	1	1	1	1	1
3217 - Non-Compliance Fees	0	10	10	10	10
27290 - Development Support - CRIO	0	10	10	10	10
290030 - Compliance Fees	0	10	10	10	10

CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT

POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name Job Code - Job Title	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
010826 - Manager II - Human Rights	0	2	2	2	2
111003 - Project Manager & Analytics Specialist III	0	1	1	1	1
11919911 - Associate Director of Strategic Affairs	0	1	1	1	1
413050 - Human Rights Specialist	0	5	5	5	5
8601101 - Administrative Assistant I	0	1	1	1	1
Grand Total	7	35	35	35	35