

**CITY OF DETROIT**

**OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL**

**REQUEST TO CLOSE INVESTIGATION MEMORANDUM**

**DATE:**

6/24/2021

TO: Ellen Ha  
Inspector General

Approved\_ 

FROM: Jacqueline Hendricks-Moore  
File Manager

RE: BOPC Chairperson   OIG FILE#: 20-0026-INV

COMPLAINANT INFORMATION: Commissioner Willie Burton

---

**I. Summary**

On November 17, 2020, the Office of Inspector General (OIG) opened an investigation into allegations of abuse of authority by Board of Police Commissioner (Board or BOPC) Chair Willie Bell. Commissioner Willie Burton alleged Chair Bell had abused his authority by blatantly disregarding parliamentary procedures during several Board meetings. The OIG's investigation found no evidence to substantiate the allegations that Chair Bell abused his authority during the meetings.

As the presiding officer over the Board's meeting, Chair Bell appears to have an operational understanding of parliamentary procedures. However, some members of the Board believes that the Chair deliberately ignores their motions when their opinions are different from other members on the Board.

Pursuant to Section 7.5-311 of the 2012 Charter of the City of Detroit (Charter) and the OIG's Administrative Hearing Rules, on June 8, 2021, the OIG provided a copy of the draft memorandum for this investigation to Commissioner Burton and Chair Bell. The purpose of sharing a draft memorandum is to provide the parties affected by the draft memorandum an opportunity to respond with new or additional evidence to correct any error or misrepresentation of facts, if any, in the draft memorandum. The OIG Administrative Hearing Rules (Hearing Rules) require the affected parties to provide a written response and/or request an administrative hearing by June 22, 2021. As of June 23, 2021, the OIG did not receive a written response or any request for an administrative hearing from Commissioner Burton or Chair Bell. Therefore this investigation is closed and made final.

## II. Background

### A. The Complaint

Commissioner Burton alleged that Chair Bell abused his authority by blatantly disregarding parliamentary procedures during several virtual Board meetings (Board meetings).<sup>1</sup> In support of his allegations, Commissioner Burton referenced several specific Board meetings in his complaint. The OIG reviewed the video recording of these Board meetings along with the corresponding meeting minutes. Based on the complaint and the OIG's review of the recordings, we initiated an investigation to address the following allegations:

1. Chair Bell ignored Commissioner Burton's motion that the Detroit Police Department (DPD) ban their use of facial recognition software at the Board meeting on July 16, 2020.
2. Chair Bell abused his authority by having Commissioner Burton's microphone muted before and after Board members voted to have his microphone muted for the duration of the board meeting on October 22, 2020. In addition, Chair Bell deliberately ignored Commissioner Burton's vote not to mute his microphone.
3. Chair Bell ignored Board members' motions that the Board hire a parliamentarian.<sup>2</sup>
4. Chair Bell violated Article VI, Section 3(f) of BOPC Bylaws by creating a non-compliant meeting agenda.<sup>3</sup>
5. The Board's Leadership abused their authority when they sought to create the positions of Deputy Board Secretary and Deputy Chief Investigator without prior consultation of the Board.

### B. 2012 City of Detroit Charter

The 2012 City of Detroit Charter (Charter) provides the BOPC with supervisory control and oversight of the Detroit Police Department (DPD). The Charter specifically outlines the duties and responsibilities of the BOPC and what role it must play in the operation of DPD. The BOPC is composed of eleven members.<sup>4</sup> The Charter mandates that BOPC shall elect a chairperson annually and that member may not serve consecutive terms as the chairperson. Furthermore, all BOPC meetings shall be held in accordance with the Michigan Open Meetings Act (OMA).<sup>5</sup>

### C. BOPC Bylaws

Article I, Section 2 of the BOPC's Bylaws states in part, "The purpose of these bylaws is to facilitate the activities of and govern the members of the Board, as authorized by the Charter..."

---

<sup>1</sup> The relevant BOPC meetings referenced in this memorandum took place on May 7<sup>th</sup>, May 14<sup>th</sup>, June 4<sup>th</sup>, June 11<sup>th</sup>, June 18<sup>th</sup>, June 25<sup>th</sup>, August 6<sup>th</sup>, October 1<sup>st</sup>, October 15<sup>th</sup>, October 16<sup>th</sup>, October 22<sup>nd</sup>, and October 29<sup>th</sup> of 2020.

<sup>2</sup> BOPC's meetings on July 16, 2020 and October 22, 2020.

<sup>3</sup> BOPC's meeting on October 15, 2020 and October 22, 2020.

<sup>4</sup> Commissioners Darryl Brown, Shirley Burch, Willie Burton, Lisa Carter, William Davis, Jesus Hernandez, Jim Holley, Martin Jones and Linda Bernard. Current Chair Willie Bell and Vice Chair Annie Holt, were elected by the Board to serve for the period of July 1, 2020 to June 30, 2021.

<sup>5</sup> Charter: Article 7. Chapter 8. Section 7-802 and Section 7-803.

Article III, Section 1 of the BOPC's Bylaws states, "The affairs of the organization shall be governed by the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners."

Article IV, Section 6, of BOPC's Bylaws states in part, "The duties of the Officers shall be as follows:...Chair: The Chairperson shall, in general, supervise the affairs of the Boards...[e]nsures that all laws of the City and the State of Michigan pertaining to the conduct of Board meetings and other activities of the Board are followed, and all recommendations of the Board are properly conveyed."

Article XII, of BOPC's Bylaws states, "The business of the Board and committees shall be conducted in accordance with the latest edition of the Robert's Rules of Order, to the extent to which it does not conflict with the BOPC's bylaws or the City Charter."

Article XII, Section A, of the BOPC's Bylaws states, "Each member of the city of Detroit BOPC shall cooperate with the Chair in preserving order and decorum and no Commissioner shall, by conversation or otherwise, delay or interrupt the proceedings of the BOPC, nor disturb any member while speaking, or fail to abide by the orders of the BOPC or its Chair except as specifically permitted by the rules of the BOPC."

Article XII, Section B, of the BOPC's Bylaws states, "City of Detroit BOPC meetings shall be conducted in a professional, courteous and respectful manner. Citizens and Commissioners shall be allowed to state their positions in an atmosphere free of slander, threats of violence or the use of the BOPC as a forum for politics. Sufficient warnings may be giving by the chair if at any time during the remarks and in the event that any individual shall behave unprofessionally or discourteously the Chair shall cut off comment or further debate."

### **III. Analysis and Findings**

Allegation 1: Chair Bell ignored Commissioner Burton's motion that DPD ban their use of facial recognition software at the July 16, 2020 board meeting.<sup>6</sup>

Commissioner Burton alleged that Chair Bell ignored his motion that DPD ban the use of facial recognition software at the July 16, 2020 Board meeting. The OIG found that Commissioner Burton made two motions at this meeting and each motion was recognized by Chair Bell.

Commissioner Burton's first motion was that DPD had not provided any information about their participation in the 1033 Program with the Department of Defense, as requested by the Board on June 18, 2020. Chair Bell responded by advising Commissioner Burton that DPD provided this information to the Board a month ago. In addition, Chair Bell advised the Board Secretary to resend DPD's information to the entire Board.

Commissioner Burton's second motion was that DPD ban the use of facial recognition software. Chair Bell ruled that Commissioner Burton's motion was out of order, because

---

<sup>6</sup> <http://video.detroitmi.gov/CablecastPublicSite/show/8633?channel=3> [Video time 39:55.]. BOPC meeting minutes page 4.

Commissioner Burton made the same motion at every meeting and the Board previously voted on this matter. During Chair Bell's ruling, Commissioner Brown seconded Commissioner Burton's motion. Thereafter, Commissioner Burton requested a legal opinion from the Board's Attorney on this matter.

According to BOPC Bylaws, the Chair's duties include presiding over all Board meetings, supervising the Board's affairs and ensuring all applicable laws, rules and regulations are being followed by the Board.<sup>7</sup> In addition, BOPC Bylaws mandate the Board's business be conducted in accordance to the latest edition of the Robert's Rules of Order as long as it does not conflict with BOPC Bylaws or the Charter.<sup>8</sup>

Because the OIG is not an expert on parliamentary procedures, the OIG consulted with an expert parliamentarian<sup>9</sup> to determine if the rulings by Chair Bell were in compliance with Robert's Rules of Order (Robert's Rules). The parliamentarian found Chair Bell properly ruled Commissioner Burton's motion to ban the use of the facial recognition software was "out of order," because the same motion had been consistently defeated at preceding meetings.<sup>10</sup> In addition, Chair Bell properly ruled both Commissioners Burton and Brown were out of order, because Commissioner Brown spoke out without being recognized by the Chair. Moreover, Commissioner Burton's request for a "legal" opinion was improper, because no legal issue was involved in the Board's discussion. According to the parliamentarian the nature of the issues raised by Commissioner Burton required a parliamentarian to evaluate Chair Bell's "out of order" ruling.<sup>11</sup>

While having an independent parliamentarian would have made the meeting less contentious, according to the OIG's expert, Chair Bell's rulings were in compliance with Robert's Rules. Therefore, the OIG concludes Chair Bell did not abuse his authority when ruling Commissioner Burton's motion was out of order.

Allegation 2: Chair Bell abused his authority by having Commissioner Burton's microphone muted before and after the Board voted to mute his microphone for the duration of the October 22, 2020 board meeting. In addition, Chair Bell deliberately ignored Commissioner Burton's vote not to mute his microphone.<sup>12</sup>

Commissioner Burton alleged that Chair Bell abused his authority by having his microphone muted before and after the Board voted to mute his microphone for the duration of the

---

<sup>7</sup> BOPC Bylaws Article IV, Section 6.

<sup>8</sup> BOPC Bylaws Article XII.

<sup>9</sup> Analine Powers, Ph.D., has been employed as a "Parliamentarian and Policy Analyst" by Detroit City Council and the Legislative Policy Division since 1985. She has served as City Council's parliamentarian since 2007. Ms. Powers holds a B.A., M.A. and a Ph.D. She is an active member of the National Association of Parliamentarians and Louise Saks Parliamentary Unit-Michigan.

<sup>10</sup> Robert's Rules 10:26, states in part, "no main motion is in order that conflicts with the motion previously adopted at any time and still in force."

<sup>11</sup> Robert's Rules 39:1 states, "A motion is dilatory if it seeks to obstruct or thwart the will of the assembly as clearly indicated by the existing parliamentary situation." Also, Robert's Rules 39:4 states in part, "It is the duty of the presiding officer to prevent members from missing the legitimate forms of motions, or abusing the privilege of renewing certain motions, merely to obstruct business."

<sup>12</sup> <http://video.detroitmi.gov/CablecastPublicSite/show/8857?channel=3> [Video time 15:12:00]. BOPC meeting minutes page 2.

October 22, 2020 board meeting. Also, that Chair Bell deliberately ignored his vote not to mute his microphone. The OIG found in the beginning of the meeting Chair Bell conducted a roll call and the entire Board was present at this meeting. Vice Chair Annie Holt made a motion that the Board approve the meeting agenda. Chair Bell recognized Vice Chair Holt's motion and brought the motion to the Board for discussion. Throughout the discussion, some Board members expressed their approval and other Board members expressed their disapproval for the newly revised meeting agenda.<sup>13</sup> During the discussion Chair Bell recognized Commissioner Burton and he had an opportunity to voice his opinion on this matter to the Board. Chair Bell ended the discussion and asked the Board to vote on the motion to approve the meeting agenda.

While Chair Bell was conducting the vote count, Commissioner Burton continuously made verbal outbursts interfering with the vote count. Chair Bell repeatedly gave warnings to Commissioner Burton to stop speaking. At one point during this process, when Chair Bell requested Commissioner Shirley Burch's vote, she asked the Board Secretary to repeat the motion that the Board is voting on. Commissioner Burch stated she could not hear the motion. Likewise, the Board Secretary advised Chair Bell that she and the stenographer are attempting to take notes and record the Board's votes, but it's difficult when more than one member is speaking. Nevertheless, Commissioner Burton continued to interrupt the meeting with his verbal outbursts. Eventually, some Board members made requests that all members should exercise appropriate decorum by waiting to be recognized by the Chair before speaking. About this time, Chair Bell requested that the Board Secretary mute Commissioner Burton's microphone. Commissioner Burton's microphone was muted and the vote count was completed.

Thereafter, Commissioner Evette Griffie made a motion that Commissioner Burton's microphone be muted for the duration of the meeting, because his verbal outbursts were disrupting the meeting. Vice-Chair Holt seconded the motion. Chair Bell recognized Commissioner Griffie's motion and brought it to the Board to vote. Chair Bell called on each Board member for their vote including Commissioner Burton. However, when Chair Bell requested Commissioner Burton's vote it appeared that his microphone was muted and he did not respond. Also, when Chair Bell requested Commissioner Lisa Carter's vote, she did not respond.

After Chair Bell had called on each Board member for their vote, the Board Secretary advised Commissioner Burton that he has the capability to mute and unmute his microphone. At that time, it appears that Commissioner Burton unmuted his microphone and began speaking to the Board. It appears that Chair Bell attempted to request Commissioner Burton's vote, but Commissioner Burton continued speaking to the Board and did not respond to Chair Bell's request for his vote. During this same time, Commissioner Carter advised Chair Bell concerning her vote response. Shortly afterwards, Chair Bell closed the vote count on the motion.

Chair Bell requested the vote count from the Board Secretary. The Board Secretary advised him the vote passed "5 Yes to 4 No", with the exception of Commissioner Jesus Hernandez who abstained from voting on the matter. Commissioner Burton expressed to the Board that he was not given an opportunity to vote. The Board Secretary responded by advising the Board which included Commissioner Burton that he had the capability to mute and unmute his microphone. In addition, Chair Bell advised the Board which included Commissioner Burton that he asked him

---

<sup>13</sup> See Allegation 4.

for his vote, but he did not respond the first time or the second time, as Commissioner Burton was too busy talking and ultimately did not provide a response on the motion.

According to BOPC Bylaws, the Board is required to conduct their business in accordance to the latest edition of the Robert's Rules, as long as it does not conflict with BOPC Bylaws or the Charter. Board members are to conduct themselves in a professional and respectful manner. Board members are required to cooperate with the Chair in preserving order and decorum in the meetings.<sup>14</sup> In addition, according to Article XII, Section B, “[s]ufficient warnings may be given by the chair if at any time during the remarks and in the event that any individual shall behave unprofessionally or discourteously the Chair shall cut off comment or further debate.”

The expert parliamentarian<sup>15</sup> found that Chair Bell's action to mute Commissioner Burton's microphone before the Board voted to mute his microphone was appropriate. Chair Bell had given Commissioner Burton more than four warnings which he ignored before his microphone was muted. Furthermore, the expert parliamentarian found that Commissioner Griffie's motion to mute Commissioner Burton's microphone was proper and in order, because he was constantly out of order and refused to be silent. In support of her opinion, the expert parliamentarian referenced Article XII of BOPC Bylaws.

According to the expert parliamentarian, Chair Bell did not require a motion to mute Commissioner Burton's microphone. However, Chair Bell recognized the motion to mute Commissioner Burton's microphone and he brought the motion to the Board to vote. Chair Bell gave every Board member an opportunity to vote on the motion. The vote passed “5 Yes to 4 No” with the exception of Commissioner Hernandez who abstained from voting on the matter. Therefore, the OIG concludes Commissioner Burton had an opportunity to vote on this motion, but he did not.

In addition, the expert parliamentarian found while Chair Bell appeared to be familiar with basic parliamentary procedures, the Chair did make some technical mistakes that may have caused additional confusion and chaos during the meeting. The technical mistakes may easily have been avoided, and the confusion and chaos may also have been eliminated if a professional parliamentarian was present. According to Robert Rules, once voting starts, no debate, discussion, editorial comment, or explanation of one's vote is allowed.<sup>16</sup> Once the vote has been announced by the Chair, it is final. The vote cannot be reopened just because a member missed their opportunity to vote.

Based on our review of the recordings of the Board meetings and the expert parliamentary findings, the OIG concludes Chair Bell did not abuse his authority by muting Commissioner Burton's microphone before and after the Board voted to mute his microphone. The OIG further recognizes that as the presiding Chairperson of the BOPC, Chair Bell's actions to preserve order in the meeting was in compliance with Article XII of the BOPC Bylaws. Lastly, the OIG finds Commissioner Burton's actions during the meeting was in violation with Articles XII of the BOPC Bylaws.

---

<sup>14</sup> BOPC Bylaws Article XII.

<sup>15</sup> Analine Powers, Ph.D. See also, footnote 9.

<sup>16</sup> Robert's Rules 45:6-7.

Allegation 3: Chair Bell ignored Board members motions that the Board should hire a parliamentarian.

Commissioner Burton alleged Chair Bell ignored Board members motions to hire a parliamentarian for the Board. The OIG found on two occasions, Board members made motions that the Board hire a parliamentarian.

On July 16, 2020, Commissioner William Davis made a motion that the Board hire a parliamentarian. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Burton. Chair Bell recognized the motion and brought it to the Board for a vote. The Board voted and the motion failed “5 No to 4 Yes”.<sup>17</sup>

On October 22, 2020, Commissioner Brown made a motion that the Board contract with a parliamentarian in the same way the Board contracts for a stenographer. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Davis. Chair Bell advised the Board that a research was needed to obtain an estimate of cost of contracting a parliamentarian. Chair Bell indicated that the staff will research the information and present it to the Board at a later date.<sup>18</sup> On March 8, 2021, the OIG inquired if the BOPC had completed its research.<sup>19</sup> On March 22, 2021, the BOPC advised the OIG that their staff had contacted the National Association of Parliamentarians (NAP) and requested information on a local parliamentarian service along with the cost for the service. However, BOPC stated that they have not yet received a response from the NAP. The OIG notes that more than six months has passed since the October motion and no further discussion has been held on this motion.

Based on the above information the OIG concludes that Chair Bell did not ignore the Board members motions’ to hire a parliamentarian at the July 16, 2020 and October 22, 2020 board meetings.

Allegation 4: Chair Bell violated Article VI, Section 3(f) of BOPC’s Bylaws by creating a non-complaint meeting agenda.<sup>20</sup>

Commissioner Burton alleged Chair Bell revised the format for the Board’s meeting agenda and the new format violates BOPC’s Bylaws. In addition, Commissioner Burton alleged Chair Bell ignored his and other Board members concerns that the new format violates BOPC’s Bylaws. The OIG found that Board members were divided about approving the revised meeting agenda for the October 15<sup>th</sup>, 22<sup>nd</sup>, and 29<sup>th</sup>, 2020 meetings. The revised agenda had the “New Business” and “Unfinished Business” sections moved from the end of the agenda to the middle of the agenda, before the presentations and resolution sections. The Commissioners asked Chair Bell

---

<sup>17</sup> <http://video.detroitmi.gov/CablecastPublicSite/show/8633?channel=3> [Video 16:03:18]. BOPC meeting minutes page 4.

<sup>18</sup> <http://video.detroitmi.gov/CablecastPublicSite/show/8857?channel=3> [Video 16:22:00]. BOPC meeting minutes page 5.

<sup>19</sup> Information/Document request Letter to the BOPC from the OIG dated March 8, 2021.

<sup>20</sup> <http://video.detroitmi.gov/CablecastPublicSite/show/8857?channel=3> [Video time 15:12:00]. BOPC meeting minutes page 2.

the reason for the changes and he explained the changes were made so that the Board's business could be completed before having the presentations and resolutions at the meetings.

At the October 15<sup>th</sup>, 22<sup>nd</sup> and 29<sup>th</sup> 2020 meetings, the Board voted to approve the revised format of its agenda. At the October 15<sup>th</sup> meeting, the vote was tied at "3 Yes to 3 No". Chair Bell advised the Board members that he would not hold a meeting without an approved agenda, before he adjourned the meeting. At the October 22<sup>nd</sup> and October 29<sup>th</sup> meetings, the vote passed at each meeting, but not unanimously.

Based on our investigation, the OIG finds Chair Bell did not ignore Commissioner Burton or any other Board members' concerns regarding the revised meeting agenda on the aforementioned dates. Chair Bell brought this matter before Board members at each meeting and the Board members voted to approve the revised agenda.<sup>21</sup>

Allegation 5: At the October 22, 2020 Board meeting some Commissioners claimed that they knew nothing about the Board considering the creation of the Deputy Board Secretary and Deputy Chief Investigator positions.

Commissioner Burton alleged he and other Commissioners did not know anything about the Board's Leadership seeking to create the positions of Deputy Board Secretary and Deputy Chief Investigator. The OIG found that on October 6, 2020, the Board's Leadership drafted an interoffice memorandum to Board members that explained the proposed BOPC's reorganization that included the creation of two new positions and a recommendation for two employees to be appointed to the newly created positions.<sup>22</sup> The Board Leadership planned to discuss the information in the memo at the October 22, 2020 Board meeting. At the board meeting, Vice-Chair Holt made a motion to approve the creation of the Deputy Board Secretary and Deputy Chief Investigator positions. Also, to appoint Interim Board Secretary Melanie White and Interim Chief Investigator Lawrence Akbar to the newly created positions. Commissioner Martin Jones seconded the motion. Chair Bell recognized the motion and brought it to the Board for discussion.

During the discussion, some Board members stated that they only received the memo the day before the October 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting. Vice-Chair Holt and the Board Secretary advised the Board that the memo was forwarded to the entire Board a few weeks before the October 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting. The Board members were divided about whether the BOPC needed these two new positions, especially when the current positions of the Board Secretary and the Chief Investigator had not yet been filled. Also, some Board members were concerned about whether approving to create these two new positions would violate the Charter. Therefore, the Board asked Chief Legal Counsel of Special Projects from the City of Detroit Law Department for a legal opinion.<sup>23</sup> The attorney advised the Board that according to Section 7-804 of the Charter, the BOPC may hire additional staff as necessary to carry out its duties. The Board voted and the motion passed "7 Yes to 4 No".

---

<sup>21</sup> BOPC Bylaws Article III.

<sup>22</sup> Interoffice Memorandum dated October 6, 2020 from BOPC's leadership (Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Holt and Chair Lisa Carter) regarding BOPC Organization Report and Projected End-of-the Year Plan 2020.

<sup>23</sup> Megan Moslimani is an attorney with the City of Detroit Law Department.

Based on the above information, the OIG concludes that the BOPC's Leadership followed proper procedure in notifying Board members with a memo concerning the proposed creation of the two new positions. The OIG has no evidence to dispute that the memo was sent to all Board members prior to the October 22, 2020 Board meeting. A Board member made a motion that BOPC create two new positions. Chair Bell recognized the motion and brought it to the Board for discussion. Although not all members of the Board supported the motion, the Board voted and the motion passed.

#### **IV. Conclusion**

The OIG investigated the allegations thoroughly and consulted with an expert parliamentarian on parliamentary procedures regarding Chair Bell's rulings to determine if his actions violated Robert's Rules of Order. The OIG found no evidence to substantiate the allegations that Chair Bell abused his authority for each allegations in the complaint.

#### **V. Recommendations**

The OIG has received numerous allegations of abuse of authority against BOPC's Chair. While investigating these allegations the OIG found that some Board members expressed their concerns that the Chair does not adequately understand Robert's Rules of Order. Specifically, they expressed frustration over their beliefs that the Chair is ignoring their motions, when their opinions are different than the opinions of other Board members. In addition, since the Chairperson's position appears to rotate between Commissioners Willie Bell and Lisa Carter, this situation continues to be an issue among some Board members. Every Board member has expressed how frustrated they are that the Board's business is constantly disrupted by Board members' inappropriate behavior at the Board meetings.<sup>24</sup> It is clear that the Board members are divided about hiring a parliamentarian for the Board meetings. But the OIG has recommended in the past that the BOPC hire an experienced parliamentarian.<sup>25</sup> The OIG recognizes that only an experienced parliamentarian is well-versed on Roberts's Rules of Order. Therefore, the OIG again urges the Board to hire a professional parliamentarian.

#### **VI. Evidence Reviewed**

The OIG's investigation reviewed the following: 1) Several videos of BOPC's meetings along with the corresponding meeting minutes; 2) BOPC bylaws and documents; and 3) Robert's Rules of Order, Newly Revised 12 Edition (Robert's Rules.). In additional to reviewing the aforementioned documentation the OIG consulted with an expert parliamentarian<sup>26</sup> concerning parliamentary procedures.

---

<sup>24</sup> The relevant BOPC meetings referenced in this memorandum took place on May 7<sup>th</sup>, May 14<sup>th</sup>, June 4<sup>th</sup>, June 11<sup>th</sup>, June 18<sup>th</sup>, June 25<sup>th</sup>, August 6<sup>th</sup>, October 1<sup>st</sup>, October 15<sup>th</sup>, October 16<sup>th</sup>, October 22<sup>nd</sup>, and October 29<sup>th</sup> of 2020.

<sup>25</sup> OIG File Nos: 20-0018-INV, 20-0019-INV, 20-0020-INV and 20-0021-INV.

<sup>26</sup> Analine Powers, Ph.D., has been employed for 14 years by the Detroit City Council, Legislative Policy Division as a "Parliamentarian and Policy Analyst". Ms. Powers holds a B.A., M.A., Ph.D. and she is an active member of the National Association of Parliamentarians and Louise Saks Parliamentary Unit-Michigan.