Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners Date of Meeting: Thursday, December 17, 2020 – 3:00 PM Location: Zoom Virtual Meeting Platform

BOPC Chairperson Willie Bell called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (December 17, 2020)

Detroit Board of Police Commissioners' Membership / Attendance		
	Attend	Not- Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt, Vice-Chairperson	Yes	
Linda D. Bernard	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Yes	
Lisa Carter		Excused
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jesus Hernandez	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Martin Jones	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	10	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for Thursday, December 17, 2020.

Chairperson Bell called the meeting to order and invited Chaplain Orville Littlejohn to provide the invocation.

INVOCATION: Chaplain Orville Littlejohn

I. MOTION: To approve the Agenda.

Motion: Commissioner Bernard **Second:** Commissioner Burch **Discussion:** Commissioner Holley expressed concern about approving the Department's 2020 Annual Improvement Plan presentation at the end of 2020. Chairperson Bell indicated that the Department's 2020 Improvement Plan will be discussed today for informational purposes and the Department's 2021 Plan will be introduced in 2021.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Bernard, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones No: Commissioner Burton and Commissioner Davis

 VOTE:
 Yes = 8
 No = 2
 Motion: ADOPTED

II. MOTION: To approve the December 10, 2020, Meeting Minutes with necessary corrections.

Motion: Commissioner Holley Second: Commissioner Jones Discussion: None.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Bernard, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones

No: Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burton, and Commissioner Davis

 VOTE:
 Yes = 7
 No = 3
 Motion: ADOPTED

Chairperson's Remarks: Chairperson Bell expressed congratulations and gratitude to Director Trisha Stein on her recent appointment with Mayor Mike E. Duggan's Administrative Team as Chief of Staff, Mayor's Executive Team. **Chairperson Bell** commended Ms. Stein for her work and contribution to the Department, the Board, and the City of Detroit.

Chairperson Bell also expressed thanks to BOPC Administration, Board Interim Secretary Melanie White, Community Relations Coordinator Teresa Blossom, and Interim Chief Investigator Lawrence Akbar, Office of the Chief Investigator, and all staff members for their work and contribution this year. **Chairperson Bell** also thanked the Board of Police Commissioners for their tremendous work and efforts during 2020. **Chairperson Bell** also expressed comments calling upon Commissioners' expertise and skills in the coming New Year toward enhancing police oversight. **Chairperson Bell** also highlighted Chief of Police James E. Craig and leadership, the DPD Executive Team, and the entire Department, and also highlighted Lieutenant Mark Young, President, LSA, and Vice-President Ron Thomas of the DPOA, for their work and contribution this year. **Chairperson Bell** also discussed the supervisory oversight measures and objectives for awareness and consideration.

Chief of Police Report: Chief of Police's Summary of CompStat Data and other Crime Information/DPD Information:

Deputy Chief Elaine Bryant representing Chief of Police James E. Craig reported on the following items: Officers Injured in the Line of Duty; Comp Stat Crime and Statistical Data for the reporting period; Protest Activities; COVID-19 impacts, and recent critical incidents impacting the Detroit Police Department and the community. See attached Meeting Transcripts for more information.

	Comp Stat Data Provided: (See Full Report in Packet) as of December 17, 2020							
Part I Violent Crimes:	Criminal Homicides:	Sexual Assaults:	Aggravated Assaults	Non-Fatal Shootings:	Robbery:	Carjacking:	Total:	Total Overall Part I Crimes
Totals:	+18%	-27%	+28%	+56%	-20%	+2%	15% Increase in Part I Violent Crimes	-12%
Property I Crimes:	Burglaries:	Larcenies	Motor Vehicle Thefts					
Totals:	-34%	-22%	-17%				-24% Decrease in Part I Property Crime	

DPD's Enforcement Efforts during the Week of December 7-13, 2020: The Department recovered 109 handguns, 4 long guns, made 91 CCW (Carrying Concealed Weapons) arrests, and 214 felony arrests. Additionally, the Department reported the following: 1,983 citations issued; 512 grams of marijuana confiscated; 51 grams of cocaine confiscated; 219 pills confiscated and 1,885 traffic stops performed. Deputy Chief Bryant discussed other community initiatives the Department is engaging: DPD Annual Secret Santa, Neighborhood Police Officers (NPOs) Program adopting families in various precincts, and other important initiatives. **Recent Promotional Class:** The Department reported that (5) Lieutenants and (22) Sergeants will graduate from the Lieutenants Promotional Assessment Course (LPAC) and Sergeants Promotional Assessment Course (SPAC) and will be welcomed with the DPD's supervisory ranks. Lastly, **Deputy Chief Bryant** congratulated Commissioner Jesus Hernandez on his recent appointment to the Hispanic Latino Commission of Michigan by Governor Gretchen Whitmer.

Deputy Chief Mark Bliss, Office of Support Operations, reported on the Department's recent preliminary Quarterly Use of Force Report submission. Deputy Chief Bliss provided clarity on the report and reported the following: The Department is currently working to enhance the Department's reporting system. For future reports, the Department will break out individuals and incidents for reporting purposes and place other protocols in place. Additionally, **Deputy Chief Bliss** shared the Department's Destruction of Animal report data will be included in future reports for the Board's information based on additional adjustments to the reporting system that captures key data. **Deputy Chief Bliss** also discussed how each Category of Force is captured and how many types of reporting is included within each category (i.e. Category 1 has (9) different subcategories, which may show a 35% use of force, but this does not reflect that 20-27 firearm discharges occurred because there are (9) subcategories that are accounted for). The Department's Policy includes the following Use of Force Categories:

 Category (1) – Investigated by Force Investigations (FI), Category 1 Uses of Force includes Fatal Shootings, Shots Fired, Fatal Vehicle Pursuits, Non-Fatal Shootings, Unintentional Shootings, Critical Vehicle Pursuits, Category 1 Use of Force Other and Category 1 Use of Force Taser.

- Category (2) Investigated by parent command includes Pressure Points, Hard Hands, Chemical Spray, Joint Locks, Conducted Energy Weapon, and No Force Used.
- Category (3) Investigated by the parent command includes, Physical Controls, Compliance Techniques, Use of PR 24 as a Compliance Tool to assist in forcibly handcuffing, Taser discharge that does not make contact with the suspect, Deployment of Chemical Spray with no complaint of adverse effects, and Canine Apprehension.
- Category (4) Investigation by the parent command includes member, at the request of EMS personnel, physically
 assisting with placing the subject/patient into an ambulance, and subject/patient suffering no injuries as a result of the
 member's assistance, nor were there any accusations of injury.
- Category Involving Drawing of a Firearm and Acquiring a Target the parent command shall investigate incidents where a member draws a firearm and acquires a target and there are no further uses of force.

Deputy Chief Bliss also reported the Department's interest in working with the Board to further develop and enhance the Quarterly Use of Force Reports. A written report (Quarterly Use of Force – 3rd Quarter) will be placed on file.

Commissioner Bernard requested protocol information on the DPD Executive(s) who will act in Chief of Police Craig's absence over the next couple of weeks. Commissioner Bernard also requested information on lethal force and less-than-lethal-force, standard equipment officers are authorized to carry, and the type of ammunition officers are allowed to utilize (i.e. bullet, cartridges). Commissioner Bernard also asked whether all members will be equipped with a name plate or identification card based on Department policy. Commissioner Bernard also raised questions about the Department's policy on prohibited chokeholds and the prohibition from employing any neck restraints. Commissioner Davis requested whether there are any reports against any officers regarding the duty to intercede since implementing the updated policy. Commissioner Burch commended Deputy Chief Bryant for her work. Commissioner Burch asked which precinct covered the areas of Van Dyke, Eight Mile and Outer Drive, considering the Ninth and Eleventh Precincts precinct boundaries. Commissioner Burch raised concerns about reporting measures and requested to follow up with the Department. Commissioner Burch also commended Sergeant Hall. Commissioner Brown thanked the DPD Executives for their reports and the Department for their work with Commander Szilagy and the SRT Team on the recent policeinvolved incident at the Fifth Precinct. Commissioner Brown also congratulated Sergeant Crystal Johns, Eighth Precinct for her accolades highlighted in District 1's Newsletter and her appointment as a union steward with the LSA. Commissioner Jones thanked DPD Executives for their presentation and thanked the Department for their comprehensive work on the Mental Health Initiatives that will address the issues between the community and the Department. Commissioner Bernard commended the Department on their strict policy regarding no gunfire for misdemeanor charges discussing its distinctions with other notable police use of force incidents that have occurred around the country resulting in fatal or serious incidents. Commissioner Bernard also discussed the Department's no firing from a moving vehicle policy provision. Chairperson Bell highlighted the recent press conference on the Department's Mental Health Initiative noting Director Trisha Stein, Mr. Bernard Parker, Honorable Councilmember Roy McCalister, Chief of Police James E. Craig, and Mayor Mike Duggan's work in this endeavor.

Director Trisha Stein, Administrative Operations, reported on the Department's Mental Health Initiatives: Director Stein reported the following: The program will be deployed within the downtown area, which will include the co-response with a mental health provider, a mental health behavioral specialist from the DWIHN provider network, and Department trained Crisis Intervention Team, (CIT) trained officers in the downtown area. The Department will expand out to the Ninth Precinct in Northeast Detroit immediately after the first of the year and within Northwest Detroit in the Eighth and the Twelfth Precincts before the end of the year. The Department will train officers in this community approach of CIT to fulfil on average approximately 20 calls per day that have a mental health nexus. In addition, also at the beginning of the year, the Department will have a behavioral health specialist, a clinician embedded within the 911 call center, starting off on one shift per day, based on need and later building capacity. By the end of the year, on 24/7 rotation, a clinician will be available to handle calls as previously mentioned at the press conference. The Department has thousands of calls that happen on a regular basis, and on average, the top nine callers call 50 times a day. Based on the nature of their calls, the Department believes the calls will be better served by a clinician. The Department will continue to provide training and support to the call takers and dispatchers to divert calls, de-escalate situations, and also deploy co-response teams of behavioral specialists and trained officers. Lastly, the third of the three-prong approach is the homeless outreach that involves working with city colleagues and housing and revitalization along with the Department's neighborhood police officers and then behavioral health specialists that will do street outreach. The Department will start in the Third Precinct in the first guarter of 2021 and connect chronically homeless individuals to housing and mental and physical health care along with other supportive services that they need. Finally, this program will be grounded and supported by the Office of Internal and External Affairs, which is led by Captain Tonya Leonard-Gilbert.

Chairperson Bell commended Chief of Police Craig and the Department on the mental health initiatives and encouraged Commissioners to monitor and become involved with the program. **Commissioner Burton** requested information on how much

money was expended over the last (4) years on military-grade equipment from the Department of Defense and asked for a description on the equipment use. **Commissioner Burton** also asked for information on the police response time for Priority One, Priority Two, and Priority Three calls for service. **Commissioner Burch** commended Director Stein on her work with the mental health programs and requested to speak further about recommendations. **Commissioner Burch** asked for clarity on Commissioner Burton's questions about police response time.

Unfinished Business.

III. MOTION: To Grant the Appeal of Jared Scott Regarding Disqualification from the Detroit Police Department Recruitment Process.

Motion: Commissioner Holley **Second:** Commissioner Bernard **Commissioner Brown** stated that he wanted to comment on the issue with the appeal and thanked Chief Legal Counsel Moslimani for correcting the recommendation. **Interim Board Secretary White** shared additional information regarding the Applicant Appeal stating that the Board's Office received updated information from the DPD's HR Division yesterday and immediately updated the Board's packet and recommendation to reflect the most recent update from the Department.

 VOTE:
 Yes = 10
 No = 0
 Motion: ADOPTED

New Business.

IV. Motion: To Post the Vacant Positions for the Board's Office, including the Board Attorney, CFO [Executive Manager of Fiscal] Position, and Board Secretary.

Second: Commissioner Brown Discussion: Chairperson Bell shared an update Motion: Commissioner Burton regarding Board personnel positions noting the first position that was posted was the Director of Personnel. The process will begin during the second week of January to review the resumes, and the Board will conduct the interviews the following week. The posting process is measured by the Human Resources Department. Additionally, the Board voted to have both interim positions for the next six months to work through the budget and the posting process. Lastly, the Human Resources Department is an integral piece to determining the key components to finalizing the positions for posting and interviews. Commissioner Burton urged the Commissioners to vote to post the positions given the length of time for the current vacancies, budget concerns, and allowances. Commissioner Holley expressed his discomfort with filling vacancies during this public health crisis amidst meeting virtually and not holding in-person meetings and urged delaying the process until the public health crisis is lifted in another 6-7 months. Commissioner Bernard encouraged the Board to vote to post the positions to prevent budget reduction for not immediately filling the vacancies, expressed that meetings could take place at the DPSH Building to hold the interviews, and recommended application procedures for interested staff members. Commissioner Brown expressed his position to fill the current vacancies citing that the process needed to begin immediately and that the Board was in need of filling the positions with competent people who can fulfill the roles and understand the needs of each position within the Board's Office, citing that he had observed items neglected and overlooked. Commissioner Davis agreed with the last two speakers stating that the Board was doing a disservice to the community by not posting the positions immediately.

Yes: Commissioner Bernard, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burton, Commissioner Davis, and Commissioner Holley No: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chair Holt, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Hernandez, and Commissioner Jones

VOTE: Yes = 5 No = 5

Motion: FAILED

PRESENTATION(S) TO THE BOARD: A. DPD's Annual Improvement Plan – Assistant Chief David Levalley, Administrative Operations

B. BOPC Survey Feedback - Community Relations Coordinator Teresa Blossom, Board of Police Commissioners C. BOPC Year-End Report – Interim Secretary to the Board and Executive Manager of Policy Melanie White, Board of Police Commissioners

A. DPD's Annual Improvement Plan: Assistant Chief David Levalley discussed that the Annual Improvement Plan, required by City Charter, was originally scheduled for presentation to the Board in March 2020. However, due to COVID-19, the presentation was delayed. The presentation consisted of highlights of the Department's 2020 Annual Improvement Goals covering Enforcement, Support Operations, and Administration areas. The Department's Annual Improvement

Plan for 2021 is underway and will be presented in early 2021. During 2020, the Department sought to employ key enforcement measures such as reducing crime, expanding Ceasefire Initiatives and Compstat focus on reducing gun crimes, and reducing drifting and drag racing. Regarding Support operations, the Department focused on deploying new vehicles for police response time efficiency, expanding the Real Time Crime Center (RTCC), expanding project greenlight initiatives, and implementing Ready Operations. Lastly, regarding the Administration, the Department's projected focus was on recruiting more officers, continuing the Police Cadet Program, creating the Internal/External Unit, and increasing Community Partnerships. **Assistant Chief Levalley** provided key updates regarding the status of the Department's goals and outcomes during 2020. A copy of the report will be placed on file along with corresponding material. **Commissioner Bernard** requested further information regarding the deployment of the Department's Shotspotter Technology, Ceasefire Program, and discussed efforts to reduce or eliminate Human Trafficking.

- B. BOPC Survey Feedback Report: Community Relations Coordinator Teresa Blossom: BOPC staff provided an overview of public feedback obtained on 24 topics sent to a random sample via Survey Monkey in October 2020. BOPC feedback was part of action steps in a resolution approved by the Board to reaffirm support for surveys and other recommendations in President Obama's Task Force on 21st Century Policing. Of 565 participants in BOPC Feedback, 85.5% lived in Detroit, 62.7% were African-American, and 62.4% were female. Responses showed a high awareness of racial profiling (94%) and implicit bias (85%). Responses showed Detroit Police Department has a positive reputation (51%). While participants felt protected by police (82%), a significant number felt harassed (45.5%) or intimidated (43%) by law enforcement. Almost half knew the City Charter gives powers to the Board (47%). Participants saw the top three roles for the Board as providing oversight of police by the public (almost 24%), making sure bad or abusive officers do not work for Detroit (almost 14%), and taking/investigating complaints against police (almost 13%). A full report is being compiled for publication and public distribution. A copy of the report will be placed on file along with corresponding material. Commissioner Bernard asked how the Board could reach the Detroit population under 40 years of age.
- C. BOPC 2020 Year End Report: Interim Secretary to the Board Melanie White provided an overview of the Board's 2020 Year End Report noting the following: The Board's achievement measures amid the COVID-19 public health crisis including the Board's continued meetings throughout 2020. The Board conducted extensive policy review and approvals and certain policies were highlighted given the Board and the Department's collaborative efforts during 2020 to develop and implement safe, constitutional, and fair policies. Additionally, discussed were policy updates inspired by National Events discussing the recent tragic killing of George Floyd by Minneapolis Police Officers that sparked national outcry for police and criminal justice reform that resulted in the revised Use of Force Policy Directive. Examples were shared of BOPC Proactive Measures. Highlights were noted regarding the BOPC Citizen Complaints and Discipline discussing the number of complaints received, processed, and investigated during 2020. The BOPC General and Administrative Summary emphasized some of the key events hosted and Board participation in key events. Also, discussed were Community Relations and Outreach Initiatives highlighting the Board's efforts that reached 140,000 Detroit households in two newsletters and increased news alert subscriptions to 5.600, extending outreach to stakeholders under 40 years of age via the Michigan Chronicle, and conducting first BOPC Feedback for public input. Regarding Office Administration, a report was provided of the number of requests processed (telephone, incoming correspondence for weekly meetings and other items) within the Board's Administrative Office for BOPC administration and weekly meetings, approval of BOPC Administrative Staff Standard Operating Procedures (SOP), and the revised Office of the Chief investigator SOP. Lastly, BOPC Goals and Objectives for 2021 were also shared. A copy of the report will be placed on file along with corresponding material. Chairperson Bell noted that staff would be provided with commendations/certificates for filing.

Resolution: Commissioner Davis read the resolution honoring Wayne County Commissioner Jewel Ware (Posthumously).

RESOLUTION HONORING Wayne County Commissioner Jewel Ware POSTHUMOUSLY				
WHEREAS	Detroit native Jewel Ware made life-long contributions that showed her boundless love for the City and its residents. An only child of Clyde and Mattie Ware, Jewel attended Detroit Public Schools and graduated from Murray-Wright High School; and			
WHEREAS	As a child, Jewel Ware was active with the March of Dimes and other programs that influenced her decision to become a social worker and later a public servant. She earned Bachelor and Master degrees from the University of Detroit-Mercy. She worked for many years as a certified social worker in the Michigan corrections and mental health systems; and			

WHEREAS	over the years, Commissioner Ware for youth, health services, and con before and during her 26 years in community events, and supporting	e to the Wayne County Commission. Though her district boundaries changed e stayed a tenacious advocate for seniors and a strong supporter of programs nmunity safety. She worked with the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners office, and many knew her tireless work in visiting constituents, attending g activities, including Safe Night Out and Trunk or Treat with Detroit Police ng-Bey was her partner in advocacy, including criminal justice reform, from ussing in 2013; and				
WHEREAS	Commissioner Ware became an influential leader through her dedicated service, community connections, and political acumen. Candidates and elected officials at all levels sought her advice, support, and determination to win. County Commissioners elected her several times to leadership as Chair and Vice Chair Pro Tem. She was an astute mentor to young people, a role responsible for new generations in city, county, and national leadership. As our Board mourns her passing on December 8, 2020 at 66 years old, our members extend condolences to Commissioner Ware's wide circle of loved ones with the assurance that her legacy will endure.					
NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT						
RESOLVED	That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, awards this resolution posthumously to Wayne County Commissioner Jewel Ware for her 26 years of public service and community leadership. Her contributions and commitment to the city of Detroit and its citizens merit our highest regards.					
Commissioner Davis moved to adopt the resolution of Wayne County Commissioner Jewel Ware (Posthumously). Commissioner Burch seconded. Discussion: None.						
V. VOTE:	Yes = 10 No = 0	Motion: PASSED				
Resolution: Commissioner Jones read the resolution honoring Retired Corporal Randolph "Randy" Williams.						
		TTION HONORING DOLPH "RANDY" WILLIAMS				
WHEREAS	Randolph Williams was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on January 4, 1994. Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Police Officer Williams began his career at the Thirteenth Precinct; and					
WHEREAS	He dutifully served the Thirteenth Precinct, and Gaming. Officer Williams displayed tremendous diligence and aptitude in his assignments. On October 18, 2018, he was promoted to the rank of Corporal and continued to serve at Gaming until his retirement; and					
WHEREAS	During his law enforcement career, Corporal Williams served in the United States Army for five years. He was the deserving recipient of a Chief Merit Award, Perfect Attendance Award, Military Ribbon, Perfect Driving Award, Consent Judgment Award, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, as well as commendations from supervisors, and numerous letters of appreciation from citizenry; and					
WHEREAS	Corporal Williams has tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for 27 years. His professionalism, commitment to public service, integrity, and dedication have been a credit to the Detroit Police Department. He is highly respected as a consummate professional.					
NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED						
	That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, awards this resolution in recognition of Corporal Randolph Williams' 27 plus years of dedicated and diligent public service. His professionalism, integrity, and lifelong commitment to the city of Detroit and its citizens merit our highest regards.					

We thank and congratulate you, Corporal Randolph "Randy" Williams.

Commissioner Brown moved to adopt the resolution of Retired Corporal Randolph "Randy" Williams to be placed in the archives of the Board of Police Commissioners. **Commissioner Bernard** seconded. Discussion: None.

- VI.
 VOTE:
 Yes = 10
 No = 0
 Motion: PASSED
- VII. Motion: Per the Charter To Start the Holiday Recess December 18, 2020 and Reconvene January 7, 2021.

Motion: Chairperson Bell Second: Commissioner Bernard Discussion: None.

 VOTE:
 Yes = 10
 No = 0
 Motion: PASSED

Report from Interim Board Secretary/Communications Submitted to BOPC as incoming information: Documents included within the Board's Weekly Packet and covered during the BOPC Year-End Report:

- 1. Weekly DPD Facial Recognition Technology Report 12/7/20 12/13/20
- 2. Search Warrant and Execution Manual Directive 202.3
- 3. Response Times by Precinct 12/15/20
- 4. BOPC Citywide Crime Comparison 12/14/20
- 5. BOPC Greenlight Heatmap 12/14/20
- 6. Weekly Facial Recognition Report 12/14/20
- 7. DWIHN DPD Behavioral Health Partnership
- 8. Staff Reports

Announcements: Mr. Robert Brown provided key announcements for the Board's use and information. Commissioner Burch commended Robert Brown and Jonya Underwood for their service, efficiency, and courteousness. Vice-Chairperson Holt also showed her gratitude. Chairperson Bell thanked all of the Board's Staff Members for their work and efforts over the years. Mr. Brown announced the following:

- 1. Next Meeting: Thursday, January 14, 2021, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting
- 2. Next Meeting: Thursday, January 21, 2021, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting

Oral Communications/Public Comments - 8 Speakers.

Chairperson Bell called for adjournment. The motion was adopted.

Chairperson Bell adjourned the meeting at 5:44 p.m.