

Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners
Date of Meeting: Thursday, December 3, 2020 – 3:00 PM
Location: Zoom Virtual Meeting Platform

BOPC Chairperson Willie Bell called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (December 3, 2020)

Detroit Board of Police Commissioners' Membership / Attendance	Attend	Not-Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt, Vice-Chairperson	Yes	
Linda D. Bernard	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Yes	
Lisa Carter		Excused
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jesus Hernandez	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Martin Jones	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	10	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for Thursday, December 3, 2020.

Chairperson Bell called the meeting to order and invited Chaplain Hettie Grady to provide the invocation.

INVOCATION: Chaplain Hettie Grady

I. MOTION: To approve the Agenda.

Motion: Commissioner Holley **Second:** Commissioner Burch **Discussion:** None.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Bernard, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Burton, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones.

No: Commissioner Davis.

VOTE: Yes = 9 No = 1 **Motion: ADOPTED**

II. MOTION: To approve the November 19, 2020, Meeting Minutes with necessary corrections.

Motion: Commissioner Brown **Second:** Commissioner Hernandez **Discussion:** None.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Bernard, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones.

No: Commissioner Burton and Commissioner Davis

VOTE: Yes = 8 No = 2 **Motion: ADOPTED**

Chairperson's Remarks:

Chairperson Bell discussed the recent police-involved shooting incident that occurred at the Fifth Precinct and the domestic violence incidents involved. **Chairperson Bell** highlighted recent Domestic Violence Activities at various precincts to acknowledge the Department's efforts to engage in ongoing awareness and community engagement to minimize incidents. **Chairperson Bell** also highlighted the City Council's recent approval of the Shotspotter Technology, which will be used to detect gunshots to reduce and eliminate crime. The Department reported to the Board prior to seeking contract approval from City Council to discuss the overall purpose, policy, and constitutional concerns. The technology will initially be deployed at the Eighth and Ninth Precincts.

Chairperson Bell also discussed the collaboration between the Board, the Department, and the Mayor toward policy development for the new technology to produce sound, comprehensive and fair policy. Also, discussed were highlights from technology – no camera use; no audio use beyond the confirmed shotspotter detection, no surveillance. **Chairperson Bell** highlighted the ongoing efforts to remove illegal guns from the street and appropriately utilize technology that will serve to reduce or eliminate violent crime. **Chairperson Bell** congratulated and welcomed Commissioner Bernard to the Board and requested remarks. **Commissioner Bernard** commended Chairperson Bell’s report and discussed her concerns regarding the Shotspotter Technology. **Commissioner Bernard** discussed that the technology is an after the fact tool that will incarcerate more African-American males and that the technology does not serve to prevent crime. **Commissioner Bernard** recommended a substantial gun buyback program as a means of being proactive in reducing violent crime.

III. MOTION: The Board approve Chief of Police James E. Craig's recommendation to appoint Lieutenant Vernal Newson to the rank of Captain.

Motion: Commissioner Holley **Second:** Commissioner Jones **Discussion:** **Commissioner Bernard** asked if there was any relevant disciplinary history concerning either of the candidates. **Chairperson Bell** indicated that the disciplinary information was provided a week ago as well as included in this week’s information packet.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Burton, Commissioner Davis, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones.

Abstain: Commissioner Bernard.

VOTE: Yes = 9 No = 0 Abstain = 1 **Motion: ADOPTED**

IV. MOTION: The Board approve Chief of Police James E. Craig's recommendation to appoint Lieutenant Tharadrous M. White to the rank of Captain.

Motion: Vice-Chairperson Holt **Second:** Commissioner Brown **Discussion:** None.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Burton, Commissioner Davis, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones.

Abstain: Commissioner Bernard.

VOTE: Yes = 9 No = 0 Abstain = 1 **Motion: ADOPTED**

Chief of Police Report: Chief of Police’s Summary of CompStat Data and other Crime Information/DPD Information:

Chief of Police James E. Craig reported on the following items: **Chief of Police Craig** asked for continued prayers on behalf of Wayne County Sheriff Benny Napoleon for his speedy and full recovery. **Chief of Police Craig** thanked the Board for their support on the recent promotions noted above. **Chief of Police Craig** also discussed the following: Officers Injured in the Line of Duty; Comp Stat Crime and Statistical Data for the reporting period; Protest Activities; COVID-19 impacts, and recent critical incidents impacting the Detroit Police Department and the community. See attached Meeting Transcripts for more information.

		Comp Stat Data Provided: (See Full Report in Packet) as of November 19, 2020						
Part I Violent Crimes:	Criminal Homicides:	Sexual Assaults:	Aggravated Assaults	Non-Fatal Shootings:	Robbery:	Carjacking:	Total:	Total Overall Part I Crimes
Totals:	+16%	-26%	+27%	+56%	-20%	+2%	15% Increase in Part I Violent Crimes	-12%
Property I Crimes:	Burglaries:	Larcenies	Motor Vehicle Thefts					
Totals:	-34%	-22%	-17%				-24% Decrease in Part I Property Crime	

Chief of Police Craig highlighted a recent meeting with the Major Cities of Police Chiefs Organization discussing the increase of gun violence, violent crimes, and gang activities across the country, citing COVID-19 and argument based disputes. ***Recent Officer-Involved Shooting Incident***. Officers were on patrol and observed a suspect holding a gun to a victim with an extended magazine. Officers intervened and during the intervention, the suspect pointed the extended weapon at the officers. This incident stemmed from an argument-based incident. Two shots were fired and the suspect was later transported for medical treatment. The officer is projected to recover from his injuries. A 72-hour debrief was held where Department officials evaluate officers' tactics and activities during the incident. **Chief of Police Craig** also discussed the recent recommendation to hold a gun buyback program, highlighting the number of arrests that have occurred, citing the removal of (60) - (100) illegal guns off the streets and 75% of those cases are being prosecuted despite the return of violent repeat offenders back to the communities. **Chief of Police Craig** further discussed that there are more African American women who are legally purchasing handguns within this region during the recent public health crisis. ***Fifth Precinct Shooting Incident***. At 11:15 p.m., the suspect was involved in a continual dispute with his girlfriend over child custody matters. The suspect later approached his girlfriend with an AR-15 loaded with .223 magazines, demanding that she get out of her car, and later firing several shots into the car, striking and fatally wounding her. Afterwards, the suspect sent text messages to the victim's family stating that he was going to kill the girlfriend and deal with the police and the judge. Later, the suspect arrived at the Fifth Precinct's parking lot waiting for an extended period of time, and later firing into the Fifth Precinct several times. **Chief of Police Craig** discussed the Fifth Precinct's Command Officers strategy to resolve and eliminate the threat at the precinct. The suspect later fired another round inside one of the police vehicles, which caused fragments of glass to strike one of the police officers. Special Response Team (SRT) Unit was called to the scene, and with the assistance of Fifth Precinct Command Officers, the members developed a strategy to eliminate the threat. **Chief of Police Craig** discussed the use of the military-grade armored vehicle to contain the threat and resolve the matter in lieu of a regular patrol vehicle. After the exchange of gunfire between the SRT Officers and the suspect, the suspect succumbed to his injuries. **Chief of Police Craig** also discussed the evidence found at the scene regarding a letter generated by the suspect describing his intentions and actions. Chief of Police Craig stated that year to date, this is the 31st incident involving violent criminal offenders. **Chief of Police Craig** provided COVID-19 statistics, commending Assistant Chief Levalley and Executive Manager Reid Branche-Wilson on tracking and retaining COVID-19 data.

Commissioner Davis asked about the six steps involving the force continuum and the placement of tear gas and rubber bullets. **Commissioner Davis** asked whether Shotspotter registered 22 and 25 caliber weapons and whether the technology was only used and designed for shots in the open. **Commissioner Davis** also asked whether previous offenders were submitting applications for Concealed Pistol License (CPLs). **Commissioner Davis** also stated he was glad to hear that no officers were injured during the recent police-involved incident. **Commissioner Holley** discussed the alarming rate of COVID-19 deaths and the homicide rate increase. **Commissioner Holley** recommended the Department, Board Chairperson and Mayor of City of Detroit address the high rate of homicides. **Commissioner Holley** also asked whether persons who are carrying illegal guns receive a penalty of imprisonment for a period of (2) years. **Commissioner Bernard** discussed the stigmas and perceptions associated with persons who retain firearms. **Commissioner Burch** discussed the recent promotional changes at the Eleventh Precinct and asked for the rationale supporting the constant changes at the Eleventh Precinct. **Commissioner Burch** asked about Traffic Officer Robinson, the status of the rotating speeding signs, and efforts to reduce shooting incidents. **Vice-Chairperson Holt** discussed the Department's submission of information on Shotspotter Technology, noting that answers to previously posed questions could be located within the material transmitted earlier in the week by the Department. **Commissioner Brown** commended the Department on its efforts to combat violence. **Commissioner Brown** asked about officers being trained to write and issue blight tickets, discussed Inspectors being threatened when they arrive to issue tickets, and posed whether the Department could hold the responsibility of issuing blight tickets. **Commissioner Brown** discussed the recent Shotspotter Presentation and the presentation to the Board, stating the Board was unaware of the intention to transmit to City Council for budget approval. **Commissioner Brown** asked whether it would be prudent for the Department to approach the Board to receive approval of the technology and development of policy before reporting to City Council, stating the budget amendment was not approved by the Board and there is no policy in place regarding the technology's operation. **Chief of Police Craig** stated that there was a presentation given to the Board on the Shotspotter Technology and that policy was underway for the Board's review. **Chief of Police Craig** also stated City Council has the authority to approve the budget allocation and that further clarification would be provided regarding the timeline of information. **Chairperson Bell** confirmed that the Department reported to the Board prior to seeking City Council approval, stating that there was a dialogue and discussion that occurred and that further dialogue would take place regarding this item. **Commissioner Jones** thanked Chief of Police Craig regarding his report and the hard work of the men and women of the Detroit Police Department. **Commissioner Jones** discussed the recent meeting involving the Shotspotter Technology Program and the anticipation of the effectiveness of the program to prevent crime involving but not limited to drive-by shootings to benefit the community. **Commissioner Burton** discussed recent cases involving Shotspotter Technology and the prohibition of recordings based on the State's Wiretap Law and other case law precedent in other jurisdictions. **Commissioner Burton** discussed that the law department, collegiate professors, the ACLU, and members of the community should be invited to discuss the Shotspotter Technology in front of the Board. **Chairperson Bell** requested any questions. **Commissioner Burton** asked why the Department did not utilize collegiate members to discuss this new

technology. **Chief of Police Craig** stated that he was not aware of the technology picking up conversations and random audio in the area. **Chairperson Bell** asked for whether there were any further questions. **Commissioner Burton** stated that he did not believe the technology was ready to be used or deployed at this time and called for a moratorium on the use of the technology. **Commissioner Burton** asked what the Department was planning to implement regarding mental health training and repeated questions posed earlier about bringing in members from the community and Academians to speak to the Board.

Captain Kurt Worboys, Professional Education and Training: In a request from Commissioner Holley to report on the training guidelines issued to police recruits during training, Captain Worboys discussed the following: the Department's Police Recruit Training Curriculum required by MCOLES (Michigan Commission on Law Enforcement Standards) and the Department including but not limited to training on response to persons with medical and mental disorders, prisoner care and treatment, domestic violence response, procedures involving civil disputes, arrest laws on search warrants, and crisis intervention training. **Chairperson Bell** requested the training curriculum for the Board. **Commissioner Brown** asked whether Captain Worboys was working with any of the local colleges and universities on the Department's mental health initiatives. **Vice-Chairperson Holt** asked whether the Department has a licensed psychologist on staff that conducts screening for circumstances. **Vice-Chairperson Holt** also asked whether it would be appropriate for the licensed psychologist to present before the Board to explain information and tools used to assist Department Members.

Unfinished Business.

V. Motion: To Approve Manual Directive 102.12 Duty to Intervene

Motion: Commissioner Holley **Second:** Commissioner Jones **Discussion:** **Vice-Chairperson Holt** discussed that she and the members of the Charter Revision Commission were surprised that officers were subjected to penalty if they were discovered turning off their Body Worn Camera. Vice-Chairperson Holt asked about disciplinary action relating to Duty to Intervene policy. **Chief of Police James E. Craig** stated that a violation of the duty to intervene policy could result in termination. **Commissioner Burton** stated that he would like to move to table the motion until the next meeting to allow more time for review by the new Commissioner and to answer any concerns recently posed.

VI. Motion: To Table Manual Directive 102.12 Duty to Intervene

Motion: Commissioner Burton **Second:** Commissioner Brown **Discussion:** **Commissioner Bernard** indicated that under Roberts' Rules of Order, a motion to table is not subject to a vote. **Chairperson Bell** indicated the motion was subject to a vote.

Yes: Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burton, and Commissioner Davis.

No: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones.

VOTE: Yes = 3 No = 6 Abstain = 1 **Motion: FAILED**

VII. Original Motion: To Approve Manual Directive 102.12 Duty to Intervene

Motion: Commissioner Holley **Second:** Commissioner Jones **Discussion:** None.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones.

No: Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burton and Commissioner Davis.

Abstain: Commissioner Bernard.

VOTE: Yes = 6 No = 3 Abstain = 1 **Motion: ADOPTED**

New Business.

VIII. Motion: To Hire a Parliamentarian.

Motion: Commissioner Brown **Second:** Commissioner Davis **Discussion:** **Chairperson Bell** indicated that this is a personnel matter and we will take the matter as a personnel matter. **Commissioner Burton** called to overrule the Chair.

PRESENTATION(S) TO THE BOARD: A. City-Wide Community Relations Council – Mr. Alvin Stokes

- A. City-Wide Community Relations Council:** Mr. Stokes indicated that the Citywide Community Relations Council have not been able to meet due to COVID-19. Mr. Stokes stated the organization's efforts are attempted to increase

communication and participation in the program. He also discussed a recent meeting with the new sergeants and his plans to align the NPO Sergeants and Presidents of the Community Relations to communicate shared responsibilities. Mr. Stokes discussed the shortfalls the Citywide Community Relations and later requested Chief of Police Craig to speak with the Presidents of the Community Relations to share recommendations from the Community Relations Council and to continue an open dialogue. **Chairperson Bell** commended Mr. Stokes on his leadership with Citywide Community Relations and extended any assistance on behalf of the Board. **Commissioner Brown** volunteered to assist the Community Relations Council within the Eighth Precinct. **Commissioner Burch** asked Mr. Stokes if he was familiar with the Eleventh Precinct and the "Love Where You Live" motto. **Vice-Chairperson Holt** thanked Mr. Stokes for his work and assistance and also discussed sharing the meeting announcements with other interested parties.

Resolution: Vice-Chairperson Holt read the resolution honoring Commissioner Evette Griffie.

**RESOLUTION HONORING
COMMISSIONER EVETTE GRIFFIE**

WHEREAS Evette Griffie, a life-long resident of the City of Detroit, was first appointed by Mayor Mike Duggan on October 18, 2018 to serve on the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners for District 2 after that elected seat became vacant; and

WHEREAS Commissioner Griffie was highly active in her community, yet immediately embraced her responsibility to advocate for residents and to ensure public accountability and oversight of the Detroit Police Department; and

WHEREAS Her work helped the Board address modern challenges. Commissioner Griffie made strong contributions to policies and metrics for facial recognition technology and many other police directives, procedures, and practices. After George Floyd's public suffocation by Minneapolis police sparked global protests, Commissioner Griffie led the Board actions for immediate reforms and results. She helped to revise or create policies to limit strangleholds and other uses of force, to require a duty to intervene, and to enhance police training. Her leadership helped put Detroit at the forefront of U.S. police reform; and

WHEREAS Commissioner Griffie upheld her responsibilities the Board simultaneously with her professional duties as Chief of Staff (Customer Service) for DTE. She also works to inspire and empower youth through The Links Inc. service organization and as a mentor in the Women of Tomorrow program and its outreach with students at the Davis Aerospace Technical High School.

WHEREAS Commissioner Griffie is hailed as part of the city's new generation of leaders. Her recognitions include Crain's Detroit *20 in their 20s* and the Michigan Chronicle's *40 under 40* and *Women of Excellence 2019*. She also received the Michigan Chronicle Legacy in Motion Rising Star Award, the Detroit Young Professional Vanguard Award, and the Women's Thrive Conference Shooting Star Award.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking on behalf of the citizens of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, recognizes and honors the enduring dedication of Commissioner Evette Griffie. Her talent and selflessness have proven to be invaluable assets to the City of Detroit; and be it further

RESOLVED, The Police Commissioners of this Board thank and congratulate you on your perseverance and determination to promote the mission of the Board and the Detroit Police Department during your productive and devoted service to the Board of Police Commissioners.

We salute and honor you, Commissioner Evette Griffie.

Vice-Chairperson Holt moved to adopt the resolution of Commissioner Evette Griffie. **Commissioner Jones** seconded. Discussion: **Commissioner Burton** indicated that he was not in favor of voting for the resolution, calling the resolution preposterous and bolstered. **Commissioner Davis** complimented the plaque presented by Commissioner Holley, stating that he did an outstanding job on the plaque.

IX. VOTE: Yes = 10 No = 0 Motion: PASSED

Report from Interim Board Secretary/Communications Submitted to BOPC as incoming information: Ms. White reported on the following items:

1. Weekly DPD Facial Recognition Technology Report 11/16/20 – 11/29/20
2. Gunshot Technology Information

3. FY2021 Budget Material
4. Project Green Light Update 12/1/20
5. Staff Reports – including but not limited to the Board's Calendar Report

Announcements: Chairperson Bell announced the following:

1. **Next Meeting:** Thursday, December 10, 2020, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting
2. **Next Community Meeting:** Thursday, January 14, 2021, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting

Oral Communications/Public Comments – 6 Speakers.

Chairperson Bell called for adjournment. The motion carried.

Chairperson Bell adjourned the meeting at 5:03 p.m.