Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners Date of Meeting: Thursday, December 10, 2020 – 3:00 PM Location: Zoom Virtual Meeting Platform

BOPC Chairperson Willie Bell called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (December 10, 2020)

Detroit Board of Police Commissioners' Membership / Attendance		
	Attend	Not- Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt, Vice-Chairperson		Excused
Linda D. Bernard	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Yes	
Lisa Carter		Excused
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jesus Hernandez	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Martin Jones	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	9	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for Thursday, December 10, 2020.

Chairperson Bell called the meeting to order and invited Chaplain Darnell Ison to provide the invocation.

INVOCATION: Chaplain Damell Ison

I. MOTION: To approve the Agenda.

Motion: Commissioner Holley **Second:** Commissioner Hernandez **Discussion: Commissioner Burch** asked whether this was the proper time to correct the minutes regarding an inaccuracy. Chairperson Bell clarified the proper time would be when the Board addresses the approval of the minutes. Commissioner Davis voiced disagreement against the agenda format because it does not follow the outline in the Board's Bylaws and noted that he will continue to vote against it. Commissioner Davis further expressed that the Board needed to have the agenda set the same way as noted in the Bylaws, and if changes were needed each time, the Board could change the agenda at that time. Commissioner Davis also stated that if the Board adjusted the agenda, the public comments should be advanced on the agenda. Commissioner Burton stated he was trying to chime in on the vote and asked what the vote was regarding because of phone reception challenges. Chairperson Bell reminded Commissioners of the requirement for an agenda to have a meeting. Commissioner Davis stated the Board needs an approved agenda. Chairperson Bell asked if any Commissioner wanted to reconsider their vote. Commissioner Davis expressed the agenda could be adjusted. Commissioner Holley requested clarity on the issue(s) with the agenda. Chairperson Bell explained that the agenda is flexible and can be adjusted given the circumstances. Commissioner Holley asked whether the previous speaker could cite the issue with the agenda. Chairperson Bell indicated that the previous speaker stated their position. Commissioner Holley asked for additional clarity. Chairperson Bell stated that the previous speaker is not in favor of the current agenda format and believes items should be adjusted differently. Commissioner Holley asked whether Commissioner Davis could give a suggestion on the agenda format to prevent any inconvenience to the community and the Board's time. Chairperson Bell explained the flexibility of the agenda format given the circumstances based on the Board's Bylaws, citing that the Board had previously visited this topic of discussion. Chairperson Bell also discussed the flexibility in previously moving the resolution items on the agenda to accommodate attendees/honorees. Chairperson Bell requested whether Commissioner Burch preferred to reconsider her vote. Commissioner Burch requested to change her vote and requested to clear the concern raised by the previous speaker about the agenda format. Chairperson Bell stated that information would be supplied. Commissioner Bernard stated that she did not understand the history and that was the reason for the abstention. Chairperson Bell reemphasized the ability to adjust the agenda format based on the circumstances.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones.

No: Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burton, and Commissioner Davis.

Abstention: Commissioner Bernard

VOTE: Yes = 5 No = 3 Abstention = 1 **Motion: ADOPTED**

II. MOTION: To approve the December 3, 2020, Meeting Minutes with necessary corrections.

Motion: Commissioner Holley **Second:** Commissioner Jones **Discussion: Commissioner Bernard** noted corrections regarding her comments about the Department being a proactive Department versus reactive concerning the "Shots Fired" [Shotspotter] contract. Commissioner Bernard stated that none of those statements were referenced within the minutes. Commissioner Bernard requested that the meeting transcript be revisited and for the minutes to be amended to include those comments. Chairperson Bell reminded the Board that in compliance with Robert's Rules of Order, not all comments are captured within the summary minutes, but are recorded in the meeting transcript report placed on the Board's website. Commissioner Burch requested for the record to reflect "Officer Robbins" in lieu of "Officer Robbinson." Chairperson Bell reiterated that information would be redistributed relating to Robert's Rules of Order Recording Minutes provisions. Commissioner Burton expressed that there were some points that he raised at the table during last week's meeting and all of his words were not captured in the minutes. Commissioner Burton also stated that there was a "smart" comment that the Chairperson made towards him that was derogatory. which he felt to be very offensive that was not captured in the meeting in the minutes. Commissioner Burton stated that he felt some form of harassment by the Chairperson with the statements that were made last week and about how these meetings have been officiated and the treatment he has received. Chairperson Bell reiterated the Board's summary minutes are not required to capture all of the comments made by a commissioner or any individual involved with the Board's meeting. The summary minutes simply highlight certain issues, motions, and recording items. Commissioner Burton stated that it was unacceptable.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Commissioner Bernard, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones.

No: Commissioner Burton and Commissioner Davis

VOTE: Yes = 7 No = 2 **Motion: ADOPTED**

Chairperson's Remarks: Chairperson Bell expressed prayers and condolences to the family of former Wayne County Commissioner Jewel Ware highlighting her great work and contributions. At Commissioner Davis's request, the Board held a moment of silence in honor of Commissioner Ware. Commissioner Bernard asked for a resolution to be prepared in honor of Commissioner Ware. Chairperson Bell noted the resolution would be presented next week during the Board Meeting. Chairperson Bell also highlighted retired Police Commander Thomas Ferebee who was instrumental in hiring African-American police officers on the Detroit Police Department. A resolution is forthcoming honoring Mr. Ferebee. Commissioner Burch noted that Wayne County Commissioner Ware's years of service would be highlighted on the Belmont Shopping Center's digital board for the community's awareness. Chairperson Bell highlighted the 2019 Annual BOPC Report and the work of Teresa Blossom and staff in completing the report. Chairperson Bell also highlighted the Board's 45th Anniversary Celebration and former Police Commissioners who were featured within the report, such as Susan Mills Meeks, Community Activist, Alexander Ritchie, Douglas Frazier, UAW Official, Professor Edward Littlejohn, Attorney and Civil Rights Activist, and Reverend Charles Butler, Civil Rights Activist. Chairperson Bell also discussed the Board's upcoming training session on January 7, 2021, on Parliamentary Procedures. Chairperson Bell also discussed past conduct during the Board's recent meetings, rules of decorum, and feedback that he and others have received regarding the Board's conduct at Board Meetings. Commissioner Jones offered remarks and support for former Commissioner Evette Griffie, emphasizing congratulatory remarks and commendations to her for her contributions to the law enforcement and oversight communities in an effort to mend the community. Commissioner Jones also welcomed and congratulated Commissioner Bernard and expressed his interest in working with Commissioner Bernard and the full Board to ensure quality oversight.

III. MOTION: To approve the Proposed Board of Police Commissioners 2021 Calendar.

Motion: Commissioner Burch Second: Commissioner Bernard Commissioner Davis inquired about the proposed training days scheduled on the same day and time as the Board's regular meeting and the impact of the trainings regarding meeting logistics. Chairperson Bell expressed that Board Leadership and Staff Administration had consulted with Corporation Counsel staff and more information could be shared during the closed session. Chairperson Bell discussed the Board's weekly schedule and the necessity for ongoing training. Commissioner Davis inquired whether the community would have an opportunity to make public comments on those training days. Chairperson Bell noted that training was restricted to Commissioners on those outlined days. Commissioner Davis asked whether all of the dates and times on the BOPC Calendar would be starting at 3:00 p.m. and whether

there was anticipation for the virus throughout the entire year. Chairperson Bell expressed that one could not anticipate or forecast regarding the public health crisis and that adjustments could be made to the calendar if applicable. Commissioner Davis stated that he was going to vote against the BOPC 2021 Calendar. Interim Board Secretary White expressed that the proposed calendar was to simply distribute a calendar for the community and for the Board to prepare for those upcoming presentations and at any time, the calendar could be adjusted given the circumstances and given any emergencies. Additionally, in compliance with Section 7-802 of the City Charter, the Board training is allowed by City Charter as long as it is in compliance with the Open Meetings Act, and the Law Department confirmed this information. Commissioner Bernard expressed her agreement with the Board's 2021 Calendar and expressed the necessity for ongoing training. Commissioner Brown agreed with a previous speaker who expressed disagreement with the Board's Meeting Calendar requesting for the meetings to continue each week and to change the time for training to 6:30 p.m. to prevent conflicting with previously scheduled meetings. Commissioner Brown stated that there was a conflict and the message the Board was sending to the public for those that are not on this meeting would be that the Board is having training. Commissioner Brown noted appreciation for the calendar but noted that once the Board voted on it, the calendar is no longer a proposed calendar. Commissioner Hernandez asked to what extent will the Board be able to provide input and have the flexibility to provide input on the types of training that Board is to receive. Chairperson Bell indicated the Board could began sharing input now. Commissioner Burch stated that she agrees with the calendar reiterating the Board is the only group that she is aware of in the United States that meets every week. Commissioner Burch agreed with the timeframe of holding trainings at 3:00 p.m. until 5:00 p.m. which is a set time that all Commissioners are generally together, and she disagreed with holding trainings at 6:30 p.m. Commissioner Burton stated the Detroit Police Department is involved in the community (24) hours. (7) seven days a week. Commissioner Burton stated the citizens of Detroit voted for more police oversight and that is how the Board expanded from five commissioners to eleven commissioners, seven of which were elected. Commissioner Burton stated the community believes the Board does not meet enough and further stated that the Board has constituents that call the office and do not receive a return phone call.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Commissioner Bernard, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones.

No: Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burton, and Commissioner Davis.

VOTE: Yes = 6 No = 3 **Motion: ADOPTED**

Chairperson Bell reiterated that Commissioners could suggest and recommend training and encouraged Commissioners to weigh in on the types of training. Chairperson Bell also reemphasized the Board's structure, the current remote status given the public health crisis, and the vast opportunities for Commissioners to represent the Board within the community. Chairperson Bell also reiterated the BOPC Public Survey would share more insight into the community's feedback on the Board.

Chief of Police Report: Chief of Police's Summary of CompStat Data and other Crime Information/DPD Information:

Assistant Chief David Levalley representing Chief of Police James E. Craig reported on the following items: Officers Injured in the Line of Duty; Comp Stat Crime and Statistical Data for the reporting period; Protest Activities; COVID-19 impacts, and recent critical incidents impacting the Detroit Police Department and the community. See attached Meeting Transcripts for more information.

		Comp Sta	Comp Stat Data Provided: (See Full Report in Packet) as of December 10 2020							
Part I Violent Crimes:	Criminal Homicides:	Sexual Assaults:	Aggravated Assaults	Non-Fatal Shootings:	Robbery:	Carjacking:	Total:	Total Overall Part I Crimes		
Totals:	+18%	-27%	+28%	+56%	-20%	+2%	15% Increase in Part I Violent Crimes	-12%		
Property I Crimes:	Burglaries:	Larcenies	Motor Vehicle Thefts							
Totals:	-34%	-22%	-17%				-24% Decrease in Part I Property Crime			

Overall Priority Response Time for last week: (11) minutes and (1) second. COVID-19 Updates: Currently, there are (68) members are in quarantine; (52) members have tested positive to date; and currently (2) members are hospitalized, listed in non-critical condition, relating to COVID-19 [one (1) sergeant and (1) civilian]. Assistant Chief Levalley discussed the precincts most heavily impacted by the COVID. Assistant Chief Levalley also reported that Police Officer Mark Robins is currently out on extended medical leave due to sustained injuries.

Commissioner Bernard asked whether the national average for police response time was approximately (7) minutes and whether the speed bumps located throughout the City would delay police response time. Assistant Chief Levalley offered a detailed discussion stating there was not a published national average on police response time due to no known standardized database and police agencies reporting the average differently. The moment that 911 answers the call and the time that police respond to the scene is (11) minutes and (1) second regarding the Department's response time. Regarding speedbumps, the majority of the route consists of primary roads, which should not have significant impact on police response time due to minimal speedbumps encountered. Commissioner Jones requested whether the average times could be quantifiable for the general public. Commissioner Jones also discussed measures that may increase the police response time average, such as false calls to E911, residents failing to answer the door, and residents failing to cooperate with the police when they respond.

Director Christopher Graveline, Professional Standards Bureau and Constitutional Policing reported on the following areas: Protest Investigations, Operation Clean Sweep, and Brady/Giglio Impaired List – A written report will be placed on file.

Protest Investigations:

To date, the Department has initiated 33 investigations into actions taken by DPD members during the protests. These 33 investigations involved 39 complainants. The Department self-initiated many of these investigations after becoming aware of an incident through media reports or social media posts. The status of these investigations are as follows:

- 14 investigations are currently open and active
- 19 investigations are closed with the following findings:
- 3 SUSTAINED MISCONDUCT; 2 NOT SUSTAINED; 3 EXONERATED; 4 UNFOUNDED; 7 ADMINISTRATIVELY CLOSED

The circumstances of the three sustained findings of misconduct are as follows:

- 1) An officer used less-than-lethal rubber pellets on three reporters without justification on May 30, 2020. IA conducted an immediate investigation upon learning of the allegations and submitted a warrant request. The WCPO has charged that officer with three counts of felonious assault. The Board approved Chief Craig's request to place that officer on Suspended without Pay status on July 23, 2020.
- 2) Assistant Chief Bettison became aware of a video posted on Instagram of an officer using pepper spray on a young woman who was walking away from that officer. IA was unable to identify the young woman; however, IA was able to identify the officer and establish that there was no justification for the use of pepper spray in that instance. The investigation has been forwarded to the Disciplinary Unit for its review and service of a Notice of Discipline.
- 3) The Department received a complaint of an officer breaking out a taillight of a citizen's vehicle with his/her PR-24 baton in the downtown area during the early morning hours of May 31, 2020. IA secured video from a business in the downtown area that showed several officers dressed in riot helmets walking near the intersection of Woodward and Grand River. As they passed the intersection, one officer appeared intentionally to swing his/her baton and smashed out the citizen's taillight. Due to the officer wearing riot gear and his/her immediate movement away from the scene, IA was not able to identify the involved-officer. Professional Standards has forwarded its findings to the City Law Department with the recommendation to compensate for the damage to the taillight.

Operation Clean Sweep:

The Department is now into the sixteenth month of its self-initiated investigation into the Major Violators Unit. To date, the investigation has uncovered numerous false affidavits, unauthorized "flipping" of drug dealers with no evidence of attempts to seek larger drug traffickers, perjury during testimony, source of information voucher fraud, and overtime and court fraud. The Department is working closely with the FBI, United States Attorney's Office, and the Wayne County Prosecutor's Office to further criminal investigations and possible criminal charges.

The Department has taken several steps to address the misconduct as the investigation continues. First, the Department has coordinated with the WCPO to review any individuals who were wrongfully incarcerated due to any misconduct. To date, one individual has been exonerated and released from the Michigan Department of Corrections. Second, directly due to this investigation, several Department members who worked in Major Violators are no longer employed by the Department. Specifically:

- 1 member was fired (that termination was appealed to arbitration and we are awaiting a decision)
- 7 members retired pending investigation or charges (including 4 sergeants)
- 4 members resigned pending investigation or charges
- 3 members resigned prior to completion of investigation

The Department has submitted warrant packages to WCPO for review for potential criminal charges (fraud/embezzlement and perjury).

The Department has also studied best practices and has implemented the following proactive measures:

- All narcotic search warrant affidavits must be approved through the chain of command up to and including the Deputy Chief
- All narcotic search warrant executions must have, at minimum, a lieutenant present. More complex warrant executions must have a captain or above present.
- Weekly body-worn camera audits
- All surveillance notes and 224-DOPE tips must be digitally uploaded into the RMS system
- All search warrants must be tracked on SmartSheets
- All narcotic personnel who have been at Major Violators for over 5 years have been transferred out of the unit. The new rule will only allow members to remain in Major Violators for 3 years

The Department will continue to provide updates as this investigation continues.

Brady/Giglio information:

This past week, the WCPO released an update to its Brady/Giglio list. The Department did not review the list prior to its release. However, upon review of the released list, there are only two current Department members on the list. Both of these members are currently assigned to positions that substantially curtail the possibility that they will be called upon for testimony. Neither of these members have a Departmentally adjudicated finding of false statements by the Department. Additionally, neither of these members have a criminal conviction involving false statements.

It is important to note that the Department does not maintain its own Brady/Giglio list. Instead, the Department understands its constitutional obligation to provide information that may touch upon a member's character for truthfulness or bias. The Department forwards information touching upon untruthfulness or bias to the WCPO, as the Department becomes aware of that information.

Thereafter, the WCPO reviews and analyzes the information and independently makes a determination as to whether the officer is Giglio-impaired.

Commissioner Davis asked whether the Department terminates members for falsifying information which likely results in the incarceration of another. Commissioner Davis asked whether the Department was anticipating whether other people will be released from custody/jail as a result of officers falsifying information. Commissioner Davis asked whether the Department notifies an officer who has left the City and transferred to another Department on whether they are Giglio-impaired or have made false testimony resulting in one's incarceration. Commissioner Rev. Holley discussed the increasing rate of homicides within the City of Detroit and the likelihood of an increase in homicides before the year's end. Commissioner Holley urged a meeting/press conference with Chief of Police Craig, Chairperson Bell, and the Board to address the community regarding the state of crime, assessing the reasons for the homicides that occur within the City, and other key updates for the community's awareness. Commissioner Holley urged an emergency meeting with the Department to discuss how to combat the violent crimes and to properly address the community on this matter from the Police Department and the civilian oversight board. Chairperson Bell stated that he was willing to initiate a forum or press conference with Chief of Police Craig and Commissioner Holley to properly address this issue. Chairperson Bell recommended to issue a year-end statement supporting Commissioner Holley's request. Assistant Chief Levalley stated that the packet of information the Department was preparing includes analysis and information on gun violence reduction initiatives in an effort to hold a press conference at the beginning of the year. Commissioner Burch expressed he critical need for the City to control the crime. Commissioner Burch discussed the meaning behind the "Love Where You Live" slogan and the impact that it has had on the community. Commissioner Burch also discussed the level of police presence at the Meijer's located on 8 Mile, in a separate area from the Belmont Center. Commissioner Burch, however, emphasized the incident involving an attack on two women in front of a neighborhood Dollar Store and the need for more DPD surveillance and observation in other inner-city areas within the neighborhood. Commissioner Burch also requested to speak with Commissioner Holley to discuss initiatives to assist the Department with fighting and reducing crime. Commissioner Bernard clarified that Department members are at the Meijers location based on official Secondary Employment. Commissioner Bernard asked for clarity on what were the types of homicides, (i.e. domestic violence, robbery-related) to have a better understanding of what is driving certain types of homicides within the community. Commissioner Bernard discussed the era of high employment and other present circumstances, noting that crime would not decrease until the economic and educational circumstances change. Commissioner Bernard also discussed the recent article published regarding the chokehold incident and asked how the Department reached its exoneration conclusion based on the victim's statement and a clear picture that the victim was being choked on the ground. Commissioner Brown supported statements previously made by Commissioner Holley, recognizing that the Homicide Unit was overworked. Commissioner Brown requested the overtime hours for the Homicide Unit and asked whether the manpower is sufficient to address all of the homicide cases. Commissioner Brown also asked about the Department's efforts to address hold time and response for the public dialing into the Telephone Crime Reporting (TCR). Commissioner Burton asked for Priority 2, 3, and 4 police average response times. Commissioner Burton stated that he was reviewing documentation that showed a national average police response time of 7 ½ minutes. Commissioner Burton also asked how the Department is servicing persons within the community who are hearing impaired and what training the Department offers its members in this regard. Chairperson Bell stated that the Department had previously provided information on Commissioner Burton's requests and would share further information, noting that training information was previously shared last week. Commissioner Burton called Point of Order stating the Chairperson could not use his voice as the Chairperson to dictate what questions should be raised at the table. Commissioner Burton reiterated his request and asked for the Department's strategies to work with members of the community who are hearing impaired.

A copy of the Department's report will be placed on file.

Unfinished Business.

Chairperson Bell addressed the issue of hiring a Parliamentarian, citing the City of Detroit, the Mayor and the Chief Financial Officer reported out that there is a revenue shortage. Chairperson Bell also emphasized that the budget is a significant item, noting the City's recent request for all personnel, unions, and organizations to incur a 5% reduction. Additionally, the Board's investigative union assigned to the Office of the Chief Investigator did not take the City's requested decrease of 2%. Therefore, this will likely have an impact on personnel. Chairperson Bell added the Board was not in the position to hire anyone outside of the scope of what the Board currently has within its personnel and noted that more information was forthcoming. Chairperson Bell noted that one of the key concerns for the City was ensuring that police were appropriately paid.

New Business.

Commissioner Davis stated several months ago, he inquired about why the Chairperson was the only Board Member reading Citizen Complaints cases and whether other commissioners would resume reading regularly. Chairperson Bell indicated that a response was shared four or five months ago, citing that Commissioner Jones was reading cases, Vice-Chairperson Holt was reading cases, and another Commissioner was in the process of receiving training. Commissioner Davis reiterated that he had not received any cases and that he was still available. Chairperson Bell offered to provide further discussion at a later time.

IV. Motion: To Post the Job Vacancy Position for the Board Attorney and Post all Vacancies that the Board's Office has currently.

Motion: Commissioner Burton Second: Commissioner Davis Discussion: Chairperson Bell indicated that he would give an explanation about the personnel and the budget matter when the Board moved into closed session when the Board discussed personnel items. Chairperson Bell reserved to move on from that particular item and emphasized the current budget status. Commissioner Burton inquired whether the personnel discussion could occur at the next Board meeting. Chairperson Bell stated the Board would have a discussion this evening, once the closed session agenda was concluded.

PRESENTATION(S) TO THE BOARD: A. Monthly Human Resources' Report: Lieutenant James Coles

A. Monthly Human Resources' Report: Lieutenant James Coles representing DPD Police Recruiting and Human Resources Section, provided a summary of activities and statistical data during the month of November 2020, noted below, including: staffing, hiring, manpower, leaves of absence, restricted duty, and suspensions. Please refer to the Human Resources' Report for full details.

EMPLOYEE CATEGORY	POSITIONS FILLED	VACANCIES
SWORN	2603	69
CIVILIANS	605	138

	NEW HIRES
Swom	26
Civilian	17
Police Assistants	0
Total New Hires	43

MCOLES AGILITY EXAM												
SCH	EDULED	APPEARED	PASS	FAILED	RESCHEDULED	NS	SCHEDULED	APPEARED	PASS	FAILED	RESCHEDULED	NS
	62	33	26	7	1	28	92	51	27	24	11	30

SWORN RECRUITING NUMBERS July 1, 2019 – November 30, 2020							
APPLICANTS	APPLICANTS IN PROCESS HIRED LACK OF TEMPORARILY PERMANENTLY AWAITING DISQUALIFIED DISQUALIFIED MCOLES						
1868	18	85	109	1,055	218	383	

DETROIT RESIDENCY INFORMATION (as of 06/29/2020)					
SWORN	CIVILIAN	POLICE ASSISTANTS			
579	353	30			

ATTRITION March 2020								
SWORN CIVILIAN POLICE ASSISTANTS TOTAL								
13		8		0		21		
LEAVES OF ABSENCE / RESTRICTED DUTY								
Employee	FMLA	FMLA	Medical	Military	Personal	Restricted	Disabled	Sick
Category	Continuous	Intermittent	Leave		Education			
Sworn	44	148	2	4	0	158	59	19

SWORN PERSONNEL SUSPENSIONS					
Police Officer Detective Investigator Sergeant Lieutenant Total					Total
8	0	0	0	0	8

TOTAL SEPARATIONS

DROP PROGRAM (DEFERRED RETIREMENT OPTION PLAN)
TOTAL
606

Commissioner Holley asked whether the Department was currently engaged in police recruitment advertising. Commissioner Holley offered (3) billboard platforms and television platform for the Department to utilize to display police recruitment ads. Commissioner Burch asked about the Department holding police recruitment at Food Distribution sites, specifically recommending Pastor Yvette Daniels-Griffin's church, Pilgrim Baptist Church of North Detroit located at near E. 7 Mile and Binder Street given the high level of attendance at the food distribution site. Commissioner Bernard also recommended the Department to include a flyer in the food distribution packages to solicit more DPD police employment applications. Chairperson Bell asked for clarity on the meaning of the term of "dismissed" included in the Human Resources Report. Currently, the Department has (4)-(5) classes in the police academy.

B. Third Precinct Presentation: Commander Franklin D. Hayes reported on overall crime within the Third Precinct and activities and operations including but not limited to the following: Crime Statistics within the Third Precinct providing year-to-date comparisons on crime data; Specialized and Targeted Enforcement Initiatives; Project Greenlight Businesses; and other partnerships. Commander Hayes also discussed crime-reduction strategies and measures (i.e. nonfatal shootings, homicides, overall crime, and quality-of-life issues) within the Third Precinct, including but not limited to partnerships with specialized agencies and units' partnerships, embedded precinct social work program, Cease Fire Initiatives, NPOs Initiatives, conducting targeted enforcements, and other enforcement initiatives. Commander Hayes also discussed other community outreach programs and partnerships including the "Blue in You" Program for the youth.

Commissioner Burch commended Commander Hayes and discussed officers' suggestion of including the "Love Where You Live" signs within each police precinct. **Commissioner Davis** asked for more information about the embedded social work program within the precinct and whether the precinct collaborates with Wayne State University to provide social work services. **Commissioner Brown** commended the Third Precinct on their work, programs, and initiatives and discussed further precinct collaboration.

Resolution: Commissioner Burch read the resolution honoring Retired Sergeant Elaine Kelly.

RESOLUTION HONORING SERGEANT ELAINE KELLY

WHEREAS Elaine Kelly was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on October 6, 1986. Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Officer Kelly began her career at the Fifth Precinct; and

Officer Kelly spent several years at the Fifth Precinct. She was promoted to Investigator on May 21, 1999 and assigned to the Fifth Precinct Investigative Operations Unit. Investigator Kelly displayed tremendous knowledge and leadership skills as an Investigator and was promoted to rank of Sergeant on February 6, 2004. Sergeant Kelly's assignments included the Office of the Chief Investigator, Human Resources Bureau as EEO Coordinator, Internal Controls, Public Information, and Neighborhood Policing Bureau East, where she served until her retirement; and

Sergeant Kelly was the deserving recipient of the following awards: Chief's Unit Award, both Consent Judgment Awards, the Ford Fireworks Award, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, and the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, as well as numerous letters of commendation from citizens and superiors; and

Sergeant Kelly has tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for 34 years. She has served the Detroit Police Department and the citizens of the City of Detroit with loyalty, professionalism, integrity and dedication, and is widely respected throughout the law enforcement community as the consummate professional.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

WHEREAS

WHEREAS

WHEREAS

That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking on behalf of the citizens of the great City of Detroit, recognizes and honors the lifelong contributions and commitment to excellence in public service of Sergeant Elaine Kelly. Her display of courage and unwavering community spirit has improved the quality of life for the citizens of Detroit. We wish you all the best in your future endeavors.

8

We thank and congratulate you, Sergeant Elaine Kelly.

Commissioner Brown moved to adopt the resolution of Retired Sergeant Elaine Kelly. **Commissioner Jones** seconded. Discussion: None.

V. VOTE: Yes = 9 No = 0 Motion: PASSED

Report from Interim Board Secretary/Communications Submitted to BOPC as incoming information: Ms. White reported on the following items and shared the timeline regarding the Department's presentation on the Shotspotter Technology and further updates on the Department's presentation of the budget process and corresponding materials:

- 1. Weekly DPD Facial Recognition Technology Report 11/30/20 12/6/20
- 2. Use of Force Quarterly Report Third Quarter
- 3. Mobile Communication Devices Manual Directive 301.5
- 4. Lawsuit Information and Materials
- 5. Draft Report on BOPC Feedback responses with Detroit Residents
- 6. Weekly Facial Recognition Report 12/7/20
- 7. Response Times by Precinct 12/7/20
- 8. BOPC Greenlight Heatmap 12/7/20
- 9. BOPC Citywide Crime Comparison 12/7/20
- 10. Final Draft 2019 Annual Report
- 11. Department Budget Responses and Brief Summary
- 12. Staff Reports

Commissioner Brown stated that the Board did not vote on the approval of the Shotspotter Technology, the budget information nor did the contract discussion come before the Board before going to City Council. Interim Board Secretary White clarified that the Department reported to the Board by way of a meeting with representatives from the Board, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Jones, and Interim Secretary to the Board and Policy Manager Melanie White, whom received information on the technology and shared the same information with the full Board for the Board's review, consideration, feedback, and discussion, Commissioner Brown shared disagreement. Commissioner Bernard expressed support of the previous speaker noting that the Department should bring important information to the full Board in advance. Commissioner Bernard also discussed the importance of the Department's Budget, the need for thoroughly reviewing and evaluating the Department's Budget, and the significant attention needed by all Commissioners. Commissioner Bernard discussed the Board's obligation to review a lengthy budget report which requires sufficient time to review and analyze. Commissioner Bernard also stated that she would share recommendations about the Use of Force Policy, particularly with respect to disabled individuals. Chairperson Bell emphasized the Board's staff's role, the purpose of the staff's responsibilities, and highlighted the great deal of responsibility for staff. Chairperson Bell noted that every item before the Board could not be discussed at the table given the level of research, analysis, and work associated with preparing for the subject matter. Chairperson Bell discussed the Board's staff structure in comparison to a similar unit of government, such as the City Council noting that each councilperson has a six-person staff, and the impact that each Councilmember has given their personnel structure. Chairperson Bell urged the Board to consider the work of the Board and the level of work that occurs throughout the week in addition to weekly meetings. Commissioner Davis requested for the Board to receive more information sooner. Commissioner Davis stated that the information the Board receives especially the day of the meeting or the day prior to the meeting should be available by the Friday prior to the meeting and should go out no later than Monday preceding the Board Meeting. Chairperson Bell discussed the time involved in preparing for a weekly meeting with limited staff. Chairperson Bell requested the previous speaker to consider the many issues and activities staff are required to resolve and handle on a daily basis. Additionally, Chairperson Bell discussed the Department's personnel structure in contrast to the Board's personnel structure. Commissioner Burch suggested that Commissioners who are elected should also receive invitations for Department meetings, policy discussions, and other critically important meetings. Chairperson Bell expressed the Board does not make distinctions between Commissioners who are elected versus appointed.

Announcements: Chairperson Bell announced the following:

- 1. Next Meeting: Thursday, December 17, 2020, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting
- 2. Next Community Meeting: Thursday, January 7, 2021, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting

Chairperson Bell asked the Board and the public for continued prayers for Wayne County Sheriff Benny Napoleon and his family during this time highlighting his association with the DPD family since joining the police department and matriculation through the Department's organization. **Commissioner Burch** asked if the Board could send a card from the Board.

Oral Communications/Public Comments - 6 Speakers.

Recess to Closed Session 5:27 p.m.

Chairperson Bell called for adjournment. The motion carried.

Chairperson Bell adjourned the meeting at 5:59 p.m.