Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners Date of Meeting: Thursday, August 6, 2020 – 3:00 PM Location: Zoom Virtual Meeting Platform

BOPC Chairperson Willie Bell called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (August 6, 2020)

Detroit Board of Police Commissioners' Membership / Attendance		
	Attend	Not-Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt, Vice-Chairperson	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Absent	
Lisa Carter	Excused	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Evette Griffie	Yes	
Jesus Hernandez	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Martin Jones	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	9	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for Thursday, August 6, 2020.

Chairperson Bell called the meeting to order and invited Chaplain Shari Lowman to provide the invocation.

INVOCATION: Chaplain Shari Lowman

I. MOTION: To approve the Agenda.

Motion: Commissioner Burch Second: Commissioner Holley Discussion: None.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Davis, Commissioner Griffie, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones

No: None.

VOTE: Yes = 9 No = 0 **Motion: PASSED**

II. MOTION: To approve the July 30, 2020, Meeting Minutes with necessary corrections.

Motion: Vice-Chairperson Holt Second: Commissioner Griffie Discussion: None.

Yes: Chairperson Bell, Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Davis, Commissioner Griffie, Commissioner Hernandez, Commissioner Holley, and Commissioner Jones

No: None.

VOTE: Yes = 9 No = 0 **Motion: PASSED**

The Board considered the following Business Items:

- Introduction of BOPC Staff
- Introduction of Chief of Police and DPD Staff
- Introduction of Elected Officials, VIPs, civic leaders or their representatives

Chairperson's Report: Chairperson Bell provided opening remarks acknowledging former Commissioner Brooks' service to the Board and the Community and discussing various updates regarding civilian oversight of law enforcement, NACOLE initiatives and training, and proposed national reform efforts. Vice-Chairperson Holt and Commissioner Holley also shared remarks regarding important DPD updates and invitations, news, and information for the Board and the community's awareness.

Resolution: Commissioner Davis read the resolution honoring Retiring Corporal Thomas J. Anton.

RESOLUTION HONORING RETIRING

CORPORAL THOMAS J. ANTON

WHEREAS Thomas J. Anton was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on December 14, 1998. Upon graduating

from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Police Officer Anton began his career at the Housing Support

Division; and

WHEREAS He dutifully served the Housing Support Division, Eighth Precinct Patrol Operation Section, Northwestern

District, and the Sixth Precinct. Officer Anton displayed tremendous diligence and aptitude in his assignments. On October 18, 2018, he was promoted to the rank of Corporal and continued to serve at the Sixth Precinct until

his retirement; and

WHEREAS During his law enforcement career, Corporal Anton was the deserving recipient of a Chief Merit Award, Ford

Fireworks Award, Consent Judgment Award, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, commendations from supervisors, and

numerous letters of appreciation from citizenry; and

WHEREAS Corporal Anton has tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for 21 plus years. His professionalism, commitment to public service, integrity, and dedication

have been a credit to the Detroit Police Department. He is highly respected as a consummate professional.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED

That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, awards this resolution in recognition of Corporal Anton's 21 plus years of dedicated and diligent public service. His professionalism, integrity, and lifelong commitment to the city of Detroit and its citizens merit our highest regards.

We thank and congratulate you, Corporal Thomas J. Anton.

Commissioner Davis moved to adopt the resolution of Retiring Corporal Thomas J. Anton. Vice-Chairperson Holt seconded. Discussion. None.

III. VOTE: Yes = 9 No = 0 Motion: PASSED

Chief of Police Report: Chief of Police's Summary of CompStat Data and other Crime Information/DPD Information:

Assistant Chief David Levalley representing Chief of Police James E. Craig reported on the following items: Officers Injured in the Line of Duty; Comp Stat Crime and Statistical Data for the reporting period; COVID-19 impacts, and recent critical incidents impacting the Detroit Police Department and the community. See attached Meeting Transcripts for more information.

Comp Stat Data Provided: (See Full Report in Packet) as of August 6, 2020							
Part I Violent Crimes:	Criminal Homicides:	Sexual Assaults:	Aggravated Assaults	Non-Fatal Shootings:	Robbery:	Carjacking:	Total:
Totals:	+24%	-33%	+15%	+48%	-14%	-7%	7% Increase in Part I Violent Crimes
Property I Crimes:	Burglaries:	Larcenies	Motor Vehicle Thefts				
Totals:	-30%	-21%	-10%				-21% Decrease in Part Property Crime

Assistant Chief Levalley reported the following: *Protest Updates*: (62) Days of Protesting; the Department has spent 26K officer hours working protests; (30) Department members were injured; (7) Department vehicles were damaged, (434) arrests were made during protests, which occurred early on, no action has been taken recently. Regarding **Summer School Protests**, the Department engaged in 300 officer hours, no members were injured, no vehicles damaged, and (37) arrests were made. During the protests, Department members maintain a wide perimeter, protect protestors against vehicle assaults without direct engagement, keep uniformed officers out of site, deploy videographers and activate Body-Worn Cameras. Additionally, the Department has submitted warrant requests on (9) individuals for felonies. (3) approved. 6 pending further review. *Complaints Updates from Protests*. 28 separate complaints for (24) different incidents; (11) were initiated by the Department; (7) of the incidents involve complainants who have not cooperated; (5) of incidents involve unknown complainants; and (1) officer has been criminally charged. Types of Misconduct Involved in Complaints. (5) of the incidents involve the use of chemical spray; (6) incidents involve the take-down of a suspect; (2) incidents involve less than lethal use of force; (4) use of force involving hard hands; (7) other allegations involve: detainment, damaged property, and missing property. Officer-Involved Shootings Evaluation. Assistant Chief Levalley reported that after officer-involved incidents, the Department conducts a 72 hour review and receives a presentation by the Force Investigation and Homicide Shooting Team to review tactics, video available, and identify information available from the shooting scene. Upon conducting the review and initial assessment of the recent police-involved shooting incidents, the Department has determined that they appear to be within policy; however, full investigations are still taking place. Additionally, the DPD and Michigan State Police (MSP) Joint Task Force generally submits the entire package to the Wayne County Prosecutor's Office (WCPO) for review and final determination on the officers' conduct. Regarding the recent news article highlighting the lawsuit filed against two officers and the exoneration of two wrongfully incarcerated men, Assistant Chief Levalley reported that Officer Michael Mosley was charged in federal court and is no longer with the Department. Regarding the second case, initiated by the WCPO Conviction Integrity Unit, is still being investigated by the Department's Internal Affairs' Unit. Assistant Chief Levalley explained the Department's after-action measures taken involving any officer involved in a police shooting incident, emphasizing that the officers are placed off work to meet with Department psychiatrists and a review and determination is made regarding whether officer misconduct was involved.

Commissioner Burch asked about the illegal vehicle incident that occurred at Cass Tech High School and tactics the Department is using to eliminating the drag racing / drifting activities on the streets. Commissioner Brown inquired about Officer Geelhood's employment status with the Department, requested an investigation into this matter, and inquired about the rationale of his name not being included on the Brady / Giglio List given the recent lawsuit and exoneration of two men. Commissioner Davis inquired about the drag racing locations and the Department's enforcement efforts regarding the illegal drag racing activity and fireworks activity. Commissioner Holley asked for assistance regarding neighborhood parties that have been occurring on the parking lot of the Historic Little Rock Baptist Church based on the violations of various City Ordinances and quality of life issues. Vice-Chairperson Holt asked for further clarification regarding students who were arrested during school protests at the bus terminal. She also discussed the activities involving drag racing and the Department's continuing efforts. Commissioner Burch inquired about Department's actions against members who fail to take appropriate police action when observing criminal behavior. Commissioner Jones discussed whether the Department had experienced additional protests at other officer-involved shooting incidents in addition to the incident that occurred at San Juan and W. McNichols.

PRESENTATION(S) TO THE BOARD: A. Captain Aric Tosqui, Crime Intelligence Unit, and Executive Manager Andrew Rutebuka,
Crime Intelligence Unit:
Project Greenlight Detroit Program (PGLD) and Facial Recognition Technology (FRT)
Programs PowerPoint Presentations Available Online

A. PROJECT GREENLIGHT DETROIT PROGRAM: Captain Aric Tosqui and Executive Manager Andrew Rutebuka presented on the Project Greenlight Detroit and Facial Recognition Technology Program Use, providing responses to the Board based on previous questions submitted. Captain Tosqui reported on the following: current number of partnering businesses with the PGLD; the number of special patrol visits performed (per day and the percentages since 2017); categorization of all PGDL calls for service and locations, with limited exceptions; training required for Police Dispatchers, cost-saving options; analyzation of calls for service, emphasizing the purpose for PGL; and examples cited regarding previous data involving carjacking incidents and data reduction based on the use of PGL. Captain Tosqui also cited statistics regarding PGLD cases with video evidence emphasizing that cases with PGLD are closed faster (average 7 days) and have a 6% chance of getting into a warrant status and being closed.

Commissioner Davis inquired about whether the case closure rate had decreased as a result of the number of PGLD technology. Commissioner Burch inquired about the Department's Neighborhood Patrol Officers' (NPO) responsiveness

and resource availability to the PGLD incident locations based on the volume of requests for service. **Commissioner Jones** discussed the efforts by his organization Detroit 300 Action Team regarding a past violent crime that had occurred and the benefits of the PGLD Program to identify and arrest violent criminal offenders in that case and others. **Commissioner Davis** inquired about the PGLD average start-up costs, the monthly fees for the installation of PGLD, and associated insurance costs.

FACIAL RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY (FRT) PROGRAM: Captain Tosqui provided an overview of the Department's Facial Recognition Technology Program, emphasizing the following: the Department's Facial Recognition Review, the process for obtaining an investigative lead, training requirements for Certified Trained Analysts use of the FRT System; the Department and the Board's development of the Facial Recognition Policy and requirements to the Board; discussion of the Department's Use of the Standalone Software, (DataWorks Plus); discussion of responses to the Board's questions including but not limited to describing incidents connected to Facial Recognition by MDOC Connection Category (Parole or Probation) and citing cases where Facial Recognition Technology assisted in the apprehension of violent criminal offenders.

Commissioner Holley inquired about the DataWorks Plus contract expiration date concerning the Facial Recognition Technology Program. Captain Tosqui clarified the Department owns the software and the contract is for maintenance, (i.e. Dataworks updating the algorithm), clarifying that the maintenance contract is set for renewal. Commissioner Burch asked about the Department's Facial Recognition Technology activities involving individuals wearing masks and the disparate impacts associated with use of the technology. Captain Tosqui stated that the image will not be eligible for FRT because more facial features are needed. Additionally, Captain Tosqui noted the following considerations based on the policy creation and implementation: violent crime classification; use of results only being used as an investigative lead; multi-layer peer and supervisory review of results before final approval; use of the FRT for expediency of mugshots based on the Department's review of the mugshots' database only. Commissioner Davis inquired about the Department's review of cases that involved previous warrant submissions that utilized FRT prior to the FRT policy. Commissioner Brown discussed challenges associated with the use of the FRT on communities of color leading to wrongful arrests and incarceration. Commissioner Brown asked about any significant differences the Department has incorporated that will result in improved use of the technology. Captain Tosqui noted distinctions the Department is currently utilizing based on the following: peer-to-peer review, supervisory review, prohibition against live FRT use, and the emphasis that the match be used only as an investigative lead. Commissioner Hernandez echoed comments regarding continuously improving the usage of the technology and also encouraged the Department to benchmark with other agencies to improve the algorithm with the vendor. Commissioner Hernandez also inquired about the Department's efforts toward community engagement including but not limited to the Department of Neighborhoods. Commissioner Hernandez commended the Department on the Presentations.

Report from Interim Board Secretary/Communications Submitted to BOPC as incoming information: Ms. White reported on the following items:

- 1. Letter dated August 3, 2020 from The Coalition for Police Transparency and Accountability
- 2. Letter dated August 3, 2020 from a Citizen concerning Illegal Car Racing
- 3. Facial Recognition Technology Support Material and Project Green Light Support Material
- 4. Project Greenlight Report dated August 1, 2020
- 5. V&F Collision 19-915 Referral
- 6. Detroit Police Reserves 2020 Manual Presentation
- Letters from the Community expressing issues, concerns and commendations regarding the Chief of Police and the Department.
- 8. July 2020 Disciplinary Case Depositions
- 9. Transmittal of DPD Written Directive 304.6 Body Worn Cameras and DPD Written Directive 403.9 Department COVID-19 Response
- 10. NACOLE Conference Weekly Summaries

Unfinished Business.

New Business.

IV. MOTION: To End the Use of Facial Recognition Technology for the remainder of the year.

Motion: Commissioner Brown Second: Commissioner Davis Discussion: Chairperson Bell ruled the motion out

of order.

Announcements: Chairperson Bell announced the following:

A. Next Meeting: Thursday, August 13, 2020, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting

B. Next Community Meeting: Thursday, August 20, 2020, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting

Oral Communications/Public Comments.

Adjournment:

Chairperson Bell recognized Commissioner Burch. Commissioner Burch moved for adjournment.

Motion: Commissioner Burch Second: Commissioner Holley Discussion. None.

VOTE: Yes = 9 No = 0 Motion: PASSED

Chairperson Bell adjourned the meeting at 5:12 p.m.