Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners Date of Meeting: Thursday, May 7, 2020 – 3:00 PM Location: Zoom Virtual Meeting Platform

BOPC Chairperson Lisa Carter called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (May 7, 2020)

| Detroit Board of Police Commissioners' Membership / Attendance | | |
|--|---------|------------|
| | Attend | Not-Attend |
| Lisa Carter, Chairperson | Yes | |
| Annie Mae Holt, Vice-Chairperson | Yes | |
| Willie E. Bell | Yes | |
| Elizabeth Brooks | Yes | |
| Darryl D. Brown | Yes | |
| Shirley A. Burch | Yes | |
| Willie E. Burton | Yes | |
| William M. Davis | Yes | |
| Evette Griffie | Excused | |
| Jim Holley | Yes | |
| | | |
| | | |
| Quorum (Yes) | 9 | |
| | | |

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for Thursday, May 7, 2020.

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes: Thursday, April 30, 2020

Chairperson Carter stated, "Good afternoon. I am Police Commissioner Lisa Carter, Chairperson of the Board, and I represent District #6. I will be conducting this afternoon's virtual meeting. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance and viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for joining our meeting.

Commissioner Griffie has asked to be excused from this afternoon's meeting. Today, we have invited Chaplain Candace Morgan to provide the invocation.

INVOCATION: Chaplain Candace Morgan

The Board considered the following Business Items:

- Approval of the Agenda
- Approval of Minutes for April 30, 2020
- Introduction of BOPC Staff
- Introduction of Chief of Police and DPD Staff
- Introduction of Elected Officials, VIPs, civic leaders or their representatives

Again, thank you for joining us this afternoon for our Virtual Board Meeting. Given the critical impact of the Coronavirus, the Board will continue to utilize this virtual platform for our weekly business meetings until further notice. Please note a few housekeeping rules before we move on. We have distributed instructions on how to access the Virtual Meeting and how to participate during the Public Comments' section on the agenda. Upon joining the meeting, please note that you will join the meeting muted. Please do not start your video unless invited to do so by the host. Video or images deemed inappropriate by the Chair will result in your dismissal from the meeting. To make a public comment, please complete the Smartsheet form referenced on the Board's Agenda. Or you may raise your hand by clicking on Participants in the attendee controls at the bottom of your computer screen (you will then see "Raise Hand" at the bottom of the participants' list). Or you may dial *9 if you are participating by mobile device. You may use any one of these options by 4:00 p.m. to be acknowledged for public comment. Finally, if you are experiencing technical difficulties, please dial any of the call-in numbers listed on the agenda to attend the meeting. Again, we thank you in advance for your patience. As a reminder, Commissioners, please acknowledge the Chair and wait until acknowledgement if you would like to make a comment.

A few announcements: May is Mental Health Awareness Month where we emphasize the importance of Mental Health Awareness. According to Mental Health America, '44 million US adults experience a mental illness. And 18% of US Adults are living with mental illness. Additionally, nearly 1 in 5 American Adults will incur a diagnosable mental health condition in any given year.' Also, according to Mental Health America, '46 percent of Americans will meet the criteria for a diagnosable mental health condition sometime in their life, and half of those people will develop conditions by the age of 14.'

While these statistics are concerning and show us that we have more work to do, there are resources available. I would like to highlight a few of them: Mental Health America which is a community-based nonprofit organization dedicated to educating and providing mental health services. Northeast Integrated Health (formerly Northeast Guidance Center) and CAPPA – Community and Police Partnership Advocacy, is an organization dedicated to partnering mental health organizations with community providers to deliver mental health services that ensure health, safety, and overall mental wellness. These organizations also offer special resources during COVID-19. Please check your local listings for more information and resources. We will continue to highlight this important topic as we encourage you to stay educated on this matter. We also urge you to continue monitoring you and your family's overall mental well-being as well as physical health. Under this coronavirus pandemic, our mental and physical well-being are equally important.

Regarding the recent protest in Lansing last week, I would like to highlight the Board's support for Governor Gretchen Whitmer's ban against assault rifles, confederate flags, and all other violent, racially discriminatory symbolism and acts. This is especially in light of the recent protest against the Governor's Stay At Home Orders that occurred in Lansing last week. The Board supports peaceful protest and assembly as well as safety measures and precautions that save lives. At the appropriate time, I will ask for a resolution in this regard. Lastly, in recognition of Public Service Recognition Week, the Board would like to highlight and acknowledge all first responders: law enforcement personnel (sworn and civilian), all front line workers and professionals including but not limited to hospital, transportation, water, grocery, sanitation, and all essential workers. We thank you for your dedication and commitment toward helping to save lives. The Board continues to send its support and prayers to the Department, Detroit, and abroad as we all continue adhering to public health mandates and safety precautions. Please stay safe and stay healthy."

Chairperson's Report: Chairperson Lisa Carter stated, "As we do every week, on behalf of the Board, I want to express the Board's concern and support for fallen and injured officers and their families. Officers' safety and citizens' protection are ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers and I ask that the Deputy Chief Marlon Wilson provide us with any updates during his report. The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas holiday periods. Typically, we meet at Police Headquarters every Thursday at 3:00 p.m. except every 2nd Thursday of the month when we meet in the community at 6:30 p.m. However, as indicated before, we will hold virtual meetings every Thursday at 3:00 p.m. until further notice. Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our Board investigates non-criminal citizens' complaints, monitors Department operations, works with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to establish police policies, rules, and regulations, and acts as the final authority on all disciplinary matters. As an oversight agency, the Board has the broad responsibility to protect the citizens and create policies to enforce strict adherence to Department policies. Additionally, the Board works to eliminate police misconduct, discriminatory police practices, and unnecessary use of force by police. The Board believes in transparency, community input, and accountability, and as a civilian oversight agency, we must protect the rights of citizens and victims. Our objective is to ensure the safety and protection for everyone. Commissioners, there are several important items for your consideration and information in your board packet emailed to you on Tuesday of this week and in your packet today. Resolutions: Today, we have (2) resolutions - First, Police Officer Edward Lamb (Retired) and a resolution supporting Governor Gretchen Whitmer's ban against assault rifles and racist and violent acts. At the appropriate, I will ask for the presentation of resolutions.

Chief's Report, From the Chief's Office, I am requesting updates on city-wide crime statistics and any other critical issues or incidents facing the Police Department. I am also requesting updates on the following: Critical incidents impacting the Department amid COVID-19 and in general; Updates regarding the Department's COVID-19 Rapid Testing and Quarantine information; Update regarding off-duty Detroit Police Officer arrested for alleged drunk driving, crashing into building; Update on internal investigation of Major Violator's Unit; Updates on Department Hazard Pay for all members; Arrest and Citation Data in light of COVID-19; Update regarding SPO recently injured in vehicular accident a few weeks ago; General update on the Department's Use of Surveillance RTCC Technology and Facial Recognition Technology amid COVID-19; General update regarding City Council's approval of the Department's Tow Budget and the Department's commitment to handle 25% or less of all Police Authorized Tows and any other important critical items relating to the Department and the community. Presentations: Today, we will have one presentation – Officer – Involved Shootings where the Board will receive updates from Force Investigations and the Homicide Task Force. Interim Secretary to the Board's Report: Our Interim Board Secretary, Ms. White will also provide us with various updates regarding incoming correspondence.

Lastly, I want to announce a few reminders: Again, if you would like to make a public comment, please complete the Smartsheet form referenced on the Board's Agenda. Or you may raise your hand by clicking on Participants in the attendee controls at the bottom of your computer screen (you will then see "Raise Hand" at the bottom of the participants' list). Or you may dial *9 if you are participating by mobile device. You may utilize any of these options by 4:00 p.m. to be acknowledged for public comment. Please also note video or images deemed inappropriate by the Chair will result in your dismissal of the meeting. During the public comments' section of the agenda, each speaker will have two (2) minutes to speak. Mr. Brown will acknowledge each speaker. We ask that you remain respectful and professional. Please also note the Board continues to accept citizen's feedback by telephone, email, fax, and mailing and will respond accordingly. The telephone numbers to the Board's Office is (313) 596-1830 and the Office of the Chief Investigator is (313) 596-2499 should you like to file a citizen's complaint regarding alleged police misconduct.

At this time, please silence your cell phones, other electronic devices and other background sounds to prevent interrupting the meeting. Finally, in the spirit of effective communication, please treat each other respectfully and professionally. Commissioners, please be reminded not to speak until you are recognized by the Chairperson and address your comments to issues that are relevant to the agenda. My objective is to run an orderly meeting and conclude within a reasonable time. Thank you."

Resolution: Commissioner Bell read the Resolution honoring Retired Corporal Edward Lamb.

RESOLUTION HONORING RETIRED CORPORAL EDWARD E. LAMB

| WHEREAS | Edward Lamb was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on February 7, 2000. Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Police Officer Lamb began his career at the Ninth Precinct; and |
|---------|--|
| WHEREAS | He dutifully served the Ninth Precinct and Eastern District, then the Ninth Precinct again before serving in Gaming. Police Officer Lamb displayed tremendous diligence and aptitude in his assignments. On October 18, 2018, he was promoted to the rank of Corporal and continued to serve at Gaming until his retirement; and |
| WHEREAS | During his law enforcement career, Corporal Lamb was the deserving recipient of a Chief Merit Award, Perfect Attendance Award, Perfect Driving Award, Consent Judgment Award, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, and the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award. He also received commendations from supervisors and numerous letters of appreciation from the citizenry; and |
| WHEREAS | Corporal Lamb has tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for more than 21 years. His professionalism, commitment to public service, integrity, and dedication have been a credit to the Detroit Police Department. He is highly respected as a consummate professional. |

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED

That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, awards this resolution in recognition of Corporal Lamb's 21-plus years of dedicated and diligent public service. His professionalism, integrity, and lifelong commitment to the City of Detroit and its citizens merit our highest regards.

We thank and congratulate you, Corporal Edward E. Lamb.

Commissioner Bell moved to adopt the resolution of Retired Corporal Edward Lamb. Commissioner Davis seconded. Discussion.

| Motion: Commissioner Bell S | econd: Commissioner Davis | Discussion. |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------|-------------|
|-----------------------------|---------------------------|-------------|

 VOTE:
 Yes = 9
 No = 0
 Motion: APPROVED

Chief of Police Report: Chief of Police's Summary of CompStat Data and other Crime Information/DPD Information: Deputy Chief Marlon Wilson representing Chief of Police James E. Craig:

Deputy Chief Marlon Wilson reported on the following items: CompStat Crime and Statistical Data for the reporting period ending May 5, 2020; Officers Critically Injured in the Line of Duty; Department Efforts to combat the spread of COVID-19; and recent critical incidents impacting the Detroit Police Department and the community.

| CompStat Data Provided: (See Full Report in Packet) as of May 5, 2020 | | | | | | | |
|---|------------------------|---------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|----------------|-------------|---|
| Part I Violent Crimes: | Criminal Homicides: | Sexual Assaults: | Aggravated Assaults: | Non-Fatal Shootings: | Robbery: | Carjacking: | Total: |
| Totals: | 50% Increase | 25% Decrease | 3% Increase | 37% Increase | 1% Increase | 8% Increase | 1% Increase in Part I Violent Crimes |
| Property Crimes | Burglary | Larceny | Auto-Theft | | | | Total: |
| Totals: | 20% Decrease | 12% Decrease | 5% Increase | | | | 10% Decrease |

Coronavirus Impacts (COVID-19) on the DPD Personnel and the Return of Members to Patrol Operations:

- (5) members currently hospitalized as a result of COVID-19
- SPO Connor Donahue recovering at a local hospital; however, SPO is showing improvement in his condition.
- (70) members currently quarantined; (57) sworn; (13) civilian
- The Department has returned 1,061 members to full duty status
- Hazard Pay is effective April 13, 2020, members will receive an additional \$5 per hour; first payment begins in July of this year.

Deputy Chief Wilson also reported on the following: Arrest Data; Tickets Issued: Officers have issued 2,170 citations since March 23, 2020; and Facial Recognition and Surveillance Use: The Department continues to utilize Facial Recognition and Surveillance Technology towards its crime-solving efforts. Currently, there is no Parks' Detail; however, the detail will resume in June, and there is a current local mandate that local precincts and divisions maintain observation. **Director Chris Graveline, Professional Standards Bureau,** reported on updates relating to the Major Violator's Internal Investigation stating the unit had developed a number of investigative leads and will resume interviews next week in continued partnership with federal law enforcement partners. Director Graveline also reported on the incident involving an officer operating while intoxicated whose car collided with a building in the Eighth Precinct. Pending blood draw results, the officer has been placed on Administrative Duty No Gun Status and is currently serving a suspension for a previous disciplinary case, which will begin on May 13, 2020. **Captain Michael Parish, Management Services Section**, reported that the Mayor, Board, and Chief of Police originally issued a joint directive establishing DPD Towing Operations. To that end, the Department has been working with the DPD Towers Association to ensure fair and equitable while preserving rights to tow in the City of Detroit. Recently, City Council approved the Department's budget including the towing aspects after receiving binding commitments, specifically that DPD would only tow approximately 25% of police authorized towing, and billing payment commitments to work in partnership with towers.

Chairperson Carter recognized Commissioner Bell. **Commissioner Bell** commended the Department on their efforts to handle the tow issue and their discussions with City Council. **Commissioner Burch** asked for up-to-date contact information for Animal Control. **Commissioner Burch** also commended Police Officers Lee Brown, Eric Hill, and Neighborhood Police Officer (NPO) Dan Robinson regarding their police activities in the Eleventh Precinct. **Commissioner Burch** shared her experience regarding the COVID-19 Rapid Testing, the professional efforts to administer the testing procedure, and distribution of the "Love Where You Live" signs. **Commissioner Brown** commended Commander Darrell Patterson and Commander Arnold Williams. **Commissioner Brown** expressed concern regarding persons who refuse to obey officer's orders to stop during traffic stop investigation; and electronic ticket devices. **Commissioner Brown** also discussed the Department's strategy to assign veteran officers with new officers to ensure training is properly implemented within all operational activities. **Commissioner Davis** asked whether the Department is contacted when the state closes Belle Isle and whether they are enforcing the permit policies. **Commissioner Burton** asked about the Department's Police Forfeiture activities, the number of vehicles confiscated during the pandemic, and the Department's use of Facial Recognition or Surveillance equipment to enforce Governor Whitmer's Stay At Home Orders.

PRESENTATIONS TO THE BOARD: (A) Officer-Involved Shootings: Captain Lena Liddell, Internal Controls, and Lieutenant Kenneth Gardner, Homicide Task Force (Power Point Presentation available online)

A. Officer-Involved Shootings' Presentation: Lieutenant Kenneth Gardner and Captain Lena Liddell explained Officer-Involved Shootings, the organizational structure and responsibilities of the Homicide Task Force, Team Specializations, Rapid Deployment of specialized units, Information Collection, Force Investigation Statistics, and Detroit Police Officers Law Enforcement Officers Killed and Assaulted.

Chairperson Carter recognized Commissioner Burch. **Commissioner Davis** inquired about investigative efforts regarding officerinvolved shootings. **Commissioner Burton** asked whether the Department currently uses Stingray Technology. **Commissioner Bell** asked the Department to discuss its policies and procedures regarding conducting custodial interrogation or questioning a member involved in an officer-involved shooting and after-action measures to conduct a full and comprehensive investigation. **Commissioner Bell** also asked for a discussion regarding the Michigan State Police's activities when working in cooperation with the Department on Homicide Task Force. **Commissioner Brown** thanked Lieutenant Gardner and his team for providing a report on the Officer-Involved Shooting Presentation. **Commissioner Burch** asked about the Michigan State Police's (MSP) authority to patrol within the City of Detroit's boundaries. **Commissioner Bell** emphasized the MSP's authority to conduct traffic enforcement within all boundaries of the State of Michigan. **Commissioner Brown** also noted the Wayne County Sheriff's Department authority within Wayne County.

Report from Interim Board Secretary/Communications Submitted to BOPC as incoming information: Ms. White reported on the following items:

- 1. DPD Facial Recognition Report #26
- 2. Request for Change of Duty Status to Administrative Leave without pay but with medical benefits for Police Officer Latasha Williams, Badge 72, assigned to the Ninth Precinct
- 3. Letter from Chief of Police Craig Re: DPD Towing Operations dated 5-4-20
- 4. A20-05623 FOIA Board of Police Commissioners
- 5. City Council Closing Resolution
- 6. Correspondence relating to Officer-Involved Shooting Presentation, Department Directives, and Articles from the Washington Post and The Guardian Publications

Unfinished Business: Chairperson Carter recognized Vice Chairperson Holt.

Motion I:

Vice-Chairperson Holt moved to approve Interim Secretary to the Board and Interim Chief Investigator to receive a (5%) pay cut or the equivalent use of (18) Vacation Days as outlined in Category C of the Mayor's Proposed Budget Plan effective May 18, 2020.

Motion IA:

Commissioner Brown moved to amend the previous motion requiring the 5% pay cut for Interim Secretary to the Board and the Interim Chief Investigator and exclude the option of the equivalent use of (18) Vacation Days. **None** seconded. Discussion. **Motion Failed.**

| Motion: Commissioner Brown | Second: None | Discussion. | Motion: FAILED |
|----------------------------|--------------|-------------|----------------|
|----------------------------|--------------|-------------|----------------|

Motion II:

Vice-Chairperson Holt moved that the Board require Interim Secretary to the Board and Interim Chief Investigator to receive a (5%) pay cut or the equivalent use of (18) Vacation Days as outlined in Category C of the Mayor's Proposed Budget Plan effective May 18, 2020. Discussion. Motion Failed.

Motion: Vice Chairperson Holt Second: Commissioner Burton Discussion.

| VOTE: | Yes = 3 | No = 5 | Motion: | FAII FD |
|-------|---------|--------|---------|---------|
| | 163 - 5 | NU - J | WOUVII. | |

Yes: Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Brown, and Commissioner Burton

Nay: Commissioner Bell, Commissioner Brooks, Commissioner Burch, Commissioner Davis and Commissioner Holley.

Motion III:

Commissioner Brown moved to table the motion for Interim Secretary to the Board and Interim Chief Investigator to receive a (5%) pay cut or the equivalent use of (18) Vacation Days as outlined in Category C. **Commissioner Davis** seconded. Discussion. **Motion Approved.**

Motion: Commissioner Brown Second: Commissioner Davis Discussion.

 VOTE:
 Yes = 6
 No = 2
 Motion: APPROVED

Yes: Vice-Chairperson Holt, Commissioner Bell, Commissioner Brooks, Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Davis, and Commissioner Holley

Nay: Commissioner Burch and Commissioner Burton

Commissioner Brown requested the Board hold a special session to discuss Board Staff Budgetary matters. **Commissioner Bell** commended Board Staff during this pandemic crisis and also agreed that additional research was needed regarding the budgetary concerns.

New Business:

Chairperson Carter recognized Commissioner Burton. **Commissioner Burton** moved that the Board ban the Detroit Police Department from using Facial Recognition Technology for one year due to the pandemic crisis. None seconded. **Motion Failed**.

Motion: Commissioner Burton Second: None Motion: FAILED

Announcements: Chairperson Carter announced the following:

- A. Next Meeting: Thursday, May 14, 2020, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting
- B. Next Community Meeting: Thursday, June 11, 2020, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting

Oral Communications/Public Comments:

Minister Eric Blount discussed the recent incident that occurred in Georgia and inquired about the rules of citizen's arrest and arrests by former law enforcement officers given the recent incident. Minister Blount also sought to receive an update on Corporal Dewayne Jones, and the investigation on the false affidavits. Lastly, Minister Blount urged the improvement of the Facial Recognition Reports. Deputy Chief Grant Ha indicated that a citizen may arrest only if a felony has been committed in their presence, and noted that a retired police officer has no more rights than a regular citizen. Vice-Chairperson Holt confirmed she had discussed the Facial Recognition Report with Mr. Blount and she, Interim Board Secretary White and Captain Tosqui would address his concerns. Ms. Ashley Smith requested information on the whereabouts of the resolution and she also inquired of the conclusion of the Arbitration Award versus the City Charter provisions regarding Corporal Dewayne Jones. Ms. Sharon Parnell expressed concerns about the 2nd Precinct current COVID-19 status of assigned members. Commissioner Brown discussed the Board would obtain a legal opinion about the issues with the Arbitrator's ruling oppose to the authority of the Board of Police Commissioners from Corporation Counsel. Attorney Wyrick stated Corporation Counsel Opinion states due to the Board of Police Commissioners not being a party to the collective bargaining agreement, the Board of Police Commissioners does not have the standing to make the appeal. The City of Detroit would have to appeal and they are not appealing the promotion. Mr. Scotty Boman urged the Board of Police Commissioners to appeal the promotion of Corporal Dewayne Jones, the Charter states the Board of Police Commissioners are the final authority. Mr. Boman called for the termination of employment for Corporal Dewayne Jones, and noted his disagreement with the Executive Order mandates.

Adjournment:

Chairperson Carter recognized Commissioner Bell. **Commissioner Bell** moved for adjournment. **Commissioner Brown** seconded. Discussion. **Results:** Motion Approved.

 VOTE:
 Yes = 9
 No = 0
 Motion: APPROVED

Chairperson Carter adjourned the meeting at 4:39 pm.