

# City of Detroit

## CITY COUNCIL

### LEGISLATIVE POLICY DIVISION


208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center  
Detroit, Michigan 48226

Phone: (313) 224-4946 Fax: (313) 224-4336

David Whitaker, Esq.  
Director  
Irvin Corley, Jr.  
Executive Policy Manager  
Marcell R. Todd, Jr.  
Senior City Planner

LaKisha Barclift, Esq.  
M. Rory Bolger, PhD, AICP  
Timothy Boscarino, AICP  
Elizabeth Cabot, Esq.  
Janese Chapman  
Tasha Cowen  
Richard Drumb  
George Etheridge

Deborah Goldstein  
Christopher Gulock  
Derrick Headd  
Marcel Hurt, Esq.  
Kimani Jeffrey  
Anne Marie Langan  
Jamie Murphy  
Analine Powers, PhD  
Sabrina Shockley  
Thomas Stephens, Esq.  
David Teeter  
Theresa Thomas  
Kathryn Lynch Underwood

TO: Charity Dean, Director   
Civil Rights, Inclusion and Opportunity

FROM: David Whitaker, Director  
Legislative Policy Division Staff

DATE: March 12, 2020

RE: 2020-2021 Budget Analysis

Attached is our budget analysis regarding your department's budget for the 2020-2021 Fiscal Year.

Please be prepared to respond to the issues/questions raised in our analysis during your scheduled hearing on **Wednesday, March 25, 2020 at 2:30 p.m.** We would then appreciate a written response to the issues/questions at your earliest convenience subsequent to your budget hearing. Please forward a copy of your responses to the Council members and the City Clerk's Office.

Please contact us if you have any questions regarding our budget analysis.

Thank you for your cooperation in this matter.

DW:dh:ss

Attachments:  
Issues and Questions  
Human Rights Budget Pages

CC: Councilmembers  
Auditor General's Office  
David Massaron, Chief Financial Officer  
Tanya Stoudemire, Budget Director  
Stephanie Grimes Washington Mayor's Office

## Civil Rights, Inclusion and Opportunity (29)

### FY 2020-2021 Budget Analysis by the Legislative Policy Division

The **Civil Rights, Inclusion and Opportunity (CRIO) Department**, formerly known as the Human Rights Department, was created by the 1974 City Charter to replace the Commission on Community Relations, and is the oldest municipal civil rights agency in the country.

The mission of CRIO is to provide excellent service to all who live, work, play or do business in Detroit, advocating for inclusion and increased opportunities resulting in a positive impact in our City.

There are four teams within the CRIO Department, each performing tasks essential for ensuring Detroit remains an equitable and inclusive City:

- The Incentives Team
- The Construction Outreach Team
- The Detroit Business Opportunity Program
- The Civil Rights Team<sup>1</sup>

**Department of Civil Rights, Inclusion and Opportunity (CRIO) Budget Summary**

	FY 2019 Actual		FY 2020 Adopted Budget		FY 2021 Mayor Recommended	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	397,850	7,315,686	402,000	1,402,000	402,000	2,402,000
Total Expenditures	6,689,199	12,641,549	1,269,711	2,347,711	1,566,934	3,566,934
Net Tax Cost	6,291,349	5,325,863	867,711	945,711	1,164,934	1,164,934

	FY 2022 Forecast		FY 2023 Forecast		FY 2024 Forecast	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	402,000	2,402,000	402,000	2,402,000	402,000	2,402,000
Total Expenditures	945,105	2,945,105	934,493	2,934,493	946,566	2,946,566
Net Tax Cost	543,105	543,105	532,493	532,493	544,566	544,566

Positions (by FTE):	1/1/2020 Actual	FY 2020 Adopted	FY 2021 Mayor Recommended	FY 2022 Forecast	FY 2023 Forecast	FY 2024 Forecast
General Fund	9	5	5	5	5	5
Non-General Fund	7	7	6	6	6	6
<b>Total Positions</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>

**Recommended General Fund Changes in CRIO for FY 21**

Appropriation	FY 20	FY 21	Increase (Decrease)	% Change
	General Fund	General Fund	General Fund	General Fund
Total Revenue	\$402,000	\$402,000	\$0	0.00%
Total Expenditure	\$1,269,711	\$1,566,934	\$297,223	23.41%
Net Tax Cost	\$867,711	\$1,164,934	\$297,223	34.25%

Regarding the General Fund only, the Mayor has recommended a total General Fund expenditure increase for CRIO in the amount of \$297,223 (23.41%), with total General Fund Revenue remaining unchanged.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Sourced from CRIO's website: <https://detroitmi.gov/departments/civil-rights-inclusion-opportunity-department>

**Recommended All Funds Changes in CRIO for FY 21**

<b>Appropriation</b>	<b>FY 20</b>	<b>FY 21</b>	<b>Increase (Decrease)</b>	<b>% Change</b>
<b>All Funds</b>	<b>All Funds</b>	<b>All Funds</b>	<b>All Funds</b>	<b>All Funds</b>
<b>Total Revenue</b>	\$1,402,000	\$2,402,000	\$1,000,000	71.33%
<b>Total Expenditure</b>	\$2,347,711	\$3,566,934	\$1,219,223	51.93%
<b>Net Tax Cost</b>	\$945,711	\$1,164,934	\$219,223	23.18%

Regarding All Funds, the Mayor has recommended an overall revenue increase for CRIO in the amount of \$1,000,000 (71.33%) and a total expenditure increase of \$1,219,223 (51.93%). These changes reflected an overall Net Tax Cost increase of \$219,223 (23.18%).

**Issues and Questions**

As illustrated in the chart above, in FY 21 the budget for the Department of Civil Rights, Inclusion and Opportunity, total revenue increases significantly overall, increasing by \$1,000,000 (71.33%). The increase is due to a significant increase in **revenue appropriation 3217 Non-Compliance Fees** (Page B-29-8), with an increase of \$1,000,000 (100%).<sup>3</sup>

The Mayor has also recommended an overall FTE decrease of 1 (-0.83%) position.<sup>4</sup> As of January 1, 2020. However, the department has 16 actual employees, as of January 1, 2020, which exceeds the department's current budgeted allocation of 12 FTE's by 4 FTE's.

1) CRIO revenues for **FY 21** are anticipated to increase significantly by **\$1,000,000 (71.33%)** due to a corresponding \$1 million decrease in **3217 Non-Compliance Fees** (Page B-29-8). What is the rationale for this aggressive revenue projection for CRIO?

2) To what amount has CRIO has captured in non-compliance fees to-date?

3) How much in non-compliance fees has CRIO transferred to the Workforce Development Fund?

4) The Mayor has proposed the elimination of the Deputy Director's position for CRIO in FY21. However, the department already has an excess of four FTE's, based on the January 1, 2020 count. Will these four FTE's have their status changed to contractual employees, will they be transferred or otherwise remain employed in the department as FTE's?

5) CRIO is tasked to monitor the employment performance of developers who receive tax abatements and other various development incentives from the City, does CRIO have sufficient staff in place to monitor development projects? How many are responsible for this assignment?

Offering employee benefits is a long standing method used by employers to attract and retain hardworking and talented staff. Does CRIO offer its employees benefits? If not, why?

<sup>2</sup> The NTC has a higher percentage increase than the expenditure increase, due to total revenues not increasing.

<sup>3</sup> Projected revenue in this *revenue* appropriation increases from \$1,000,000 in FY 20 to \$2,000,000 in FY 21.

<sup>4</sup> The reduction includes the elimination of one non-general fund position.

5) Ideally, what level of staffing would the department require to adequately perform its increasing responsibilities?

6) Please briefly describe the department's new expense initiatives, new capital funding requests, operational reform and savings proposals, and new revenue initiatives/proposals to be implemented in FY 2020. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiative/request/proposal are impacting FY 2021.

## CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION AND OPPORTUNITY (29)

### *AGENCY PLAN: MISSION, DESCRIPTION, AND GOALS SUMMARY*

#### **MISSION:**

The mission of the Civil Rights, Inclusion & Opportunity Department (“Civil Rights or CRIO”) is to remove discriminatory barriers through innovative and high quality customer-driven programs that foster economic opportunity and empowerment, which will benefit Detroit residents, visitors and the entrepreneurial sector of the local economy. CRIO is tasked with investigating complaints of discrimination for the protected class, sexual harassment and workplace violence. CRIO is also responsible for maintaining the Limited English Proficiency (LEP) Plan and enforcing the American Disabilities Act. Furthermore, the department is responsible for the certification of Detroit-Headquartered, Detroit-Based, and Small Businesses; Certifications for Women; and Minority and Start-Up businesses, as well as Section 3 Certification and monitoring.

Additional duties of the department include monitoring the inclusion of Detroit-Based Contractors and Detroit Residents on a multitude of development projects occurring throughout the City of Detroit.

#### **DESCRIPTION:**

- The Civil Rights, Inclusion and Opportunity Department, by City Charter, serves as an alternative dispute resolution agency. The department is responsible for addressing barriers and/or discrimination issues that adversely affect the well-being and image of the city of Detroit, its residents, visitors and employees.
- Enhance existing processes and procedures to remedy and prevent discriminatory treatment in education, employment, medical facilities, housing, public accommodations, public service and commercial space.
- Responsively receive and mediate complaints alleging unlawful discrimination.

#### **AGENCY GOALS:**

- Recognize the need for basic civil rights protection for all Detroit residents, employees and visitors. Ensure that all citizens and those desiring to live and/or work in Detroit are afforded an opportunity to grow and participate in Detroit’s economic, educational and social processes.
- Ensure equal opportunity and fair treatment of all citizens and take positive action to address discriminatory practices.
- Certify Detroit-Headquartered, Detroit-Based, Small, Women and Minority Owned Businesses.
- Produce a monthly City of Detroit Certified Business Registry to be used as a procurement reference for city departments, businesses, public and non-profit organizations.
- Monitor vendor workforces’ for companies seeking contract awards or tax abatement relief to ensure equitable representation of minorities and females consistent with local, state and federal equal employment opportunity policies.
- Monitor economic development and diversity goals between the City and private developers and those developers that receive tax abatements to ensure inclusion.
- Secure the rights of citizens to obtain service from City government without discrimination.
- Increase mutual understanding among the residents of the community; promote good will; and work cooperatively with other agencies of government, community groups and organizations to eliminate discrimination and future problems.
- Establish and implement processes and programs to educate and promote equal opportunity and fair treatment of all citizens, visitors and employees. Enhance existing processes to remedy and prevent discriminatory treatment in education, employment, medical facilities, public accommodations, public service, and commercial space. Administer and maintain a zero tolerance policy for any form of violence in the workplace, against customers or visitors of the city of Detroit.

Department Name: Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity  
 Department #: 29

**Budget Summary:**

	FY 2019 Actual		FY 2020 Adopted Budget		FY 2021 Mayor Recommended	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	397,850	7,315,686	402,000	1,402,000	402,000	2,402,000
Total Expenditures	6,689,199	12,641,549	1,269,711	2,347,711	1,566,934	3,566,934
Net Tax Cost	6,291,349	5,325,863	867,711	945,711	1,164,934	1,164,934

	FY 2022 Forecast		FY 2023 Forecast		FY 2024 Forecast	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	402,000	2,402,000	402,000	2,402,000	402,000	2,402,000
Total Expenditures	945,105	2,945,105	934,493	2,934,493	946,566	2,946,566
Net Tax Cost	543,105	543,105	532,493	532,493	544,566	544,566

Positions (by FTE):	1/1/2020 Actual	FY 2020 Adopted	FY 2021 Mayor Recommended	FY 2022 Forecast	FY 2023 Forecast	FY 2024 Forecast
	General Fund	9	5	5	5	5
Non-General Fund	7	7	6	6	6	6
Total Positions	16	12	11	11	11	11

CITY OF DETROIT  
 BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
 EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS  
 DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
<b>29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, &amp; Opportunity</b>	<b>2,347,711</b>	<b>3,566,934</b>	<b>2,945,105</b>	<b>2,934,493</b>	<b>2,946,566</b>
Salaries & Wages	788,520	975,431	985,907	996,592	1,007,491
Employee Benefits	159,547	211,543	212,672	213,823	214,997
Professional & Contractual Services	603,391	723,434	90,000	90,000	90,000
Operating Supplies	33,000	40,000	40,000	40,000	40,000
Operating Services	84,709	101,713	101,713	101,713	101,713
Equipment Acquisition	78,000	-	-	-	-
Other Expenses	600,544	1,514,813	1,514,813	1,492,365	1,492,365
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>2,347,711</b>	<b>3,566,934</b>	<b>2,945,105</b>	<b>2,934,493</b>	<b>2,946,566</b>

**CITY OF DETROIT**  
**BUDGET DEVELOPMENT**  
**REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS**  
**DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY**

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
<b>29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, &amp; Opportunity</b>	<b>1,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>
Sales & Charges for Services	1,402,000	2,402,000	2,402,000	2,402,000	2,402,000
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>1,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>



**CITY OF DETROIT**  
**BUDGET DEVELOPMENT**  
**EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL**  
**DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY**

Department # - Department Name	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
Fund # - Fund Name					
Summary Category					
<b>29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, &amp; Opportunity</b>	<b>2,347,711</b>	<b>3,566,934</b>	<b>2,945,105</b>	<b>2,934,493</b>	<b>2,946,566</b>
<b>1000 - General Fund</b>	<b>1,269,711</b>	<b>1,566,934</b>	<b>945,105</b>	<b>934,493</b>	<b>946,566</b>
Salaries & Wages	403,520	523,796	534,272	544,957	555,856
Employee Benefits	130,091	176,995	178,124	179,275	180,449
Professional & Contractual Services	603,391	723,434	90,000	90,000	90,000
Operating Supplies	33,000	20,000	20,000	20,000	20,000
Operating Services	84,709	100,261	100,261	100,261	100,261
Other Expenses	15,000	22,448	22,448	-	-
<b>3217 - Non-Compliance Fees</b>	<b>1,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>
Salaries & Wages	385,000	451,635	451,635	451,635	451,635
Employee Benefits	29,456	34,548	34,548	34,548	34,548
Operating Supplies	-	20,000	20,000	20,000	20,000
Operating Services	-	1,452	1,452	1,452	1,452
Other Expenses	585,544	1,492,365	1,492,365	1,492,365	1,492,365
<b>4533 - City of Detroit Capital Projects</b>	<b>78,000</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>
Equipment Acquisition	78,000	-	-	-	-
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>2,347,711</b>	<b>3,566,934</b>	<b>2,945,105</b>	<b>2,934,493</b>	<b>2,946,566</b>

**CITY OF DETROIT**  
**BUDGET DEVELOPMENT**  
**REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL**  
**DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY**

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
<b>29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, &amp; Opportunity</b>	<b>1,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>
1000 - General Fund	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000
Sales & Charges for Services	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000
<b>3217 - Non-Compliance Fees</b>	<b>1,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>
Sales & Charges for Services	1,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>1,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>

CITY OF DETROIT  
 BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
 FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - EXPENDITURES  
 DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
<b>29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, &amp; Opportunity</b>	<b>2,347,711</b>	<b>3,566,934</b>	<b>2,945,105</b>	<b>2,934,493</b>	<b>2,946,566</b>
1000 - General Fund	1,269,711	1,566,934	945,105	934,493	946,566
00250 - CRIO Department Administration	1,269,711	1,566,934	945,105	934,493	946,566
290010 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	1,269,711	1,566,934	945,105	934,493	946,566
<b>3217 - Non-Compliance Fees</b>	<b>1,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>
20388 - Non Compliance Fees	1,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000
290030 - Compliance Fees	1,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000
<b>4533 - City of Detroit Capital Projects</b>	<b>78,000</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>
20507 - CoD Capital Projects 2019	78,000	-	-	-	-
290010 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	78,000	-	-	-	-
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>2,347,711</b>	<b>3,566,934</b>	<b>2,945,105</b>	<b>2,934,493</b>	<b>2,946,566</b>

CITY OF DETROIT  
 BUDGET DEVELOPMENT  
 FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - REVENUES  
 DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY

Department # - Department Name	FY2020	FY2021	FY2022	FY2023	FY2024
Fund # - Fund Name	Adopted	Mayor	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name					
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name					
<b>29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, &amp; Opportunity</b>	<b>1,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>
1000 - General Fund	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000
00250 - CRIO Department Administration	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000
290010 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000	402,000
<b>3217 - Non-Compliance Fees</b>	<b>1,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>
20388 - Non Compliance Fees	1,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000
290030 - Compliance Fees	1,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>1,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>	<b>2,402,000</b>

**CITY OF DETROIT**  
**BUDGET DEVELOPMENT**  
**POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER**  
**DEPARTMENT 29 - CIVIL RIGHTS, INCLUSION, & OPPORTUNITY**

Department # - Department Name	FY2020	FY2021	FY2022	FY2023	FY2024
Fund # - Fund Name	Adopted	Mayor	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	by FTE	by FTE	by FTE	by FTE	by FTE
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name					
Job Code - Job Title					
<b>29 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, &amp; Opportunity</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>
1000 - General Fund	5	5	5	5	5
00250 - CRIO Department Administration	5	5	5	5	5
290010 - Civil Rights, Inclusion, & Opportunity	5	5	5	5	5
010180 - Director of Human Rights Department	1	1	1	1	1
010182 - Deputy Director of Human Rights Department	1	0	0	0	0
010826 - Manager II - Human Rights	1	1	1	1	1
012061 - Administrative Assistant - Grade II	1	1	1	1	1
222040 - Data Analyst	0	1	1	1	1
413050 - Human Rights Specialist	1	0	0	0	0
919911 - Associate Director of Strategic Affairs	0	1	1	1	1
<b>3217 - Non-Compliance Fees</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>
20388 - Non Compliance Fees	7	6	6	6	6
<b>290030 - Compliance Fees</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>
929101 - Administrative Special Services Staff I	4	3	3	3	3
929102 - Administrative Special Services Staff II	3	3	3	3	3
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>11</b>