## 09/05/2019

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	DETROIT BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS
9	
10	WEEKLY MEETING
11	
12	THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 5, 2019 3 P.M.
13	
14	DETROIT PUBLIC SAFETY HEADQUARTERS
15	
16	1301 THIRD STREET
17	
18	DETROIT, MICHIGAN 48226
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	



1	BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS:
2	
3	GREGORY HICKS, Secretary to the Board
4	LISA CARTER, (District 6), Chairperson
5	ANNIE HOLT, Commissioner at Large
6	ELIZABETH BROOKS, Commissioner at Large
7	JIM HOLLY, Commissioner at large
8	DARRYL D. BROWN, Commissioner (District 1)
9	EVETTE GRIFFE, Commissioner (District 2)
10	SHIRLEY A. BURCH, Commissioner (District 3)
11	WILLIE E. BELL, Commissioner (District 4)
12	WILLIE E. BURTON, Commissioner (District 5)
13	WILLIAM M. DAVIS, Commissioner (District 7)
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	APPEARING FOR THE OFFICE OF CHIEF OF POLICE:
19	
20	CHIEF OF POLICE JAMES E. CRAIG
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	



- 1 Detroit, Michigan
- 2 Thursday, September 5, 2019
- 3 At approx. 3:01 PM.
- 4 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Welcome to the
- 5 weekly Board of Police Commissioners meeting. My
- 6 name is Liza Carter and I represent District 6
- 7 and I will be conducting our meeting today.
- 8 On behalf of the Board, for those of
- 9 you in attendance thank you for joining us. For
- the people viewing this meeting on our government
- 11 cable channel thank you for viewing our meeting.
- 12 Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche has
- requested to be excused from today's meeting.
- 14 Today we have invited Chaplain Mark Clark ro
- 15 provide the invocation.
- 16 Chaplain Clark, thank you.
- 17 (INVOCATION WAS GIVEN).
- 18 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Thank you,
- 19 Chaplain Clark. At this time we will have
- 20 commissioners introduce themselves beginning with
- 21 to my far right with Commissioner Holt.
- 22 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Good afternoon,
- 23 Commissioner Annie Holt, at large.
- 24 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Good afternoon,
- Commissioner William Davis, District 7.



- 1 COMMISSIONER BURCH: Good afternoon,
- 2 Shirley Burch, District 3.
- 3 COMMISSIONER BROOKS: Good afternoon,
- 4 Elizabeth Brooks, at large.
- 5 COMMISSIONER BELL: Willie Bell,
- 6 District 4.
- 7 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: Jim Holley, at
- 8 large.
- 9 SECRETARY HICKS: Madam Chair, you have
- 10 a quorum.
- 11 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Thank you. At
- 12 this time, Commissioners, you have before you the
- 13 agenda for today. Is there a motion to approve?
- 14 COMMISSIONER BURCH: So moved.
- 15 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Support.
- 16 COMMISSIONER CARTER: It's been moved
- 17 and supported that we approve the agenda for
- 18 today, September 5, 2019. Is there any
- 19 discussion? Those in favor?
- 20 COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
- 21 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Those opposed?
- 22 Motion carries. At this time, Commissioners, you
- 23 have before you the minutes from August 29, 2019.
- 24 Is there a motion for approval?
- 25 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: So moved.



- 1 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Support.
- 2 COMMISSIONER CARTER: It's been moved
- 3 and supported that we approve the minutes from
- 4 August 29, 2019. Is there any discussion?
- 5 Those in favor?
- 6 COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
- 7 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Those opposed?
- 8 Motion carries. At this time, Mr. Hicks, would
- 9 you please introduce the BOPC staff.
- 10 SECRETARY HICKS: Thank you, Madam
- 11 Chair. Just prior to making those introductions
- 12 I want to indicate for the record that Sgt. Quinn
- 13 is taping the meeting today. Media Services is
- 14 providing the audio-visual work and Dale Rose is
- 15 the court reporter today.
- And I have immediately sitting next to
- 17 me attorney for the Board Mr. Wyrick and so if we
- 18 can just work our way down and members of the
- 19 BOPC staff can introduce yourselves and then
- 20 we'll conclude with the introduction from Chief
- 21 Investigator Dr. Polly McAllister who will in
- 22 turn also introduce staff of the Office of the
- 23 Chief Investigator.
- 24 MR. ROBERT BROWN: Robert Brown, Board
- 25 staff.



- 1 MR. WYRICK: Jermaine Wyrick, Board
- 2 attorney.
- 3 CHIEF INV. DR. McALLISTER: Good
- 4 afternoon, Board. I'm Dr. Polly McAllister and
- 5 attending today's meeting with me today is
- 6 Supervising Investigator Akbar, Senior
- 7 Investigator Magegal, Investigator Nichols,
- 8 Investigator Stewart and Investigator Callaway.
- 9 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Thank you. At
- 10 this time, good afternoon, Chief Craig.
- 11 CHIEF CRAIG: Good afternoon, Madam
- 12 Chair and Board.
- 13 COMMISSIONER CARTER: If you would like
- 14 to introduce any staff you have with you.
- 15 CHIEF CRAIG: Yes, I'll start with 1st
- 16 Asst. Chief Stair and go around the room.
- 17 (DPD STAFF INTRODUCES THEMSELVES).
- 18 CHIEF CRAIG: What a team that is,
- 19 right?
- 20 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Thank you, Chief.
- 21 (APPLAUSE).
- 22 COMMISSIONER CARTER: At this time I'd
- 23 like to acknowledge Commissioner Brown who's
- 24 joined us this afternoon.
- 25 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Good afternoon,



- 1 Madam Chair.
- 2 COMMISSIONER CARTER: At this time is
- 3 there are any elected officials, VIPs, civil
- 4 leaders or their representatives, please stand
- 5 and give your name for the record, please.
- 6 (PEOPLE INTRODUCE THEMSELVES).
- 7 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Thank you. At
- 8 this time we'll move on with the agenda to the
- 9 Chair's report. On behalf of the Board I want to
- 10 express our concern and support for fallen and
- 11 injured officers. Our concerns for officer
- 12 safety and citizen protection is ranked as two of
- 13 the most important priorities of the Board.
- Our Board receives a weekly report from
- 15 the department listing injured officers. I would
- 16 ask that the Chief of Police during your remarks
- 17 please provide us with any additional information
- 18 related to injured and fallen officers.
- 19 The Board of Police Commissioners meets
- 20 every week except for Thanksgiving and Christmas
- 21 holiday periods. We meet at the police
- 22 headquarters three weeks in the month on
- 23 Thursdays at 3 PM. We also meet in the community
- 24 every second Thursday of the month at 6:30 PM.
- 25 Under the Detroit City Charter, Article



- 1 7, Chapter 8 the Board of Police Commissioners is
- 2 empowered to provide civilian oversight and
- 3 supervisory control of the police department.
- 4 Our Board investigates non-criminal citizen
- 5 complaints, monitors the department for
- 6 compliance with all laws and reviews and modifies
- 7 police policy to eliminate misconduct,
- 8 discriminatory police practices and unnecessary
- 9 use of force by police.
- 10 As a civilian oversight agency we
- 11 protect the civil rights of citizens. Our
- 12 objective is to increase the quality of life for
- 13 residents and visitors to Detroit.
- I want to point to several important
- 15 items for your consideration and information.
- 16 The NACOLE conference is fastly approaching. I
- 17 remind the Board that we are continuing to work
- 18 with they NACOLE, the National Association for
- 19 Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement to host the
- 20 national conference on September 22 through 26,
- 21 2019 in Detroit.
- 22 During the same time Detroit will be
- 23 celebrating our 45th year as a civilian oversight
- 24 organization. The BOPC has secured an exciting
- 25 keynote speaker for our 45th anniversary dinner,



- 1 Christie E. Lopez.
- 2 The 45th anniversary dinner is Tuesday,
- 3 September 24, 2019 at 5 PM, from 5 to 7 PM at the
- 4 Marriott Hotel. Christie E. Lopez is a former
- 5 member of the U.S. Department of Justice in the
- 6 Special Litigation Section as well as a visiting
- 7 professor at Georgetown Law School.
- 8 Professor Lopez's work has centered on
- 9 criminal justice reform and constitutional
- 10 policing. Professor Lopez led the DOJ in
- 11 conducting pattern or practice investigation of
- 12 local police departments and negotiated
- 13 settlement agreements in Ferguson, Chicago, New
- 14 Orleans, Los Angeles Sheriff's Department,
- 15 Newark, New Jersey and several other important
- 16 oversight initiatives across the country.
- 17 Again, the planning process is well
- 18 underway and we invite your participation. We
- 19 also invite you to volunteer to help with the
- 20 conference and dinner. Volunteer forms are
- 21 located on the back table.
- Two weeks ago the Chief of Police
- 23 transmitted to the Board three recommendations
- 24 for appointment to the command ranks of the
- 25 department.



- 1 The positions are for Deputy Chief,
- 2 Commander and Captain. Each Board members was
- 3 transmitted copies of the appointment packages on
- 4 Monday, August 26, 2019.
- 5 Our staff has completed a review of
- 6 these recommendations. At the end of my report I
- 7 will ask Commissioner Bell to move for the
- 8 recommendations for Deputy Chief, Commander and
- 9 Captain.
- 10 Several weeks ago I outlined a process
- 11 for amendments to our bylaws. In discussion with
- 12 various Board members there are several items
- 13 that must be corrected to provide for an
- 14 efficient operation of our Board and office.
- 15 First, we must bring our organizational
- 16 chart to compliance with our existing bylaws.
- 17 The bylaws, Section 10 reads that the Secretary
- 18 of the Board has the authority and the
- 19 responsibility for supervising all employees with
- 20 the exception of Director of Personnel.
- 21 Our organizational chart suggests
- 22 otherwise. We must bring the organizational
- 23 chart in line with our bylaws.
- Second, we continue to have questions
- 25 about our subcommittee structure. On a Board



- 1 with 11 members it is necessary to create
- 2 specialization between Board members to carry out
- 3 our broad function. I will soon be announcing
- 4 subcommittee assignments and I encourage each
- 5 Board member to participate in the work of the
- 6 Board.
- 7 Our subcommittees are advisory to the
- 8 full Board. While the Open Meetings Act and
- 9 Roberts Rules do not require for our
- 10 subcommittees to have open meetings, we need to
- 11 have an internal discussion on the methods that
- 12 we will use to deepen our understanding on
- 13 specialized issues and topics.
- 14 At the point that we will be reviewing
- our bylaws I will be open to any recommendations
- 16 and discussions on our subcommittee structure.
- 17 Third, we continue to struggle around
- 18 the conduct of individual Board members at our
- 19 meetings. In the past we asked former Supreme
- 20 Court Justice Conrad Mallett, Jr to strengthen
- 21 language in our bylaws to provide for a remedy so
- 22 that we can continue to conduct orderly meetings.
- Our meetings are for the Board and for
- 24 the business associated with police policy and
- 25 practice. We ask the public to attend and follow



- 1 the work of the Board. We also ask for public
- 2 input. Our agendas have specific structure to
- 3 them. There are appropriate times on the agenda
- 4 for individual Commissioners to voice their views
- 5 and for the public's comment on the work of the
- 6 Board.
- 7 At the end of the day the Board works
- 8 by majority vote. It is not necessary to
- 9 continue to bring measures to the floor knowing
- 10 that a specific action lacks sufficient support
- 11 of the majority.
- I will also emphasize the discussions
- of the Board come through the Chair. If you are
- 14 not recognized by the Chair you do not have the
- 15 floor and therefore the privilege to speak.
- I ask in the interest of order at your
- 17 meetings for your cooperation -- cooperation from
- 18 the Board and the audience.
- 19 A good review of our bylaws would
- 20 afford another opportunity to strengthen our
- 21 language on several areas that will help us work
- 22 together as a Board.
- 23 If there are any Commissioners who
- 24 would like to submit bylaw changes, I will be
- 25 accepting them up until the end of September. In



09/05/2019 Page 13

1 the meantime I point to the attorney to the Board

- 2 who advises the Board to continue his role as
- 3 parliamentarian. I will be going to him as
- 4 needed for clarification of various rules and
- 5 procedures.
- 6 Yesterday the Chief of Police
- 7 transmitted to the Board a request for change of
- 8 duty status/suspension without pay for Sgt.
- 9 Racian Martin, Badge No. S-157 assigned to
- 10 Commercial Auto Theft. We are in the process of
- 11 contacting the union and arranging for a closed
- 12 session on this matter.
- I hope to bring this to the Board
- 14 within the next few weeks and appropriate
- 15 notification will occur before the closed
- 16 session.
- 17 Today we have two retirement
- 18 resolutions from outstanding members of law
- 19 enforcement, Comm. Charles Mahone and Cpl. Denise
- 20 Walker. Both are 30+ year veterans of the
- 21 department and the resolutions I will ask two of
- 22 our Commissioners to read the resolutions into
- 23 the record and we will seek approval of the
- 24 resolutions.
- We also have two presentations for the



- 1 Board. The first will be from Mr. Melanie White,
- 2 Executive Manager for Policy. Ms. White will
- 3 provide the Board with a summary of
- 4 recommendations on Proposed Directive 307.5,
- 5 facial recognition.
- 6 Ms. White's work is based on a
- 7 comprehensive review of the best practices on the
- 8 subject of facial recognition. The Board will
- 9 take these recommendations under advisement. As
- 10 Chair, I have authorized Ms. White to transmit
- 11 these recommendations to the department for their
- 12 review and information.
- 13 After we have received additional input
- 14 from the Board and reactions from the department
- 15 we will schedule the item for a vote. Please
- 16 note we are not voting on facial recognition
- 17 today. We are receiving recommendations only.
- 18 The second presentation is on mental
- 19 health. The focus of the presentation is on DPD
- 20 training and implementation of ental health
- 21 techniques and methods.
- 22 Capt. Sonya Russell leads the training
- 23 academy and will be making the presentation.
- 24 Under the Chief's report I am
- 25 requesting an update on our crime statistics and



- 1 any critical information or issues facing the
- 2 department.
- 3 At the end of the meeting we will have
- 4 public comments from the audience. Please make
- 5 sure you print your name on the speaker cards.
- 6 Cards are located in the back on the table or can
- 7 be obtained by seeing Mr. Brown, Mr. Robert Brown
- 8 who's seated up here in the front.
- 9 He will need your card before the end
- 10 of the Chief of Police report. We will hold each
- 11 speaker to the allotted 2 minutes and I ask
- 12 everyone to place their cell phones and other
- 13 electronic devices on vibrate to make sure that
- 14 you are not interrupting the meeting.
- 15 I also want to apologize to you all in
- 16 advance. I have to leave at 4:30 today and in
- 17 the absence of the Vice-Chair Eva Dewaelsche I
- 18 will be asking the immediate past Chair
- 19 Commissioner Bell to close the meeting.
- 20 And at this time I'm going to go to
- 21 Commissioner Bell for the motion.
- 22 COMMISSIONER BELL: I move to support
- 23 the Chief of Police request to appoint Comm.
- 24 Elaine R. Bryant to the rank of Deputy Chief.
- 25 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Support.



- 1 COMMISSIONER DAVIS: Point of
- 2 information. Is that individual here today?
- 3 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Is there any
- 4 discussion? It's been moved and supported that
- 5 we support the Chief's request to appoint Comm.
- 6 Elaine R. Bryant to the rank of Deputy Chief.
- 7 Is there any discussion? Those in
- 8 favor?
- 9 COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
- 10 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Those opposed?
- 11 Motion carries.
- 12 (APPLAUSE.)
- 13 COMMISSIONER BELL: Madam Chair, I move
- 14 to support the Chief of Police request to appoint
- 15 Capt. Michael L. McGinnis, II to the rank of
- 16 Commander.
- 17 COMMISSIONERS: Support.
- 18 COMMISSIONER CARTER: It's been moved
- 19 and supported that we support the -- we approve
- 20 the Chief's request to appoint Capt. Michael L.
- 21 McGinnis, II to the rank of Commander. Is there
- 22 any discussion? Those in favor?
- 23 COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
- 24 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Those opposed?
- 25 The motion carries.



- 1 (APPLAUSE.)
- 2 COMMISSIONER BELL: Madam Chair, I move
- 3 to support the Chief of Police's request to
- 4 appoint Lt. Brian D. Harris to the rank of
- 5 Captain.
- 6 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Support.
- 7 COMMISSIONER CARTER: It's been moved
- 8 and supported that we approve the request to
- 9 appoint Lt. Brian D. Harris to the rank of
- 10 Captain. Is there any discussion?
- 11 Those in favor?
- 12 COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
- 13 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Those opposed?
- 14 The motion carries.
- 15 (APPLAUSE.)
- 16 COMMISSIONER CARTER: I'm going to
- 17 first recognize Commissioner Willie Burton. I'm
- 18 not sure when you came in, but thank you for
- 19 joining us, sir.
- 20 And then ask that if you want to speak
- 21 Deputy Chief Elaine Bryant, Comm. Michael
- 22 McGinnis, II and Capt. Brian Harris, please step
- 23 to the microphone and also before you get started
- 24 I'm recognizing Commissioner Griffie who just
- 25 walked in.



- 1 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: Thank you.
- DEPUTY CHIEF BRYANT: Good afternoon,
- 3 honorable Board. Good afternoon, Chief, 1st AC.
- 4 I just want to say thank you and I appreciate
- 5 this appointment and I'm going to everything to
- 6 make sure that I do the best job that I can for
- 7 the citizens, for the police officers and for the
- 8 community.
- 9 (APPLAUSE).
- 10 COMM. McGINNIS: Good afternoon,
- 11 Michael McGinnis and through the Chair I'd like
- 12 to thank the Chief of Police. I'm a product of
- 13 my leadership and I thank you very much.
- 14 To the Board I want to thank you for
- 15 your service and your sacrifice and dedication
- 16 and as well for approving this appointment.
- I take my job very seriously and I'm so
- 18 honored to be a Detroit police office; thank you.
- 19 (APPLAUSE.)
- 20 CAPT. HARRIS: Through the Chair to the
- 21 Board and thank you Chief Craig, 1st Asst. Chief
- 22 Stair. I'd like to thank you for the opportunity
- 23 to serve in this capacity to lead the members of
- 24 the department, to be a servant leader as well as
- 25 my commitment to the community at large, so thank



- 1 you very much for this privilege.
- 2 (APPLAUSE).
- 3 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Commissions,
- 4 anybody have any --
- 5 COMMISSIONER BELL: Madam Chair, I
- 6 wanted to say that the Deputy Chief and the
- 7 Commander, we have had some interaction and I
- 8 just say over a period of time I think both of
- 9 them are outstanding. I can't speak to
- 10 personally to the young Lieutenant who's now a
- 11 Captain, but I'm pretty sure I have a great deal
- of confidence in Chief Craig and his command
- 13 staff who's making that appointment and looking
- 14 at his resume he's outstanding and I think the
- 15 Board agreed by voting yeah.
- So I just want to say we're looking
- 17 forward to outstanding work in terms of your
- 18 newly appointed positions, continue to work 24
- 19 hours; thank you.
- 20 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Thank you and
- 21 congratulations to you all. At this time
- 22 Commissioners, we have a resolution honoring
- 23 Commander Charles Mahone. Is he here? I didn't
- 24 see him.
- 25 COMMISSIONER BELL: Madam Chair, I have



- 1 the resolution to honor Charles E. Mahone.
- 2 He was appointed to the department on
- 3 August 14, 1989. Upon graduating from the
- 4 academy he was assigned to the 10th Precinct and
- 5 WHEREAS, he displayed a tremendous
- 6 aptitude to his assignment and was promoted to
- 7 the rank of sergeant of May 21, 1999. Other
- 8 assignments include Special Crimes Section, 1st
- 9 Precinct, Gang Enforcement Crews.
- 10 He developed his supervisory skills and
- 11 was promoted to the rank of lieutenant on June
- 12 14, 2006. He served as executive lieutenant at
- 13 the 10th Precinct to October 7, 2013.
- On October 7, 2013 he was appointed to
- 15 the rank of Captain and assigned to the 5th
- 16 Precinct and later Organized Crime.
- I just want to say WHEREAS he had a
- 18 distinguished career with Commander Patrol, 7th
- 19 Precinct and he is now the 7th Precinct Commander
- 20 and he has received numerous awards but I'm
- 21 going to move on.
- He served this department for 30 years
- 23 and daily demonstrated his loyalty and dedication
- 24 to the citizens of Detroit. His professionalism,
- 25 expertise, leadership attests to the fact that he



- 1 represents the consummate professional.
- 2 NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the
- 3 Detroit Board of Police Commissioners speaking on
- 4 behalf of the citizens of the great city of
- 5 Detroit award this resolution recognition of
- 6 Comm. Charles E. Mahone for 30 years of dedicated
- 7 and diligent public service, integrity and
- 8 lifelong commitment to the city of Detroit and
- 9 citizens merit our highest regard.
- 10 We thank him and congratulate him,
- 11 Comm. Charles E. Mahone on his retirement.
- 12 (APPLAUSE.)
- 13 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Commissioner
- 14 Holt.
- 15 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Thank you, Chair
- 16 for this honor to share this resolution in
- 17 honoring retiring Cpl. Denise B. Walker.
- 18 WHEREAS Denise Walker was appointed to
- 19 the Detroit Police Department on April 6, 1987.
- 20 Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan
- 21 Police Academy Police Officer Walker began her
- 22 career at the Youth Section and
- 23 WHEREAS, she dutifully served the Youth
- 24 Section, 7th Precinct, Central District Gaming
- 25 Division, Risk Management Northeastern District,



- 1 Office of the Assistant Chief, Office of the
- 2 Chief of Police, Tactical Operations, 1st
- 3 Precinct, Downtown Services, Chief's Neighborhood
- 4 Liaison and Special Events Unit.
- 5 Police Officer Walker displayed
- 6 tremendous diligence and aptitude in her
- 7 assignments. She was promoted to the rank of
- 8 corporal on January 1, 2019 and continued to
- 9 serve in the Special Events Unit until her
- 10 retirement and
- 11 WHEREAS during her law enforcement
- 12 career Cpl. Walker provided security for several
- 13 United States dignitaries and foreign heads of
- 14 state. She was the deserving recipient of a
- 15 Chief's Unit Award, three Perfect Attendance
- 16 Awards, Chief's Citation, Consent Judgment Award
- 17 and the Major League Baseball All Star
- 18 Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral
- 19 recognition award, the Super Bowl XL Recognition
- 20 Award and numerous letters and appreciation from
- 21 citizenry and
- 22 WHEREAS Cpl. Walker has tirelessly
- 23 served the Detroit Police Department, the
- 24 citizens of Detroit and its neighboring
- 25 communities for 32 years, her professionalism,



- 1 commitment to public service, integrity and
- 2 dedication have been a credit to the Detroit
- 3 Police Department.
- 4 She is highly respected as a consummate
- 5 professional.
- 6 NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the
- 7 Detroit Board of Police Commissioners speaking
- 8 for the citizens of the Detroit and the Detroit
- 9 Police Department award this resolution in
- 10 recognition of Cpl. Denise Walker's 32 years of
- 11 dedicated and diligent public service.
- Her professionalism, integrity and
- 13 lifelong commitment to the city of Detroit and
- 14 its citizens merit our highest rewards.
- We thank and congratulate you, Cpl.
- 16 Denise B. Walker.
- 17 (APPLAUSE).
- 18 COMMISSIONER BELL: Madam Chair, I move
- 19 to receive these two awards for the Commander and
- 20 Cpl. Walker.
- 21 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Support.
- 22 COMMISSIONER CARTER: It's been moved
- 23 and supported that we adopt the resolutions
- 24 honoring Comm. Charles Mahone and Cpl. Denise
- 25 Walker. Is there any discussion?



- 1 Those in favor?
- 2 COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
- 3 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Those opposed?
- 4 Motion carries. Thank you all.
- 5 At this time, Chief Craig, your report.
- 6 CHIEF CRAIG: Thank you, Madam Chair
- 7 and, again, Board of Police Commissioners.
- 8 I'll start with crime. We're
- 9 continuing to move in the right direction. As of
- 10 today's date we're up 2 homicides. As you know
- 11 probably a couple of weeks ago we were up at high
- 12 as 12, so we're continuing to move in the right
- 13 direction.
- Our non-fatal shootings, we're up 11
- 15 whereas a couple of weeks ago, three weeks ago,
- 16 we were in the mid 20s.
- 17 Sexual assaults we'll up 3, so we're
- 18 making progress there. Aggravated assaults,
- we're down 176 and robberies we're down 45,
- 20 carjackings we're down 52.
- 21 Overall 2 percent reduction in violent
- 22 crime. As it relates to property crime we're
- 23 down 3 percent. So the task continues, the work
- 24 continues, but again as I often times say we're
- 25 not waving a flag of success; progress for sure.



- 1 We still feel there's too much
- 2 violence, especially when we talk about the
- 3 senseless outbreaks of violence that emanate from
- 4 a verbal argument, so we're going to continue to
- 5 push hard as we enter into the last quarter of
- 6 the year.
- 7 I want to also just thank the Board for
- 8 your support of three very talented individuals
- 9 that got promoted. All are very humble. They
- 10 certainly could have gotten up and talked about
- 11 their background, experience, what brought them
- 12 to this day, but I would tell you starting with
- 13 Deputy Chief Bryant, unreal.
- We're talking about Professional
- 15 Standards. She worked OCI. Every job she's
- 16 worked she has distinguished herself. It is no
- 17 secret in the police department probably one of
- 18 the most challenging positions is Professional
- 19 Standards.
- 20 She went in there and really did
- 21 phenomenal work. As you know, she's been there
- 22 through our most recent investigation involving a
- 23 narcotics officer, certainly working through the
- 24 6th Precinct which was one of our bigger
- 25 investigations, played a key role in that, so for



- 1 that, extremely proud.
- 2 Commander McGinnis as you know works
- 3 Homicide and that's a very challenging
- 4 assignment, so like Elaine, there's some big
- 5 shoes that will have to be filled.
- 6 Clearance rate, his commitment to
- 7 excellence. One of the things that he's drove
- 8 home that is certainly very important to me is
- 9 not only making sure that we're transparent in
- 10 getting information out on wanted suspects, but
- 11 also making sure that we touch the family members
- 12 of victims is very critical and he's done that
- 13 superbly.
- 14 And then certainly last but not least
- 15 Capt. Brian Harris, certainly a distinguished
- 16 professional, former military background.
- 17 Went into a very difficult assignment.
- 18 In fact, we all know that our Special Response
- 19 Team is one that responds to every critical
- 20 incident. I think I reported to this Board last
- 21 week that we have seen an increase in critical
- 22 incidents.
- You don't hear much about their work.
- 24 Many times they go into a situation where the
- 25 person is armed, the person is distressed, under



- 1 the influence, suffering from mental illness and
- 2 those matters are resolved without incident.
- 3 The time they take -- I can tell you
- 4 countless stories about the work of Special
- 5 Response Team, but it's the leadership that
- 6 really counts in making sure that we're
- 7 thoughtful, we're patient and we do whatever we
- 8 need to do to make sure that that incident is
- 9 brought to a safe conclusion.
- 10 So you're getting three of the
- 11 department's best moving forward, so I'm very
- 12 excited about each and every one of them, so
- 13 thank you for your service.
- And with that I'll take any questions
- 15 you might have.
- 16 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Thank you, Chief.
- 17 Questions for the Chief?
- 18 COMMISSIONER BROOKS: I don't have any
- 19 questions, I just have a very quick statement to
- 20 make. I felt very safe and secure at the Jazz
- 21 Festival this weekend. All the police out there
- 22 serving us, putting their life on the line made
- 23 me feel good, made me feel proud to be a Police
- 24 Commissioner and I just want to say thank you and
- 25 I said it to some of them out there.



- 1 To all the police officers that put
- 2 their live on line to save us; thank you.
- 3 CHIEF CRAIG: Through the Chair, I'd
- 4 like to just respond to the Commissioner's
- 5 comment. Those are the kinds of incidents and
- 6 when you think about the largest free jazz
- 7 festival in the country that goes on for I think
- 8 it's four days, incident free.
- 9 And I appreciate the acknowledgment.
- 10 Certain under Comm. Franklin, will you stand and
- 11 be acknowledged and certainly Deputy Chief
- 12 Bettison, will you stand also.
- These two, and I know there's the other
- 14 members of the command team that, you know, many
- 15 times we don't talk about it until bad happens in
- 16 the footprint and so I just want the community
- 17 and the Board to acknowledge these two for their
- 18 leadership.
- 19 (APPLAUSE.)
- 20 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: Madam
- 21 Chairperson, Chief, I've been absent for a couple
- 22 of days, but where are we with the officer --
- 23 with Jones? You promised to bring back a report a
- 24 few weeks ago. Where are we with that? Is it
- 25 possible you tell us something?



- 1 CHIEF CRAIG: Through the Chair, I did
- 2 have a briefing with several of your colleagues
- 3 on last week and a couple of the members of the
- 4 community. That matter is still pending given
- 5 the fact that the misdemeanor charge is being
- 6 appealed, so he is still in restricted duty
- 7 status.
- 8 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: Thank you.
- 9 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Any other
- 10 questions?
- 11 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Madam Chair.
- 12 Chief, I just wanted to follow-up and find out if
- 13 we -- in case I might have missed it -- with the
- 14 numbers on the abandoned houses that were being
- 15 boarded up by the NPOs that was headed up by
- 16 Capt. Hope. Do we have those numbers?
- 17 DEPUTY CHIEF BETTISON: Deputy Chief
- 18 Bettison for the record and it is 3,365, that's
- 19 where we are today.
- 20 CHIEF CRAIG: And through the Chair,
- 21 that should be in respect to the east side of
- 22 Detroit, so tremendous effort made by the NPOs.
- 23 We certainly are looking to scale back the NPO
- 24 involvement because with right now trying to
- 25 balance the impact unintended consequences of the



- 1 board-ups and what impact is that having in being
- 2 responsive to our community.
- 4 don't know if any community members have gotten
- 5 any concerns about availability and I don't know,
- 6 Deputy Chief, if you've heard -- you've gotten
- 7 some?
- 8 DEPUTY CHIEF BETTISON: Yes, sir.
- 9 CHIEF CRAIG: So we certainly don't
- 10 want to take them so far out of their primary
- 11 work that we're not being responsive to the
- 12 community and so one of the things that we have
- 13 done is to make sure that we listen to the
- 14 community on that issue.
- I don't know if the Board has gotten
- 16 any feedback on that as of yet. I have not heard
- 17 anything, but --
- 18 COMMISSIONER BURCH: Madam Chair.
- 19 Chief, I just wanted to share and to the audience
- 20 the service of the NPOs, our Commanders and I'm
- 21 speaking specifically of Comm. Slappy and Chief
- 22 Bettison.
- We called together a meeting of the
- 24 community leaders in District 3. We just had a
- 25 friendly chitchat about what we experience, how



- 1 we can help the police because they need help,
- 2 they can't do it by themselves.
- 3 So as community leaders we sat at
- 4 Butler Park just casual to share, Chief, their
- 5 concerns what we can do to help you with the
- 6 responses that when we don't receive, we don't
- 7 get angry, we just know there's a priority.
- 8 So, therefore, Chief -- and I think DC
- 9 Bettison for taking the time out to meet those
- 10 leaders so they would be able to speak back to
- 11 their constituents. That's what we need to do is
- 12 to share the good news because the police need
- 13 us, we need them.
- One other thing I wanted to say, Madam
- 15 Chair, and to the Chief. I wanted to say a lot
- of times maybe the word police, we need to
- 17 consider that word because sometimes it's a
- 18 frightening thing to say "here come the police."
- 19 Why not simply say they are law
- 20 enforcement officers, that's really what they
- 21 are. They enforce the law. We -- when we have
- 22 situations where someone doesn't stop, if a
- 23 police officer says "stop" you should stop. And
- 24 so, again, I think we've got to change that
- 25 culture of lawlessness that the police don't



- 1 deserve and we as citizens don't.
- 2 So I commend you and thank you, Chief,
- 3 for training your men to address --
- 4 CHIEF CRAIG: And women.
- 5 COMMISSIONER BURCH: And women -- don't
- 6 forget the lady as Comm. Slappy -- thank you,
- 7 Chief.
- 8 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: I apologize to
- 9 you, through the Chair. Chief, I apologize. I
- 10 found there was -- what do we do if -- Human
- 11 Resources, in terms of encouraging our police
- 12 officers to go to school. If you come in at 18
- 13 and 19 years old and you basically -- is there
- 14 anything that we do to try to encourage them to
- 15 get a agree rather than just rely on the career
- 16 without being challenged?
- 17 What do we do, can you help me with
- 18 that?
- 19 CHIEF CRAIG: Through the Chair, I will
- 20 tell you this department really does excell in
- 21 creating opportunities and growth and I'm going
- 22 to put 1st Asst. Chief on the spot for a moment
- 23 because what we're doing today is unlike what
- 24 we've done in years past.
- 25 She certainly is a product of it.



- 1 Would you mind just talking just a little bit
- 2 about the Wayne State program as an example, and
- 3 then as she's coming up to speak I'm going to
- 4 also remind you that in order to take the
- 5 supervisor exam, sergeant or lieutenant, you have
- 6 to have certain credit hours, so that in and of
- 7 itself is encouragement.
- 8 But I think what you'll hear from the
- 9 1st Asst. Chief will really impress you.
- 10 1st ASST. CHIEF STAIR: Good afternoon,
- 11 Board. Again, 1st Asst. Chief Stair. What the
- 12 Chief is referring to is one of the major
- 13 programs that we developed along with Wayne State
- 14 a few years ago.
- 15 In fact, tomorrow is the beginning of a
- 16 third cohort where it is a leadership academy
- 17 where members who go through it receive a
- 18 master's business certificate.
- 19 So obviously you have to have a
- 20 bachelor's degree in order to go through the
- 21 program, but that program, many of the members
- 22 who have participated and graduated have, one,
- 23 gone on to MBA, to get MBAs. AC Levalley sitting
- 24 next to me also went thought the program with me
- 25 initially together and I already had a master's



- 1 degree, but I always say all master degrees
- 2 aren't created equal, right, and so I took the
- 3 opportunity to go and get the certificate which
- 4 was actually fee for us.
- 5 Obviously we have to pay the high costs
- 6 associated with the tuition to get MBAs, but
- 7 several of us who were in our cohort is doing
- 8 that.
- 9 Then the Chief actually has the chief's
- 10 scholarship where two members of the department
- 11 each year is given an opportunity to receive a
- 12 free master's degree in criminal justice and
- 13 Chief Fitzgerald is actually in that program as
- 14 well.
- 15 So as the chief indicated, in order to
- 16 get promoted you need a certain amount of credits
- 17 and so everybody wants to get promoted. There's
- 18 a lot of movement in the department all the time,
- 19 so people are doing that.
- 20 And then the City provides tuition
- 21 reimbursement to help along with the tuition and
- 22 members of the department are paid additional
- 23 monies depending upon on their education.
- 24 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: May I respond?
- 25 COMMISSIONER CARTER: I just wanted to



- 1 say before you respond. Comm. Sloan also is in
- 2 that program, right?
- 3 1st ASST. CHIEF STAIR: Yes, she is.
- 4 She finished the program and she's an MBA
- 5 student.
- 6 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: And I appreciate
- 7 that. It's that -- and I don't know about Wayne
- 8 State and I know -- I'm a product of Wayne State,
- 9 but I'm also always looking out for Wayne County
- 10 Community College.
- We have about three or four of your
- 12 police officers that teach, but right now we have
- 13 less than 30 percent of the police officers
- 14 that's in classes, so I'm just -- I'm willing to
- 15 offer you 10 scholarships if you want -- if it
- 16 would help.
- 17 1st ASST. CHIEF STAIR: Absolutely,
- 18 sir.
- 19 (APPLAUSE.)
- 20 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: I'm saying to you
- 21 that out of 3,000 police officers we can talk
- 22 about spots here and there and I'm grateful and I
- 23 know that the Chief is -- he believes in
- 24 education because he's a product of that, but I
- 25 also know that the police officer is educated by



- 1 way of beyond high school, it all gives him a
- 2 clear view in how to quickly think.
- 3 And I think also in terms of promotions
- 4 as you've indicated, but I'm telling you that the
- 5 -- I like for you just to -- and I'm not trying
- 6 to be adversarial or being controversial.
- 7 I'm just saying to you out of 3,000 or
- 8 so police officers I'd like to know at sometime
- 9 before the end of the year where are we with that
- 10 and how can we help in terms of encouraging other
- 11 officers to really not to rely on the job, but
- 12 also rely that indeed -- if it was left up to me
- 13 after two or three H years you have to have
- 14 something, but it's not left up to me, but I'm
- 15 just saying to you I do feel like it is -- it's
- 16 -- well, the best I can say to you is is that its
- 17 low at Wayne County Community College. I don't
- 18 know what it is at Wayne State, but I do know --
- 19 and that we basically do everything we can to
- 20 make sure that criminal justice, law enforcement
- 21 are credits, so if there's something we can do to
- 22 help, I'm able to do that for you without expense
- 23 on their behalf, okay?
- 24 1st ASST. CHIEF STAIR: Thank you so
- 25 much for that offer. In fact, I'll give you a



- 1 call tomorrow so that we can -- thank you, sir.
- 2 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: All right.
- 3 COMMISSIONER BURCH: I want to just
- 4 piggyback on what the lady just said about
- 5 education. I still think, and I'm speaking
- 6 really to attorney Wyrick.
- Why is it that, again, can we make an
- 8 amendment somehow when someone graduates from our
- 9 academy it should be something, like I said, an
- 10 amendment that they have to remain in Detroit for
- 11 three or five years before they can move on to
- 12 another state.
- 13 And the reason I say that and I now you
- 14 all agree, we have the best trainers in the
- 15 world. People come here to get trained to be an
- 16 officer, so why do we allow them to leave us. At
- 17 least give us three years and who knows, they
- 18 might start living us and don't want to leave.
- 19 But that should believe an amendment to
- 20 whatever laws you all have out there, that's why
- 21 I'm speaking to Mr. Wyrick. Would you look into
- 22 that? Do you all agree? Well, move on.
- 23 COMMISSIONER CARTER: It's state law
- 24 that prohibits us from doing that.
- 25 COMMISSIONER BURCH: We can't do



- 1 anything?
- 2 COMMISSIONER BELL: No.
- 3 COMMISSIONER CARTER: It's been in
- 4 works for years, but nothing has become of it.
- 5 Attorney Wyrick, would you like to --
- 6 MR. WYRICK: You said it correctly.
- 7 There's a state law that currently prohibits,
- 8 although there are some ideas right now in the
- 9 legislature from what I understand that may even
- 10 change it in the way that you would like.
- 11 COMMISSIONER BURCH: It's worth looking
- 12 into, right?
- 13 MR. WYRICK: I believe there's a
- 14 legislation, but Representative Santana might
- 15 change that.
- 16 COMMISSIONER CARTER: I'm sorry,
- 17 Senator --
- 18 MR. WYRICK: I'm sorry, Senator
- 19 Santana.
- 20 CHIEF CRAIG: Through the Chair, I just
- 21 want to make a point that I find interesting.
- 22 Over the last several months, some of those
- 23 officers who left Detroit Police Department are
- 24 returning. I sworn in at least over the last
- 25 two months maybe four.



- 1 They know what I know, the grass is
- 2 certainly not greener on the other side.
- 3 Although I got to tell you when I left Detroit
- 4 many years ago, Commissioner Bell, and went to
- 5 LA, I stayed for 28 years and the grass was
- 6 greener at the time, but it took me over 34 years
- 7 to make my way back, Commissioner Bell.
- 8 COMMISSIONER BELL: Came back.
- 9 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Any other
- 10 questions for the Chief? Thank you.
- 11 At this time we'll move on to the
- 12 presentation from Executive Policy Manager
- 13 Melanie White.
- MS. WHITE: Good afternoon, your
- 15 Honorable Board, may it please the Board my name
- 16 is Melanie White, Executive Manager of Policy and
- 17 today I am presenting on -- the briefing to the
- 18 BOPC on facial recognition recommendations from
- 19 the Policy Division.
- Before you you have three documents.
- 21 The first one should be the actual revised policy
- 22 that the department transmitted to the Board of
- 23 Police Commissioners. The second copy is the
- 24 Policy Division's detailed report of the facial
- 25 recognition recommendations, and then your third



- 1 item that you have should be the actual
- 2 PowerPoint presentation.
- And so today we'll be working from the
- 4 PowerPoint presentation which is also on both of
- 5 the screens.
- Just a brief outline of the
- 7 presentation today. I'll cover the introduction
- 8 which details some important key dates and it
- 9 also discusses the activities conducted by the
- 10 Policy Division to reach the policy
- 11 recommendations and then of course I'll go
- 12 through highlights of the policy recommendations.
- So starting with the four key dates in
- 14 2017. DPD contracted for facial recognition with
- 15 DataWorks Plus Company and the Detroit City
- 16 Council approved the contract and the department
- 17 has been operating that system for a little over
- 18 a year and a half now.
- 19 On January 18, 2019 DPD submitted the
- 20 initial transmitted or initial proposed policy
- 21 and the Board at that time began its review and
- 22 evaluation of the initial proposed policy. As
- 23 you might remember, there were actually two
- 24 policies that you all received, and so that's
- 25 with regard to the first one.



- On June 27, 2019 DPD rescinded the
- 2 initial proposed policy, but later on August 1
- 3 transmitted a revised proposed policy and we,
- 4 again, began to review the evaluation.
- 5 At the Board's request the Policy
- 6 Division conducted the following activities. We
- 7 conducted a robust review, research and analysis
- 8 of professional guidelines and recommendations.
- 9 We discussed the facial recognition
- 10 technology program with department officials and
- 11 executives. We also toured the Detroit Police
- 12 Department Realtime Crime Center and received the
- 13 facial recognition tour.
- We also engaged in review and
- 15 communications with various officials around the
- 16 country as it relates to maybe their decision on
- 17 the facial recognition technology.
- 18 And also of course we attended the
- 19 Board of Police Commissioners meetings, listened
- 20 to the Honorable Board's concerns and comments as
- 21 well as the public citizenry feedback and
- 22 comments from the DPD.
- 23 So your recommendations that we have
- 24 developed as a result of all those activities
- 25 conducted total 23 recommendations to be included



- 1 in the proposed policy for your consideration.
- 2 The recommendations are divided into
- 3 two categories. On Page 4 it outlines the first
- 4 category as the broad category that discussed the
- 5 general areas or importance and those are areas
- 6 related to what's the purpose of facial
- 7 recognition technology, whether members will be
- 8 required to continue receiving training and
- 9 defining terms and the like.
- 10 The second category discusses the
- 11 critical importance, so those are specific areas
- 12 of importance and those areas are related to the
- impacts, items directly impacting the technology
- 14 system and its use.
- 15 And some of those areas under that
- 16 category include required notifications, required
- 17 audits and prohibitions.
- 18 On Page 5 of your PowerPoint
- 19 presentation I'll start with the first category
- 20 which is the broad category and these are the key
- 21 administrative recommendations here.
- 22 First, the facial recognition
- 23 technology purpose should be indicated within a
- 24 department policy. Previously the department had
- 25 indicated that facial recognition technology



- 1 would only be used in Part 1 violent crime
- 2 investigations and home invasion 1
- 3 investigations, so that purpose should be stated
- 4 within the policy primarily at the beginning of
- 5 the policy for our public and operational
- 6 clarity.
- 7 The second recommendation is that
- 8 department members who are permitted to use the
- 9 facial recognition technology system shall
- 10 receive ongoing competent training. We know that
- 11 members who are currently utilizing that system
- 12 have received FBI certification and so we're
- indicating that members who are allowed to use
- 14 that system shall receive this ongoing continuous
- 15 training.
- The third recommendation consists of
- 17 specifying supervisor responsibilities, whether
- 18 that is supervisors indicating in writing whether
- 19 or not they confirm or refute or disagree with
- 20 the peer-to-peer recommendation and also
- 21 identifying any other additional facial
- 22 recognition monitoring responsibilities that the
- 23 supervisor might have.
- The fourth recommendation on Page 5 is
- 25 the department policy should indicate the minimum



- 1 required standard, whether that is the reasonable
- 2 suspicion standard or probable cause standard.
- 3 And, again, for your information the details of
- 4 these recommendations are included in your
- 5 written report, but we're just highlighting the
- 6 main points today.
- 7 The fifth recommendation, the
- 8 department policy should include definitions for
- 9 public and operational clarity and definitions
- 10 were included in that first draft, but not
- included in the second draft, so we're asking
- 12 that they be placed back in the final draft if
- 13 approved by the Board.
- On Page 6, the next recommendation
- 15 consists of addressing data retention, so the
- 16 department policy should address what happens to
- 17 those images that are not used in the Part 1
- 18 violent crime investigations or elevated to the
- 19 next level. Those images should be purged.
- 20 Also under the data retention item, it
- 21 should prohibit data sharing with public and
- 22 private organizations, security firms, employers
- 23 to eliminate discriminatory employment practices.
- 24 The next recommendation speaks to
- 25 ensuring against hacking and other data breaches



- 1 and this is requiring that the policy have some
- 2 provision in there. Again, the first draft
- 3 addressed that, but the second draft did not, so
- 4 we're asking that that be placed back into the
- 5 draft to address implementing and retaining
- 6 preventative measures to safeguard confidential
- 7 information kept in the facial recognition
- 8 system.
- 9 And the last recommendation on this
- 10 page discusses -- detailing how to request facial
- 11 recognition assistance with regards to an
- 12 investigation. What's required, as an example,
- whether that should be in writing, what should be
- included in the case file, that sort of thing.
- Under the second and last category of
- 16 your recommendations, again it's entitled
- 17 "Critical Importance" and this section or this
- 18 category involves three main areas: Required
- 19 notifications, required audits and documentation
- 20 and prohibitions.
- 21 So under the first category required
- 22 notifications are as follows: The department
- 23 shall notify the Board of the DataWorks contract,
- 24 grants and any other modifications with regards
- 25 to the contract or the grant for the Board's



- 1 review and approval and consideration.
- 2 Second, the department shall notify the
- 3 Board of Police Commissioners of any policy
- 4 amendments or modifications to the policy if
- 5 approved.
- 6 The third recommendation is regarding
- 7 notification of algorithm agnostic improvements,
- 8 so if there are any improvements in the internal
- 9 workings of the system, of the actual facial
- 10 recognition system, any changes in the
- 11 step-by-step procedures the Board of Police
- 12 Commissioners shall be notified by the police
- 13 department.
- 14 The next recommendation is regarding
- 15 notifications of violations of policy, so if
- 16 there are any violations of department policy the
- 17 department shall notify the Board of Police
- 18 Commissioners of those violations for your
- 19 information.
- 20 And then the last recommendation on
- 21 this page, on Page 7, discusses -- or requires
- 22 the department to provide clarity on whether
- 23 outside agencies will have use and access to the
- 24 system.
- On Page 8 under required audits and



- 1 documentation the recommendations are as follows.
- 2 The department shall require supervisors
- 3 peer-to-peer and of course the peer evaluation to
- 4 be in writing. Additionally the supervisors who
- 5 either concur or disagree with the peer-to-peer's
- 6 evaluation because, as we know, it's layers to
- 7 the review process of the facial recognition
- 8 process, so the peer-to-peer review, then a
- 9 supervisory review.
- We're indicating that supervisors and
- 11 everyone conducting that review shall indicate
- 12 their findings and conclusions in writing for
- 13 transparency and accountability purposes.
- 14 The next recommendation is regarding
- 15 department audits. The department is already
- 16 engaged in ongoing and continuous audits as it
- 17 relates to the facial recognition system.
- We're just asking or posing that that
- 19 requirement be placed within a department policy
- 20 so that it will be requirement going forward as
- 21 well.
- The next recommendation is involving
- 23 including enforcement provisions. Previously the
- 24 department included provisions and we're asking
- 25 that those items again be placed back in this



- 1 last final draft.
- 2 So all violations shall be reported to
- 3 the BOPC immediately and strict adherence to the
- 4 disciplinary policy.
- 5 The next recommendation is regarding
- 6 annual report mandatory provisions, and those are
- 7 relating to requirements and information that the
- 8 Board shall receive each year as it relates to
- 9 the facial recognition system.
- 10 Any information that the department
- 11 brings fort or any information that is identified
- in terms of Part 1 violent crime suspects, any
- 13 details should be reported to the Board of Police
- 14 Commissioners during that annual reporting.
- 15 And the last recommendation on that
- 16 page is with regards to complying with current
- 17 federal, state and local laws. The policy should
- 18 require yearly checks and compliance with all
- 19 applicable laws to anticipate new regulations.
- 20 We know that there are two house bills
- 21 that are currently pending, House Bill 4810 and
- 22 Senate Bill 342. And so we're, again, asking
- 23 that any changes to the laws that the department,
- 24 of course, comply with those regulations.
- 25 And the last section is regarding



- 1 prohibitions and they are as follows: So the
- 2 department policy shall establish and shall
- 3 indicate in the department policy that facial
- 4 recognition technology does not establish
- 5 probably cause to arrest or at least clarify that
- 6 statement.
- 7 The second recommendation on this page
- 8 is the prohibition mobile facial recognition,
- 9 drones, livestream, surveillance, realtime, etc.
- 10 so we know that the Mayor, Mayor Duggan, put out
- 11 a letter that discussed the prohibition against
- 12 facial recognition and the use of surveillance
- and so we're asking that surveillance carried
- 14 over to all the technology that it's involved in.
- 15 The third recommendation there
- 16 discusses the prohibition against the use for
- immigration purposes and the last recommendation
- 18 is regarding prohibition against predictive
- 19 analytics, and that is used to predict future
- 20 events.
- 21 And your last page -- second to last
- 22 page of your presentation of course discusses and
- 23 re-emphasizes Constitutional protections, so
- 24 again the department shall not violate the 1st,
- 4th and 14th Amendments and will not, of course,



- 1 perform or require or request facial recognition
- 2 searches against an individual or an organization
- 3 with respect to the 1st Amendment, 4th Amendment
- 4 or 14th Amendment violations.
- 5 And so all have those details of course
- 6 are listed there as well and that is currently in
- 7 the department's policy, but we wanted to
- 8 highlight that again as the Board emphasizing
- 9 that measure, that protective measure.
- 10 And your last page of your presentation
- included key references that of course we use to
- 12 research, conduct research and analysis and we
- 13 conduct research and analysis with a lot more
- 14 recommendations or a lot more publications than
- 15 you see on Page 11. It was some close to 50
- 16 references that we reviewed and conducted for
- 17 your consideration, and you can refer to your
- 18 written report for additional details on the
- 19 recommendations and the key references.
- 20 And that concludes my report at this
- 21 time.
- 22 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Do you have any
- 23 questions for Ms. White?
- 24 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Through the Chair
- 25 I thank you so very much for this most detailed



- 1 discussion. You have three pages of references,
- 2 some of which have presented here before us. I
- 3 think it's well known that when I first became a
- 4 Commissioner I came here real excited about the
- 5 Green Light installation and what that would mean
- 6 for citizens, especially the older adults
- 7 citizens I believed at that time.
- 8 So when the Green Light discussion
- 9 became attached to the facial recognition I was
- 10 just blindsided because I didn't understand that
- 11 terminology. But since that time I've tried to
- 12 really engage in studying what the facial
- 13 recognition phenomenon would mean especially as
- 14 relates to the technology initially seemingly was
- 15 inaccurate as it identified or confused folks of
- 16 color, not only males, but as I came to
- 17 understand females as well.
- Now, I have a man child and his daddy
- 19 and I have sat down and educated him on how to
- 20 behave when he is in the presence of a police
- 21 officer who has stopped him for whatever reason.
- 22 So naturally I'm sensitive when it does
- 23 come to the potential encounter between my man
- 24 child and the police, and it doesn't always have
- 25 to be a race issue. Sometimes black police



- 1 officers can be as combative with these young
- 2 males as white police officers will also be
- 3 combative with white young males, so it's not
- 4 always an issue of race as it relates to those
- 5 young teenagers. I'm trying to get there.
- I have tried to research some positive
- 7 information on the subject. I stumbled across a
- 8 document that was created by the Integrated
- 9 Justice Information Systems in conjunction with
- 10 the International Association of Police Chiefs.
- Now, what's happened since January up
- 12 to today, they already advocated that this is how
- 13 we were supposed to engage in explaining facial
- 14 recognition to our citizenry.
- One of the highlights was that we were
- 16 first supposed to -- and Chief knows this -- we
- 17 were first supposed to have a public forum to see
- 18 how the public -- but now that that's in our
- 19 history this document that you have created, I
- 20 promise you, it fall in direct guidelines with
- 21 what was advocated in the -- it's the IJUSIACP
- 22 and I'm sure the Chief is familiar with the
- 23 International Association of Police Chiefs.
- 24 Thank you so very much for the time and
- 25 the energy that you have taken along with



- 1 Secretary Hicks to create this document.
- 2 MS. WHITE: Thank you. I was going --
- 3 through the Chair, I was going to also thank
- 4 Mr. Hicks, the Board staff, Supervising
- 5 Investigator Akbar. There were several of us who
- 6 worked very hard in getting this information to
- 7 you today, so thank you.
- 8 COMMISSIONER BURCH: Through the Chair,
- 9 Mr. Hicks told me to thank you.
- 10 MS. WHITE: Okay.
- 11 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: I want to echo
- 12 my colleague's sentiments. This is a very
- 13 thorough document and I know it took a lot of
- 14 time and I think addresses a lot of the comments
- 15 and concerns of the Board and as well as many
- 16 that have been brought to light in these
- 17 meetings.
- 18 But I do have a couple of questions.
- 19 My first question is -- and it's just for my own
- 20 understanding. There's a topic in there that
- 21 says mobile facial recognition and it says the
- 22 use of mobile FR/Evolution multi-modal
- 23 identification device, what is that exactly?
- 24 MS. WHITE: So in the research that I
- 25 conducted, through the Chair, it's basically that



- 1 mobile facial recognition, so it's just a
- 2 technical term for utilizing the facial
- 3 recognition software through the use of a mobile
- 4 device.
- 5 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: I see, so this
- 6 would prohibit the department from being able to
- 7 use the facial recognition, it has to be done
- 8 through the computer system?
- 9 MS. WHITE: Right, through the still
- 10 images only, yes.
- 11 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: Through the
- 12 Chair, I have one more question, but I think it's
- 13 directed towards you or our Board Secretary.
- 14 Next step for this -- so obviously our
- 15 staff has done a great job of putting together a
- 16 list of recommendations.
- 17 What is the process that we follow to
- 18 either accept or tweak or change, revise this?
- 19 Does it go back to the police department for
- 20 consideration, come back to us?
- 21 How does that process work?
- 22 COMMISSIONER CARTER: It will go back to
- 23 the department for consideration.
- 24 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: And we have to
- 25 vote as a body, okay.



1 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Will vote on the

- 2 final policy as a body.
- 3 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: Vote on the
- 4 recommendation?
- 5 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: Through the
- 6 Chair, just to repeat what I said, I asked what
- 7 the process was for this to come back before us
- 8 formally and I was told by the Chair that we
- 9 would submit this to the police department for
- 10 consideration and once it's a policy it comes
- 11 back and then at that time it will be on a vote
- 12 by pleasure of the Board to consider this.
- 13 COMMISSIONER BURCH: I'm just trying to
- 14 make it clear to myself, but then we have to be
- 15 clear to the citizens. That remember, Chief,
- 16 when we asked the question -- it wasn't to you
- 17 directly, but it was to Chief White, if something
- 18 -- if a person goes out of the order of what they
- 19 should be doing with the facial recognition, they
- 20 would be punished.
- 21 I think the public needs to know what
- 22 punishment would they receive if they went
- 23 against everything that the facial recognition
- 24 should do.
- 25 And then Part 2 of that question, Madam



- 1 Chair, okay, so if the people -- if someone gets
- 2 out of the scrutiny -- say the plan is going
- 3 well. Like she said, he might be gone and the
- 4 next Chief comes in and they may go a little and
- 5 deviate from what was written, who's going to
- 6 keep track if something changes in the policy
- 7 that was written in the first place?
- 8 Who's going to do all that, to watch
- 9 make sure they stay in the guidelines of what the
- 10 Chief has said it would do. Can you help me or
- 11 somebody?
- 12 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Who's going to
- 13 keep the police department in line, I think that
- 14 would be us.
- 15 COMMISSIONER BURCH: I know but that's
- 16 what I'm saying. How would we know?
- 17 COMMISSIONER CARTER: So we would have
- 18 to -- that's where the trust comes in. Not just
- 19 trust, but with policy, following the policy, and
- 20 also with -- we have weekly meetings. Audits are
- 21 in the --
- 22 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: Through the
- 23 Chair, I would just refer Commissioner -- Burch,
- 24 I'm sorry to see Page 9 of recommended changes to
- 25 the policy in which it does state that there's a



- 1 new addendum to the policy that's recommended in
- 2 which it talks about the annual audit where the
- 3 information that I think she's asking would be
- 4 addressed. This is like a recommendation from
- 5 our staff to the police department. There's a
- 6 third-party audit and perform an audit to inform
- 7 us of what happening. The findings of that audit
- 8 would be presented to the Board so we would know
- 9 what was going on.
- 10 And also there's weekly meetings where
- 11 we are -- in the original documentation there was
- 12 discussion of weekly meetings in which the police
- department would provide us a report of
- 14 everything that was happening as it related to
- 15 facial recognition, the number of requests, the
- 16 number of crimes that were attempted to solve,
- 17 number of leads that were produced from the
- 18 software.
- 19 COMMISSIONER BURCH: I thank you. I
- 20 just wanted to make it clear that the audience
- 21 knows what.
- 22 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: So ideally what
- 23 I would hope to see at that point is that if this
- 24 is transmitted to the police department the new
- 25 policy would be made public as the old policy



- 1 directive was and then that would be available to
- 2 the public to read as well.
- 3 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Also through the
- 4 Chair, please. Page 8 of the document, if I may
- 5 read aloud, "Notification of policy violations
- 6 including any breach of 1st Amendment violations,
- 7 the department shall add the following
- 8 provisions. If for any reason facial recognition
- 9 is used contrary to department policies and
- 10 procedures including but not limited to Section
- 11 30.5 2.3, 1st Amendment, the Board of Police
- 12 Commissioners, the Mayor, City Council President
- 13 and President Pro Tem shall be notified within
- 14 four hours of a breach. Notification shall be
- 15 both verbally and written."
- So even as soon as -- apparently as
- 17 soon as that breach is recognized we are -- those
- 18 agencies are supposed to come together and try to
- 19 figure out how to reconcile the situation.
- 20 MS. WHITE: Through the Chair, that is
- 21 correct, yes.
- 22 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Right, right, yep,
- 23 it's tight.
- 24 COMMISSIONER BROWN: There's a few
- 25 questions. When you were reviewing the policy



- 1 did you have a chance to go over the DataWorks
- 2 contract to see what was in that along with the
- 3 purchase of the software, if there's any
- 4 components or things that we just didn't have to
- 5 buy?
- 6 MS. WHITE: Through the Chair, I did
- 7 review the DataWorks contract and I believe may
- 8 have provided copies of that information, but I'm
- 9 not sure if that was the most recent and
- 10 up-to-date version of it, so I didn't think it
- 11 was comparable or that it made sense coming from
- 12 me as opposed to the department presenting that
- 13 contract for your review, and that's why one of
- 14 the recommendations in the policy recommendation
- 15 was that the department transmit the actual
- 16 contract to the Board of Police Commissioners for
- 17 a thorough review of the most recent version.
- 18 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Also with the
- 19 supposed to discipline, a few questions I have,
- 20 Madam Chair.
- 21 Have we had the discussion with our
- 22 unions as far as the disciplinary action against
- 23 members that violate the policy?
- 24 MS. WHITE: Through the Chair, we have
- 25 not had discussions with the unions as of this



- 1 date, but I will indicate that the recommendation
- 2 that you do see in your report, that was -- those
- 3 were provisions that were initially included in
- 4 the first draft of the proposed policy
- 5 transmitted by the department to the Board, so
- 6 that simply is the language lifted from that
- 7 first draft and we're requested that it be placed
- 8 back into the final draft.
- 9 COMMISSIONER BROWN: And right now we
- 10 have no state law governing the use of facial
- 11 recognition technology?
- MS. WHITE: Yes, sir, we do not.
- 13 COMMISSIONER BROWN: So that was
- 14 inaccurate in your report about complying with
- 15 them. Do we have any at the federal level?
- MS. WHITE: Through the Chair, we do
- 17 not have currently any federal, state law with
- 18 regard to facial recognition.
- 19 However, as mentioned previously, there
- 20 are two current bills that are pending and of
- 21 course because this technology and the subject
- 22 matter is moving so rapidly there will likely be
- 23 some regulation and that's one of the arguments
- 24 that there be mandatory regulation on the subject
- 25 matter, so in that event the department will



- 1 still be required to follow all laws.
- 2 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Just two more. So
- 3 in the event that the system is hacked how are we
- 4 going to -- are we going to add something in the
- 5 policy about maybe scrubbing the database or how
- 6 would we contain situations with hacking?
- 7 Have we considered scrubbing the
- 8 database and restarting or are we going to
- 9 consider anything like that if the system is
- 10 hacked?
- MS. WHITE: Through the Chair, we are
- 12 asking that the Board provide -- the department
- 13 provide their technical procedures and policies
- 14 as it relates to safequarding and protecting that
- 15 information, that confidential and sensitive
- 16 information.
- So we're asking the department to
- 18 transmit their information and their expertise in
- 19 that regard.
- 20 COMMISSIONER BROWN: And then last
- 21 question. On top of this excellent information
- 22 and research that you did, I didn't see too much
- 23 research on any departments or states that were
- 24 opposed, that have banned the recognition in any
- of your reports. Have I missed that?



- I didn't get this other piece that I
- 2 had to go through timely, so I didn't really have
- 3 a chance to read it.
- 4 MS. WHITE: Yes, sir. Through the
- 5 Chair, we did conduct research of other agencies
- 6 who have banned the use of facial recognition
- 7 technology and I can provide you that
- 8 information.
- 9 But just thinking right now, one of the
- 10 main reasons why they banned the technology was
- 11 some of the agencies were contemplating using it
- 12 through surveillance, through live video
- 13 streaming, that sort of thing, but again I can
- 14 get you the details on other -- other details why
- they were contemplating or why they did actually
- 16 ban the technology.
- 17 There were several jurisdictions, San
- 18 Francisco, Berkeley, Somerville, Massachusetts
- 19 and another agency. And also they indicated
- 20 other important reasons, so I can get you that
- 21 information.
- 22 COMMISSIONER BROWN: And those are the
- 23 same reasons that we have the capability that's
- in the software to do the same things that they
- 25 were opposed to which is the livestream, the



- 1 mobile facial recognition piece and things like
- 2 that that can be intertwined into the body-worn
- 3 cameras and the mobile units in scout cars.
- 4 Do we have anything -- have we looked
- 5 at when we chang and we switch over to this, and
- 6 Chief, DC, if anyone wants to jump in on it, just
- 7 help me out with it, when we chang this software
- 8 it's going to affect the software or the entire
- 9 system that we're using right now, also is it
- 10 still going to be two or three stand-alone
- 11 systems?
- 12 CHIEF CRAIG: Through the Chair, in
- 13 response to the Commissioner's issue. As I've
- 14 indicated a number of times the software is
- 15 separate from Green Light cameras, traffic
- 16 management cameras and body-worn cameras,
- 17 even the Axon who is the maker of a number of
- 18 body-worn cameras, is probably the dominant
- 19 company, they oppose having facial recognition
- 20 embedded into their cameras.
- 21 They recognize that there's no way to
- 22 safeguard misidentification, if it's -- imagine a
- 23 police officer with a body-worn camera with
- 24 facial recognition embedded and this thing is
- 25 going through the cycle it goes through and it's



- 1 misidentifying someone that they have contact
- 2 with in the field, that's problematic.
- 3 The safeguards that we have in place is
- 4 the reason why we don't use livestreaming and
- 5 certainly we agree with the body-worn camera
- 6 company that you can't have -- the technology is
- 7 not advanced to the level that it won't
- 8 misidentify.
- 9 As I've indicated in my demonstrations
- 10 if you're inserting a photograph and you get 178
- 11 hits on that one photograph and by chance one of
- 12 them is the correct one, just says that 177 were
- 13 not the right match.
- 14 And so we cannot rely on the
- 15 technology, it's not advanced to that point and
- 16 that's the reason why the peer review and then
- 17 supervisor concurrence is critical.
- 18 And in addition to that, the training
- 19 that's given the analysts that go through 24
- 20 hours of biometric training through the FBI which
- 21 is also critical. You cannot rely on the
- 22 technology alone because if you do that and if
- 23 you allow the technology to say the No. 1
- 24 photograph must be the right one, you will
- 25 misidentify probably, my estimation, 98 percent



- of the time, which does -- and so that's why we
- 2 agree with the criticism of the technology, but
- 3 if you use it appropriately and put the necessary
- 4 safeguards in, it minimizes misidentifications.
- 5 And, again, when you talk about
- 6 probable cause, reasonable suspicion, as I
- 7 indicated this is a tool to develop a lead. You
- 8 cannot use reasonable suspicion or probable cause
- 9 to arrest somebody based on a facial recognition
- 10 identification.
- 11 And, again, that identification is
- 12 truly made by the analyst, not the technology.
- 13 You just can't make an arrest, you can make a
- 14 detention.
- 15 COMMISSIONER BROWN: So basically our
- 16 primary use of this is to just use it as a
- 17 virtual lineup?
- 18 CHIEF CRAIG: I wouldn't call it a
- 19 virtual lineup. The technology, through the
- 20 Chair again, it's going through our mug book
- 21 database first and once it goes through that if
- there's a match that's made by the analyst, again
- 23 not -- of course the technology speeds the
- 24 process up.
- 25 So going back to the way police work



Page 66

- 1 was done years ago, you go through these pages
- 2 and pages of photographs hoping to identify a
- 3 possible suspect. But even then you just can't
- 4 go out and make that arrest. I think the way we
- 5 use it certainly is a best practice. As the
- 6 report was given, there was some discussion about
- 7 how some other cities were using it. There have
- 8 been discussions, some cities have used it in
- 9 livestreaming.
- I would never be comfortable with that
- 11 given where the technology is today. Where it's
- 12 at today -- again, I emphasize, it will
- 13 misidentify if you just rely solely on the
- 14 technology.
- 15 I know Andrew who is here with us today
- 16 was one of the management-level analysts who is
- 17 very articulate and understands the rigger and
- 18 the process one has to go through in making an
- 19 identification.
- 20 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Thank you, Madam
- 21 Chair.
- 22 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Thank you and I
- 23 am about to leave so I'm going to ask that
- 24 Commissioner Bell take over from here.
- 25 Thank you, Commissioners, and thank you



- 1 Ms. White.
- 2 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Thank you. Chief
- 3 Craig, now the contract expires in 2020, correct,
- 4 with DataWorks?
- 5 CHIEF CRAIG: Through the Chair, I
- 6 believe it's 2020, not certain.
- 7 COMMISSIONER HOLT: So what plans do we
- 8 see in terms of reupping or what?
- 9 CHIEF CRAIG: We certainly want to go
- 10 through this process. Certainly if it is
- 11 supported by the Commission and it's time to
- 12 renew, we bring it back to the Commission.
- And, again, I think it was also stated
- 14 because of how this technology is evolving at the
- 15 pace that it is, any significant changes in the
- 16 technology should be brought before this body.
- 17 Again, the technology is not at a place
- 18 when you can insert in a body-worn camera and
- 19 expect it to identify, say, a wanted suspect.
- 20 And then the other problem is the
- 21 rigger and the way we use it it's strictly
- 22 towards felonies with the addition of a home
- 23 invasion 1.
- 24 So imagine if we were using the
- 25 technology and somebody came up with a child



- 1 support warrant, that's not how we would want to
- 2 and never intended to use it in that manner.
- 3 COMMISSIONER HOLT: One last comment.
- 4 The organization I quoted earlier, they also
- 5 shared a comment that might also bring some kind
- of solidity to our thinking because we seem to
- 7 only see it as something that will identify
- 8 innocent folks as if they were perpetrators.
- 9 Facial recognition is a development
- 10 when used appropriately can help law enforcement
- 11 exonerate the innocent, narrow searches for the
- 12 guilty and maximize limited resources.
- 13 And when we think of the stress on our
- 14 law enforcement here in the city, that's another
- 15 reason why I'm wondering it would serve us as
- 16 well. We are strapping for sufficient persons in
- 17 our law enforcement department.
- 18 CHIEF CRAIG: Through the Chair,
- 19 absolutely leveraging technology is a very
- 20 efficient and effective way in deploying
- 21 resources. Some have suggested well, forget the
- 22 technology, just hire more police. It's just not
- 23 that simple.
- New York has, what, 38,000 police and
- 25 they use technology probably better than anybody



- 1 in the United States and they have cameras
- 2 everywhere. There's no other city in America
- 3 with the number of cameras, so any suggestion to
- 4 say well, hire more police officers is the right
- 5 answer, I would submit that how many police
- 6 officers would it take to place a police officer
- 7 on every corner, every block 24 hours, seven days
- 8 a week?
- 9 I can tell you the cities that are most
- 10 effective at reducing crime, and I know there's
- 11 some head shaking, but I worked Los Angeles and
- 12 Los Angeles was very effective at using
- 13 technology and yes, they have 10,000 police
- 14 officers.
- 15 And by the way, they have a homicide
- 16 rate on par with Detroit, with a population
- 17 that's much higher. So when I say I'm not
- 18 speaking from something I read in a book or the
- 19 opinion of the IACP, I'm speaking from a place of
- 20 experience.
- 21 And I will tell you, I'm as concerned
- 22 and more concerned even on how we use the
- 23 technology and the fact -- and we talk about
- 24 accountability -- if somebody uses that
- 25 technology improperly, they should be held



- 1 accountable which could lead to dismissal and
- 2 even criminal prosecution.
- 3 That's the seriousness I take with the
- 4 use of this technology. Does it work, does it
- 5 help. We talk about 30 percent of all of the
- 6 times we've used it where we've taken it and
- 7 moved it to the next level of the investigation
- 8 and we've identified some people in some real
- 9 serious crimes.
- 10 I think -- you know, that matters and
- if you talk to our Homicide, I don't think -- one
- 12 of the things we have missed in this conversation
- 13 about facial recognition, I would love for a
- 14 presentation to be made by our Homicide team.
- The 2nd Precinct is second in the city,
- 16 so Homicide has used it more than any other
- 17 departmental entity only followed by the 2nd
- 18 Precinct.
- 19 But Homicide will tell you the times
- 20 they've used it successfully had it not been for
- 21 the technology it would have been a who-done-it.
- 22 That's a fact.
- 23 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Thank you.
- 24 COMMISSIONER BURTON: Through the
- 25 Chair, so question for Ms. Melanie White. When



- 1 did the Policy Committee -- when did they meet
- 2 and who's on that committee?
- 3 MS. WHITE: Through the Chair, the
- 4 Policy Subcommittee did not meet on this item.
- 5 That is the purpose of this particular forum that
- 6 I bring the information and a recommendations
- 7 that we researched to the full Board to the
- 8 committee as a whole, so this is taking the place
- 9 of the Policy Subcommittee meeting.
- 10 COMMISSIONER BURTON: How did the body
- 11 -- the Board of Police Commissioners get involved
- in this policy when the Detroit Police Department
- 13 did not come before this body in the beginning
- 14 for approval. They secure funding, implemented a
- 15 program, used it for nearly two years. We don't
- 16 know where the data is being collected, how it's
- 17 being used so far.
- 18 So the whole thing should be
- 19 sanctioned, so how do we get to the point of
- 20 talking about policies, and should we be
- 21 approving a policy two years later?
- 22 COMMISSIONER BELL: Commissioner
- 23 Burton, we are here today and this has been
- 24 ongoing for a period of time. I think all of
- 25 Commission agrees that this is an issue before us



- 1 and we are dealing -- and we're addressing it
- 2 now.
- 3 Ms. Melanie White was given charge by
- 4 the Chair to speak to the whole Board to
- 5 enlighten them in reference to where we are with
- 6 this.
- 7 There's been no committee meetings.
- 8 You heard the Chair -- well, perhaps you didn't
- 9 because you were not here at the time she made a
- 10 statement that she restructured that whole
- 11 process.
- But the main thing we as committee of
- 13 the whole have been enlightened by this process,
- 14 so that's where we are today. Thank you.
- 15 I just want to add that the Chief
- 16 brought up that this is -- facial recognition is
- 17 not brand new, it just hit the floor in 2018 or
- 18 '19. It's been around a long time.
- 19 We haven't talked about -- the Chief
- 20 cited a couple of departments, but there are a
- 21 hundred different departments that have utilized
- 22 this system for over the period of time, so if we
- 23 talk about the two or three that's banned it, but
- 24 this system has been in the cutting edge of
- 25 technology for quite some time.



- 1 And I want the people to know and the
- 2 Board to know this is not about Chief Craig.
- 3 It's not about us as individual members. This is
- 4 about policy and the process by City Charter that
- 5 we're mandated in reference to the Chief of
- 6 Police and the Board of Police Commissioners and
- 7 DPD.
- 8 It is not about individuals in terms of
- 9 how we arrive at the process, so don't look --
- 10 and I think Chief Craig is doing the great job,
- 11 but it's not about Chief Craig, it's being DPD
- 12 and he happen to be the Chief of Police at this
- 13 particular time.
- 14 And anything that we review would be
- 15 ongoing. This Board has been around since 1974,
- 16 Chief of Police been around since Chief Tanian in
- 17 terms of that whole process, we've had numerous
- 18 chiefs, so don't get stuck on the individual.
- 19 Look at how we mandate policy, that is your
- 20 mandate in terms of how we function.
- Thank you, Ms. White, it's been a very
- 22 robust discussion, I guess we can move on to the
- 23 next issue.
- 24 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: I just want to
- 25 confirm, so the next step is -- I just want to



- 1 make sure we're all aligned on the next step.
- Melanie White will send this document to the
- 3 police department?
- 4 COMMISSIONER BELL: That has already
- 5 been forthcoming, they're already in the loop.
- 6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: And we should
- 7 then wait for the --
- 8 COMMISSIONER BELL: We're on a fast
- 9 track to address this matter.
- 10 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: Got it.
- 11 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you.
- 12 CHIEF CRAIG: Through the Chair, can I
- 13 make one final comment? I just want to let the
- 14 record reflect all the issues that I know
- 15 Commissioner Burton has raised over the month or
- 16 so, I take them seriously because I know he
- 17 speaks on behalf of constituents that agrees with
- 18 him.
- 19 I don't disagree with a lot of the
- 20 issues. I think the issue is really showing how
- 21 serious that this department takes the use of
- 22 that technology and certainly we don't want one
- 23 abuse at all. This is really, as I've said
- 24 before, about dealing with violent criminals
- 25 only, and about those family remembers of those



- 1 victims and giving them some peace and resolve.
- 2 So, again I don't disagree with a lot
- 3 of issues that are being raised. I agree with
- 4 them. I just want -- and that's why I made a
- 5 public invitation just to come see it and have an
- 6 understanding because it's hard to really grasp
- 7 the use of the technology unless you really see
- 8 it. It doesn't mean he's going to change his
- 9 mind, but certainly it may give him some level of
- 10 appreciation of how we use it.
- 11 COMMISSIONER BELL: And we have invited
- 12 others to come with him them, except for one
- 13 commissioner, you already highlighted that, so we
- 14 can move on. Thanks again, Ms. White.
- MS. WHITE: Thank you.
- 16 COMMISSIONER BURTON: Through the
- 17 chair, you know, we as a city cannot afford to
- 18 misidentify a single person. We are the poorest,
- 19 blackest city in America, over 60 percent poverty
- 20 rate. 85 percent of the citizens of Detroit are
- 21 African-American.
- There is over 30 organizations sitting
- 23 here today will be speaking out today at 7500
- 24 Oakland Street at 6 o'clock.
- The Chief of Police, you're welcome to



- 1 come, Mayor Duggan is welcome to come, the
- 2. community will be there.
- 3 COMMISSIONER BELL: Could you save your
- 4 announcements until we get to that point in time
- 5 because we want to move the agenda.
- 6 COMMISSIONER BURTON: You know, we just
- 7 -- it's not just the announcement, Chairman Bell.
- We as a city cannot afford to misidentify a 8
- 9 single person with this techno-racism, can't
- identify one black male from another, it is 10
- 11 wrong.
- 12 COMMISSIONER BELL: Well, Chief Craig
- 13 indicated he agreed with you, some of us agree
- 14 with you, but let's move on.
- 15 The next issue on the agenda items is
- 16 mental health, DPD and that would be Capt.
- 17 Russell; thank you.
- CAPT. RUSSELL: Good afternoon, Board. 18
- 19 I'm Capt. Russell, Professional Education and
- Training and I'm here today to talk about mental 20
- 21 health.
- 2.2 I don't know what's going on, Board,
- but we'll go ahead and move forward. You guys 23
- have copy -- you all have a copy of the 24
- 25 presentation, so we can go ahead and move



- 1 forward.
- 2 So, once again, I'm from Professional
- 3 Education and Training and I'm here to talk about
- 4 mental health and the reason why we train on
- 5 mental health is for a lot of reasons.
- 6 It reduces injuries to responding
- 7 officers by using de-escalation techniques. We
- 8 increase the safety of our citizens by
- 9 appropriate communication strategies.
- 10 We identify community-based approach as
- 11 a response to those with mental disorders. It
- 12 helps us to have appropriate resolutions for
- 13 first responders and it minimizes the stigma
- 14 associated with mental disorders.
- 15 It also helps us assist officers in
- 16 determining the most fair and humane response to
- individuals who suffer from mentally ill.
- 18 So mental illness training, of course
- 19 we train our new recruits in the academy on
- 20 mental illness and of course the state standard
- 21 consists of three hours of mental illness
- 22 training and eight hours of health and wellness,
- 23 so there's a total of 11 hours that's mandated by
- 24 the State of Michigan before a police officer can
- 25 be certified as a law enforcement officer .



- 1 And, of course, DPD standard, of course
- 2 we go above and beyond with an additional eight
- 3 hours that we give the new recruits.
- 4 This additional eight hours consists of
- 5 mental health first aid training which is kind of
- 6 dealing with suicide combination in addition to
- 7 how to deal with the mentally ill in our
- 8 community.
- 9 So for our new recruits total we
- 10 average about 19 hours of mental health illness
- 11 training before they exit the police academy.
- 12 So the Detroit Police Department is in
- 13 partnership with Detroit-Wayne Mental Health
- 14 Authority and this is a partnership that's been
- 15 sustained for guite some time.
- They provide ongoing training for our
- 17 senior members of the department. We talk about
- 18 senior members, we're talking about people that's
- 19 Detroit Police Department outside of the academy.
- This program is sponsored by CAPPA and
- 21 it is a mandatory two-hour block of instruction.
- 22 It teaches our officers how to deal with
- 23 community members who suffer from mental illness
- and homelessness.
- We have a yearly mental health



- 1 symposium. During that mental health symposium
- 2 we talk about marriage and family. We also talk
- 3 about suicide prevention, we talk about
- 4 alcoholism, drug abuse, and different things that
- 5 officers need to make sure that they stay in
- 6 compliance as a law enforcement officer and the
- 7 stresses on the job in addition to health and
- 8 wellness.
- 9 The ongoing training also talks about
- 10 -- provides effective communication skills when
- 11 dealing with families or persons that's affected
- 12 by mental illness.
- The training provides resources with
- 14 mental health issues, homelessness, meal
- 15 programs, abuse of thought counseling and crisis
- 16 centers. Additionally, these officers are
- 17 provided training and resources for their own
- 18 self-care, suicide prevention, substance abuse,
- 19 disorder and stressors. So we have two different
- 20 things that were given to the officers. Of
- 21 course the mental health symposium, that's yearly
- 22 in addition to the two-hour block of instruction
- 23 that they get that's mandated in-service
- 24 training.
- 25 So the number of calls for service for



- 1 the last six months involving mental illness, so
- 2 we talk about mental illness there's a couple of
- 3 things that come to mind. Of course these
- 4 numbers are not in fact concrete and with that
- 5 being said because there are several different
- 6 police runs that we get with members of the
- 7 community in which they have not been diagnosed
- 8 as mental health -- having mental illness. So
- 9 this is just an example or some of the calls that
- 10 we get and what are some of the responses.
- 11 So as you see at the bottom the most
- 12 common responses could be clearing with a
- 13 transport or clearing with no action required or
- 14 advising depending on what the situation is when
- 15 the officers get a police run.
- 16 Barricaded gunpersons and mentally ill.
- 17 All members assigned to the Special Response Team
- 18 are certified in hostage negotiation and crisis
- 19 intervention. They go through 40 hours of
- 20 training. The training received by members of
- 21 SRT aids them in identifying the mental and
- 22 personality disorders prevalent during crisis
- 23 situations.
- 24 They are able to propose tactical plans
- 25 to resolve volatile situations. In the last six



Page 81

- 1 months from February 1st to August 31st Special
- 2 Response Team had 16 barricaded armed persons
- 3 which are all arrests. Three that we know of for
- 4 certain suffer from mental illness based upon the
- 5 investigation with the family at the scene who
- 6 provided this information, but that does not mean
- 7 that the other 16 were not a result of mental
- 8 illness because maybe they just were not
- 9 diagnosed at that time or it's still unknown, so
- 10 these are not concrete numbers, these are just
- 11 the numbers we've had in the last six months.
- 12 So the department is currently in the
- 13 process of rolling out CIT and CIT is a
- 14 grant-funded regional project with Detroit-Wayne
- 15 Mental Health Authority and basically what it is
- 16 is that it is a relationship of 40 hours of
- 17 training for law enforcement on how to better
- 18 respond to people experiencing a mental health
- 19 crisis.
- 20 Currently we have four DPD officers who
- 21 have been certified as CIT instructors and we
- 22 also are rolling out this training next week. We
- 23 have 10 DPD members and 14 regional partners who
- 24 will be going through this training. Once again,
- 25 I want to emphasize this is a county initiative.



- 1 That means it won't just be DPD, it will be other
- 2 people within Wayne County that's receiving the
- 3 training as well.
- 4 The rollout is going to begin in
- 5 Downtown Services and the 9th Precinct.
- 6 Obviously Downtown Services because we have a lot
- 7 of homeless mentally ill recipients in that area
- 8 and of course we want to be properly trained at
- 9 all times and received as much training as we can
- 10 on how to deal with these situations.
- 11 For additional CIP training courses
- 12 it's scheduled of course in the year 2020. We
- 13 are estimating a course that the department have
- 14 40 additional members trained by the end of next
- 15 year, but those numbers are not up to us, that's
- 16 up, of course, to Wayne County Health Authority,
- 17 but you would think with Detroit being the
- 18 largest department that we will be to getting a
- 19 lot of training opportunities.
- 20 And I'll take any questions?
- 21 COMMISSIONER BELL: Commissioners?
- 22 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: Through the
- 23 Chair, just a question on -- I think it's the
- 24 sixth slide. When you talk about the number of
- 25 calls for service, how do you classify those?



- 1 So, for example, you had 676 mental
- 2 violent armed and how would you classify that it
- 3 was a mental violence?
- 4 The reason I'm asking is I'm wondering
- 5 if this is even underrepresentation of resources
- 6 that are devoted to this?
- 7 CAPT. RUSSELL: Through the Chair, once
- 8 again, these numbers are not concrete because,
- 9 once again, we're not for certain of people --
- 10 how many people have actually been diagnosed with
- 11 mental illness. This is just a caller calling in
- 12 saying this is a mental call.
- 13 He don't know for certain until we
- 14 actually get there and confirm what type of run
- 15 it is?
- 16 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: I see, so it's
- 17 identified based on the caller?
- 18 CAPT. RUSSELL: Correct.
- 19 CHIEF CRAIG: Through the Chair, I want
- 20 to also respond to your question, I think it's a
- 21 good one. Many times when we get the call for
- 22 service it is the citizen reporting that there's
- 23 a person suffering from mental illness based on
- 24 behavior. It could be under the influence.
- 25 It could be any number of things and



- 1 sometimes even after the officer gets to the
- 2 scene I think based on your question there is an
- 3 underreporting, it's much higher.
- I can tell you definitively and I know
- 5 we have the new captain here who responds to our
- 6 barricaded gunmen situations, those crisis-type
- 7 calls, most of them being family, sometimes it's
- 8 intoxicants, other times it's mental illness, but
- 9 more times than not it's someone suffering who's
- 10 having a crisis.
- 11 COMMISSIONER BURTON: Through the
- 12 Chair. Question, do you think that social
- 13 workers would make a greater impact going out on
- 14 those mental health runs with officers?
- 15 CAPT. RUSSELL: Through the Chair, we
- 16 do have a program in downtown where social
- 17 workers do work with law enforcement and provide
- 18 those services. We also have those services
- 19 available through CAPPA as well, sir.
- 20 COMMISSIONER BURTON: No, the question
- 21 is do you feel that social workers would make a
- 22 better impact going out on the mental health runs
- 23 as well as domestic violence runs with officers
- 24 being the first contact where the officer --
- 25 CAPT. RUSSELL: Through the Chair, I



Page 85

- 1 think that any additional assistance in response
- 2 to bettering the department with mental health is
- 3 of course welcomed.
- 4 COMMISSIONER BURTON: Minneapolis, you
- 5 know, they started a pilot program where officers
- 6 was working with social workers going out on
- 7 those mental health runs and domestic violence
- 8 and the program actually worked in Minneapolis.
- 9 I think that looking at situations here
- 10 with some of the officers performance coming in
- 11 contact with those that may need treatment
- 12 instead of a beat-down like we witnessed here at
- 13 Receiving Hospital I think social workers will
- 14 play a better role going out on calls or runs
- 15 with officers as we saw what took place in
- 16 Minneapolis with their pilot program a few years
- 17 back.
- 18 CAPT. RUSSELL: Through the Chair, we
- 19 welcome any additional training or experience
- 20 that we could bring to the Detroit Police
- 21 Department. Our job, of course, is to always
- 22 assist the citizens and become better at what we
- 23 do every day, sir, so that's something we can
- 24 look into.
- 25 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: Thank you for the



- 1 report, I really appreciate that. I can
- 2 understand the training. My concern is, you
- 3 know, when things are going on downtown the
- 4 mentally ill and the homeless went to Midtown.
- 5 Midtown started taking -- start developing, then
- 6 they move to my town, North End and I see so much
- 7 of it, that prevalent more so than ever before.
- 8 My question is this. For example, if
- 9 you got 4,000 people here, whether armed or
- 10 unarmed, where do you take me? If I'm acting
- 11 erratic and my wife or son or daughter told you
- 12 that I have a mental problem, where do you take
- me? Where do you take these 4,000 people?
- 14 CAPT. RUSSELL: Through the Chair, we
- 15 take it Detroit Receiving Crisis Center and if
- 16 that is full we look for other crisis centers
- 17 throughout the city and sometimes suburban areas
- 18 depending on what the housing availability is,
- 19 sir.
- 20 COMMISSIONER HOLLEY: And that's great.
- 21 I just feel for me and FOR this Board and maybe
- 22 just for me, I would like to have a little bit
- 23 more -- if give me an idea of what happens from
- 24 beginning to end and where are we with that in
- 25 terms of the mental health facilities because my



- 1 understanding is that we have a lot of mental
- 2 health in the jails and that's not where they
- 3 should be.
- 4 And so I'm asking you -- I hear you and
- 5 I think you're doing -- you're absolutely -- I
- 6 might not be able to explain it like I really
- 7 want to articulate it, but I am concerned that on
- 8 the back end where do you take me? How do I get
- 9 help? How do I basically -- revolving door where
- 10 I end up -- I see the same six to 12 people every
- 11 single week after they go and they come right
- 12 back.
- 13 CAPT. RUSSELL: Through the Chair, so
- 14 first and foremost anytime we get a police run
- 15 and it's dealing with someone who suffers from
- 16 mental illness, of course we find out, we do an
- 17 investigation. We more than likely take them
- 18 down to the Crisis Center. We would petition
- 19 those individuals and with that being said, the
- 20 fact that we don't have mental health housing
- 21 here in the state of Michigan, that option was
- 22 taken from us by Governor Engler some time ago.
- So that's why you're seeing the
- 24 constant turnover rate of the same individual
- 25 back on the street. There's a group of homeless



- 1 population or mentally ill who do not want help
- 2 and so sometimes there are times when we are
- 3 dispatched and we have to do some additional
- 4 counseling or convince them to get help.
- 5 It doesn't always work in our
- 6 advantage, but you're seeing the turnover rate
- 7 due to the fact that mental institutions have
- 8 been closed in the state of Michigan.
- 9 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: I was going to
- 10 make a statement and, Commissioner Holley, I
- 11 agree with everything that she just said and we
- 12 all know that mental health has been
- deprioritized in this state, I personally feel
- 14 that way, and I think it's caused an undue burden
- on a lot of the police and law enforcement across
- 16 the state.
- 17 And there's only so much that our
- 18 police department can do and it sounds like we're
- 19 doing the best we can with the resources we have
- 20 available. I know I've talked to organizations
- 21 like NSO, everybody is burdened with the same
- 22 problem and so I think if people are very
- 23 passionate around this issue I would implore
- 24 everybody including the audience to their state
- 25 legislature and work with them on legislature and



- 1 funding to get this problem resolved at a macro
- 2 level.
- 3 There are some things that this Board
- 4 just does not have jurisdiction over, but we do
- 5 the best we can with what we have and I think
- 6 this is one of those issues. I commend officers
- 7 who deal with this every day and I agree that
- 8 training is absolutely necessary so we don't end
- 9 up with situations where we criminalize
- 10 unnecessarily mentally ill population.
- But I would implore everybody who are
- 12 very serious about this topic to put their money
- 13 where their mouth is and go call somebody or make
- 14 something happen outside of this meeting.
- 15 CAPT. RUSSELL: Through the Chair, I
- 16 appreciate that and with that being said when we
- 17 talk about additional training, DPD is doing it
- 18 doing intervention through bringing the Crisis
- 19 Intervention Team rollout to benefit and work
- 20 more closely with making sure that we stay in
- 21 compliance while we're resolving these issues.
- 22 A lot of our homeless population and
- 23 mentally ill are mixed together now with the
- 24 mental institutions not being provided in the
- 25 state of Michigan.



- 1 COMMISSIONER BELL: Yes, sir.
- 2 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Capt. Russell,
- 3 thank you for this report. Thank you for just
- 4 taking the time to dive into the mental illness
- 5 thing. On the 8-hour block, that's the one
- 6 that's developed by DPD?
- 7 CAPT. RUSSELL: Yes, sir.
- 8 COMMISSIONER BROWN: How often is that
- 9 revised or updated and are we working with -- I
- 10 think it's Councilman McAllister has a Mental
- 11 Illness Task Force. Are we working with
- 12 individuals or organizations like that through
- 13 those channels to help keep that updated with the
- 14 most relevant information and techniques for
- 15 dealing with those situations?
- 16 CAPT. RUSSELL: Through the Chair, yes,
- 17 we are, sir. We're working with several
- 18 different partners and, of course, we're
- 19 constantly updating yearly because, as I said,
- 20 we're developing the Crisis Intervention Team
- 21 reaching out to other agencies in addition to
- 22 other states and we just sent officers to Seattle
- 23 last week to get some additional training on how
- 24 to curb mental illness in the city of Detroit.
- 25 COMMISSIONER BROWN: All right, thank



- 1 you.
- 2 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Through the Chair,
- 3 you mentioned early on that there are other
- 4 people who take the training along with the
- 5 police officers, did I understand?
- 6 CAPT. RUSSELL: Through the Chair, so
- 7 when we do the rollout, ma'am, for the Crisis
- 8 Intervention Team this a county initiative, so
- 9 that means that other departments within Wayne
- 10 County will be a part of that initiative. And
- 11 the reason why I keep stipulating that is so that
- 12 you can understand it's just not DPD.
- These numbers are determined by Wayne
- 14 County Health, so we will hopefully get the
- 15 majority of the seats by us being the largest
- 16 department in Wayne County, but we don't know for
- 17 sure.
- 18 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Then it is only for
- 19 law enforcement?
- 20 CAPT. RUSSELL: That's correct, ma'am,
- 21 law enforcement agencies within Wayne County.
- 22 COMMISSIONER HOLT: Okay, thank you.
- 23 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you for a well
- 24 thought-out report. We can only do so much on
- 25 the front end and going people to Receiving



- 1 Hospital Crisis Center has been forever, but the
- 2 bottom line, Chief Craig has pointed out over and
- 3 over again we have social workers in each
- 4 precinct, not just one, and in some instances two
- 5 dealing with social work and domestic violence.
- 6 That's been ongoing a long period of time.
- 7 So you need to be cognizant of that
- 8 effort that we are trying to make on the back end
- 9 once we contact. We don't have the ability to
- 10 roll out social workers with police officers. We
- 11 have a tough time rolling out police officers, so
- 12 -- but we doing the best we can in this
- 13 particular area, so thank you once again on
- 14 behalf of the Board.
- 15 CAPT. RUSSELL: Through the Chair,
- 16 thank you, sir, and thank you, Board.
- 17 COMMISSIONER BELL: Any standing and ad
- 18 hoc committee reports? Mr. Hicks?
- 19 SECRETARY HICKS: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
- 20 I want to draw your attention to the two items
- 21 that are listed on the agenda as incoming items.
- 22 Both of these items are items in which you've
- 23 already reviewed or discussed in the meeting, so
- 24 unless you have any specific questions of me I
- 25 would not have any additional items to report on



- 1 this evening.
- 2 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you. Old
- 3 business?
- 4 COMMISSIONER BURTON: Through the
- 5 Chair, under old business I got a couple of
- 6 items. Ne item was based off of the National
- 7 Association of Civilian Law Enforcement Training
- 8 that's coming up. For some reason in my folder I
- 9 ended up with a ticket -- registration ticket of
- 10 Darryl Brown, former past Vice-Chair.
- How is hat mix-up because I still don't
- 12 have my ticket, but I ended up with a folder a
- 13 few weeks ago with Darryl Brown -- Commissioner
- 14 Brown's ticket in my folder.
- 15 COMMISSIONER BELL: Speak with Mr.
- 16 Hicks after the meeting, please. I have no idea.
- 17 COMMISSIONER BURTON: Also under old
- 18 business, I move -- I put a motion out there last
- 19 week and I'll put it out here again this week, I
- 20 move that the Board of Police Commissioners move
- 21 our meetings out of police headquarters, move
- them to the community so we won't be in violation
- 23 of the Open Meetings Act.
- 24 A number of citizens are being
- 25 discouraged from coming down here because they



- 1 have to show ID. There's a cause and effect in
- 2 the Open Meetings Act where all meetings are open
- 3 -- all public meeting are open to the public, so,
- 4 you know, and there shouldn't be ID asked for
- 5 individuals coming down to this meeting.
- 6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: Point of order.
- 7 His motion and discussion are being mixed. I
- 8 think we need to stick to the agenda and make the
- 9 motion and then we can have discussion following
- 10 that. Roberts Rules of Order which I believe
- 11 we're governed by.
- 12 COMMISSIONER BELL: Yes, ma'am, that is
- 13 correct. You're making a statement or you're
- 14 making a motion?
- 15 COMMISSIONER BURTON: So I move that we
- 16 move Board of Police Commissioners meetings to
- 17 the community, move them away from police
- 18 headquarters so we can be in compliance of the
- 19 Open Meetings Act. Once again, we are being
- 20 violated each week when we meet.
- 21 COMMISSIONER BELL: Now you're making a
- 22 statement. Make a clear motion.
- 23 COMMISSIONER BURTON: The motion is I
- 24 move to we move our Board of Police Commissioners
- 25 meetings from police headquarters into the



- 1 community so we can be in compliance with the
- 2 Open Meetings Act.
- 3 COMMISSIONER BROWN: I second the
- 4 motion.
- 5 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Been properly
- 6 move and seconded. Any discussion?
- 7 COMMISSIONER BURCH: Discussion? Mr.
- 8 Chair, this has been before the Board before and
- 9 we took a vote, so why are we repeating? This is
- 10 my question, sir.
- We already said no, we did not want to
- 12 go from this building by vote, did we not?
- 13 COMMISSIONER BELL: Yes, ma'am.
- 14 COMMISSIONER BURCH: So why we doing it
- 15 again?
- 16 COMMISSIONER BELL: I agree. I guess
- 17 we can entertain a motion to vote it down again.
- 18 COMMISSIONER BURTON: Move for record
- 19 roll call vote, Mr. Chair.
- 20 COMMISSIONER BELL: Sir. That is out of
- 21 order. Those in favor of the motion.
- THREE COMMISSIONERS: Aye.
- COMMISSIONER BELL: Those opposed?
- 24 FIVE COMMISSIONERS: Nav.
- 25 COMMISSIONER BURTON: We had a few



- 1 people on the Board, Mr. Chairman, that didn't
- 2 take a vote that was silent, so that's why I
- 3 called for a record roll call vote.
- 4 COMMISSIONER BELL: Sir, that does not
- 5 meet the required roll call.
- 6 SECRETARY HICKS: Mr. Chair, I recorded
- 7 five people voting against and three in support
- 8 and the motion fails.
- 9 COMMISSIONER BELL: Motion fails, thank
- 10 you. We can move on.
- 11 COMMISSIONER BURCH: New business,
- 12 Mr. Chair. I would like to share with the 3rd
- 13 District that we are having a Cop on the Block
- 14 event on this Saturday with our commander and
- 15 NPOs who is Comm. Slappy from 12 o'clock to 2 on
- 16 Marx Street and Lance.
- 17 They neighbors out there that live on
- 18 Dequindre, Marx and Orleans please come out and
- 19 just chitchat with our commander, Cop on the
- 20 Block. You can call me; thank you.
- 21 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIE: Through the
- 22 Chair, I just wanted to say thank you to the
- 23 Detroit Police Department. In my neighborhood
- 24 there was a rash -- there had been a recent rash
- 25 of break-ins. I think I mentioned that at one of



- 1 the meetings and I got a call from one of the --
- 2 from the Commander and she said that there had
- 3 been an arrest made in the neighborhood so there
- 4 was some definite action taken and I informed
- 5 some of my neighbors and everybody is very
- 6 excited to hear that the police department has
- 7 stepped up and make sure that we are addressing
- 8 that issue, so thank you.
- 9 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you.
- 10 COMMISSIONER BURTON: Through the
- 11 Chair, so, you know, I move that --
- 12 COMMISSIONER BELL: Is this an
- 13 announcement, sir?
- 14 COMMISSIONER BURTON: No, there was old
- 15 business, there was new business, I'm putting
- 16 something out there under new business.
- 17 COMMISSIONER BELL: New business has
- 18 been closed, we moved on to announcements.
- 19 COMMISSIONER BURTON: You went old
- 20 business.
- 21 COMMISSIONER BELL: I went new business
- 22 too.
- 23 COMMISSIONER BURTON: I have a motion
- 24 out there for new business.
- 25 COMMISSIONER BELL: We on



- 1 announcements, sir. Our next meeting is
- 2 Thursday, September 12, 2019 at 6:30 PM, the 4th
- 3 Precinct at Kennedy Recreation Center, 2260 South
- 4 Fort Street.
- 5 Our next community meeting in October
- 6 will be Thursday, October 10, 2019, 6:30 PM, 7th
- 7 Precinct, St. John Presbyterian Church, 1961 East
- 8 Lafayette.
- 9 We move on to oral communications with
- 10 public comments. Mr. Brown.
- 11 MR. ROBERT BROWN: Mr. Chair, I
- 12 currently have have 11 cards. Is it possible
- 13 before I call the first speaker that we can have
- 14 them all line up over there as but I call them?
- 15 COMMISSIONER BELL: That would be
- 16 great.
- 17 MR. ROBERT BROWN: Ms. Bernice Smith,
- 18 Mr. Ed Blount, Mr. Eric Williams, Ms. Karen
- 19 Gordon, Ms. Tawana Petty, Ms. Brenda Hill, Ms.
- 20 Consuela Lopez, Mr. Bryan Ferguson, Dr. David
- 21 Dudenhoefer, Mr. John Doe and Ms. Michelle
- 22 George.
- Your first speaker will be Ms. Bernice
- 24 Smith.
- 25 COMMISSIONER BELL: We have 1 speakers?



- 1 MR. ROBERT BROWN: Yes, sir.
- 2 COMMISSIONER BELL: And we have two
- 3 minutes speaking. We appreciate that you abide
- 4 by the time frame and respect the process; thank
- 5 you.
- 6 MS. SMITH: Good afternoon. Bernice
- 7 Smith. I just want to make an announcement in
- 8 regards to what happened Sunday at church was
- 9 very pleasing. The subject with the minister
- 10 saying pleasing him and he stated that there are
- 11 a lot of people who have no real concern for
- 12 anybody but themselves, their involvement with
- 13 people is self serving. They often view people
- 14 as pawns and opportunities. Self pleasing has a
- 15 sense of community and there is no we or us in
- 16 our vocabulary. So I'll end with that.
- I just want to let you know that I am
- 18 delighted to give you the good news that the
- 19 squatters are gone due to the fact of Chief Hope
- 20 has a wonderful job, her and Sgt. Hewitt. I gave
- 21 them this information in regards to the squatters
- 22 and also the man on the other side two doors down
- 23 with 10 cars in his garage -- in his yard. All
- 24 of that has been taken care of and, Chief, I just
- 25 want to let you know I am so thrilled I don't



- 1 know what to do because it's a pleasure to go
- 2 down the street now and don't have to see the
- 3 squatters outside on the porch and all the people
- 4 that's around in that area and cars all in the
- 5 area.
- 6 And I wish you would give her to chance
- 7 to -- you and Bettison, give her a chance to be
- 8 the Commander, you know. You gave some
- 9 promotions this morning about the other election,
- 10 so let's give her a chance to do something
- 11 because she's doing a wonderful job in all
- 12 sincerity.
- I think that you should give her a
- 14 chance to go up the ladder a little bit. And
- 15 also we do have the drug situation that we're
- 16 going to be dealing with next, so I just want to
- 17 let you know. Thank you so much for your
- 18 cooperation and I'm really thrilled because the
- 19 people in the neighborhood, they're thrilled
- 20 also.
- Take care, thank you so much.
- 22 MR. BLOUNT: Good afternoon, Board and
- 23 Chief. For the record, my name is Eric Blount, a
- 24 lifelong Detroiter and it is just so painfully
- 25 obvious that this facial recognition technology



- 1 is being pushed through as fast as possible.
- 2 The whole requirement of equality that
- 3 people of color be treated and be recognized just
- 4 as accurately as everyone else should be a
- 5 non-starter from the beginning, but this was
- 6 approved by not all members of City Council. But
- 7 enough to be approved and then the policy was
- 8 submitted.
- 9 It is just still -- and then on top of
- 10 that no federal, state or city regulations.
- 11 There's every reason in the world to stop and
- 12 pause and think and make sure we're getting this
- 13 thing right, especially when it discriminates
- 14 against people of color.
- And then the occupant of the White
- 16 House, at any point in time he can declare a
- 17 national emergency and require you to do anything
- 18 and everything he wants you to do with this
- 19 technology and you'll have to comply with federal
- 20 regulations.
- 21 Rev. Holley, you made a comment about
- 22 the update for Cpl. Jones. I was one of the
- 23 community members that met with Chief Craig and a
- 24 dozen of his appointees. We reviewed the
- 25 additional tape that he had. Many of us



- 1 including Commissioner Bell were not persuaded by
- 2 the additional information. It just seemed to be
- 3 more of the same.
- 4 So in light of transparency which the
- 5 Chief said he is a proponent of, I will request
- 6 that the Chief release the video that reporter
- 7 Gregory Hunter from The Detroit News did video
- 8 record the whole meeting, except the video that
- 9 had some graphic and some foul language in it,
- 10 but in light of that you may be able to
- 11 understand more of ow the meeting went, why
- 12 various people did not agree that there were any
- 13 more or different information that would change
- 14 our opinion.
- 15 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you, sir.
- MR. ROBERT BROWN: Mr. Williams.
- 17 MR. WILLIAMS: Hi, good afternoon. My
- 18 name is Eric Williams, I'm an attorney with the
- 19 Detroit Justice Center here in Detroit. So I
- 20 just wanted to say first I commend the Board of
- 21 Commissioners for taking the time to become
- 22 educated about the technology and how it's used
- 23 in other places. What I would also say is that
- the information you've gotten that come from only
- one source and that's from -- basically from the



- 1 police, that it would actually probably be only
- 2 fair and enhance your own knowledge of the issue
- 3 to receive essentially a presentation from those
- 4 who are opposed to the use of facial recognition
- 5 technology.
- I think we've come a very long way
- 7 looking at the policies and procedures that were
- 8 proposed kind of where we are today as to where
- 9 we were, say, a month ago. This evolution shows
- 10 that there really is lot more to think about than
- 11 what we're hearing from the police department.
- I would also say everybody acknowledges
- that there's a problem with how facial
- 14 recognition technology could be used, so the
- 15 solution it seems to me is to never build a
- 16 system that would allow you to do the things we
- 17 think are problematic.
- If we're going to insist on only using
- 19 it for still photos as a tool sort of after the
- 20 fact, then do not buy a system with the
- 21 capability to do the things we don't want done.
- 22 That seems tone to be a pretty straightforward
- 23 solution to it.
- I would also say this. One, Los
- 25 Angeles with a population of roughly 4 million



- 1 had 259 murders in 2018. They do not use facial
- 2 recognition technology as of June this year.
- 3 Detroit had 261 or so homicides over
- 4 the same period with a quarter of the population.
- 5 I'd also say the city of New York which does use
- 6 facial recognition technology has been caught up
- 7 in court on numerous occasions for its
- 8 unconstitutional use of facial recognition
- 9 technology and as someone who lived there for 15
- 10 years probably the most brutal police department
- 11 I've ever encountered.
- 12 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you.
- MR. ROBERT BROWN: Ms. Gordon?
- MS. GORDON: Hi, I let Dr. Rivere know
- 15 that she sent me a letter from the office of
- investigation and I don't know what she watched,
- 17 but it wasn't the one I sent to her because she
- 18 wanted to justify what the police did.
- 19 One, they had riders with them. They
- 20 destroyed my property. That's in the video. She
- 21 didn't see that. They stood around, they laughed
- 22 at me, they talked about me. She didn't see
- 23 that. They bumped each other five, she didn't
- 24 see that which I did actually talk to her
- 25 supervisor.



- 1 And then another thing is, I don't now
- 2 if y'all don't want to know or y'all don't care.
- 3 I drive around because I have a lot of doctor
- 4 appointments to different cities.
- 5 I see more Detroit cops in different
- 6 cities than I do in Detroit, and that's said.
- 7 And my thing is, if you want to fix the problem,
- 8 make sure that they on their job or they would be
- 9 there.
- 10 I done lived in two different cities
- 11 and I have never seen cops out of their area.
- 12 Put a GPS on them, check them to see if they been
- 13 drinking because that wouldn't take nothing. To
- 14 blow when they come in, to blow when they off
- 15 duty because half of them not on their job.
- 16 That's why they don't come to response and I bet
- 17 you if you put a GPS the response time would get
- 18 100 percent better.
- 19 And Police Chief Craig, I'm asking you
- 20 to look at that video that -- the police body cam
- 21 video and tell me the same thing she said, that
- 22 it was okay what the police officer did to me
- 23 that day. I'm asking you, I don't want your
- 24 homies to look hat it because you have to see it
- 25 for yourself because I want you a tell me in your



- 1 words that what they did was not -- was a police
- 2 officer should do to a person.
- 3 And then what the -- I'm just saying it
- 4 don't make no sense the way the police officer
- 5 treat people, not all of them.
- 6 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you.
- 7 MR. ROBERT BROWN: Ms. Petty.
- 8 MS. PETTY: I'm here as usual to ask
- 9 the Board of Police Commissioners to vote no on
- 10 DPD use of facial recognition. However, I must
- 11 also state that this is not a Detroit issue, a
- 12 Michigan issue or even a United States issue.
- The issue of police use of facial
- 14 recognition is a global issue with insurmountable
- 15 implications for the detriment of our civil and
- 16 human rights and liberties.
- 17 Today dozens of national organizations
- 18 representing over 15 million people across the
- 19 United States launched a campaign to ban facial
- 20 recognition.
- This will be followed by various grass
- 22 roots organizational campaigns to put pressure on
- 23 legislatures to get behind local, state and
- 24 federal bills currently pending in responsive
- 25 jurisdictions. The house bill in Michigan, the



- 1 senate bill in Michigan, the two federal bills in
- 2 Michigan and the City Council ordinances
- 3 specifically related to Detroit.
- 4 I am confident that if we get rid of
- 5 this pervasive racially biased flawed biometric
- 6 technology we can put our heads together to think
- 7 of true ways to create safety in our
- 8 neighborhoods that don't include watch lists,
- 9 databases and facial recognition surveillance.
- 10 Once again, I am asking you all to vote
- 11 no; thank you.
- 12 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you.
- MR. ROBERT BROWN: Ms. Hill.
- 14 MS. HILL: My name is Brenda Hill and
- 15 I'd like to speak about Officer Young's statement
- 16 from last meeting and he was not on the agenda
- 17 and he was allowed to go more than seven minutes
- 18 and talk about facial recognition technology.
- I believe that violates the Open
- 20 Meetings Act as well. This meeting continuing to
- 21 be in this building is a violation of the Open
- 22 Meetings Act. I don't have a problem with the
- 23 building's rules, they absolutely need to be in
- 24 place here. We do need safety in this building,
- 25 but this meeting is a public meeting. It falls



- 1 under different rules and it needs not to be in
- 2 this building. That is the problem and we need
- 3 to do something about it sooner rather than
- 4 later. We don't need to wait on corporate
- 5 counsel to give you an answer to something that
- 6 is so clear.
- 7 And you have opportunity after
- 8 opportunity when Commissioner Burton brings it
- 9 before the floor to say no, we don't need to be
- 10 in this building. I'll help you get another
- 11 place until you get an answer from corporate
- 12 counsel. I don't know of any time there's been a
- 13 threat to anybody in this room, so why are we
- 14 running scared of the public. We need to stop
- 15 that.
- And as far as facial recognition, I'm
- 17 from New York as well. The police officers have
- 18 hundreds of lawsuits against the police
- 19 department in New York about the use of facial
- 20 recognition technology. We don't need to be
- 21 under that list until we do better.
- 22 Right now all of the evidence says that
- 23 black folks are in trouble on the facial
- 24 recognition technology. I'm going to leave my
- 25 black grandson here. There's no way that I want



- 1 one person, especially him, to be pulled into a
- 2 situation using facial recognition technology.
- 3 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you.
- 4 MS. HILL: Officer Young went on and on
- 5 and on. We all should have that same right.
- 6 MR. ROBERT BROWN: Ms. Lopez.
- 7 MS. LOPEZ: Hola, my name is Consuela
- 8 Lopez. I am the elected Co-Chair of LPAC for
- 9 Southeast Michigan, Law Enforcement and Community
- 10 Relations as well as executive director of AMOTLA
- 11 which is Law Enforcement and Community Advocacy
- 12 and Engagement Group.
- 13 All summer we've -- we host a meeting
- 14 at the 3rd Precinct with local, state and federal
- 15 law enforcement, hospitals, Detroit Public
- 16 Schools PD and Transit Police in regards to
- 17 coordinating and creating our efforts in regards
- 18 to anti-trafficking. So I would like to invite
- 19 you Police Commissioners as well as Chief Craig
- 20 to our next meeting which is going to be
- 21 September 25 at the 3rd Precinct at 4.
- I would like to share with you our
- assessments and our suggested recommendations
- 24 that will help support DPD in serving our
- 25 community. There's two issues that continue to



- 1 happen that we do not like.
- 2 And that one that happened here
- 3 actually at HQ is the lack of sensitivity and
- 4 compassion. I actually represent to advocate for
- 5 the immigrant community and so what happens is
- 6 that, say, last week we had a missing child out
- 7 of the 8th Precinct and how she was treated, the
- 8 mother, was just appalling.
- 9 And what I find with the immigrant
- 10 community is that when crime is happening against
- 11 them they already don't have a healthy
- 12 relationship with law enforcement and they are
- 13 afraid and so when I wanted to advocate for her
- 14 to come here to talk to you all, she was afraid.
- 15 And so we have to -- and I'm willing to work with
- 16 you continuously to bridge this gap to create a
- 17 better understanding and that's basically it.
- 18 And so the one relationship with all
- 19 the chiefs that I have Chief Craig, you're the
- 20 only one I don't have a professional relationship
- 21 and I would like to request an audience so I can
- 22 talk to you guys more in detail on what we've
- 23 been doing successfully. Thank you.
- MR. ROBERT BROWN: Mr. Ferguson.
- MR. FERGUSON: Good afternoon. Y name



- 1 is Bryan Ferguson, I'm the president of
- 2 Schoolcraft Improvement Association.
- I say bring on facial recognition.
- 4 After hearing the presentation and the policies,
- 5 I'm for it. They say it's not being legislated
- 6 right. Now it's time to right it. We could be
- 7 in the forefront of this. We could write their
- 8 policy and if we need to start changing up as we
- 9 can, let's do it.
- In my neighborhood we have cameras.
- 11 When they first brought -- Chief Craig first
- 12 brought first Green Light we loved it, we loved
- 13 it. We put them up in our neighborhoods. My
- 14 block is well known. It's called the green light
- 15 block. You don't come down our street. I have
- 16 one of the safest blocks in the city of Detroit,
- 17 I can honestly say that.
- 18 I life within the 6th Precinct. You
- 19 don't come down our street. You will be caught.
- 20 Those cameras will catch you because my neighbors
- 21 are older people and they don't see that good,
- 22 they don't. By the time they get to the end of
- 23 the block they don't wear blue when they probably
- 24 had on red. But those cameras are not going to
- 25 lie, they going to catch you, and they will keep



- 1 asking, keep asking the police need help.
- I'm here to help. So whatever I have
- 3 to do to make sure this thing gets passed, I'll
- 4 scream to the highest heaven because technology
- 5 is here. We were here before with DNA. I don't
- 6 want them grabbing my glass after I touched it,
- 7 right. So why not do a facial recognition.
- And if we get it wrong, let them go.
- 9 If the thing is not there, let them go point
- 10 blank. It's just that easy. So Chief, Board,
- 11 you vote on it, I'm for it; thank you.
- 12 MR. ROBERT BROWN: Mr. Dudenhoefer.
- MR. DUDENHOEFER: My name is David
- 14 Dudenhoefer, the elected Chair of the 13th
- 15 District Republican Committee and I appreciate
- 16 being a part of this and I thank all of you for
- 17 your comments, and it was an interesting
- 18 conversation. I did learn a few things that I
- 19 was in the dark about before and I will schedule
- 20 an appointment to see the facility so that I can
- 21 speak intelligently to it.
- 22 There are a few concerns that folks
- 23 that I'm involved with have. Obviously they feel
- 24 this could be some sort of a Trojan horse of we
- 25 welcome it in today because it's very benevolent



- 1 and you folks have good intentions in mind, I'm
- 2 not questioning any of your intentions at all
- 3 including the Chief.
- 4 But years from now what could this
- 5 incrementally evolve into or devolve into is the
- 6 concern that some folks have.
- 7 And Chief spoke to the fact that we
- 8 really can't put an officer on every corner, how
- 9 would you protect every citizen from crime and
- 10 yet, maybe not in the room, but some public
- 11 servants in heavily densely populated areas would
- 12 just assume take the ability for citizens to
- 13 defend themselves away from them including guns
- 14 and what have you.
- So how do you reconcile that gap
- 16 between being able to defend yourself and not
- 17 rely on an officer on the phone or a camera in
- 18 the air, but to be able to defend yourself as a
- 19 means of bringing crime down.
- 20 So that's something that public
- 21 servants are going to have to reconcile I think.
- 22 The only other thing I'm concerned with is the
- 23 technology itself and how it came about, because
- 24 it is projected an \$11.6 billion a year industry
- 25 I think some 2030.



- 1 Was it something that was lobbied to
- 2 the City because we saw this with the -- when I
- 3 fought red light cameras in Lansing. That the
- 4 two photo radar camera companies located in
- 5 Arizona were spending lots of money lobbying
- 6 these different municipalities to take this on
- 7 and then of course we found out what sort of
- 8 flaws they had, and then state legislators ended
- 9 up removing them.
- 10 So I just want to make sure that that's
- 11 not something that's happening here, that it's
- 12 being pushed on your folks that you need this.
- But anyway my time is done, but thank
- 14 you for the robust conversation, appreciate it.
- MR. DOE: I do live in the 3rd
- 16 District. Welcome. So I listened to the
- 17 presentation. I was all about talking about the
- 18 Open Meetings Act violation of entering into the
- 19 building and I can say that that's been covered.
- 20 What I did not see in the presentation
- 21 was any notification to the Board of importing
- 22 new base level identifying images as to, A, the
- 23 source of information, or, B, the grading of the
- 24 source overall and if individual source images
- 25 are graded in quality that was missing.



- 1 Two, regarding the cross-referencing
- 2 and matches to identify additional information
- 3 which could pen a suspect with probable cause,
- 4 there should be a grading threshold of offenses
- 5 which should be available for that
- 6 cross-referencing that would be subject to
- 7 authorization by the Board as to what levels of
- 8 offense would be potentially cross-referencable.
- 9 No. 3, I think the fact the
- 10 community-induced trauma by federal agency
- 11 actions should be included in your mental health
- 12 incidents. We do have some issues with the fact
- 13 that we are a border city and that we are being
- 14 preyed upon by federal agencies.
- 15 It does create community trauma. Thank
- 16 you.
- 17 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you.
- 18 MS. ROBERT BROWN: Ms. Michelle George
- 19 and, Mr. Chair, that will be your last speaker.
- 20 MS. GEORGE: To Chairman Bell and to
- 21 this Honorable Board, hi Chief Craig -- to Chief
- 22 Craig, briefly I want to -- before I get on the
- 23 facial recognition I wanted to bring up just an
- 24 open invitation in September I'm having a blood
- 25 pressure Sunday and I know it's been a lot of



- 1 stress on the officers, but we would like to know
- 2 everybody's blood pressure. Are your blood
- 3 pressure numbers causing a memory loss so I'll
- 4 bring more information on that I'm going to open
- 5 up to the officers coming as well to know their
- 6 blood pressure.
- 7 Also briefly in terms of last week it
- 8 was discussed about I guess investigators having
- 9 firearms, but I also wanted to add in addition to
- 10 that there's some concerns with the Chaplain
- 11 Corps that they would also like when they go for
- 12 the aftercare program dealing with residents who
- 13 have been involved with domestic violence they do
- 14 not carry firearms and there's a concern among
- 15 the Chaplain Corps.
- So, Chief Craig, Deputy Chief Bettison
- 17 I just wanted to offer that consideration to have
- 18 maybe where the officers can carry firearms.
- 19 Also I'm going to add as well -- now to
- 20 talk about facial recognition, my concern is I've
- 21 done a lot of research on it. You need to look
- 22 at the hearings that was in Washington, D.C.
- 23 where the senior advisor from Georgetown
- 24 University talked about it and apparently on the
- 25 federal level it was implemented by



- 1 recommendations that was not included, and the
- 2 concerns is with this facial recognition there
- 3 are a lot of concerns with being unreliable and
- 4 misidentification among dark complexion persons
- 5 as well as young people and as well as women.
- 6 So you start looking at that, I went to
- 7 the Michigan Commission of Civil Rights to file a
- 8 complaint, but they're looking into a hearing
- 9 with facial recognition and also to City Council,
- 10 so you need to look at because you're going to
- 11 open yourselves up to a lawsuit.
- 12 She was on a national news talking
- 13 about the concerns, but that is true. It targets
- dark complexion people as well as women and women
- 15 need to be upset as well, so if you're coming to
- 16 the City Council meeting we will be talking about
- on Tuesday and there's a townhall meeting today.
- 18 Thank you.
- 19 MR. ROBERT BROWN: That's your last
- 20 speaker, Mr. Chair.
- 21 COMMISSIONER BELL: Thank you for your
- 22 attendance. If there's no other business here,
- 23 we'll entertain a motion for adjournment.
- 24 COMMISSIONERS: So moved.
- 25 COMMISSIONER BELL: Properly moved.



1	Discussion?	Those in	favor	aye.		
2	CO	MMISSIONE	RS: Ay	ye.		
3		( I	Proceed	dings	concluded	at
4	5:23 p.m.)					
5						
6						
7						
8						
9						
10						
11						
12						
13						
14						
15						
16						
17						
18						
19						
20						
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						

1	CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER				
2					
3					
4	STATE OF MICHIGAN )				
5	) SS				
6	COUNTY OF WAYNE )				
7					
8	I HEREBY CERTIFY that I reported				
9	stenographically the foregoing proceedings at the				
10	time and place hereinbefore set forth; that				
11	thereafter the same was reduced to computer				
12	transcription and that this is a full, true,				
13	complete and correct transcription of said				
14	proceedings.				
15	4 4				
16	all coll				
17	way to				
18	DALE E. ROSE CSR-0087				
19	Notary Public,				
20	Wayne County, Michigan				
21					
22					
23	My Commission expires: 7-15-24				
24					



25

\$

**\$11.6** 113:24

22:8 41:2 43:1,2 44:17 48:12 64:23 67:23 98:25

10:17 35:15 81:23 98:6 99:23

10,000 69:13

100 105:18

10th 20:4,13

11:1 24:14 50:15 77:23 98:12

24:12 87:10 96:15 98:2

**13th** 112:14

20:3,12 81:23

14th 49:25 50:4

104:9 106:18

81:2,7

24:19

64:12

64:10

32:12 40:19

32:13 72:18 78:10

98:7

73:15

21:19

20:3

20:7

**1st** 6:15 18:3,21 20:8 22:2 32:22 33:9,10,11 35:3,17 36:24 49:24 50:3 58:6,11 81:1

15:11 24:10,21 55:25 96:15

2.3 58:11

20:12

20:13,14

40:14

72:17 104:1

3:2 4:18,23 5:4 8:21 9:3 10:4 22:8 40:19 41:1 98:2,6

2020 67:3,6 82:12

2030 113:25

**20s** 24:16

20:7

8:20

98:3

41:25

9:3 19:18 64:19 69:7

109:21

104:1

26 8:20 10:4

104:3

41:1

39:5

4:23 5:4

2nd 70:15,17

4:2 7:23 24:17,23 30:24 115:9

**3,000** 35:21 36:7

**3,365** 29:18

20:22 21:6 35:13 70:5

75:22

**30.5** 58:11

**307.5** 14:4

**31st** 81:1

22:25 23:10

39:6

48:22

**38,000** 68:24

**3:01** 3:3

**3o+** 13:20

3rd 96:12 109:14,21 114:15

4:6 42:3 103:25 109:21

**4,000** 86:9,13

80:19 81:16 82:14

24:19

45th 8:23,25 9:2

48:21

**4:30** 15:16

4th 49:25 50:3 98:2

3:2 4:18 9:3 42:18 43:24

50:15

24:20

**5:23** 118:4

5th 20:15

3:6 21:19 44:14 75:24

75:19

83:1

**6:30** 7:24 98:2,6

**6th** 25:24 111:18

3:25 8:1 9:3 20:13,14 46:21

75:23

7th 20:18,19 21:24 98:6

8

8 8:1 46:25 58:4

8-hour 90:5

**85** 75:20

8th 110:7

9

9 56:24

98 64:25

9th 82:5

Α

abandoned 29:14

**abide** 99:3

ability 92:9 113:12

absence 15:17

absent 28:21

**absolutely** 35:17 68:19 87:5

89:8 107:23

abuse 74:23 79:4,15,18

AC 18:3 33:23

academy 14:23 20:4 21:21

33:16 37:9 77:19 78:11,19

accept 54:18

accepting 12:25

access 46:23

accountability 47:13 69:24

accountable 70:1

accurately 101:4

acknowledge 6:23 28:17

acknowledged 28:11

acknowledges 103:12

acknowledgment 28:9

09/05/2019

**Act** 11:8 93:23 94:2,19 95:2 107:20,22 114:18

acting 86:10

action 12:10 59:22 80:13 97:4

actions 115:11

activities 40:9 41:6,24

actual 39:21 40:1 46:9 59:15

ad 92:17

add 58:7 61:4 72:15 116:9,19

addendum 57:1

**addition** 64:18 67:22 78:6

79:7,22 90:21 116:9

**additional** 7:17 14:13 34:22 43:21 50:18 78:2,4 82:11,14

85:1,19 88:3 89:17 90:23 92:25 101:25 102:2 115:2

Additionally 47:4 79:16

address 32:3 44:16 45:5 74:9

addressed 45:3 57:4

addresses 53:14

addressing 44:15 72:1 97:7

adherence 48:3

adjournment 117:23

administrative 42:21

adopt 23:23

adults 51:6

advance 15:16

advanced 64:7,15

advantage 88:6

adversarial 36:6

advisement 14:9

advises 13:2

advising 80:14

**advisor** 116:23

advisory 11:7

Advocacy 109:11

advoc

advocate 110:4,13

advocated 52:12,21

affect 63:8

affected 79:11

afford 12:20 75:17 76:8

afraid 110:13.14

African-american 75:21

aftercare 116:12

afternoon 3:22,24 4:1,3 6:4,

10,11,24,25 18:2,3,10 33:10 39:14 76:18 99:6 100:22

102:17 110:25

agencies 46:23 58:18 62:5,11

90:21 91:21 115:14

agency 8:10 62:19 115:10

agenda 4:13,17 7:8 12:3 76:5,

15 92:21 94:8 107:16

agendas 12:2

Aggravated 24:18

agnostic 46:7

**agree** 32:15 37:14,22 64:5

65:2 75:3 76:13 88:11 89:7

95:16 102:12

agreed 19:15 76:13

agreements 9:13

agrees 71:25 74:17

ahead 76:23,25

aid 78:5

aids 80:21

**air** 113:18

**Akbar** 6:6 53:5

alcoholism 79:4

algorithm 46:7

aligned 74:1

allotted 15:11

allowed 43:13 107:17

**aloud** 58:5

**amendment** 37:8,10,19 50:3,4 58:6,11

**amendments** 10:11 46:4 49:25

America 69:2 75:19

**AMOTLA** 109:10

**amount** 34:16

analysis 41:7 50:12,13

analyst 65:12,22

analysts 64:19 66:16

analytics 49:19

**Andrew** 66:15

Angeles 9:14 69:11,12 103:25

**angry** 31:7

**Annie** 3:23

anniversary 8:25 9:2

**announcement** 76:7 97:13 99:7

**announcements** 76:4 97:18 98:1

announcing 11:3

annual 48:6,14 57:2

anti-trafficking 109:18

anticipate 48:19

anytime 87:14

apologize 15:15 32:8,9

appalling 110:8

apparently 58:16 116:24

appealed 29:6

**APPLAUSE** 6:21 16:12 17:1, 15 18:9,19 19:2 21:12 23:17 28:19 35:19

applicable 48:19

**appoint** 15:23 16:5,14,20 17:4,9

**appointed** 19:18 20:2,14 21:18

appointees 101:24

**appointment** 9:24 10:3 18:5, 16 19:13 112:20

appointments 105:4

appreciation 22:20 75:10

approach 77:10

approaching 8:16

appropriately 65:3 68:10

**approval** 4:24 13:23 46:1

**approve** 4:13,17 5:3 16:19

**approved** 40:16 44:13 46:5 101:6,7

approving 18:16 71:21

approx 3:3

**April** 21:19

aptitude 20:6 22:6

**area** 82:7 92:13 100:4,5 105:11

**areas** 12:21 42:5,11,12,15 45:18 86:17 113:11

argument 25:4

arguments 60:23

Arizona 114:5

armed 26:25 81:2 83:2 86:9

arranging 13:11

**arrest** 49:5 65:9,13 66:4 97:3

arrests 81:3

arrive 73:9

Article 7:25

articulate 66:17 87:7

assaults 24:17,18

assessments 109:23

assigned 13:9 20:4,15 80:17

assignment 20:6 26:4,17

assignments 11:4 20:8 22:7

assist 77:15 85:22

assistance 45:11 85:1

Assistant 22:1

**Association** 8:18 52:10,23 93:7 111:2

**Asst** 6:16 18:21 32:22 33:9,10, 11 35:3,17 36:24

**assume** 113:12

attached 51:9

attempted 57:16

**attend** 11:25

attendance 3:9 22:15 117:22

attended 41:18

attending 6:5

attention 92:20

attests 20:25

**attorney** 5:17 6:2 13:1 37:6 38:5 102:18

**audience** 12:18 15:4 30:19 57:20 88:24 110:21

audio-visual 5:14

audit 57:2,6,7

**audits** 42:17 45:19 46:25 47:15,16 56:20

**August** 4:23 5:4 10:4 20:3 41:2 81:1

authority 10:18 78:14 81:15

authorization 115:7

authorized 14:10

**Auto** 13:10

availability 30:5 86:18

average 78:10

**award** 21:5 22:15,16,18,19,20 23:9

awards 20:20 22:16 23:19

**Axon** 63:17

**aye** 4:20 5:6 16:9,23 17:12 24:2 95:22 118:1,2

В

bachelor's 33:20

back 9:21 15:6 28:23 29:23 31:10 39:7,8 44:12 45:4 47:25 54:19,20,22 55:7,11 60:8 65:25 67:12 85:17 87:8,12,25 92:8

background 25:11 26:16

**bad** 28:15

**Badge** 13:9

balance 29:25

ban 62:16 106:19

banned 61:24 62:6,10 72:23

barricaded 80:16 81:2 84:6

base 114:22

Baseball 22:17

**based** 14:6 65:9 81:4 83:17,23 84:2 93:6

**basically** 32:13 36:19 53:25 65:15 81:15 87:9 102:25 110:17

beat-down 85:12

began 21:21 40:21 41:4

begin 82:4

**beginning** 3:20 33:15 43:4 71:13 86:24 101:5

**behalf** 3:8 7:9 21:4 36:23 74:17 92:14

**behave** 51:20

behavior 83:24

believed 51:7

believes 35:23

Bell 4:5 10:7 15:19,21,22 16:13 17:2 19:5,25 23:18 38:2 39:4,7,8 66:24 71:22 74:4,8, 11 75:11 76:3,7,12 82:21 90:1 91:23 92:17 93:2,15 94:12,21 95:13,16,20,23 96:4,9 97:9, 12,17,21,25 98:15,25 99:2 102:1,15 104:12 106:6 107:12 109:3 115:17,20 117:21,25

benefit 89:19

benevolent 112:25

Berkeley 62:18

Bernice 98:17,23 99:6

bet 105:16

bettering 85:2

**Bettison** 28:12 29:17,18 30:8, 22 31:9 100:7 116:16

**biased** 107:5

**big** 26:4

bigger 25:24

bill 48:21,22 106:25 107:1

**billion** 113:24

bills 48:20 60:20 106:24 107:1

biometric 64:20 107:5

bit 33:1 86:22 100:14

black 51:25 76:10 108:23,25

blackest 75:19

blank 112:10

blindsided 51:10

**block** 69:7 78:21 79:22 90:5 96:13,20 111:14,15,23

**blocks** 111:16

blood 115:24 116:2,6

Blount 98:18 100:22.23

blow 105:14

blue 111:23

**Board** 3:5,8 5:17,24 6:1,4,12 7:9,13,14,19 8:1,4,17 9:23 10:2,12,14,18,25 11:2,5,6,8, 18,23 12:1,6,7,13,18,22 13:1, 2,7,13 14:1,3,8,14 18:3,14,21 19:15 21:3 23:7 24:7 25:7 26:20 28:17 30:15 33:11 39:15,22 40:21 41:19 44:13 45:23 46:3,11,17 48:8,13 50:8 53:4,15 54:13 55:12 57:8 58:11 59:16 60:5 61:12 71:7, 11 72:4 73:2,6,15 76:18,22 86:21 89:3 92:14,16 93:20 94:16,24 95:8 96:1 100:22 102:20 106:9 112:10 114:21 115:7,21

**Board's** 41:5,20 45:25

board-ups 30:1

boarded 29:15

**body** 54:25 55:2 67:16 71:10, 13 105:20

**body-worn** 63:2,16,18,23 64:5 67:18

book 65:20 69:18

**BOPC** 5:9.19 8:24 39:18 48:3

**border** 115:13

**bottom** 80:11 92:2

**Bowl** 22:19

**brand** 72:17

breach 58:6,14,17

breaches 44:25

break-ins 96:25

Brenda 98:19 107:14

**Brian** 17:4,9,22 26:15

**bridge** 110:16

briefing 29:2 39:17

briefly 115:22 116:7

**bring** 10:15,22 12:9 13:13 28:23 67:12 68:5 71:6 85:20

111:3 115:23 116:4

**bringing** 89:18 113:19

**brings** 48:11 108:8

broad 11:3 42:4,20

**Brooks** 4:3,4 27:18

**brought** 25:11 27:9 53:16 67:16 72:16 111:11,12

Brown 5:24 6:23,25 15:7 17:6 29:11 58:24 59:18 60:9,13 61:2,20 62:22 65:15 66:20 90:2,8,25 93:10,13 95:3 98:10,11,17 99:1 102:16 104:13 106:7 107:13 109:6 110:24 112:12 115:18 117:19

**Brown's** 93:14

**brutal** 104:10

Bryan 98:20 111:1

**Bryant** 15:24 16:6 17:21 18:2 25:13

**build** 103:15

**building** 95:12 107:21,24 108:2,10 114:19

building's 107:23

**bumped** 104:23

**Burch** 4:1,2,14 30:18 32:5 37:3,25 38:11 53:8 55:13 56:15,23 57:19 95:7,14 96:11

**burden** 88:14

burdened 88:21

**Burton** 17:17 70:24 71:10,23 74:15 75:16 76:6 84:11,20 85:4 93:4,17 94:15,23 95:18, 25 97:10,14,19,23 108:8

**business** 11:24 33:18 93:3,5, 18 96:11 97:15,16,17,20,21, 24 117:22

**Butler** 31:4

buy 59:5 103:20

**bylaw** 12:24

**bylaws** 10:11,16,17,23 11:15, 21 12:19

C

**cable** 3:11

**call** 37:1 65:18 83:12,21 89:13 95:19 96:3,5,20 97:1 98:13,14

Callaway 6:8

called 30:23 96:3 111:14

caller 83:11,17

calling 83:11

**calls** 79:25 80:9 82:25 84:7 85:14

cam 105:20

camera 63:23 64:5 67:18 113:17 114:4

**cameras** 63:3,15,16,18,20 69:1,3 111:10,20,24 114:3

campaign 106:19

campaigns 106:22

capability 62:23 103:21

capacity 18:23

**CAPPA** 78:20 84:19

Capt 14:22 16:15,20 17:22 18:20 26:15 29:16 76:16,18, 19 83:7,18 84:15,25 85:18 86:14 87:13 89:15 90:2,7,16 91:6,20 92:15

**captain** 10:2,9 17:5,10 19:11 20:15 84:5

card 15:9

cards 15:5,6 98:12

care 99:24 100:21 105:2

career 20:18 21:22 22:12

32:15

carjackings 24:20

carried 49:13

**carries** 4:22 5:8 16:11,25 17:14 24:4

carry 11:2 116:14,18

cars 63:3 99:23 100:4

Carter 3:4,6,18 4:11,16,21 5:2, 7 6:9,13,20,22 7:2,7 15:25 16:3,10,18,24 17:7,13,16 19:3,20 21:13 23:22 24:3 27:16 29:9 34:25 37:23 38:3, 16 39:9 50:22 54:22 55:1 56:12,17 66:22 95:5

case 29:13 45:14

casual 31:4

catch 111:20,25

categories 42:3

**category** 42:4,10,16,19,20 45:15,18,21

caught 104:6 111:19

**caused** 88:14

causing 116:3

celebrating 8:23

**cell** 15:12

**Center** 41:12 86:15 87:18 92:1 98:3 102:19

centered 9:8

centers 79:16 86:16

Central 21:24

certificate 33:18 34:3

certification 43:12

certified 77:25 80:18 81:21

chair 4:9 5:11 6:12 7:1 12:13, 14 14:10 15:18 16:13 17:2 18:11,20 19:5,25 21:15 23:18 24:6 28:3 29:1,11,20 30:18 31:15 32:9,19 38:20 50:24 53:3,8,25 54:12 55:6,8 56:1, 23 58:4,20 59:6,20,24 60:16 61:11 62:5 63:12 65:20 66:21 67:5 68:18 70:25 71:3 72:4,8 74:12 75:17 82:23 83:7,19

84:12,15,25 85:18 86:14 87:13 89:15 90:16 91:2,6 92:15,19 93:5 95:8,19 96:6, 12,22 97:11 98:11 112:14 115:19 117:20

Chair's 7:9

Chairman 76:7 96:1 115:20

Chairperson 28:21

challenged 32:16

**challenging** 25:18 26:3

**chance** 59:1 62:3 64:11 100:6, 7,10,14

chang 63:5,7

**change** 13:7 31:24 38:10,15 54:18 75:8 102:13

changing 111:8

channel 3:11

channels 90:13

**Chaplain** 3:14,16,19 116:10, 15

Chapter 8:1

charge 29:5 72:3

**Charles** 13:19 19:23 20:1 21:6,11 23:24

chart 10:16,21,23

Charter 7:25 73:4

**check** 105:12

**checks** 48:18

Chicago 9:13

chief 5:20,23 6:3,10,11,15,16, 18,20 7:16 9:22 10:1,8 13:6 15:10,23,24 16:6,14 17:3,21 18:2,3,12,21 19:6,12 22:1,2 24:5,6 25:13 27:16,17 28:3, 11,21 29:1,12,17,20 30:6,8,9, 19,21 31:4,8,15 32:2,4,7,9,19, 22 33:9,10,11,12 34:9,13,15 35:3,17,23 36:24 38:20 39:10 52:16,22 55:15,17 56:4,10 63:6,12 65:18 67:2,5,9 68:18

72:15,19 73:2,5,10,11,12,16 74:12 75:25 76:12 83:19 92:2 99:19,24 100:23 101:23 102:5,6 105:19 109:19 110:19 111:11 112:10 113:3,7 115:21 116:16

**chief's** 14:24 16:5,20 22:3,15, 16 34:9

chiefs 52:10,23 73:18 110:19

**child** 51:18,24 67:25 110:6

chitchat 30:25 96:19

Christie 9:1,4

Christmas 7:20

church 98:7 99:8

**CIP** 82:11

**CIT** 81:13,21

Citation 22:16

cited 72:20

cities 66:7,8 69:9 105:4,6,10

citizen 7:12 8:4 83:22 113:9

citizenry 22:21 41:21 52:14

**citizens** 8:11 18:7 20:24 21:4, 9 22:24 23:8,14 32:1 51:6,7 55:15 75:20 77:8 85:22 93:24 113:12

city 7:25 21:4,8 23:13 34:20 40:15 58:12 68:14 69:2 70:15 73:4 75:17,19 76:8 86:17 90:24 101:6,10 104:5 107:2 111:16 114:2 115:13 117:9,16

civil 7:3 8:11 106:15 117:7

civilian 8:2,10,19,23 93:7

clarification 13:4

clarify 49:5

clarity 43:6 44:9 46:22

**Clark** 3:14,16,19

classes 35:14

classify 82:25 83:2

**clear** 36:2 55:14,15 57:20 94:22 108:6

Clearance 26:6

**clearing** 80:12,13

close 15:19 50:15

closed 13:11,15 88:8 97:18

**closely** 89:20

Co-chair 109:8

cognizant 92:7

cohort 33:16 34:7

colleague's 53:12

colleagues 29:2

collected 71:16

College 35:10 36:17

color 51:16 101:3,14

combative 52:1,3

combination 78:6

comfortable 66:10

**Comm** 13:19 15:23 16:5 17:21 18:10 21:6,11 23:24 28:10 30:21 32:6 35:1 96:15

command 9:24 19:12 28:14

**commander** 10:2,8 16:16,21 19:7,23 20:18,19 23:19 26:2 96:14,19 97:2 100:8

Commanders 30:20

commend 32:2 89:6 102:20

**comment** 12:5 28:5 68:3,5 74:13 101:21

**comments** 15:4 41:20,22 53:14 98:10 112:17

Commercial 13:10

COMMISSIONER 70:24

**Commission** 67:11,12 71:25 117:7

**commissioner** 3:4,12,18,21, 22,23,24,25 4:1,3,5,7,11,14,

15,16,21,25 5:1,2,7 6:9,13,20, 22,23,25 7:2,7 10:7 15:19,21, 22,25 16:1,3,10,13,18,24 17:2,6,7,13,16,17,24 18:1 19:3,5,20,25 21:13,15 23:18, 21,22 24:3 27:16,18,24 28:20 29:8,9,11 30:18 32:5,8 34:24, 25 35:6,20 37:2,3,23,25 38:2, 3,11,16 39:4,7,8,9 50:22,24 51:4 53:8,11 54:5,11,22,24 55:1,3,5,13 56:12,15,17,22,23 57:19,22 58:3,22,24 59:18 60:9,13 61:2,20 62:22 65:15 66:20,22,24 67:2,7 68:3 70:23 71:10,22 73:24 74:4,6,8,10, 11,15 75:11,13,16 76:3,6,12 82:21,22 83:16 84:11,20 85:4, 25 86:20 88:9,10 90:1,2,8,25 91:2,18,22,23 92:17 93:2,4, 13,15,17 94:6,12,15,21,23 95:3,5,7,13,14,16,18,20,23,25 96:4,9,11,21 97:9,10,12,14, 17,19,21,23,25 98:15,25 99:2 102:1,15 104:12 106:6 107:12 108:8 109:3 115:17 117:21,25

Commissioner's 28:4 63:13

commissioners 3:5,20 4:12, 20,22 5:6 7:19 8:1 12:4,23 13:22 16:9,17,23 17:12 19:22 21:3 23:7 24:2,7 39:23 41:19 46:3,12,18 48:14 58:12 59:16 66:25 71:11 73:6 82:21 93:20 94:16,24 95:22,24 102:21 106:9 109:19 117:24 118:2

Commissions 19:3

**commitment** 18:25 21:8 23:1, 13 26:6

**committee** 71:1,2,8 72:7,12 92:18 112:15

**common** 80:12

communication 77:9 79:10

communications 41:15 98:9

communities 22:25

**community** 7:23 18:8,25 28:16 29:4 30:2,4,12,14,24

31:3 35:10 36:17 76:2 78:8,23 80:7 93:22 94:17 95:1 98:5 99:15 101:23 109:9,11,25 110:5,10 115:15

community-based 77:10

community-induced 115:10

companies 114:4

company 40:15 63:19 64:6

comparable 59:11

compassion 110:4

competent 43:10

complaint 117:8

complaints 8:5 30:3

completed 10:5

complexion 117:4,14

**compliance** 8:6 10:16 48:18 79:6 89:21 94:18 95:1

comply 48:24 101:19

complying 48:16 60:14

components 59:4

comprehensive 14:7

computer 54:8

**concern** 7:10 86:2 99:11 113:6 116:14,20

**concerned** 69:21,22 87:7 113:22

**concerns** 7:11 30:5 31:5 41:20 53:15 112:22 116:10 117:2,3,13

conclude 5:20

concluded 118:3

concludes 50:20

conclusion 27:9

conclusions 47:12

concrete 80:4 81:10 83:8

concur 47:5

concurrence 64:17

**conduct** 11:18,22 50:12,13 62:5

**conducted** 40:9 41:6,7,25 50:16 53:25

conducting 3:7 9:11 47:11

conference 8:16,20 9:20

confidence 19:12

confident 107:4

confidential 45:6 61:15

confirm 43:19 73:25 83:14

confused 51:15

congratulate 21:10 23:15

congratulations 19:21

conjunction 52:9

**Conrad** 11:20

Consent 22:16

consequences 29:25

**consideration** 8:15 42:1 46:1 50:17 54:20,23 55:10 116:17

considered 61:7

**consists** 43:16 44:15 77:21 78:4

constant 87:24

constantly 90:19

constituents 31:11 74:17

constitutional 9:9 49:23

Consuela 98:20 109:7

consummate 21:1 23:4

contact 64:1 84:24 85:11 92:9

contacting 13:11

contemplating 62:11,15

**continue** 10:24 11:17,22 12:9 13:2 19:18 25:4 42:8 109:25

continued 22:8

continues 24:23,24



**continuing** 8:17 24:9,12 107:20

**continuous** 43:14 47:16

continuously 110:16

**contract** 40:16 45:23,25 59:2, 7.13.16 67:3

contracted 40:14

contrary 58:9

control 8:3

controversial 36:6

conversation 70:12 112:18

114:14

convince 88:4

**cooperation** 12:17 100:18

coordinating 109:17

Cop 96:13,19

copies 10:3 59:8

cops 105:5,11

copy 39:23 76:24

corner 69:7 113:8

corporal 22:8

corporate 108:4,11

**Corps** 116:11,15

**correct** 58:21 64:12 67:3 83:18 91:20 94:13

corrected 10:13

correctly 38:6

costs 34:5

**Council** 40:16 58:12 101:6

107:2 117:9,16

Councilman 90:10

**counsel** 108:5,12

counseling 79:15 88:4

countless 27:4

country 9:16 28:7 41:16

counts 27:6

**county** 35:9 36:17 81:25 82:2, 16 91:8,10,14,16,21

**couple** 24:11,15 28:21 29:3 53:18 72:20 80:2 93:5

**courses** 82:11

court 5:15 11:20 104:7

**cover** 40:7

**covered** 114:19

**Cpl** 13:19 21:17 22:12,22 23:10,15,20,24 101:22

Craig 6:10,11,15,18 18:21 19:12 24:5,6 28:3 29:1,20 30:9 32:4,19 38:20 63:12 65:18 67:3,5,9 68:18 73:2,10, 11 74:12 76:12 83:19 92:2 101:23 105:19 109:19 110:19 111:11 115:21,22 116:16

create 11:1 53:1 107:7 110:16

115:15

created 34:2 52:8,19

creating 32:21 109:17

credit 23:2 33:6

credits 34:16 36:21

Crews 20:9

**crime** 14:25 20:16 24:8,22 41:12 43:1 44:18 48:12 69:10 110:10 113:9,19

crimes 20:8 57:16 70:9

criminal 9:9 34:12 36:20 70:2

criminalize 89:9

criminals 74:24

**crisis** 79:15 80:18,22 81:19 84:10 86:15,16 87:18 89:18 90:20 91:7 92:1

crisis-type 84:6

**critical** 15:1 26:12,19,21 42:11 45:17 64:17,21

criticism 65:2

cross-referencable 115:8

cross-referencing 115:1,6

**culture** 31:25

curb 90:24

current 48:16 60:20

cutting 72:24

cycle 63:25

D

**D.C.** 116:22

daddy 51:18

daily 20:23

**Dale** 5:14

dark 112:19 117:4,14

**Darryl** 93:10,13

data 44:15,20,21,25 71:16

database 61:5,8 65:21

databases 107:9

**Dataworks** 40:15 45:23 59:1,7

67:4

date 24:10 60:1

dates 40:8,13

daughter 86:11

**David** 98:20 112:13

Davis 3:24,25 4:15 5:1 16:1

**day** 12:7 25:12 85:23 89:7 105:23

\_ \_\_\_\_

days 28:8,22 69:7

**DC** 31:8 63:6

de-escalation 77:7

deal 19:11 78:7,22 82:10 89:7

**dealing** 72:1 74:24 78:6 79:11 87:15 90:15 92:5 100:16

116:12

decision 41:16

declare 101:16

dedicated 21:6 23:11

dedication 18:15 20:23 23:2

deepen 11:12

defend 113:13,16,18

defining 42:9

definite 97:4

definitions 44:8,9

definitively 84:4

degree 33:20 34:1,12

degrees 34:1

delighted 99:18

demonstrated 20:23

demonstrations 64:9

**Denise** 13:19 21:17,18 23:10, 16,24

**densely** 113:11

department 7:15 8:3,5 9:5,14, 25 13:21 14:11,14 15:2 18:24 20:2,22 21:19 22:23 23:3,9 25:17 32:20 34:10,18,22 38:23 39:22 40:16 41:10,12 42:24 43:8,25 44:8,16 45:22 46:2,13,16,17,22 47:2,15,19, 24 48:10,23 49:2,3,24 54:6, 19,23 55:9 56:13 57:5,13,24 58:7,9 59:12,15 60:5,25 61:12,17 68:17 71:12 74:3,21 78:12,17,19 81:12 82:13,18 85:2,21 88:18 91:16 96:23 97:6 103:11 104:10 108:19

**department's** 27:11 50:7

departmental 70:17

**departments** 9:12 61:23 72:20,21 91:9

depending 34:23 80:14 86:18

deploying 68:20

deprioritized 88:13

**Deputy** 10:1,8 15:24 16:6 17:21 18:2 19:6 25:13 28:11 29:17 30:6,8 116:16 Dequindre 96:18

deserve 32:1

deserving 22:14

destroyed 104:20

detail 110:22

detailed 39:24 50:25

detailing 45:10

**details** 40:8 44:3 48:13 50:5,

18 62:14

detention 65:14

determined 91:13

determining 77:16

detriment 106:15

**Detroit** 3:1 7:25 8:13,21,22 18:18 20:24 21:3,5,8,19,20 22:23,24 23:2,7,8,13 29:22 37:10 38:23 39:3 40:15 41:11 69:16 71:12 75:20 78:12,19 82:17 85:20 86:15 90:24 96:23 102:7,19 104:3 105:5,6 106:11 107:3 109:15 111:16

**Detroit-wayne** 78:13 81:14

Detroiter 100:24

develop 65:7

**developed** 20:10 33:13 41:24

90:6

developing 86:5 90:20

development 68:9

deviate 56:5

device 53:23 54:4

**devices** 15:13

devolve 113:5

devoted 83:6

**Dewaelsche** 3:12 15:17

diagnosed 80:7 81:9 83:10

difficult 26:17

dignitaries 22:13

diligence 22:6

diligent 21:7 23:11

dinner 8:25 9:2,20

direct 52:20

directed 54:13

**direction** 24:9,13

directive 14:4 58:1

directly 42:13 55:17

director 10:20 109:10

disagree 43:19 47:5 74:19

75:2

disciplinary 48:4 59:22

discipline 59:19

discouraged 93:25

discriminates 101:13

discriminatory 8:8 44:23

discussed 41:9 42:4 49:11

92:23 116:8

**discusses** 40:9 42:10 45:10

46:21 49:16,22

**discussion** 4:19 5:4 10:11 11:11 16:4,7,22 17:10 23:25 51:1,8 57:12 59:21 66:6 73:22 94:7,9 95:6,7 118:1

**discussions** 11:16 12:12

59:25 66:8

dismissal 70:1

disorder 79:19

disorders 77:11,14 80:22

dispatched 88:3

displayed 20:5 22:5

distinguished 20:18 25:16

26:15

distressed 26:25

**District** 3:6,25 4:2,6 21:24,25 30:24 96:13 112:15 114:16

dive 90:4



divided 42:2

**Division** 21:25 39:19 40:10 41:6

Division's 39:24

**DNA** 112:5

**doctor** 105:3

**document** 52:8,19 53:1,13 58:4 74:2

**documentation** 45:19 47:1 57:11

documents 39:20

**Doe** 98:21 114:15

**DOJ** 9:10

**domestic** 84:23 85:7 92:5 116:13

dominant 63:18

door 87:9

doors 99:22

**downtown** 22:3 82:5,6 84:16 86:3

dozen 101:24

dozens 106:17

**DPD** 6:17 14:19 40:14,19 41:1, 22 73:7,11 76:16 78:1 81:20, 23 82:1 89:17 90:6 91:12 106:10 109:24

**draft** 44:10,11,12 45:2,3,5 48:1 60:4,7,8

draw 92:20

drinking 105:13

drive 105:3

**drones** 49:9

drove 26:7

drug 79:4 100:15

 $\textbf{Dudenhoefer} \ \ 98{:}21\ 112{:}12,$ 

13,14

due 88:7 99:19

**Duggan** 49:10 76:1

dutifully 21:23

duty 13:8 29:6 105:15

Ε

earlier 68:4

**early** 91:3

east 29:21 98:7

easy 112:10

echo 53:11

**Ed** 98:18

edge 72:24

educated 35:25 51:19 102:22

**education** 34:23 35:24 37:5

76:19 77:3

effect 94:1

effective 68:20 69:10,12 79:10

efficient 10:14 68:20

effort 29:22 92:8

**efforts** 109:17

Elaine 15:24 16:6 17:21 26:4

elected 7:3 109:8 112:14

election 100:9

electronic 15:13

elevated 44:18

eliminate 8:7 44:23

Elizabeth 4:4

emanate 25:3

embedded 63:20,24

emergency 101:17

emphasize 12:12 66:12 81:25

emphasizing 50:8

employees 10:19

employers 44:22

employment 44:23

empowered 8:2

encounter 51:23

encountered 104:11

encourage 11:4 32:14

encouragement 33:7

encouraging 32:11 36:10

**end** 10:6 12:7,25 15:3,9 36:9 82:14 86:6,24 87:8,10 89:8 91:25 92:8 99:16 111:22

ended 93:9,12 114:8

**energy** 52:25

enforce 31:21

enforcement 8:19 13:19 20:9 22:11 31:20 36:20 47:23 68:10,14,17 77:25 79:6 81:17 84:17 88:15 91:19,21 93:7 109:9,11,15 110:12

engage 51:12 52:13

engaged 41:14 47:16

Engagement 109:12

**Engler** 87:22

enhance 103:2

enlighten 72:5

enlightened 72:13

ensuring 44:25

ental 14:20

**enter** 25:5

entering 114:18

entertain 95:17 117:23

entire 63:8

entitled 45:16

**entity** 70:17

**equal** 34:2

equality 101:2

Eric 98:18 100:23 102:18

erratic 86:11

essentially 103:3

establish 49:2,4

estimating 82:13

estimation 64:25

Eva 3:12 15:17

evaluation 40:22 41:4 47:3,6

evening 93:1

event 60:25 61:3 96:14

events 22:4,9 49:20

everybody's 116:2

evidence 108:22

evolution 103:9

**evolve** 113:5

evolving 67:14

exam 33:5

**excell** 32:20

excellence 26:7

excellent 61:21

exception 10:20

excited 27:12 51:4 97:6

exciting 8:24

excused 3:13

**executive** 14:2 20:12 39:12,16

109:10

executives 41:11

existing 10:16

**exit** 78:11

exonerate 68:11

**expect** 67:19

expense 36:22

experience 25:11 30:25 69:20

85:19

experiencing 81:18

**expertise** 20:25 61:18

expires 67:3

explain 87:6

explaining 52:13

express 7:10

extremely 26:1

F

facial 14:5,8,16 39:18,24 40:14 41:9,13,17 42:6,22,25

43:9,21 45:7,10 46:9 47:7,17

48:9 49:3,8,12 50:1 51:9,12

52:13 53:21 54:1,2,7 55:19,23

57:15 58:8 60:10,18 62:6

63:1,19,24 65:9 68:9 70:13

72:16 100:25 103:4,13 104:1,

6,8 106:10,13,19 107:9,18

108:16,19,23 109:2 111:3

112:7 115:23 116:20 117:2,9

facilities 86:25

facility 112:20

facing 15:1

fact 20:25 26:18 29:5 33:15 36:25 69:23 70:22 80:4 87:20

88:7 99:19 103:20 113:7

115:9,12

fails 96:8,9

fair 77:16 103:2

fall 52:20

fallen 7:10,18

falls 107:25

familiar 52:22

families 79:11

family 26:11 74:25 79:2 81:5

84:7

fast 74:8 101:1

**fastly** 8:16

favor 4:19 5:5 16:8,22 17:11

24:1 95:21 118:1

**FBI** 43:12 64:20

February 81:1

federal 48:17 60:15,17 101:10,

19 106:24 107:1 109:14

115:10,14 116:25

fee 34:4

feedback 30:16 41:21

feel 25:1 27:23 36:15 84:21

86:21 88:13 112:23

felonies 67:22

felt 27:20

**females** 51:17

Ferguson 9:13 98:20 110:24,

25 111:1

festival 27:21 28:7

field 64:2

figure 58:19

file 45:14 117:7

**filled** 26:5

final 44:12 48:1 55:2 60:8

74:13

find 29:12 38:21 87:16 110:9

findings 47:12 57:7

finished 35:4

firearms 116:9,14,18

firms 44:22

Fitzgerald 34:13

**fix** 105:7

flag 24:25

**flawed** 107:5

**flaws** 114:8

floor 12:9,15 72:17 108:9

focus 14:19

folder 93:8,12,14

folks 51:15 68:8 108:23

112:22 113:1.6 114:12

follow 11:25 54:17 61:1

follow-up 29:12 footprint 28:16 force 8:9 90:11 forefront 111:7 foreign 22:13 foremost 87:14 forever 92:1 forget 32:6 68:21 formally 55:8 forms 9:20 fort 48:11 98:4 forthcoming 74:5 **forum** 52:17 71:5 forward 19:17 27:11 47:20 76:23 77:1 fought 114:3 foul 102:9 found 32:10 114:7 fourth 43:24 FR/EVOLUTION 53:22 frame 99:4 Francisco 62:18 Franklin 28:10 free 28:6,8 34:12 friendly 30:25 frightening 31:18 front 15:8 91:25 full 11:8 71:7 86:16 function 11:3 73:20 funding 71:14 89:1 Funeral 22:18 **future** 49:19

G

**Gaming** 21:24

**Gang** 20:9

gap 110:16 113:15

garage 99:23

gave 99:20 100:8

general 42:5

George 98:22 115:18,20

**Georgetown** 9:7 116:23

**give** 7:5 36:25 37:17 75:9 78:3 86:23 99:18 100:6,7,10,13

108:5

giving 75:1

glass 112:6

global 106:14

**good** 3:22,24 4:1,3 6:3,10,11, 25 12:19 18:2,3,10 27:23 31:12 33:10 39:14 76:18 83:21 99:6,18 100:22 102:17 110:25 111:21 113:1

Gordon 98:19 104:13,14

governed 94:11

governing 60:10

government 3:10

Governor 87:22

**GPS** 105:12,17

grabbing 112:6

graded 114:25

grading 114:23 115:4

graduated 33:22

graduates 37:8

graduating 20:3 21:20

grandson 108:25

**grant** 45:25

grant-funded 81:14

grants 45:24

graphic 102:9

**grasp** 75:6

grass 39:1,5 106:21

grateful 35:22

great 19:11 21:4 54:15 73:10

86:20 98:16

greater 84:13

green 51:5,8 63:15 111:12,14

greener 39:2,6

Gregory 102:7

**Griffie** 17:24 18:1 53:11 54:5, 11,24 55:3,5 56:22 57:22 73:24 74:6,10 82:22 83:16 88:9 94:6 96:21

group 87:25 109:12

growth 32:21

guess 73:22 95:16 116:8

guidelines 41:8 52:20 56:9

**guilty** 68:12

gunmen 84:6

gunpersons 80:16

**guns** 113:13

**guys** 76:23 110:22

Н

hacked 61:3,10

hacking 44:25 61:6

half 40:18 105:15

happen 73:12 89:14 110:1

happened 52:11 99:8 110:2

happening 57:7,14 110:10 114:11

hard 25:5 53:6 75:6

**Harris** 17:4,9,22 18:20 26:15

hat 93:11 105:24

head 69:11

**headed** 29:15

headquarters 7:22 93:21



94:18,25

heads 22:13 107:6

health 14:19,20 76:16,21 77:4, 5,22 78:5,10,13,25 79:1,7,14, 21 80:8 81:15,18 82:16 84:14, 22 85:2,7 86:25 87:2,20 88:12 91:14 115:11

healthy 110:11

hear 26:23 33:8 87:4 97:6

heard 30:6,16 72:8

hearing 103:11 111:4 117:8

**hearings** 116:22

heaven 112:4

**heavily** 113:11

held 69:25

helps 77:12,15

**Hewitt** 99:20

**Hicks** 4:9 5:8,10 53:1,4,9 92:18,19 93:16 96:6

high 24:11 34:5 36:1

higher 69:17 84:3

highest 21:9 23:14 112:4

highlight 50:8

highlighted 75:13

highlighting 44:5

**highlights** 40:12 52:15

highly 23:4

Hill 98:19 107:13,14 109:4

hire 68:22 69:4

history 52:19

hit 72:17

**hits** 64:11

hoc 92:18

**Hola** 109:7

**hold** 15:10

holiday 7:21

09/05/2019

Holley 4:7,25 28:20 29:8 32:8 34:24 35:6,20 37:2 85:25 86:20 88:10 101:21

**Holt** 3:21,22,23 21:14,15 23:21 50:24 58:3,22 67:2,7 68:3 70:23 91:2,18,22

home 26:8 43:2 67:22

homeless 82:7 86:4 87:25

89:22

homelessness 78:24 79:14

homicide 26:3 69:15 70:11,14,

16.19

homicides 24:10 104:3

homies 105:24

honestly 111:17

honor 20:1 21:16

honorable 18:3 39:15 41:20

115:21

honored 18:18

honoring 19:22 21:17 23:24

hope 13:13 29:16 57:23 99:19

hoping 66:2

horse 112:24

Hospital 85:13 92:1

hospitals 109:15

**host** 8:19 109:13

hostage 80:18

Hotel 9:4

**hours** 19:19 33:6 58:14 64:20 69:7 77:21,22,23 78:3,4,10

80:19 81:16

house 48:20,21 101:16 106:25

**houses** 29:14

housing 86:18 87:20

**HQ** 110:3

human 32:10 106:16

**humane** 77:16

humble 25:9

hundred 72:21

hundreds 108:18

**Hunter** 102:7

ı

**IACP** 69:19

**ID** 94:1,4

idea 86:23 93:16

ideally 57:22

**ideas** 38:8

identification 53:23 65:10,11

66:19

identified 48:11 51:15 70:8 83:17

identify 66:2 67:19 68:7 76:10

77:10 115:2

identifying 43:21 80:21

114:22

**II** 16:15,21 17:22

IJUSIACP 52:21

ill 77:17 78:7 80:16 82:7 86:4

88:1 89:10,23

illness 27:1 77:18,20,21 78:10,23 79:12 80:1,2,8 81:4, 8 83:11,23 84:8 87:16 90:4,

11,24

images 44:17,19 54:10 114:22,24

imagine 63:22 67:24

immediately 5:16 48:3

immigrant 110:5,9

immigration 49:17

impact 29:25 30:1 84:13,22

impacting 42:13

impacts 42:13

implementation 14:20

implemented 71:14 116:25

implementing 45:5

implications 106:15

implore 88:23 89:11

importance 42:5,11,12 45:17

**important** 7:13 8:14 9:15 26:8

40:8 62:20

importing 114:21

impress 33:9

improperly 69:25

**Improvement** 111:2

improvements 46:7,8

in-service 79:23

inaccurate 51:15 60:14

incident 26:20 27:2,8 28:8

incidents 26:22 28:5 115:12

include 20:8 42:16 44:8 107:8

included 41:25 44:4,10,11 45:14 47:24 50:11 60:3

115:11 117:1

including 47:23 58:6,10 88:24 102:1 113:3,13

incoming 92:21

increase 8:12 26:21 77:8

incrementally 113:5

indicating 43:13,18 47:10

individual 11:18 12:4 16:2 50:2 73:3,18 87:24 114:24

individuals 25:8 73:8 77:17 87:19 90:12 94:5

**industry** 113:24

influence 27:1 83:24

inform 57:6

**information** 7:17 8:15 14:12 15:1 16:2 26:10 44:3 45:7 46:19 48:7,10,11 52:7,9 53:6 57:3 59:8 61:15,16,18,21

62:8,21 71:6 81:6 90:14 99:21 102:2,13,24 114:23 115:2 116:4

informed 97:4

initial 40:20,22 41:2

initially 33:25 51:14 60:3

initiative 81:25 91:8,10

initiatives 9:16

injured 7:11,15,18

injuries 77:6

innocent 68:8,11

**input** 12:2 14:13

insert 67:18

inserting 64:10

insist 103:18

installation 51:5

instances 92:4

**institutions** 88:7 89:24

instruction 78:21 79:22

instructors 81:21

insurmountable 106:14

Integrated 52:8

integrity 21:7 23:1,12

intelligently 112:21

intended 68:2

intentions 113:1,2

interaction 19:7

interest 12:16

interesting 38:21 112:17

internal 11:11 46:8

International 52:10,23

interrupting 15:14

intertwined 63:2

intervention 80:19 89:18,19

90:20 91:8

intoxicants 84:8

introduce 3:20 5:9,19,22 6:14

7:6

**INTRODUCES** 6:17

introduction 5:20 40:7

introductions 5:11

**INV** 6:3

invasion 43:2 67:23

investigates 8:4

investigation 9:11 25:22 45:12 70:7 81:5 87:17 104:16

investigations 25:25 43:2,3 44:18

Investigator 5:21,23 6:6,7,8

investigators 116:8

invitation 75:5 115:24

**invite** 9:18,19 109:18

invited 3:14 75:11

invocation 3:15,17

involved 49:14 71:11 112:23 116:13

involvement 29:24 99:12

involves 45:18

involving 25:22 47:22 80:1

issue 30:14 51:25 52:4 63:13 71:25 73:23 74:20 76:15 88:23 97:8 103:2 106:11,12, 13,14

**issues** 11:13 15:1 74:14,20 75:3 79:14 89:6,21 109:25 115:12

item 14:15 40:1 44:20 71:4 93:6

items 8:15 10:12 42:13 47:25 76:15 92:20,21,22,25 93:6



J

**jails** 87:2

January 22:8 40:19 52:11

jazz 27:20 28:6

Jermaine 6:1

Jersey 9:15

Jim 4:7

**job** 18:6,17 25:15 36:11 54:15 73:10 79:7 85:21 99:20 100:11 105:8,15

John 98:7,21

joined 6:24

joining 3:9 17:19

Jones 28:23 101:22

Jr 11:20

Judgment 22:16

jump 63:6

June 20:11 41:1 104:2

jurisdiction 89:4

jurisdictions 62:17 106:25

justice 9:5,9 11:20 34:12 36:20 52:9 102:19

justify 104:18

K

**Karen** 98:18

Kennedy 98:3

**key** 25:25 40:8,13 42:20 50:11,19

keynote 8:25

kind 68:5 78:5 103:8

kinds 28:5

knowing 12:9

knowledge 103:2

L

**LA** 39:5

lack 110:3

lacks 12:10

ladder 100:14

lady 32:6 37:4

Lafayette 98:8

Lance 96:16

language 11:21 12:21 60:6

102:9

Lansing 114:3

large 3:23 4:4,8 18:25

largest 28:6 82:18 91:15

laughed 104:21

launched 106:19

law 8:19 9:7 13:18 22:11 31:19,21 36:20 37:23 38:7 60:10,17 68:10,14,17 77:25 79:6 81:17 84:17 88:15 91:19, 21 93:7 109:9,11,15 110:12

lawlessness 31:25

laws 8:6 37:20 48:17,19,23

61:1

lawsuit 117:11

lawsuits 108:18

layers 47:6

lead 18:23 65:7 70:1

leader 18:24

leaders 7:4 30:24 31:3,10

leadership 18:13 20:25 27:5

28:18 33:16

leads 14:22 57:17

League 22:17

learn 112:18

leave 15:16 37:16,18 66:23

108:24

**led** 9:10

left 36:12,14 38:23 39:3

legislated 111:5

legislation 38:14

legislators 114:8

legislature 38:9 88:25

legislatures 106:23

letter 49:11 104:15

**letters** 22:20

Levalley 33:23

level 44:19 60:15 64:7 70:7

75:9 89:2 114:22 116:25

**levels** 115:7

leveraging 68:19

Liaison 22:4

liberties 106:16

lie 111:25

lieutenant 19:10 20:11,12

33:5

life 8:12 27:22 111:18

lifelong 21:8 23:13 100:24

lifted 60:6

**light** 51:5,8 53:16 63:15 102:4,

10 111:12,14 114:3

limited 58:10 68:12

lineup 65:17,19

list 54:16 108:21

listed 50:6 92:21

**listen** 30:13

listened 41:19 114:16

listing 7:15

lists 107:8

Litigation 9:6

live 28:2 62:12 96:17 114:15

lived 104:9 105:10



**livestream** 49:9 62:25 **livestreaming** 64:4 66:9

**living** 37:18

**Liza** 3:6

lobbied 114:1

lobbying 114:5

**local** 9:12 48:17 106:23 109:14

located 9:21 15:6 114:4

long 72:18 92:6 103:6

looked 63:4

loop 74:5

**Lopez** 9:1,4,10 98:20 109:6,7,

Lopez's 9:8

Los 9:14 69:11,12 103:24

loss 116:3

lot 31:15 34:18 50:13,14 53:13,14 74:19 75:2 77:5 82:6,19 87:1 88:15 89:22 99:11 103:10 105:3 115:25 116:21 117:3

lots 114:5

love 70:13

loved 111:12

low 36:17

loyalty 20:23

**LPAC** 109:8

Lt 17:4.9

M

**macro** 89:1

Madam 4:9 5:10 6:11 7:1 16:13 17:2 19:5,25 23:18 24:6 28:20 29:11 30:18 31:14 55:25 59:20 66:20

made 27:22,23 29:22 57:25

59:11 65:12,22 70:14 72:9 75:4 97:3 101:21

Magegal 6:7

**Mahone** 13:19 19:23 20:1

21:6,11 23:24

main 44:6 45:18 62:10 72:12

major 22:17 33:12

majority 12:8,11 91:15

make 15:4,13 18:6 27:8,20 30:13 36:20 37:7 38:21 39:7 55:14 56:9 57:20 65:13 66:4 74:1,13 79:5 84:13,21 88:10 89:13 92:8 94:8,22 97:7 99:7 101:12 105:8 106:4 112:3 114:10

maker 63:17

**making** 5:11 14:23 19:13 24:18 26:9,11 27:6 66:18 89:20 94:13,14,21

male 76:10

males 51:16 52:2,3

**Mallett** 11:20

man 51:18,23 99:22

management 21:25 63:16

management-level 66:16

Manager 14:2 39:12,16

mandate 73:19,20

mandated 73:5 77:23 79:23

mandatory 48:6 60:24 78:21

manner 68:2

Mark 3:14

marriage 79:2

Marriott 9:4

Martin 13:9

Marx 96:16,18

Massachusetts 62:18

master 34:1

master's 33:18,25 34:12

match 64:13 65:22

matches 115:2

matter 13:12 29:4 60:22,25

74:9

matters 27:2 70:10

maximize 68:12

Mayor 49:10 58:12 76:1

**MBA** 33:23 35:4

MBAS 33:23 34:6

Mcallister 5:21 6:3,4 90:10

Mcginnis 16:15,21 17:22

18:10,11 26:2

meal 79:14

means 82:1 91:9 113:19

meantime 13:1

measure 50:9

measures 12:9 45:6

**Media** 5:13

meet 7:21,23 31:9 71:1,4

94:20 96:5

meeting 3:5,7,10,11,13 5:13 6:5 15:3,14,19 30:23 71:9 89:14 92:23 93:16 94:3,5 98:1,5 102:8,11 107:16,20,25 109:13,20 117:16,17

meetings 11:8,10,19,22,23 12:17 41:19 53:17 56:20 57:10,12 72:7 93:21,23 94:2, 16,19,25 95:2 97:1 107:20,22 114:18

**meets** 7:19

**Melanie** 14:1 39:13,16 70:25 72:3 74:2

member 9:5 11:5

members 5:18 10:2,12 11:1,2, 18 13:18 18:23 26:11 28:14 29:3 30:4 33:17,21 34:10,22 42:7 43:8,11,13 59:23 73:3



78:17,18,23 80:6,17,20 81:23 82:14 101:6,23

**memory** 116:3

men 32:3

mental 14:18 27:1 76:16,20 77:4,5,11,14,18,20,21 78:5, 10,13,23,25 79:1,12,14,21 80:1,2,8,21 81:4,7,15,18 83:1, 3,11,12,23 84:8,14,22 85:2,7 86:12,25 87:1,16,20 88:7,12 89:24 90:4,10,24 115:11

mentally 77:17 78:7 80:16 82:7 86:4 88:1 89:10,23

mentioned 60:19 91:3 96:25

merit 21:9 23:14

met 101:23

methods 11:11 14:21

Metropolitan 21:20

Michael 16:15,20 17:21 18:11

Michelle 98:21 115:18

Michigan 3:1 77:24 87:21 88:8 89:25 106:12,25 107:1,2 109:9 117:7

microphone 17:23

mid 24:16

Midtown 86:4.5

military 26:16

million 103:25 106:18

mind 33:1 75:9 80:3 113:1

minimizes 65:4 77:13

minimum 43:25

minister 99:9

**Minneapolis** 85:4,8,16

minutes 4:23 5:3 15:11 99:3 107:17

misconduct 8:7

misdemeanor 29:5

misidentification 63:22 117:4

misidentifications 65:4

misidentify 64:8,25 66:13

75:18 76:8

misidentifying 64:1

missed 29:13 61:25 70:12

missing 110:6 114:25

mix-up 93:11

mixed 89:23 94:7

**mobile** 49:8 53:21,22 54:1,3

63:1,3

modifications 45:24 46:4

modifies 8:6

moment 32:22

Monday 10:4

money 89:12 114:5

monies 34:23

monitoring 43:22

monitors 8:5

month 7:22.24 74:15 103:9

months 38:22,25 80:1 81:1,11

morning 100:9

mother 110:8

motion 4:13,22,24 5:8 15:21 16:11,25 17:14 24:4 93:18 94:7,9,14,22,23 95:4,17,21

96:8,9 97:23 117:23

**mouth** 89:13

move 7:8 10:7 15:22 16:13 17:2 20:21 23:18 24:9,12 37:11,22 39:11 73:22 75:14 76:5,14,23,25 86:6 93:18,20, 21 94:15,16,17,24 95:6,18 96:10 97:11 98:9

moved 4:14,16,25 5:2 16:4,18 17:7 23:22 70:7 97:18 117:24.

movement 34:18

moving 27:11 60:22

mug 65:20

multi-modal 53:22

municipalities 114:6

murders 104:1

Ν

**NACOLE** 8:16,18

narcotics 25:23

**narrow** 68:11

national 8:18,20 93:6 101:17

106:17 117:12

naturally 51:22

Nay 95:24

Ne 93:6

needed 13:4

negotiated 9:12

negotiation 80:18

neighborhood 22:3 96:23

97:3 100:19 111:10

neighborhoods 107:8 111:13

neighboring 22:24

neighbors 96:17 97:5 111:20

Newark 9:15

**newly** 19:18

news 31:12 99:18 102:7

117:12

Nichols 6:7

non-criminal 8:4

non-fatal 24:14

non-starter 101:5

North 86:6

Northeastern 21:25

**note** 14:16

notification 13:15 46:7 58:5,

14 114:21

**notifications** 42:16 45:19,22 46:15

notified 46:12 58:13

notify 45:23 46:2,17

**NPO** 29:23

**NPOS** 29:15,22 30:20 96:15

**NSO** 88:21

**number** 57:15,16,17 63:14,17 69:3 79:25 82:24 83:25 93:24

**numbers** 29:14,16 80:4 81:10, 11 82:15 83:8 91:13 116:3

numerous 20:20 22:20 73:17 104:7

0

Oakland 75:24

objective 8:12

obtained 15:7

**obvious** 100:25

occasions 104:7

occupant 101:15

occur 13:15

**OCI** 25:15

October 20:13,14 98:5,6

offense 115:8

offenses 115:4

offer 35:15 36:25 116:17

office 5:22 10:14 18:18 22:1 104:15

officer 7:11 21:21 22:5 25:23 28:22 31:23 35:25 37:16 51:21 63:23 69:6 77:24,25 79:6 84:1,24 105:22 106:2,4 107:15 109:4 113:8,17

officers 7:11,15,18 18:7 28:1 31:20 32:12 35:12,13,21 36:8, 11 38:23 52:1,2 69:4,6,14

09/05/2019

77:7,15 78:22 79:5,16,20 80:15 81:20 84:14,23 85:5,10, 15 89:6 90:22 91:5 92:10.11

108:17 116:1,5,18

officials 7:3 41:10,15

older 51:6 111:21

ongoing 43:10,14 47:16 71:24

73:15 78:16 79:9 92:6

open 11:8,10,15 93:23 94:2,3, 19 95:2 107:19,21 114:18 115:24 116:4 117:11

operating 40:17

operation 10:14

operational 43:5 44:9

Operations 22:2

opinion 69:19 102:14

**opportunities** 32:21 82:19

99:14

opportunity 12:20 18:22 34:3,

11 108:7,8

**oppose** 63:19

**opposed** 4:21 5:7 16:10,24 17:13 24:3 59:12 61:24 62:25 95:23 103:4

**option** 87:21

oral 98:9

order 12:16 33:4.20 34:15 55:18 94:6,10 95:21

orderly 11:22

ordinances 107:2

organization 8:24 50:2 68:4

organizational 10:15,21,22

106:22

organizations 44:22 75:22 88:20 90:12 106:17

Organized 20:16

original 57:11

**Orleans** 9:14 96:18

outbreaks 25:3

outline 40:6

outlined 10:10

outlines 42:3

outstanding 13:18 19:9,14,17

oversight 8:2,10,19,23 9:16

ow 102:11

Ρ

**p.m.** 118:4

**pace** 67:15

packages 10:3

pages 51:1 66:1,2

paid 34:22

painfully 100:24

par 69:16

Park 31:4

Parks 22:18

parliamentarian 13:3

part 43:1 44:17 48:12 55:25

91:10 112:16

participate 11:5

participated 33:22

participation 9:18

partners 81:23 90:18

partnership 78:13,14

**passed** 112:3

passionate 88:23

past 11:19 15:18 32:24 93:10

patient 27:7

**Patrol** 20:18

pattern 9:11

pause 101:12

pawns 99:14

pay 13:8 34:5

**PD** 109:16

**peace** 75:1

peer 47:3 64:16

peer-to-peer 43:20 47:3,8

peer-to-peer's 47:5

pen 115:3

pending 29:4 48:21 60:20 106:24

people 3:10 7:6 34:19 37:15 56:1 70:8 73:1 78:18 81:18 82:2 83:9,10 86:9,13 87:10 88:22 91:4,25 96:1,7 99:11,13 100:3,19 101:3,14 102:12 106:5,18 111:21 117:5,14

**percent** 24:21,23 35:13 64:25 70:5 75:19,20 105:18

Perfect 22:15

perform 50:1 57:6

performance 85:10

**period** 19:8 71:24 72:22 92:6 104:4

periods 7:21

permitted 43:8

perpetrators 68:8

**person** 26:25 55:18 75:18 76:9 83:23 106:2 109:1

personality 80:22

personally 19:10 88:13

Personnel 10:20

persons 68:16 79:11 81:2 117:4

persuaded 102:1

pervasive 107:5

petition 87:18

Petty 98:19 106:7,8

phenomenal 25:21

phenomenon 51:13

phone 113:17

**phones** 15:12

photo 114:4

photograph 64:10,11,24

photographs 66:2

**photos** 103:19

piece 62:1 63:1

piggyback 37:4

pilot 85:5,16

**place** 15:12 56:7 64:3 67:17 69:6,19 71:8 85:15 107:24 108:11

**places** 102:23

plan 56:2

planning 9:17

plans 67:7 80:24

play 85:14

played 25:25

pleasing 99:9,10,14

pleasure 55:12 100:1

**PM** 3:3 7:23,24 9:3 98:2,6

**point** 8:14 11:14 13:1 16:1 38:21 57:23 64:15 71:19 76:4 94:6 101:16 112:9

pointed 92:2

points 44:6

police 3:5 7:16,19,21 8:1,3,7, 8,9 9:12,22 11:24 13:6 15:10, 23 16:14 18:7,12,18 21:3,19, 21 22:2,5,23 23:3,7,9 24:7 25:17 27:21,23 28:1 31:1,12, 16,18,23,25 32:11 35:12,13, 21,25 36:8 38:23 39:23 41:11, 19 46:3,11,12,17 48:13 51:20, 24,25 52:2,10,23 54:19 55:9 56:13 57:5,12,24 58:11 59:16 63:23 65:25 68:22,24 69:4,5, 6,13 71:11,12 73:6,12,16 74:3

75:25 77:24 78:11,12,19 80:6, 15 85:20 87:14 88:15,18 91:5 92:10,11 93:20,21 94:16,17, 24,25 96:23 97:6 103:1,11 104:10,18 105:19,20,22 106:1,4,9,13 108:17,18 109:16,19 112:1

Police's 17:3

**policies** 40:24 58:9 61:13 71:20 103:7 111:4

policing 9:10

**policy** 8:7 11:24 14:2 39:12, 16,19,21,24 40:10,12,20,22 41:2,3,5 42:1,24 43:4,5,25 44:8,16 45:1 46:3,4,15,16 47:19 48:4,17 49:2,3 50:7 55:2,10 56:6,19,25 57:1,25 58:5,25 59:14,23 60:4 61:5 71:1,4,9,12,21 73:4,19 101:7 111:8

**Polly** 5:21 6:4

poorest 75:18

populated 113:11

**population** 69:16 88:1 89:10, 22 103:25 104:4

**porch** 100:3

**posing** 47:18

positions 10:1 19:18 25:18

positive 52:6

potential 51:23

potentially 115:8

poverty 75:19

Powerpoint 40:2,4 42:18

practice 9:11 11:25 66:5

practices 8:8 14:7 44:23

precinct 20:4,9,13,16,19 21:24 22:3 25:24 70:15,18 82:5 92:4 98:3,7 109:14,21 110:7 111:18

predict 49:19

predictive 49:18

Presbyterian 98:7

presence 51:20

presentation 14:18,19,23 39:12 40:2,4,7 42:19 49:22 50:10 70:14 76:25 103:3 111:4 114:17,20

presentations 13:25

presented 51:2 57:8

**presenting** 39:17 59:12

president 58:12,13 111:1

**pressure** 106:22 115:25 116:2,3,6

pretty 19:11 103:22

prevalent 80:22 86:7

preventative 45:6

prevention 79:3,18

previously 42:24 47:23 60:19

preyed 115:14

primarily 43:4

primary 30:10 65:16

**print** 15:5

prior 5:11

priorities 7:13

priority 31:7

private 44:22

privilege 12:15 19:1

**Pro** 58:13

probable 44:2 65:6,8 115:3

**problem** 67:20 86:12 88:22 89:1 103:13 105:7 107:22

108:2

problematic 64:2 103:17

procedures 13:5 46:11 58:10

61:13 103:7

proceedings 118:3

**process** 9:17 10:10 13:10 47:7,8 54:17,21 55:7 65:24 66:18 67:10 72:11,13 73:4,9, 17 81:13 99:4

produced 57:17

**product** 18:12 32:25 35:8,24

**professional** 21:1 23:5 25:14, 18 26:16 41:8 76:19 77:2 110:20

professionalism 20:24 22:25 23:12

professor 9:7,8,10

**program** 33:2,21,24 34:13 35:2,4 41:10 71:15 78:20 84:16 85:5,8,16 116:12

programs 33:13 79:15

progress 24:18,25

prohibit 44:21 54:6

prohibition 49:8,11,16,18

prohibitions 42:17 45:20 49:1

**prohibits** 37:24 38:7

project 81:14

projected 113:24

promise 52:20

promised 28:23

promoted 20:6,11 22:7 25:9

34:16,17

promotions 36:3 100:9

properly 82:8 95:5 117:25

property 24:22 104:20

proponent 102:5

propose 80:24

**proposed** 14:4 40:20,22 41:2, 3 42:1 60:4 103:8

prosecution 70:2

protect 8:11 113:9

protecting 61:14

protection 7:12

protections 49:23

protective 50:9

proud 26:1 27:23

**provide** 3:15 7:17 8:2 10:13 11:21 14:3 46:22 57:13 61:12, 13 62:7 78:16 84:17

**provided** 22:12 59:8 79:17 81:6 89:24

providing 5:14

provision 45:2

**provisions** 47:23,24 48:6 58:8 60:3

public 11:25 12:1 15:4 21:723:1,11 41:21 43:5 44:9,2152:17,18 55:21 57:25 58:275:5 94:3 98:10 107:25108:14 109:15 113:10,20

public's 12:5

publications 50:14

**pulled** 109:1

punished 55:20

punishment 55:22

purchase 59:3

**purged** 44:19

purpose 42:6,23 43:3 71:5

**purposes** 47:13 49:17

**push** 25:5

**pushed** 101:1 114:12

put 28:1 32:22 49:10 65:3 89:12 93:18,19 105:12,17 106:22 107:6 111:13 113:8

putting 27:22 54:15 97:15

Q

quality 8:12 114:25

quarter 25:5 104:4

**question** 53:19 54:12 55:16, 25 61:21 70:25 82:23 83:20 84:2,12,20 86:8 95:10

questioning 113:2

**questions** 10:24 27:14,17,19 29:10 39:10 50:23 53:18 58:25 59:19 82:20 92:24

quick 27:19

quickly 36:2

**Quinn** 5:12

quorum 4:10

quoted 68:4

R

race 51:25 52:4

racially 107:5

Racian 13:9

radar 114:4

raised 74:15 75:3

rank 15:24 16:6,15,21 17:4,9 20:7,11,15 22:7

ranked 7:12

ranks 9:24

rapidly 60:22

rash 96:24

rate 26:6 69:16 75:20 87:24 88:6

re-emphasizes 49:23

reach 40:10

reaching 90:21

reactions 14:14

read 13:22 58:2,5 62:3 69:18

reads 10:17

real 51:4 70:8 99:11

realtime 41:12 49:9

reason 37:13 51:21 58:8 64:4,

16 68:15 77:4 83:4 91:11 93:8 101:11

reasonable 44:1 65:6,8

reasons 62:10,20,23 77:5

receive 23:19 31:6 33:17 34:11 43:10,14 48:8 55:22 103:3

received 14:13 20:20 40:24 41:12 43:12 80:20 82:9

receives 7:14

receiving 14:17 42:8 82:2 85:13 86:15 91:25

recent 25:22 59:9,17 96:24

recipient 22:14

recipients 82:7

recognition 14:5,8,16 21:5
22:18,19 23:10 39:18,25
40:14 41:9,13,17 42:7,22,25
43:9,22 45:7,11 46:10 47:7,17
48:9 49:4,8,12 50:1 51:9,13
52:14 53:21 54:1,3,7 55:19,23
57:15 58:8 60:11,18 61:24
62:6 63:1,19,24 65:9 68:9
70:13 72:16 100:25 103:4,14
104:2,6,8 106:10,14,20 107:9,
18 108:16,20,24 109:2 111:3
112:7 115:23 116:20 117:2,9

recognize 17:17 63:21

recognized 12:14 58:17 101:3

recognizing 17:24

recommendation 43:7,16,20, 24 44:7,14,24 45:9 46:6,14,20 47:14,22 48:5,15 49:7,15,17 55:4 57:4 59:14 60:1

recommendations 9:23 10:6, 8 11:15 14:4,9,11,17 39:18,25 40:11,12 41:8,23,25 42:2,21 44:4 45:16 47:1 50:14,19 54:16 59:14 71:6 109:23 117:1

**recommended** 56:24 57:1

reconcile 58:19 113:15,21

**record** 5:12 7:5 13:23 29:18 74:14 95:18 96:3 100:23 102:8

recorded 96:6

Recreation 98:3

recruits 77:19 78:3,9

red 111:24 114:3

reduces 77:6

reducing 69:10

reduction 24:21

refer 50:17 56:23

reference 72:5 73:5

references 50:11,16,19 51:1

referring 33:12

reflect 74:14

reform 9:9

**refute** 43:19

regard 21:9 40:25 60:18 61:19

regional 81:14,23

registration 93:9

regulation 60:23,24

**regulations** 48:19,24 101:10, 20

reimbursement 34:21

related 7:18 42:6,12 57:14 107:3

**relates** 24:22 41:16 47:17 48:8 51:14 52:4 61:14

relating 48:7

Relations 109:10

relationship 81:16 110:12,18, 20

release 102:6

relevant 90:14

rely 32:15 36:11,12 64:14,21 66:13 113:17

remain 37:10 remarks 7:16

remedy 11:21

remember 40:23 55:15

remembers 74:25

remind 8:17 33:4

removing 114:9

renew 67:12

repeat 55:6

repeating 95:9

**report** 7:9,14 10:6 14:24 15:10 24:5 28:23 39:24 44:5 48:6 50:18,20 57:13 60:2,14 66:6 86:1 90:3 91:24 92:25

reported 26:20 48:2,13

reporter 5:15 102:6

reporting 48:14 83:22

reports 61:25 92:18

represent 3:6 110:4

Representative 38:14

representatives 7:4

representing 106:18

represents 21:1

Republican 112:15

request 13:7 15:23 16:5,14,20 17:3,8 41:5 45:10 50:1 102:5 110:21

requested 3:13 60:7

requesting 14:25

requests 57:15

require 11:9 47:2 48:18 50:1

101:17

**required** 42:8,16 44:1 45:12, 18,19,21 46:25 61:1 80:13 96:5

requirement 47:19,20 101:2

requirements 48:7

requires 46:21

requiring 45:1

rescinded 41:1

research 41:7 50:12,13 52:6 53:24 61:22,23 62:5 116:21

researched 71:7

residents 8:13 116:12

resolution 19:22 20:1 21:5,16

23:9

resolutions 13:18,21,22,24

23:23 77:12

resolve 75:1 80:25

resolved 21:2 23:6 27:2 89:1

resolving 89:21

resources 32:11 68:12,21

79:13,17 83:5 88:19

respect 29:21 50:3 99:4

respected 23:4

respond 28:4 34:24 35:1

81:18 83:20

responders 77:13

responding 77:6

responds 26:19 84:5

response 26:18 27:5 63:13

77:11,16 80:17 81:2 85:1

105:16,17

responses 31:6 80:10,12

responsibilities 43:17,22

responsibility 10:19

responsive 30:2,11 106:24

restarting 61:8

restricted 29:6

restructured 72:10

result 41:24 81:7

resume 19:14

retaining 45:5

retention 44:15,20

retirement 13:17 21:11 22:10

retiring 21:17

returning 38:24

reupping 67:8

**Rev** 101:21

review 10:5 12:19 14:7,12

40:21 41:4,7,14 46:1 47:7,8,9,

11 59:7,13,17 64:16 73:14

reviewed 50:16 92:23 101:24

reviewing 11:14 58:25

reviews 8:6

revise 54:18

revised 39:21 41:3 90:9

revolving 87:9

rewards 23:14

rid 107:4

**riders** 104:19

rigger 66:17 67:21

rights 8:11 106:16 117:7

**Risk** 21:25

**Rivere** 104:14

ro 3:14

robberies 24:19

**Robert** 5:24 15:7 98:11,17

99:1 102:16 104:13 106:7 107:13 109:6 110:24 112:12

115:18 117:19

**Roberts** 11:9 94:10

robust 41:7 73:22 114:14

role 13:2 25:25 85:14

roll 92:10 95:19 96:3,5

rolling 81:13,22 92:11

rollout 82:4 89:19 91:7

room 6:16 108:13 113:10



roots 106:22

Rosa 22:18

**Rose** 5:14

roughly 103:25

rules 11:9 13:4 94:10 107:23

108:1

run 80:15 83:14 87:14

running 108:14

runs 80:6 84:14,22,23 85:7,14

**Russell** 14:22 76:17,18,19 83:7,18 84:15,25 85:18 86:14 87:13 89:15 90:2,7,16 91:6,20 92:15

S

**S-157** 13:9

sacrifice 18:15

**safe** 27:9,20

safeguard 45:6 63:22

safeguarding 61:14

safeguards 64:3 65:4

**safest** 111:16

safety 7:12 77:8 107:7,24

**San** 62:17

sanctioned 71:19

Santana 38:14,19

sat 31:3 51:19

Saturday 96:14

save 28:2 76:3

**scale** 29:23

scared 108:14

scene 81:5 84:2

schedule 14:15 112:19

scheduled 82:12

scholarship 34:10

scholarships 35:15

school 9:7 32:12 36:1

Schoolcraft 111:2

**Schools** 109:16

**scout** 63:3

**scream** 112:4

screens 40:5

scrubbing 61:5,7

scrutiny 56:2

searches 50:2 68:11

seated 15:8

seats 91:15

**Seattle** 90:22

seconded 95:6

**secret** 25:17

**Secretary** 4:9 5:10 10:17 53:1

54:13 92:19 96:6

section 9:6 10:17 20:8 21:22,

24 45:17 48:25 58:10

secure 27:20 71:14

secured 8:24

security 22:12 44:22

seek 13:23

seemingly 51:14

self-care 79:18

senate 48:22 107:1

**Senator** 38:17,18

send 74:2

senior 6:6 78:17,18 116:23

sense 59:11 99:15 106:4

senseless 25:3

**sensitive** 51:22 61:15

sensitivity 110:3

sentiments 53:12

separate 63:15

**September** 3:2 4:18 8:20 9:3 12:25 98:2 109:21 115:24

sergeant 20:7 33:5

seriousness 70:3

servant 18:24

servants 113:11,21

serve 18:23 22:9 68:15

served 20:12,22 21:23 22:23

**service** 18:15 21:7 23:1,11 27:13 30:20 79:25 82:25

83:22

**services** 5:13 22:3 82:5,6

84:18

serving 27:22 99:13 109:24

session 13:12,16

settlement 9:13

**Sexual** 24:17

**Sgt** 5:12 13:8 99:20

shaking 69:11

**share** 21:16 30:19 31:4,12

96:12 109:22

shared 68:5

sharing 44:21

Sheriff's 9:14

Shirley 4:2

**shoes** 26:5

shootings 24:14

**show** 94:1

showing 74:20

**shows** 103:9

side 29:21 39:2 99:22

significant 67:15

silent 96:2

**simple** 68:23

**simply** 31:19 60:6

sincerity 100:12

single 75:18 76:9 87:11

sir 17:19 30:8 35:18 37:1 60:12 62:4 84:19 85:23 86:19 90:1,7,17 92:16 95:10,20 96:4 97:13 98:1 99:1 102:15

**sitting** 5:16 33:23 75:22

**situation** 26:24 58:19 80:14 100:15 109:2

**situations** 31:22 61:6 80:23, 25 82:10 84:6 85:9 89:9 90:15

sixth 82:24

skills 20:10 79:10

**Slappy** 30:21 32:6 96:15

slide 82:24

**Sloan** 35:1

**Smith** 98:17,24 99:6,7

**social** 84:12,16,21 85:6,13 92:3,5,10

**software** 54:3 57:18 59:3 62:24 63:7,8,14

**solely** 66:13

solidity 68:6

**solution** 103:15,23

**solve** 57:16

Somerville 62:18

son 86:11

Sonya 14:22

sooner 108:3

**sort** 45:14 62:13 103:19 112:24 114:7

**sounds** 88:18

source 102:25 114:23,24

**South** 98:3

Southeast 109:9

**speak** 12:15 17:20 19:9 31:10 33:3 72:4 93:15 107:15 112:21

**speaker** 8:25 15:5,11 98:13,23 115:19 117:20

speakers 98:25

**speaking** 21:3 23:7 30:21 37:5,21 69:18,19 75:23 99:3

speaks 44:24 74:17

**Special** 9:6 20:8 22:4,9 26:18 27:4 80:17 81:1

specialization 11:2

specialized 11:13

specific 12:2,10 42:11 92:24

**specifically** 30:21 107:3

**speeds** 65:23

spending 114:5

**spoke** 113:7

sponsored 78:20

spot 32:22

**spots** 35:22

squatters 99:19,21 100:3

**SRT** 80:21

**St** 98:7

**staff** 5:9,19,22,25 6:14,17 10:5 19:13 53:4 54:15 57:5

**Stair** 6:16 18:22 33:10,11 35:3,17 36:24

stand 7:4 28:10,12

stand-alone 63:10

standard 44:1,2 77:20 78:1

**Standards** 25:15,19

standing 92:17

**Star** 22:17

**start** 6:15 24:8 37:18 42:19 86:5 111:8 117:6

started 17:23 85:5 86:5

starting 25:12 40:13

state 22:14 33:2,13 35:8 36:18

37:12,23 38:7 48:17 56:25 60:10,17 77:20,24 87:21 88:8, 13,16,24 89:25 101:10 106:11,23 109:14 114:8

stated 43:3 67:13 99:10

**statement** 27:19 49:6 72:10 88:10 94:13,22 107:15

**states** 22:13 61:23 69:1 90:22 106:12.19

statistics 14:25

status 29:7

status/suspension 13:8

stay 56:9 79:5 89:20

stayed 39:5

step 17:22 54:14 73:25 74:1

step-by-step 46:11

stepped 97:7

Stewart 6:8

stick 94:8

**stigma** 77:13

stipulating 91:11

**stood** 104:21

stop 31:22,23 101:11 108:14

stopped 51:21

stories 27:4

straightforward 103:22

strapping 68:16

strategies 77:9

streaming 62:13

**street** 75:24 87:25 96:16 98:4 100:2 111:15,19

strengthen 11:20 12:20

stress 68:13 116:1

stresses 79:7

stressors 79:19

strict 48:3



strictly 67:21

**structure** 10:25 11:16 12:2

struggle 11:17

stuck 73:18

student 35:5

studying 51:12

stumbled 52:7

**subcommittee** 10:25 11:4,16 71:4,9

subcommittees 11:7,10

**subject** 14:8 52:7 60:21,24 99:9 115:6

submit 12:24 55:9 69:5

submitted 40:19 101:8

substance 79:18

suburban 86:17

**success** 24:25

successfully 70:20 110:23

suffer 77:17 78:23 81:4

suffering 27:1 83:23 84:9

**suffers** 87:15

sufficient 12:10 68:16

**suggested** 68:21 109:23

suggestion 69:3

suggests 10:21

**suicide** 78:6 79:3,18

summary 14:3

**summer** 109:13

**Sunday** 99:8 115:25

**Super** 22:19

superbly 26:13

supervising 6:6 10:19 53:4

**supervisor** 33:5 43:17,23 64:17 104:25

supervisors 43:18 47:2,4,10

09/05/2019

supervisory 8:3 20:10 47:9

**support** 4:15 5:1 7:10 12:10 15:22,25 16:5,14,17,19 17:3,6 23:21 25:8 68:1 96:7 109:24

**supported** 4:17 5:3 16:4,19 17:8 23:23 67:11

**supposed** 52:13,16,17 58:18 59:19

**Supreme** 11:19

**surveillance** 49:9,12,13 62:12 107:9

**suspect** 66:3 67:19 115:3

suspects 26:10 48:12

suspicion 44:2 65:6,8

sustained 78:15

switch 63:5

sworn 38:24

symposium 79:1,21

**system** 40:17 42:14 43:9,11, 14 45:8 46:9,10,24 47:17 48:9 54:8 61:3,9 63:9 72:22,24 103:16,20

systems 52:9 63:11

Т

table 9:21 15:6

tactical 22:2 80:24

takes 74:21

taking 31:9 71:8 86:5 90:4 102:21

talented 25:8

talk 25:2 28:15 35:21 65:5 69:23 70:5,11 72:23 76:20 77:3 78:17 79:2,3 80:2 82:24 89:17 104:24 107:18 110:14, 22 116:20

**talked** 25:10 72:19 88:20 104:22 116:24

**talking** 25:14 33:1 71:20 78:18 114:17 117:12,16

talks 57:2 79:9

**Tanian** 73:16

tape 101:25

taping 5:13

targets 117:13

task 24:23 90:11

**Tawana** 98:19

teach 35:12

teaches 78:22

**team** 6:18 26:19 27:5 28:14 70:14 80:17 81:2 89:19 90:20 91:8

technical 54:2 61:13

techniques 14:21 77:7 90:14

techno-racism 76:9

technology 41:10,17 42:7,13, 23,25 43:9 49:4,14 51:14 60:11,21 62:7,10,16 64:6,15, 22,23 65:2,12,19,23 66:11,14 67:14,16,17,25 68:19,22,25 69:13,23,25 70:4,21 72:25 74:22 75:7 100:25 101:19 102:22 103:5,14 104:2,6,9 107:6,18 108:20,24 109:2 112:4 113:23

teenagers 52:5

telling 36:4

**Tem** 58:13

term 54:2

terminology 51:11

**terms** 19:17 32:11 36:3,10 42:9 48:12 67:8 73:8,17,20 86:25 116:7

Thanksgiving 7:20

Theft 13:10

**thing** 31:14,18 45:14 62:13 63:24 71:18 72:12 90:5



101:13 105:1,7,21 112:3,9 113:22

**things** 26:7 30:12 59:4 62:24 63:1 70:12 79:4,20 80:3 83:25 86:3 89:3 103:16,21 112:18

thinking 62:9 68:6

third-party 57:6

thought 33:24 79:15

thought-out 91:24

thoughtful 27:7

threat 108:13

threshold 115:4

thrilled 99:25 100:18,19

**Thursday** 3:2 7:24 98:2,6

Thursdays 7:23

ticket 93:9,12,14

tight 58:23

time 3:19 4:12,22 5:8 6:10,22 7:2,8 8:22 15:20 19:8,21 24:5 27:3 31:9 34:18 39:6,11 40:21 50:21 51:7,11 52:24 53:14 55:11 65:1 67:11 71:24 72:9, 18,22,25 73:13 76:4 78:15 81:9 87:22 90:4 92:6,11 99:4 101:16 102:21 105:17 108:12 111:6,22 114:13

timely 62:2

times 12:3 24:24 26:24 28:15 31:16 63:14 70:6,19 82:9 83:21 84:8,9 88:2

tirelessly 22:22

today 3:7,14 4:13,18 5:13,15 6:5 13:17 14:17 15:16 16:2 29:19 32:23 39:17 40:3,7 44:6 52:12 53:7 66:11,12,15 71:23 72:14 75:23 76:20 103:8 106:17 112:25 117:17

today's 3:13 6:5 24:10

told 53:9 55:8 86:11

tomorrow 33:15 37:1

tone 103:22

tool 65:7 103:19

top 61:21 101:9

topic 53:20 89:12

**topics** 11:13

total 41:25 77:23 78:9

touch 26:11

touched 112:6

tough 92:11

tour 41:13

toured 41:11

town 86:6

townhall 117:17

track 56:6 74:9

traffic 63:15

train 77:4,19

trained 37:15 82:8,14

trainers 37:14

training 14:20,22 32:3 42:8 43:10,15 64:18,20 76:20 77:3, 18,22 78:5,11,16 79:9,13,17, 24 80:20 81:17,22,24 82:3,9, 11,19 85:19 86:2 89:8,17 90:23 91:4 93:7

**Transit** 109:16

transmit 14:10 59:15 61:18

**transmitted** 9:23 10:3 13:7 39:22 40:20 41:3 57:24 60:5

transparency 47:13 102:4

transparent 26:9

transport 80:13

trauma 115:10,15

treat 106:5

treated 101:3 110:7

treatment 85:11

tremendous 20:5 22:6 29:22

**Trojan** 112:24

trouble 108:23

true 107:7 117:13

trust 56:18,19

**Tuesday** 9:2 117:17

tuition 34:6,20,21

turn 5:22

turnover 87:24 88:6

tweak 54:18

two-hour 78:21 79:22

type 83:14

U

**U.S.** 9:5

unarmed 86:10

unconstitutional 104:8

underreporting 84:3

underrepresentation 83:5

understand 38:9 51:10,17 86:2 91:5,12 102:11

understanding 11:12 53:20 75:6 87:1 110:17

understands 66:17

underway 9:18

undue 88:14

unintended 29:25

union 13:11

unions 59:22,25

**Unit** 22:4,9,15

United 22:13 69:1 106:12,19

**units** 63:3

University 116:24

unknown 81:9

unlike 32:23

unnecessarily 89:10

unnecessary 8:8

unreal 25:13

unreliable 117:3

up-to-date 59:10

update 14:25 101:22

**updated** 90:9,13

updating 90:19

upset 117:15

usual 106:8

utilized 72:21

utilizing 43:11 54:2

٧

verbal 25:4

verbally 58:15

version 59:10,17

veterans 13:20

vibrate 15:13

Vice-chair 15:17 93:10

victims 26:12 75:1

video 62:12 102:6,7,8 104:20

105:20,21

view 36:2 99:13

viewing 3:10,11

views 12:4

violate 49:24 59:23

violated 94:20

violates 107:19

violation 93:22 107:21 114:18

violations 46:15,16,18 48:2

50:4 58:5,6

**violence** 25:2,3 83:3 84:23

85:7 92:5 116:13

violent 24:21 43:1 44:18 48:12

74:24 83:2

**VIPS** 7:3

virtual 65:17,19

visiting 9:6

visitors 8:13

vocabulary 99:16

**voice** 12:4

volatile 80:25

volunteer 9:19,20

**vote** 12:8 14:15 54:25 55:1,3, 11 95:9,12,17,19 96:2,3 106:9

107:10 112:11

voting 14:16 19:15 96:7

W

wait 74:7 108:4

**walked** 17:25

Walker 13:20 21:17,18,21

22:5,12,22 23:16,20,25

**Walker's** 23:10

wanted 19:6 26:10 29:12 30:19 31:14,15 34:25 50:7

57:20 67:19 96:22 102:20 104:18 110:13 115:23 116:9.

17

warrant 68:1

Washington 116:22

watch 56:8 107:8

watched 104:16

waving 24:25

Wayne 33:2,13 35:7,8,9 36:17,

18 82:2,16 91:9,13,16,21

ways 107:7

wear 111:23

**week** 7:20 26:21 29:3 69:8 81:22 87:11 90:23 93:19

01.22 07.11 90.23 93.19

94:20 110:6 116:7

weekend 27:21

**weekly** 3:5 7:14 56:20 57:10, 12

weeks 7:22 9:22 10:10 13:14 24:11,15 28:24 93:13

welcomed 85:3

wellness 77:22 79:8

white 14:1,2,10 39:13,14,16 50:23 52:2,3 53:2,10,24 54:9 55:17 58:20 59:6,24 60:12,16 61:11 62:4 67:1 70:25 71:3 72:3 73:21 74:2 75:14,15 101:15

White's 14:6

who-done-it 70:21

wife 86:11

William 3:25

Williams 98:18 102:16,17,18

Willie 4:5 17:17

witnessed 85:12

women 32:4,5 117:5,14

wonderful 99:20 100:11

wondering 68:15 83:4

word 31:16,17

words 106:1

work 5:14,18 8:17 9:8 11:5 12:1,5,21 14:6 19:17,18 24:23 25:21 26:23 27:4 30:11 54:21 65:25 70:4 84:17 88:5,25 89:19 92:5 110:15

**worked** 25:15,16 53:6 69:11 85:8

workers 84:13,17,21 85:6,13 92:3.10

**working** 25:23 40:3 85:6 90:9, 11,17

workings 46:9

works 12:7 26:2 38:4

world 37:15 101:11

worth 38:11

write 111:7

writing 43:18 45:13 47:4,12

written 44:5 50:18 56:5,7

58:15

wrong 76:11 112:8

**Wyrick** 5:17 6:1 37:6,21 38:5, 6,13,18

Χ

XL 22:19

Υ

y'all 105:2

yard 99:23

year 8:23 13:20 25:6 34:11 36:9 40:18 48:8 82:12,15 104:2 113:24

**yearly** 48:18 78:25 79:21 90:19

years 20:22 21:6 22:25 23:10 32:13,24 33:14 36:13 37:11, 17 38:4 39:4,5,6 66:1 71:15, 21 85:16 104:10 113:4

Yesterday 13:6

York 68:24 104:5 108:17,19

**young** 19:10 52:1,3,5 109:4 117:5

Young's 107:15

Youth 21:22,23