

Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners

Date of Meeting: August 8, 2019 - 6:30 PM

Location: Samaritan Center - Carolyn Cheeks Kilpatrick Room, 5555 Conner St., Detroit, MI 48213

BOPC Chairperson Lisa Carter called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 6:30 PM (August 8, 2019)

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance		
	Attend	Not-Attend
Lisa Carter, Chairperson	Yes	
Eva Garza Dewaelsche, Vice Chairperson	Yes	
Willie E. Bell	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Evette Griffie	Yes	
Jim Holley	Excused	
Annie Mae Holt	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	10	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for August 8, 2019.

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes: Thursday, August 1, 2019

BOPC Chairperson Lisa R. Carter: Good Evening! I am Police Commissioner Lisa Carter, I represent District #6. I serve as the Chair of the Board and will be conducting our meeting tonight. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance, thank you for joining us. For people viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for viewing our meeting.

At the top of our meeting, I ask the Board and the people in attendance to join me in a moment of reflection to acknowledge some of the most horrific events in our recent memory. On August 3, 2019 in El Paso, Texas, 22 people were killed and 24 injured by what is commonly known as a person motivated by white supremacy. And on August 4, 2019 in Dayton, Ohio another 10 people were killed and 26 injured. The individuals impacted by these events were young and old, Black, Brown and white, citizens and immigrants, male and female, all of which were tragically impacted by the use of guns that should be illegal in the United States.

I direct your attention to the October 27, 2018 mass shootings at The Tree of Life, Jewish Synagogue in Pittsburgh. Eleven people were killed and seven were injured all while attending a religious ceremony in the synagogue by a white nationalist. I want to also reflect on the June 17, 2015, murders at Mother Emanuel AME Church in Charleston, South Carolina. Mother Emanuel Church was founded in 1816 and is one of the oldest Black congregations in the south. Mother Emanuel with its rich history of resistance and support to the community did not survive the corrosive and sick ideology of white supremacy. The death toll at Mother Emanuel was 9 killed and several others injured. I want to also reflect on the many cries that "Black Lives Matter" and the difficulty that our federal government has in calling "a spade a spade" in the murder of Eric Garner. On July 17, 2014, Eric Garner died in the New York City borough of Staten Island after Daniel Pantaleo, a New York City Police Officer, applied an illegal chokehold while arresting him for the sale of two cigarettes. These and other events are forcing a needed discussion on race, white supremacy and gun violence that is long overdue. I ask that we reflect on the tragic loss of life and what it is doing to our communities. One of the people killed in any of these horrific events might have grown to develop a universal cure for cancer or become the next Nobel Peace Awardee.

I work with young people at Wayne State University, I see their potential. It is a crime to snuff out their lives before they have an opportunity to explore and enjoy life or make their contributions to our society. I ask for 1 moment of silent reflection for the young and old, each race and ethnicity and belief structure at home and around the world.

>> Silent Reflection.

This is the 8th community meeting held this year by the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners. Tonight we are in Precinct #5, Detroit Voting District #4. I want to thank Samaritan Center for the use of the Carolyn Cheeks Kilpatrick Room. The

Commissioners representing Precinct #5 is Willie Bell and Willie Burton. I ask Commissioner Willie Bell to welcome the Board and the audience to District #4. Today, we have invited Chaplain Valerie Parks to provide the invocation. Chaplain Zenobia Robinson provided the invocation.

Chairperson Carter ask for introductions of Commissioners. Carter continued, thank you Commissioners, it is good to see each of you tonight. Commissioner Annie Holt will be arriving late today, she is volunteering with the FCA employment process designed to help Detroiters obtain jobs in the automobile industry. Chairperson Carter also asked Mark Owens, executive director for the Samaritan Center, to bring greetings. The Samaritan Center is a hub of community activity, including health services, employment services and a job center, Head Start for children, ARISE Detroit and other services and organizations. Chairperson Carter asked Jay Henderson, President of the 5th Precinct Police-Community Relations Council to welcome us to the 5th precinct. The 5th Precinct Police-Community Relations Council meets every first Wednesday (except July and August). Finally, Carter asked for the introductions of the Deputy Chief of Police Marlin Wilson, representing Chief of Police James Craig, BOPC and DPD staff and other civic leaders and representatives.

Chairperson's Report: Chairperson Lisa Carter said, "As many of you may know, part of my background in law enforcement is in training. As a trainer, I am accustomed to repeating changes in procedures to other law enforcement personnel three times to allow for it to be heard by the broadest audience. I also want citizens attending our evening meetings to have the same access to information as others who attend the regular daytime meetings. Therefore, before getting to the core of my report, I want to repeat for the third time some information that I shared with the audience at previous meetings. I want to call attention to a change in our procedure. Typically, we create an opportunity for the public to address the Board under PUBLIC COMMENTS at the end of our meetings. The practice is consistent with the Open Meetings Act.

Previously, I introduced two changes to our practice. (1) If the Board will be voting on a policy recommendation, I will allow a special public comment period before the vote. This special public comment period will be restricted to the policy under consideration. (2) The normal Public Comments at the end of the meeting will remain as part of our standard agenda. However, if you would like to speak in public comments at the end of our meetings, you will have to provide a card acknowledging your interests to address the Board no later than the end of the Chief of Police's Report.

For clarity, the Board of Police Commissioners does not require people attending our meetings to show identification or to identify themselves as a condition to participate in our meetings. However, the Public Safety Headquarters Building does require identification. The Board does not operate the Public Safety Headquarters Building. The enhanced security of public facilities go back to the provisions of the Patriot Act and are implemented in all federal, state and local governmental buildings. As you can see, at our community meetings which are normally held in non-governmental settings like the Samaritan Center, we do not have security checks unless it is required by the host facility. With these announcements and clarifications, I will continue with my normal Chairperson's Report.

On behalf of the Board, I want to express our concern and support for fallen and injured officers. Our concerns for officer safety and citizen protection is ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers. I would ask Deputy Chief of Police Marlin Wilson during his remarks to provide us with any additional information related to injured and fallen officers. The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas Holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters 3 weeks in the month on Thursdays at 3:00 PM. We also meet in the community every 2nd Thursday of the month at 6:30 PM.

Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our citizens are justified in asking "How does civilian oversight of law enforcement help you as a citizen within our community?" Our answer is, we protect the civil rights of citizens. Oversight organizations like the BOPC are at the forefront of investigating, reviewing and auditing individual cases of citizen complaints and patterns of operations by police agencies to eliminate misconduct, discriminatory police practices and unnecessary use of force by police. Our work is based on developing and supporting effective policing. Mutual trust and respect between the police and the community is critical toward increasing the quality of life for residents and visitors to Detroit. The Board of Police Commissioners exists to provide civilian oversight for the work of the Detroit Police Department. As a Board, we receive and investigate non-criminal citizens' complaints, monitor the operations of the Department and work with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to make or modify police policy.

I want to point to several important items for your consideration and information. The Board of Police Commissioners received a modified version of the Chief's proposed directive on facial recognition and it has been referred to our Policy Committee. Again, copies are posted at our website. The Policy Committee will review and deliberate on the proposed directive. After their review

they will propose modifications and submit the modifications to the Police Department. The Department will then take a review of the modifications and return the proposed directive to the FULL Board. It is after this process of exchange and evaluation that the FULL Board will schedule the final version of the policy for a vote. We will re-post the modified version of the directive at www.detroitmi.gov/bopc as well as notify the public of our intent to vote well in advance of a vote. We continue to receive feedback on facial recognition related issues and encourage our citizens to express their concerns directly to the Board. You can send an e-mail, write a letter, talk with us directly or attend our meetings to express your concerns.

Again, I remind the Board, we are continuing to work with NACOLE (National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement) to host the National Conference on September 22 thru 26, 2019 in Detroit. During the same time, Detroit will be celebrating our 45th year as a civilian oversight organization. We are inviting law-enforcement and other civic minded individuals and organizations to join us at the conference. The planning process is well underway, and again we invite your participation.

Today, we have one resolution acknowledging the contributions of Mr. Jeffry White to policing in Detroit. We also have two certificates of recognition for Commander Eric Ewing and Neighborhood Police Officer Herman King. I will ask Commissioner Bell to make these presentations at the appropriate point on our agenda. Today, we have two presentations scheduled. The first presentation is our monthly report from Dr. Marcella Anderson, Director of Police Personnel. The report will cover the recruitment, processing and hiring procedures for both sworn and civilian employees of the Police Department. The second Presentation is from Commander Ewing and Captain Michael Diccico who will discuss crime fighting strategies in the precinct as well as partnerships that they use to deliver services within the precinct.

Under the Chief's Report, I am requesting an update on our crime statistics and any critical issues facing the Police Department. The Board is concerned with several items and request the following reports.

- (1) Information and deployment plans to respond to the uptick in our crime statistics including an increase in homicides and non-fatal shootings. We note the increase in multi-victim shootings.
- (2) I am requesting information and the Chief's observation on the joint sex trafficking campaign by federal and local law enforcement called "Operation Independence Day". We understand that several arrests have been made and several victims have been located.
- (3) We ask the Chief about an update on the abandoned housing inspection and board-up program as press reports continue to indicate additional bodies found in abandoned buildings.
- (4) Finally, I am asking for a status report on Corporal DeWayne Jones and his employment status with the Department.

Again, at the end of the meeting we will have public comments from the audience. Please make sure you print your name on a speaker's card. Cards are located in the back on the table or can be obtained by seeing Mr. Robert Brown. He will need your card before the end of the Chief of Police Report. We will hold each speaker to the allotted 2 minutes. I ask that everyone turn off your cell phones and other electronic devices. This request does not include the devices held by DPD personnel as many of you are on emergency standby. I ask DPD personnel to put their phones on vibrate so that ringing phones will not interrupt our meeting."

Resolution: Commissioner Willie Bell read into the record a resolution acknowledging the contributions of Mr. Jeffry White to the work of the Detroit Police Department.

RESOLUTION HONORING MR. JEFFRY WHITE

WHEREAS Mr. Jeffry White is a lifelong Detroit resident and community activist who has worked tirelessly over the years to be an agent of change in the Detroit community he loves. Mr. White is a graduate of Finney High School. After graduating from high school, he enlisted in the United States Marine Corps where he served proudly and with honor for four years. Once Mr. White was honorably discharged from the Marines, he started his career path with Ameritech Phone Company. Throughout his years with the company, he earned numerous awards for his excellence and dedication to the company, even when the company merged and changed names several times, to what we now know as AT&T.

WHEREAS Mr. White has been affiliated with Communication Workers of America for 34 years. He is a member of the Coleman A. Young American Legion Post and serves also as a member on the Selective Service Board for the State of Michigan; and

WHEREAS Mr. White attends the Fifth and Ninth Precinct Community Relations meetings and is always willing to assist with monetary donations and volunteering his time for programs and activities that are helpful and beneficial to public safety and the community at large. Mr. White has been a major contributor of food and other resources for community functions at the Fifth Precinct for the past several years; and

WHEREAS Mr. White is a caring person and one who can always be counted on in the time of need, especially for large annual events like National Night Out, Police Week, Halloween, and Christmas, when it is time to adopt families in need. His wish is to see the Fifth Precinct and its citizens become the model for harmony in working together for public safety and the good of all the community.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners speaking for the citizens of the city of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, acknowledges the dedicated, hardworking, caring, and committed support of Mr. Jeffrey White. His devotion and years of dedication to the community of the Fifth Precinct and the citizens throughout the city of Detroit, merit our highest regards.
DETROIT BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche moved the resolution acknowledging Mr. Jeffrey White. **Commissioner Yvette Griffie**, second.
VOTE – Yes = 10, No = 0, MOTION APPROVED

Commissioner Willie Bell indicated that **Commander Eric Ewing** and **Neighborhood Police Officer Herman King** are on furlough and will not be available for presentations at tonight's meeting. **Commissioner Bell** requested that **Jay Henderson** add both presentation to the next meeting of the 5th Precinct's Police Community Relations Council.

COP Police Report: Deputy Chief of Police Marlin Wilson, representing **COP James Craig** reported crime and statistical data utilizing **DPD Department report** dated August 8, 2019. **Deputy Chief of Police Wilson** reported year-to date data by category including, 7% increase in **Criminal Homicides**, **Sexual Assaults** 3% increase, **Aggravated Assaults** -0% decrease, **non-fatal shootings** 5% increase, **Robbery** -5% decrease, **Carjacking** -32% decrease, **Burglary** -9% decrease, **Larceny** -3% decrease, **Stolen Vehicle** -1% decrease and **Part 1 offenses** -4% decrease. **DC Wilson** provided information on injured officers. **DC Wilson** also responded to the four questions contained in **Chairperson Carter's** report.

(1) Information and deployment plans to respond to the uptick in our crime statistics including an increase in homicides and non-fatal shootings. We note the increase in multi-victim shootings. Response: **DC Wilson** indicated the Department is deploying various resources including **DPD's Ceasefire Program**, **felony apprehension program**, **ticket and two and arrest strategies** all designed to impact the uptick in crime.

(2) I am requesting information and the Chief's observation on the joint sex trafficking campaign by federal and local law enforcement called "Operation Independence Day". We understand that several arrests have been made and several victims have been located. Response: **DC Wilson** indicated 11 individuals were involved in Detroit and the overall operational nationally involved 103 victims. The program was a coordinated law enforcement operation with federal agencies acting as the head.

(3) We ask the Chief about an update on the abandoned housing inspection and board-up program as press reports continue to indicate additional bodies found in abandoned buildings. Response: **DC Wilson** indicated that 2000 homes have been inspected and other city resources have been used to board-up the abandon structures.

(4) Finally, I am asking for a status report on **Corporal DeWayne Jones** and his employment status with the Department. **DC Wilson** indicated a Chief hearing was convened on June 21, 2019 and was adjourned to a future date; **Corporal DeWayne Jones** is still employed with the Department.

DC Wilson also announced **Police Field Day** activities for the following weekend and invited all to attend.

Presentation to the Board: (A) Monthly Human resources Report, Dr. Marcella Anderson, DPD Personnel Director

(A) Monthly Human Resources Report, Dr. Marcella Anderson, DPD Personnel Director, provided statistical data for June 2019 (August 6, 2019 Report). **Dr. Anderson** indicated that of the total positions (2,669 Sworn) in the Department, **DPD** has 184 vacant Police officers. Of the 667 (Civilian) positions in the Department, 58 are vacant. **Dr. Anderson** discussed recruitment and **MCOLES** processing indicating the Department has 652 applications from 7/1/2019 to 7/31/2019 the Department hired 0 individuals (0 sworn, 0 civilian and 0 police assistants). **Anderson** reported 318 are awaiting **MCOLES** certification, 6 are in process. **Anderson** also indicated that our residency data as of 7/31/2019 reflect Detroit residents at 572 Sworn, 340 Civilian and 31 Police Assistants. For non-Detroit residents for the same period, 1852 Sworn, 269 civilians and 30 Police Assistants. **Anderson** also provide attrition data and leaves of absence and restricted duty data. **Dr. Anderson** indicated that her report covered officers suspended and not at work (10 Police Officers suspended, 1 Detective, 2 Sergeant, 1 Command Officer for a total of 14 individuals).

(B) 5th Police Precinct Report, Captain Dicclco discussed with the Board precinct level statistical data of crimes that took place in the 5th Police Precinct and outlined the several of the crime fighting measures conducted by the precinct. **Captain Dicclco** also briefly outlined some of the outreach and partnerships underway in the precinct.

BOPC Standing Committee Reports: None.

Report from Secretary to the Board: Mr. Hicks indicated that on the agenda seven items have come into the Board (see list below). He summarized several of the items. (Report from Board Secretary / Communications (Submitted to BOPC; Not for Action)

1. Revised Neighborhood Police Officers Contact List distributed to the Board via email August 1, 2019
2. August 2, 2019, e-mail from Robert Rutkowski Re: Facial Recognition Technology
3. 5th Precinct GIS Crime Map Report
4. Draft BOPC Newsletter, Summer 2019, emailed under separate cover
5. DPD HR Report, August 2019
6. Project Green Light List Update August 7, 2019
7. 11 Emails from Citizens taken from BOPC Website/Opposing Facial Recognition Technology

Old Business: None.

New Business: Commissioner Darryl Brown acknowledged the work of the Department related to national Night Out.

Announcements: The next regular meeting is scheduled for August 15, 2019 at 3:00 PM at Detroit Public Safety Headquarters, 1301 Third Street, Detroit MI 48226. The following month community meeting is scheduled for September 12, 2019 at 6:30 PM at Kemeny Recreation Center, 2260 South Fort Street, Detroit, MI 48217 (4th Precinct).

Oral Communications - 10 individual comments

Ms. Faith: Welcome to the honorable board as usual. My name is Ms. Faith for the record. And I want to first give condolences to the families who have lost family members to violent deaths recently. And also to deceased persons found in abandoned buildings. And the injured and fallen officers as well. I appreciate the service they've given to the communities they serve in. And also thank Commissioner Brooks one more time for being there for me 5 years ago when I needed help. And also Commissioner Burch, Dewaelsche, Carter, how they have stood all these years. The men, they get their honor all the time, the ladies you hardly ever hear. But I know we do give them honor, but I want to give them double honor today. I just appreciate y'all so very much, for the work y'all have done in the communities that you serve and also Commissioner Davis has been assigned ____ but he's done work, good work also. And commissioner Holt, she's also given a lot of good work. Commissioner Griffie and the of the board. I appreciate y'all, all of you so very much for the work that y'all have done. and I always want to look at the good that I see and honor that. Anybody can say something else, but it takes soothing to say the good, and I always want to say the good because that's what I appreciate the very most of all of y'all. Now also in the human trafficking effort and the increase in the work that they have done. The accomplishments I appreciate very very much because I've seen a lot of women and men who are exposed to that and the good work that y'all are also is astounding me. There my time, Thank y'all for letting me speak.

Eric Blunt: good afternoon board. For the record my name is Eric Blunt, a lifelong Detroit. I want to thank the Board for at least asking the question about the status of corporal Jones. As you know I've worn this T-shirt for several months in an effort to make sure that proper discipline is applied. But board I need you to challenge this police department when they have inadequate answers to your questions. So when they just say his hearing has been delayed, the hearing of June 21st has been delayed, we need to know why, what's the next steps, and what you expect to be reported out And when. This issue I will not let get away, and if you are concerned about any issue you really should secondly, oh. And I did notice that in the Human Resources report that there are now 14 suspensions. 1 less than last month. Does that mean that Corporal Jones is no longer suspense? Just looking at the numbers may be able to tell you more about the story about what's going on and hold people like we always say accountable for what's happening. Lastly, Commissioner Griffie if you weren't embarrassed, I was embarrassed for you. Your comments last week were totally inadequate. So hopefully you apologized to the chief and everyone at the 12th precinct. When you approach the chief of police with a very serious issue, you gotta have all your facts and figures ready and willing to share with him. There was some confusion about whom the commander was that you spoke to. The chief had to correct you that it wasn't a male it was a female. You should have gone to the neighborhood police officer to address your concerns, as we are told as citizens. So please if you haven't apologize to The chief and everyone in the 12th precinct. Thank you

Ms. Marie Thornton: please consider my letter to the board of police commissioners as an official request under the Michigan Freedom of information Act for a hard copy of the facial expression technology proposed policy. And I want to turn that over to you all, I am not a senior citizen. Have to go to a website And you know a young lady about the same age as my child, y'all so fast you don't know what they're talking about. So I put my request in writing for that. The other thing is I am a precinct delegate of precinct 147. I need to know about that young lady who was at rouge park and got shot and left her children behind. Give us an update. Did they catch the people, where are they at? And then the another thing, I don't understand the comment that the public

is supposed to cut off their cellphone but the people who are police officers get to keep theirs on. If you are going to have an open meeting and you're allowed to record the meetings, you might as well tell us to cut it down because we have a right to record this whole entire meeting and I'm trying. I did t mean to come to your meeting. I did my community work and I thought I passed the baton on the younger folks. But I still haven't got over this facial recognition. I can still see that police officer, deputy police chief, laughing, in my mind, arresting commissioner Willie burton was ok. It's not. It's not sitting well with me.

Arthur Bowman: good evening my name is Aurthur Bowman. I'm representing Byp100 Detroit. I come here this evening to repeat our opposition to any expansion of the project green light and to the facial recognition technology policies. We have heard you talk a lot tonight about crime in the city, all this crime in the city. And we hear in the State of the City address mayor Dugan talking about how project green light has been curbing crime. So which one is it? It seems like we have All these expansions of surveillance and criminalization programs but no actual turnover in crime, in reduction of crimes. Furthermore, the policies that have been released about facial recognition technology have pretty much said that the Detroit police department is going to notify the public themselves when they intend to use it. Let me make this abundantly clear, we are tired of police investigating themselves. We are tired of police feeling that the public should be fine with the police overseeing themselves, we need real oversight of the Detroit Police Department. And we need this board to actually represent the people of Detroit in expressing our opposition to the expansion of project light and expansion of facial recognition technology

Valerie Glenn: hello my name is Valerie Glenn, lifelong resident of the City of Detroit precinct delegate 171. I am very concerned about the fact that to enter the public safety building, that I need to have state issued is. My suggestion and along with most The people in the public, is that the you need to move that meeting. That meeting does not need to be in that building it's just that simple. If you move the meeting then you do not violate the open meetings act. The open meetings act as a state issued law, you're supposed to follow the open meetings act. And if you don't do that then we would just go on and on in terms of pressuring you, to ask you, to persuade you to move the meeting. We don't need to tell you we are not concerned, you know how we feel about the facial recognition. You know the public does not agree with that. What is wrong with it is that the technology is not developed well enough. As an African-American woman, and as an African-American as any person of color you know that the facial recognition does not work for us. Therefore it's different I've been going into 1300 beaubian, my husband, as most of you know, was a police officer for many years. Elmore Simon. Elmore, whenever I would go in there I'd show my id, but it didn't go through a machine. It was not something that they processed and you maintain. Right now they have me and Lorie Parks mixed up. They think that she's me and they think that I'm her and I don't see Lori I guess she's left. However, that is a problem, that's a problem. Thank you.

Meko Williams: Peace and greeting to this body of police commissioners. I'm free, nothing happened. You know I'm jut shocked and I'm very dismayed at what I've heard tonight in regards to the crime report status. I'm also shocked and dismayed at the leadership of the police department and the city of Detroit as a whole. Two situations happened over the past month. Recently was at the democratic national debates, where activists were demonstrating. And we have free open space that was blocked in front of the fox theatre. Of course there are people believe we were blocked out, I believe we were locked out. And even after providing all of the explanations that we were officially there for the campaigns that were in the streets, for the demonstrations that were taking place, people were still blocked at each corner by Detroit police. I just want to provide this commission and the police officers and especially the city of Detroit leadership that we are tax payers. We don't need any permission to go here, there or anywhere because we pay taxes here and we also find the streets and the roads and the police department and their salaries. Now again this whole over reach that has been happening over the past month. You come after activists, you come after community people, you come after a police commissioner, but you can't come after the murders, the drug dealers, the rapists, the sex traffickers and the kidnappers. Facial technology didn't solve any of those other crimes so what is the big deal here? I'm just trying to understand for the public's right to know that the open meetings act specifically states that all meetings must be held in community spaces, and public spaces. They should not be held at Commissioner headquarters where I was denied entry because i didn't have my state id. And I feel that is terrible. So again I just want everyone to know that we still have the right And we still have authority to go anywhere we want and we pay the taxes here and you all are here to serve us. Thank you.

Lori Parks: listen to day when I came in the two female officers, Lori Parks, the two female officers that's sitting over there had made a statement about, i just heard them say that the trouble makers are here, I felt that it was. I just want everyone to know in here that we come to these meetings to make sure that the police commissioners are doing their job, it's not to make trouble or anything like that. And then I wanna let you know why the police commissioners was created, it was created so that the citizens could have an oversight of the police. So I would like to know has anyone of you have shadowed a police officer or sat a day in a precinct and came back with a, something to let us know what's going on in there? And if you haven't, why? And if you choose to, when? And the police officer who you just tabled again, the one that beat the lady, yea. So I would like to know are you guys waiting on his retirement date or something like that because he keeps tabling it, so I would like to know when is his retirement date? And I still have not got a record of what he's done the whole time he was on the police force. How many violations he's got,

how many times he's been written up. So I think that you should make the decision not later, now. Quit tabling it. I need him to be gone because I don't want my daughter, your cousin or my sister going to that police station or wherever he's at and he reacts like that again. Each one of you when I come back can you please let me know when you're gonna do the assignment that I just asked for. When are you gonna make sure that you go to a precinct in your district and bring a report back on what they are doing. On all the police officers that have had violations against them or written up. We need to know who they are. Thank you.

Joanne Warwick: Hello good evening. I was at the Last police commission meeting, Joanne Warwick. I notice you went into close session and I saw Mike Duggan in the building was he at your closed session? I'm Just curious, it looked a little, I wondered. So I would like to object to the policy that you announced commissioner Carter about people not only being able to put in a public comment card if they arrive before the end of the police chief presentation. I find that disrespectful of citizens and their schedules. I come from another meeting and I can't always get there on time and then people have to be there for many hours. So that seems to me disrespectful of the citizens who take time to come to the meetings and I will stay if you don't want to hear from the citizens then please resign. When it comes to the board ups deputy mayor Craig why are the police doing the land banks job? It actually is general services division isn't it? If the city and the land bank would stop their illegal 50% discount that the police should not be participating in, then they should have a lot more money to take care of the homes. Regarding medical marijuana don't discriminate against applicants there are people who Can use medical marijuana responsibly Just like alcohol, just like people can use alcohol irresponsibly. So please it's time to get with the 21st-century which is actually going back in time when it wasn't illegal. Regarding medical marijuana, and I appreciate with Mr. Blunt said Because when I ask police officers why and they don't know the reason they can't cite this authority they called me argumentative. I agree they need more training to know the rules so that when they're telling somebody to do something they don't seem arbitrary. The state of _____, they have an incredible brutal dictatorship and they turned a prison into a shopping mall there so maybe we should do that to some of ours.

Brenda Hill: My name is Brenda Hill and I want to talk about the over policing of community meetings. We've had three advocates, will two advocate activists and a police commissioner arrested. One activist was not only arrested she was thrown down and hurt and then put into a straight jacket. We are at this meeting and we have less police officers than we've had at any meetings and i only can see the difference is we got a lot of white folks in here. And y'all don't wanna scare them but you don't mind trying to scare the people who come to the community meetings. Also I want to say that facial recognition should not be used in fact it should be taken out of Detroit at any location. I live in the first district. I was at the first district for town hall, the chief said the first district has the most green lights but they're top 2 in crime. That should not be going together. So green light is just another shakedown extortion. I wonder who's getting the kickback off that. Also the word surveil is broken down to its most minute remedial level and it's still means that if you go from camera to field division to camera to field division, that's still surveillance. But however, several murderers and rapists are still on the streets of Detroit so it's not working. He also said that 500 people have been used by facial recognition and 38% of that they used to identify people but none of the other ones have been arrested. I want to know where is that data and how is it classified and how long does it stay and who gets to keep it and who gets to pass it off. There's a no, a nada on facial recognition. Thank you.

Madge Morgan: My name is Madge Penelope Morgan. And the first thing I want to say is Mr. Burton you're my hero. Also I heard so many people talking today about crime and punishment and alleged law-enforcement and I have no one to doubt what so ever that the aim objective of these demons wearing Human suits is to criminalize every black person in Detroit and I ain't having it. Check this out I'm a nurse A professional got my license and everything but I've been trying to get my jury trial for getting a ticket for disorderly conduct for taking a swig out of a bottle sitting on a bench. And I ain't having it. So anyway I'm just saying, facial recognition minority report y'all, No. do it like you're told, no.

Ms. Debrosar: I'm Ms. Debrosar and I live in this neighborhood, I grew on the west side, bought a house over On Morningside and I've been there for 8 years. It's a total difference between the west side and the east side. First of all I just want to say that America has caused us more cases of PTSD than any war we've ever had. The police are rated right under that. My uncle was killed by a policeman and it was said that he choked himself, strangled his self with his shoe string but we know that you take your shoe strings And your belts off when you go to jail so that's another lie. The facial recognition we all know it doesn't matter what kind of money you got, what chair you sit on, or where you sit at in the city, we all know that anybody who's goi g to be on those cameras are going to be people that are considered minority. Which does not mean that they are going to be white Americans. They are going to be black and brown. They are going to be criminalizing us. They are going to use them against us, they are going to start using them against our children. So I think that we should not use those. I think that you all because you're sitting at the head of the table should be the ones to say "no this is not going to help our people". You may want to get these kick backs, you may want to do this but I think you should do what's right and say that facial recognition is a no go. It's not going to work in Detroit, it's not going to work in any city. We should Be worried about Flint and the water issues That are going on. We should be worried about all of the problems that we have with our citizens who can't get food and we should be worried about the people and the citizens who don't have water now that are being cut off and who don't have power and the unaffordable housing

that we have in Detroit. We have so many other issues to worry about and facial recognition should be one that should've been deeded soon as it was brought to the table.

Thomas Khalif: Good evening everybody, those present will recall the comments that I made a few weeks ago on behalf of the taking back pride initiative and the core community regarding the Nazis and Police who marched with them in June violating our safety and practices of policing protesters to march them directly into our lines. To open this meeting with a moment of silence over the victims of white supremacy while remaining silent on supporting white supremacy on marching with them. Not acceptable. I can only strenuously ____ my comments and urge you again to take action but today I'm here to speak about the facial recognition software, the silencing the people, as noted by commissioner Burton. He's not alone in being arrested for questioning this practice it's a system like green light, a system of pay to play, and you're going to give them more money. I mean we've been pouring money into policing and it's only made more criminals the crime rate is skyrocketing. Policing as we understand it today has been proven not to work. And just defending the sinking ship is not helping anybody it's only creating more crime and more poverty and more debt. The cities they have researched this software and have used it have banned it. It's not just because it doesn't work, it's because it's racist, and because it's a violation of everybody's privacy rights. Policing as it exists has failed to prove itself to be functional, failed to prove itself worthy of the budget it already has, failed to prove itself to be worthy of the power it ____, can't gove or more of both. I urge you to take your responsibility to people more seriously. It feels like you're asleep at the wheel. I have 25 seconds left so I'd like to give every ya the table an opportunity to respond. The issue of Nahtzi's marching with police at pride. Is there anybody who would like to speak on that? In that case to respond the recent event in Venezuela, as such an issue with a lack of safety is because America is waging an economic war on that country just like its waging an economic war on the city of Detroit.

Christen Sunnenberg: I've spoken before in a public comment about how facial recognition technology and project greenlight criminalizes people of color by largely misidentifying them And creating false posit matches. But what I also really want to stress is the overall harm to our civil liberties that the use of this technology by police being whether it is accurate or not. It allows for large scale surveillance and behavior policing without police even having to be in our communities. We are not placated by the fame the oversight and restraint this policy claims to provide for and we don't want the technology in our city at all. There's no evidence that surveillance technology prevents crime or makes us safer. It's a power move allowing for a greater degree of social control by police and greater profits for the tech industry. We don't want it regulated by the few people in similar positions of power we want it banned. This technology also endangers immigrants at a time that we have immigration concentration camps at our border. Ice has already been using image databases and facial recognition technology to find and deport our neighbors across the country. Immigration authorities have scanned state databases of drivers licenses to locate and deport undocumented immigrants. Detroit having this sort of database set up and ready for their use is extremely dangerous whether or not there are current plans for DPD to cooperate with ICE. The Board of police Commissioners was created to allow for civilian oversight of the police as a reaction to racist and extremely abusive policing. Since almost all of the opinions voiced by the people that you represent have spoken out against this technology to vote yes on it anyway would call into question the validity of this board. It will make sparkling clear that many board members are here to stand up for what makes the police feel safe and in control. Not to stand up for the people and what makes us safe. _____ into algorithms, I reviewed security footage and found that systems look for triggers could include emotional and cognitive state registered by your facial expression to determine whether they think you're likely to commit a crime.

Crystal Bonner: Hi good evening Crystal Bonner here. Retired Detroit public school teacher and current teacher with the state of Michigan at a mental health facility. I am against facial recognition technology, why because it's 70% inaccurate and I did a brief little research and found that out. So that's why am against it. And then where is the data coming from where are you grabbing the data and who has the ability to get the data. You're leaving it open and possibly for hackers, and they could be getting our personal information that's a problem. And then with the nazi marching thing, in light of what happens on the communities over last weekend, duh, when are we gonna learn we cannot allow that type of extreme people to march anywhere. Especially in Detroit where the majority is black. But even if they weren't, The nazis like I said before, responsible for millions of people's dying during World War II. And then they're responsible for the lynching and the killing of black people here in the United States. When are we going to learn it should not continue and our police force definitely should not walk along with them. Whenever they try to march or something gather them up put them in the cart or bus or whatever. That's what should happen to them. And in regards to the police department and how they're gong about trying to make sure we're secure in our homes, do the police force have, because I used to work in security too I was trained by the police department. But do they have like regular routines where they travel around the neighborhoods? Do they go on rotes or do they sit down and have donuts until a call happens? I mean I'm just wondering about that. And in the 5th precinct he said it's only about 45 people deployable in that large area? I lived in the 5th police precinct district. I'm in your district 4. It's just how are they going about doing this?? I'm not done. If they patrol the area on a regular basis that would cut down on a lot of crime and if will create fellowship among the citizens in the area, because we

need to know who our police officers are. And please don't threaten me anymore when I come to these meetings. Yes you are come on now.

Scottie Bowman: OK first of all you're still violating the charter by requiring people to identify themselves As a precondition of attending the meetings. That is why I put on the card founder of Detroit Residents Advancing Civilian Oversight, my name is well enough known I am Scottie Bowman. The charter Requires that all members be healed under the open meetings act, not just one per month. The charter gives you supervisory control and policymaking Powers. Apparently our chair does not know her limitations, she is not limited, or the board is not limited from making policies that end the illegal requirement of one identifying self to attend meetings. One cannot simply use this as a go around to avoid the law, anymore than if you held the meetings at a bar and said well we're allowing people under 21 in its just the stupid bouncer at the bar won't let them in. Well you chose to put the meeting at the bar. Another thing the chair ended up saying oh turn off all your electronic devices, apparently you didn't read the open meeting act those are allowed under the open meeting act, again. By the way this is a misdemeanor punishable by a \$1000 fine in the first violation, \$2000 fine a d a year in jail for each successive one, so you're all at risk of facing that. And I will be putting a complaint in the with the attorney general I promise. I'm gonna be putting in a complaint with the attorney general probably before your next meeting. You can't have, and then we have, oh let's see what else. When I was coming here, They tried to kick me out because I had a sign with me. Well again, didn't read the open meetings act. It says you cannot be excluded from a meeting other than a violation of the peace and carrying these signs around is not a violation of the peace. Now I did get in eventually, but I think it may have just been there were enough media people happened to see me holding up the sign that maybe it would look bad if you do something else to me. Follow the law, I'm asking you. You can't oversee law enforcement while you are law breakers.

K Hearn: Good evening I'm Katie Hearn representing Detroit Community technology project as well as all of the black women out there who look like somebody else. The issue of facial recognition technology particularly that by law enforcement extends far beyond careful selection of language, curated crime center tours or rough/rushed commuted contract quota of cameras installed. In addition to the innate and well documented flaws of facial recognition technology it's also important to note that a mere policy, whether 2 pages or 20, comprehensive or piecemeal will not prevent abuse of the system. Confidential databases across the country are abused by law enforcement, including MSU's open MSP's database by DPD, but that's just the word on the street. The implication of FRT are serious and are far reaching and it pains me to see our well founded concerns dismissed as confusion, hysteria or trouble making. All of our concerns are your concerns. With that a few reminders. Facial recognition using still images is just as bad as using real time video streaming. That was never an issue so please stop citing it. Other cities are not banning facial recognition technology simply because there police force or policy writers aren't as good as ours. Why are they banning it and why are we continuing to push forward. Racial bias will Always be an issue and I'm not referring only to algorithms. Given how many resident having voiced concerns about the make up Of this police force, perhaps this is a consideration tjtat should extend to the analysts working in the crime center as well. Finally we still haven't seen any third party data that project green light prevents crime so hearing that again reiterated tonight we need to look at that before we pour millions of dollars into these real time crime centers and certainly we need to get our money back for the facial recognition technology live-stream from dataworks

Tawana petty: Tawana Petty representing Detroit community technology project as well as a resident of the city of Detroit for my entire life. Today I stand here in the spirit of ancestor Ron Scott who I know is rolling over in his grave because he has been visiting me in my dreams. A revised proposed policy directive was received by the board of police commissioners July 25th. The policy although on its face looks more humane it is not. Any policy that will force police use of facial recognition must be voted down. A technology has proven inaccurate on darker skin tones, women and children cannot be adequately regulated simply by adding two analysts to the equation. Humans have biases and they make mistakes. The pressure to solve crimes Exacerbate these biases and mistakes. Police departments all over the United States have already been found to cut corners and abuse this technology. Detroiters cannot sub for the border of false arrest and lawsuits and unwarranted interactions with law-enforcement. This does not benefit residents or police officers. We understand that facial recognition stands to become a \$9.6 billion marginal market by 2022, but in Detroit we must put people over profit. This technology is dangerous and must be banned. It does not make us safer. It creates a virtual wall around already marginalized demographics. Do the right thing and vote no on facial recognition. If you don't we will Ban it. There's policies in the senate, in the house, there's city council policies. And any type of legislation that we are able to push for, we will push for and if that doesn't get voted down then we will use civil disobedience. Anything within our legal right to resist this technology. And at the end of the day, it won't just protect the people sitting on brigs side of the table it will protect you too. So don't think that because you're on that side of the table that you're exempt from being profiled with facial recognition.

Cindy D: I'm here to bring up a couple of things. John _____ a friend of mine asked me to find out how many people had OD'ed and he thinks people are being OD'ed purposely. I think it's Fentanyl that maybe some of our leaders might have something to do with it. So I made a sign years ago, how much does a police state cost, or how much does it. How much would it cost, or how much does it. Well I'd like to know how much it's costing right now. I was in psychology years ago and we had one study where we were looking at this theory about teaching ethics to people. And isn't by watching people, it was by showing that you had confidence that they were going to do the right thing. You try and teach them to do the right thing and then you don't surveil them because they might, sure if they think they're being watched they might try and do the right thing but that isn't the way. If the government policies are so bad here, and there's so much poverty and such lack of care of these people the government is actually preying on the people. It shouldn't surprise us that we've got all this violence. Then you watch these movies where they look like Miami vice and we had comedy when we first had tv, stand up comedy situation, we didn't have a bunch of violence. When the police officers themselves, the way they treated Joanne Warwick or the way they tried to take domiko out. They were targeting domiko because I was at the charter meeting yelling. I was yelling jokes out and putting the charter commission down all night and I got lots of warnings but nobody tried to hurt me. And I stopped them the first time they tried to take domiko out. And by the way, people can put these green lights up all over and it looks like a surveillance state. What's the difference between being in jail and being out jail.

Amanda Hill: I'm with BYP100 and we are here to speak to the fact that already took him money has gone to over policing and surveillance. 9 million has been spent initially on project green light, 4 million more was just allowed to the to add to 2 more real time crime centers. Shoutout to Capt. Lopez, Sheffield and Jones for being the only ones who voted against that. That 13 million in and of it's self is more than enough that would have been able to be resources to our communities that need it to prevent quality of life crimes, these petty crimes that they're catching on these cameras instead of just preventing them by resourcing us in a city where the average median income is \$26,000 per household. Crime is inevitable at that point. When you don't invest into people, into resourcing our communities, crime is inevitable and locking more people away doesn't stop it. It doesn't keep us safe. It just means that that's one wave of people taken away from their families, one less person in the household to contribute, one less parent that's not with their children and then the cycle goes on and on and on and we keep giving police more money to lock us away. Not to mention the lack of public consent that went into initially putting facial recognition technology into place and then this half hearted attempt 2 years after implementing the technology that is faulty as people have said, Pretending to care about what the public thinks about this technology they're already using is insulting. And I wanna know really quickly even if facial recognition technology isn't the only basis by which someone is arrested and eventually has a criminal record, you still get that false arrest, you still get that person who's misidentified who's potentially violated by police, who misses work, who loses their kids, it's a problem and we need to solve it.

2:23:02 Ms. George - Hello Chairman Carter, to the Board of Police Commissioners and to the Deputy Chief. I want to say, I want everyone to, if you have a pen, write this number down. Talking to the Detroit citizens 1 (800) 482-3604, this is the Michigan Commission of Civil Rights. You have to write the Michigan Commission of Civil Rights, they just had a meeting on July 29th, so you could either make the complaint about the facial recognition online or either on the telephone. That is very important, also like the young lady was stating earlier its Senate Bill 342 and House Bill 4810. Senator Laseal and Representative Robinson that wants to put that ban on facial recognition. The citizens, you have to realize you have rights. And just like with the mass shootings, when they are waiting on so many people to get slaughtered. Is that when they hear from so many citizens. I want everyone to call that phone number. And make that complaint online find out when the next Michigan Commission of Civil Rights and from there go to the Office of Civil Rights. Also I would like to say I wrote Deputy Chief Bettison about Chief Craig. We need to have a town hall meeting in this neighborhood. I know the Mayor and Chief Craig met with ex-felons according to the newspaper. To deal with the crime but it also has to be the citizens that are involved because there is one area in District 2, where you never see police. It's not the Commander of the 2nd Precinct fault, it just some areas that you do not see police. We have a lot of crime, so we have to hone in on that. I wrote the Mayor, I guess I will have to go back on the 11th Floor again. To make that point to meet with him. They only wrote me about facial recognition. Also, I want to talk about the Officer that was accosted by his friend. Where is that investigation? It was an officer that was a 14 year veteran that had the large sum of money and I would like to know where is that investigation? The reason I asked that is because it made it toward a lot of newspapers across the country. I had a lot more, but my time is up I will respect that.

Deputy Chief Wilson indicated through the Chair in response, that's still at Internal Affairs, so the case is still being investigated.

2:25:37 Tracy Martin: Good evening Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, I am Attorney Tracy Martin with Motor City Justice and Black Women Lawyers Association of Michigan. Today, I appear for the second time as a private citizen and stakeholder concerned for our future. I realize we are in the midst of a digital revolution. I oppose facial recognition technology in its current form. But I am not _____. I am for technology rolled out with proven policies and best practices that mitigate risk for potential negative human impact like. False arrest and wrongful conviction that devastate families, desegregate communities and further feed into the new Jim Crow. The proliferation of mass incarceration and prison industrial complex. I am also FRT Ban for Amazon product that the city currently uses that demonstrates significant reduction and its extremely high error rate when it comes to Black, Brown and LGQT people. On Tuesday, August 6th, I visited the Detroit Real Time Crime Center for a tour. And what gives me pause is that the Green Light Camera at the Command Center appears to be operating right along side facial recognition technology ops, which should be separate. There should be no intersectionality whatsoever, between Data Works and facial recognition technology. And I am concerned that one day Detroit will be operating a fusion center contributing to the information sharing environment without strong control and oversight of facial recognition use. I was advise that facial recognition search results wouldn't be considered positive ID's, and don't establish probable cause. And that no attorney oversight is necessary because there is no witness like our tradition photo array that currently does require attorney oversight. I disagree, because while there maybe no human witness there is certainly an eye in the sky witness that on its face certainly appears unconstitutional adopt an policy and legal framework that's offered by the bureau of justice systems in order to protect the privacy and civil rights of the public. Detroit is at a dangerous cross roads though BOPC oversight I urge this honorably body to hold DPD accountable for not only citizen safety but also transparency the preservation of privacy and civil liberties and justice for all. Thank you.

NOTE: PUBLIC COMMENT INCOMPLETE. WILL BE COMPLETE BY THURSDAY. ALSO COMMENTS HAVE NOT BEEN VERIFIED BY CABLE BROADCAST> WILL BE COMPLETE BY THURSDAY.

Motion to Adjourn, William Davis, Second, Holt.

Chairperson Carter adjourned the meeting at 8:50 PM.