

Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners

Date of Meeting: July 18, 2019 – 3:00 PM

Location: Detroit Public Safety Headquarters, 1301 Third Street, Detroit, MI 48226

BOPC Chairperson Lisa Carter called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (July 18, 2019)

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance	Attend	Not-Attend
Lisa Carter, Chairperson	Yes	
Eva Garza Dewaelsche, Vice Chairperson	Yes	
Willie E. Bell	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Evette Griffie	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	11	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for July 18, 2019.

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes:
Thursday, July 11, 2019**

Chairperson Lisa R. Carter said “Good Afternoon! I am Police Commissioner Lisa Carter, I represent District #6. I serve as the Chair of the Board and will be conducting our meeting today. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance, thank you for joining us. For people viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for viewing our meeting. Today, we have invited Chaplain James Powell to provide the invocation.” Chaplain Powell gave the invocation for the meeting.

Chairperson’s Report: Lisa R, Carter said, “On behalf of the Board, I want to express our concern and support for fallen and injured officers. Our concerns for officer safety and citizen protection is ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers. I would ask the Chief of Police during his remarks to provide us with any additional information related to injured and fallen officers. The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas Holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters 3 weeks in the month on Thursdays at 3:00 PM. We also meet in the community every 2nd Thursday of the month at 6:30 PM.

Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our citizens are justified in asking “How does civilian oversight of law enforcement help you as a citizen within our community?” Our answer is, we protect the civil rights of citizens. Oversight organizations like the BOPC are at the forefront of investigating, reviewing and auditing individual cases of citizen complaints and patterns of operations by police agencies to eliminate misconduct, discriminatory police practices and unnecessary use of force by police. Our work is based on developing and supporting effective policing. Mutual trust and respect between the police and the community is critical toward increasing the quality of life for residents and visitors to Detroit. The Board of Police Commissioners exists to provide civilian oversight for the work of the Detroit Police Department. As a Board, we receive and investigate non-criminal citizens’ complaints, monitor the operations of the Department and work with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to make or modify police policy.

I want to point to several important items for your consideration and information. This is going to surprise some people: I am currently opposed to the use of facial recognition by the Detroit Police Department and will vote against the policy directive proposed by Chief James Craig. The technology is flawed, and those flaws primarily relate to bias against African-Americans, Latinos, and other people of color. Such a flawed tool has no place in a police department servicing a majority black and brown city like ours – or in any agency concerned about fairness and justice until the technology is fixed. Some changes in the policy might help in changing my view. Surprise is likely because, in the last week, people have confused my commitment to run an orderly, productive meeting as support for facial recognition use by law enforcement. Obviously, the two are not the same.

In a key way, though, they are related: our Board cannot have serious, reflective, mature consideration of public safety issues like facial recognition or make respectable decisions about those matters without an orderly process. We also cannot expect the public to follow the issues or our decisions – particularly controversial or complex ones – without an orderly process. The Board of Police Commissioners is mandated by the City Charter with “supervisory control and oversight” of the police department. Our 11 members deal with serious and often grave issues with far-reaching impact on the daily lives of police officers and city residents and their families, as well as the public safety and reputation of the entire city.

As Chair, I do not want our work hampered or devalued with unneeded interruptions, shouting matches, cardboard signs, and other disruptive – and sometimes staged – grandstanding. Democracy needs advocacy and passion, but it does not need a sideshow. Given all the places on the agenda where a Board member may speak each and every week, no Commissioner needs to be disruptive like last Thursday. Any Commissioner could have asked about my goals or complained about lacking an office at several other places on the agenda, rather than disrupt a presentation to a community leader, which our Board only does at the monthly community meetings. As the video shows, facial recognition was only raised once the disruption started. However, had any Commissioner sincerely wanted to ask or make comments about it, the agenda has places for that too – such as the standing Chief of Police Report.

All 11 police commissioners voluntarily take on the hard work of civilian oversight. There is no salary, so everyone makes a special commitment to be prepared on the issues, attend meetings, make decisions, and serve the public. We meet every Thursday, except holidays, and most Commissioners have outstanding records of attendance and service. We do not always agree, and I know not every Board member will agree with me in opposing facial recognition once Chief Craig submits his revised policy directive and it goes through the standard practices to appear on the agenda for a vote. However, as a Police Commissioner and as Chair, I am committed to upholding an orderly process to ensure our work and decisions are clear for the record and for the public.

Additionally, I encourage the attendees to our meetings to cooperate with the orderly management of the meeting. Our Board has several avenues for the public to exchange with the Board. Proposed policies and directives are posted at our website for public inspection. Typically, these postings are available for 60 days. The Board has and hopefully will continue to receive letters, e-mail and notes directly from the public. Individuals can engage with the Board during our meetings. On the issue of facial recognition, we have received public comments supporting and opposing facial recognition. At our June 13th meeting, we heard from 33 individuals. At our June 20th meeting, we heard from 5 individuals. At our June 27th meeting, we heard from 18 individuals and at our June 11th meeting, we heard from 27 individuals. While many of your questions require research, investigation and time to answer, I can assure you that this Board listens and include your observations in our policy making process.

I want to apologize to the Board. I also want to apologize to Ms. Thedora Ragland who was asked last week to appear before the Board to accept a resolution for her many contributions to law enforcement. The conduct of our Board was embarrassing and no citizen should ever be caught up in the internal politics of the Board. Last week should be seen as a teachable moment for our Board. I will be moving forward to obtain more training for the entire Board on parliamentary procedures. I will investigate how we can seek to employ a Sergeant-at-Arms for our meetings.

As citizen representatives, elected and appointed, we should not rely on using the police department to handle differences between our Board and the public. I underscore the need for cooperation and the common courtesies that you would provide a person should they visit your home. However, should the need surface where the security and safety of the public and the Board is threatened, I will do what is necessary to keep order. I will ask for recesses to cool down our emotions. I will insist that we treat each other professionally. I hope that we never have to experience again the disruption that circumvents our purpose and puts us in a position where we are not representing the interest of the community.

Today, we have a full agenda, so I ask for your cooperation as we make it through the agenda. We have three resolutions for retiring officers.

- Sergeant Vanessa Wyatt. We adopted her retirement resolution on May 16, 2019, but with 42 years of service, it is appropriate that the resolution be presented to Sergeant Wyatt. At the appropriate point in the agenda, I will ask Commissioner William Davis to present to Sergeant Wyatt her retirement resolution.
- Deputy Chief Elvin Barren. Deputy Chief Barren is one of our most respected and popular Deputy Chief's. Barren will be retiring from the Detroit Police Department after 21 years of service to head the Southfield Police Department.
- Corporal Victoria Eschen from the 6th Precinct is also retiring after 20 years of service to the Department.

The Board received a request from the Chief of Police to suspend without pay, Police Officer Naim Brown. Information on this suspension has been shared with the full Board. Mr. Wyrick is reviewing the request. The BOPC has notified the Detroit Police Officers Association and we are projecting a hearing on this matter on August 1, 2019.

The next Graduation from the Police Academy for Class 2019-D will be Friday, August 2, 2019 at 10:30 AM at Second Ebenezer Church. I encourage the Board to attend and show your support to new officers and their families who will soon be joining the police force.

Also, at today's meeting we will have a presentation on police recruitment. Lieutenant James Coles and Sergeant Starr Gonzales will be making the presentation.

Under the Chief's Report, I am requesting an update on our crime statistics and any critical issues facing the Police Department. I also read in the newspaper today the Chief's remarks regarding his willingness to cooperate with the Board. The Chief indicated that he would consider advance notification to the Board of the use of the technology. The Chief also indicated that the Department has had and used this technology for some period. Clearly, we have some hard local data and experience between the Department and our local Homeland Security operations to better understand how the Detroit Department might use this technology. I would ask the Chief for a written report on the past use of the technology so that we can understand its application and use. After such a report, we can sit and really discuss how we can move forward.

Again, at the end of the meeting we will have public comments from the audience. Please make sure you print your name on a speaker's card. Cards are located in the back on the table or can be obtained by seeing Mr. Robert Brown. He will need your card before the beginning of public comments. We will hold each speaker to the allotted 2 minutes. I ask that everyone turn off your cell phones and other electronic devices. This request does not include the devices held by DPD personnel as many of you are on emergency standby. I ask DPD personnel to put their phones on vibrate so that ringing phones will not interrupt our meeting.

Resolutions: Chairperson Carter requested Commissioner William to present and read into the record a resolution for Sergeant Vanessa Wyatt.

**RESOLUTION HONORING RETIRING
SERGEANT VANESSA WYATT**

WHEREAS Vanessa Wyatt was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on July 18, 1977. Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Officer Wyatt began her career at the Seventh Precinct; and

WHEREAS Officer Wyatt's assignments with the Detroit Police Department included the Eleventh Precinct, reassigned to the Seventh Precinct, Special Duty Section, Tenth Precinct, Mini Station Section, and the Training Academy; and

WHEREAS Officer Wyatt displayed tremendous knowledge and leadership skills as a Police Officer and was promoted to the rank of Sergeant on October 9, 1987. As Sergeant, she was reassigned to the Training Academy. Her other assignments included the Recruiting Division, Second Precinct, Southwestern District, and reassigned to the Second Precinct where she served until her retirement; and

WHEREAS Sergeant Wyatt was the deserving recipient of the following awards: Meritorious Service Award, Chief's Unit Award, both Consent Judgment Awards, two Chief's Citation and Medals, the Ford Fireworks Awards, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, and the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, as well as numerous letters of commendation from citizens and superiors; and

WHEREAS Sergeant Wyatt has tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for 41 plus years. She has served the Detroit Police Department and the citizens of the City of Detroit with loyalty, professionalism, integrity and dedication, and is widely respected throughout the law enforcement community as the consummate professional.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking on behalf of the citizens of the great City of Detroit recognize and honor the lifelong contributions and commitment to excellence in public service of Sergeant Vanessa Wyatt. Her display of courage and unwavering community spirit has improved the quality of life for the citizens of Detroit. We wish you all the best in your future endeavors. We thank and congratulate you, Sergeant Vanessa Wyatt.

Commissioner William Davis moved the resolution for the retirement of Sergeant Vanessa Wyatt. **Commissioner, Yvette Griffie, Second.**

VOTE - Yes = 11,

No = 0,

MOTION APPROVED

Chairperson Carter requested **Commissioner Willie Bell** to read into the record a resolution for **Deputy Chief of Police, Elvin Barren**.

**RESOLUTION HONORING
DEPUTY CHIEF ELVIN V. BARREN**

WHEREAS Mr. Elvin Barren was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on July 6, 1998, and upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy he was assigned to the Tactical Services Section; and

WHEREAS Police Officer Barren displayed tremendous aptitude in his assignments, and was promoted to the rank of Sergeant on June 14, 2006. His other assignments included Central District and Chief of Police Office. He developed his supervisory skills and was promoted to the rank of Lieutenant on December 21, 2010 and assigned as the Commanding Officer of the Training Center and Tactical Support as the Officer in Charge; and

WHEREAS Lieutenant Barren, still being recognized for his distinguished service, was promoted to the rank of Commander on October 7, 2013 and assigned to Organized Crime, Metropolitan Division, and Downtown Services. He monitored the daily operations of three precincts and operations related to sporting venues, entertainment district, special events, Dignitary Executive Protection and movie productions citywide. On September 5, 2017, Commander Barren was promoted to rank of Deputy Chief and assigned to Neighborhood Policing Bureau East, Metropolitan Division, and Downtown Services Division. Deputy Chief Barren provided effective leadership mentoring to all patrol entities under his command, where he remained until his retirement; and

WHEREAS Deputy Chief Barren served as an Operations Specialist in the United States Navy for eight years and received an honorable discharge. Deputy Chief Barren is also a recipient of a Lifesaving Citation & Medal, Chief's Merit Award, Perfect Attendance Award, Ford Fireworks Award, and both Consent Judgment Awards, Four Year Degree Award, National Football League Superbowl XL Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Award, Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, and numerous letters and certificates of appreciation; and

WHEREAS Deputy Chief Barren served the Detroit Police Department diligently for 21 years and daily demonstrated his loyalty and dedication to the citizens of Detroit. His professionalism, expertise, and leadership attest to the fact that he represents the consummate professional.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking on behalf of the citizens of the great city of Detroit recognize and honor the contributions and commitment to excellence in public service of Deputy Chief Elvin V. Barren.

Commissioner Willie Bell moved the resolution for the retirement of Deputy Chief of Police Elvin Barren. **Commissioner, Eva Dewaelsche, Second.**

VOTE – Yes = 11, No = 0, MOTION APPROVED

Chairperson Carter requested **Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche** to read into the record a resolution for **Corporal Victoria Eschen**.

**RESOLUTION HONORING RETIRING
CORPORAL VICTORIA ESCHEN**

WHEREAS Victoria Eschen was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on May 24, 1999. Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Police Officer Eschen began her career at the Eight Precinct; and

WHEREAS She dutifully served the Eighth Precinct, Northwestern District, Gang Enforcement, Eighth Precinct again, Narcotics, Firearm Investigation Team, Twelfth Precinct, and Sixth Precinct. Police Officer Eschen displayed tremendous diligence and aptitude in her assignments. She was promoted to the rank of Corporal on October 18, 2018 and continued to serve at Sixth Precinct until her retirement; and

WHEREAS During her law enforcement career, Corporal Eschen was the deserving recipient of a Chief's Merit Award, five Chief's Citations, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, and the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, as well as commendations from supervisors, and numerous letters of appreciation from citizenry; and

WHEREAS Corporal Eschen has tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for 20 years. Her professionalism, commitment to public service, integrity, and dedication has been a credit to the Detroit Police Department. She is highly respected as a consummate professional.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, awards this resolution in recognition of Corporal Victoria Eschen's 20 years of dedicated and diligent public service. Her professionalism, integrity, and lifelong commitment to the city of Detroit and its citizens merit our highest regards. We thank and congratulate you, Corporal Victoria Eschen.

Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche moved the resolution for the retirement of Corporal Victoria Eschen. **Commissioner, Annie Holt, Second.**

VOTE – Yes = 11,

No = 0,

MOTION APPROVED

COP Police Report: Chief of Police James Craig reported that crime is continuing to trend downward as against last year. Chief of Police James Craig reported crime and Statistical data utilizing DPD Department report dated July 18, 2019. Chief Craig reported year-to-date data by category including, -2% decrease in Criminal Homicides, Sexual Assaults 8% increase, Aggravated Assaults -1% decrease, non-fatal shootings 7% increase, Robbery -7% decrease, Carjacking -36% decrease, Burglary -8% decrease, Larceny -5% decrease, Stolen Vehicle -2% decrease and Part 1 offenses -5% decrease. Chief Craig indicated that the Neighborhood Police Officers have inspected and GSD boarded up 1,800 vacant and abandon houses on the eastside of the city. Chief Craig joined in the comments related to the retirement of Deputy Chief of Police Elvin Barren. Craig indicated Barren was an effective commander who interacted well with community groups and would be missed as a member of the Chief's command staff. Chief Craig indicated that he had no additional information on injured officers. Chief Craig also indicated the Department has had and used facial recognition software for one and a half years as well as used cooperatively the Michigan State Police Department's facial recognition software for 18 years. The Chief confirmed the use of some 500 captures with a 30% identification rate. The Chief indicated he was open to a discussion and refinement in the proposed facial recognition policy.

Presentations to the Board: (A) Police Recruitment, Lieutenant James Coles, Sergeant Starr Gonzales, Dr. Marcella Anderson, PhD., and Sergeant Danna McCord.

(A) Police Recruitment, Sergeant Danna McCord, Lieutenant James Coles, Sergeant Starr Gonzales outlined the mission of the Recruitment Unit. The presentation was divided into several sections including Field Recruitment, the hiring process, Disqualifications and fiscal 2019-2020 recruitment goals. Under recruitment goals it was reported that between January thru June, 2019 the unit had participated in 160 recruitment events as well as maintained a continued focus on social media for recruitment and arranging to be included in 35 college job boards. It was also reported the unit works with the three workforce development centers (Samaritan Center, Northwest Activities Center and Ser Metro) to create a special focus in recruitment of Detroit residents for the position of police officers. The unit also discussed the application and background phases of recruitment. In the discussion the unit also referred to a list of the ten top reasons for application disqualifications and background disqualifications. The presentation concluded in a discussion of the 2019-2020 goals to hire 360 police officers, provide for cross training in the recruitment office and focus on increasing the number of applicants for the written and physical agility tests required for becoming a police officer. Personnel Director Marcella Anderson, also reported to the Board that the starting compensation for new police officers has been increased to \$44,000.00.

BOPC Standing Committee Reports: None.

Report from Secretary to the Board: Mr. Hicks indicated that on the agenda seven items have come into the Board (see list below). He summarized two of the seven items.

1. Memorandum from Chief Craig re: Change in Duty Status Suspension Without Pay but with Medical Benefits for Police Officer Naim Brown, Badge 498, assigned to the Fifth Precinct
2. Letter from Chief Craig Re: Graduation Ceremony for Class 2019-D at Second Ebenezer Church, 14601 Dequindre, Detroit, MI 48212, Friday, August 2, 2019 @ 10:30 a.m.
3. Greenlight List Update
4. Press Statement by Chairperson Lisa Carter re: July 11, 2019 BOPC Meeting
5. Proposed Directive from Chief of Police RE: Mobile Fingerprint Reader (Manual Directive 304.8). Received July 17, 2019, distributed to full Board, July 17, 2019, posted on BOPC web for public review, July 17, 2019 and referred to Policy Committee
6. Neighborhood Day @ Dad Butler Park – Saturday, August 3, 2019 12pm – 5pm from Commissioner Burch
7. Detroit News Detroit News Article, Police Board Chair: I oppose facial recognition software dated July 18, 2019

Announcements: The next meeting is scheduled for July 25, 2019 at 3:00 PM at Public Safety Headquarters Building, 1301 Third Street, Detroit MI 48226. The following month community meeting is scheduled for August 8, 2019 at 6:30 PM at the Samaritan Center, 5555 Conner Street, in the Carolyn Cheeks Kilpatrick Room at 6:30 PM (5th Precinct).

Oral Communications – 20 individual comments

Tawanna Petty: What is happening in Detroit with facial recognition technology likens me to biometric experiments on the level of the Tuskegee experiment. It is the largest biometric experiment on the level of a concentrated demographic of black people in modern history. Project Green light and related facial recognition technology harkens me back so the days of the lantern laws of the 1800s when black men were forced, were required to walk with a lit lantern in front of their faces under the guides of safety if they were not in the presence of a white person. In some cities and countries this technology is already use the target in Muslim. DPD may not use it for that purpose but what if ICE wants to. Even if this technology becomes accurate it is subject to human bias. Coupled with the pressure to solve crimes it becomes extremely dangerous. It is for this reason that I joined the growing course of people around the world to resist this flawed technology. Oakland California became the third city to ban government and police use of facial recognition technology just this Tuesday. It is my prayer that Detroit becomes the fourth city to ban police and government use of this technology. It is my hope that Michigan becomes the first state to ban this technology. Chief Craig referenced Michigan's facial recognition technology two wrongs don't make a right. Our Michigan Secretary of State has given every ID that comes through their office since 1998 to the state police for over 20 years without consent. We must stop this pervasive non- consentful use of this technology. The mayor just publicly said that he objects to facial recognition technology. Then if that's the case there is no reason to vote for it.

Eric Blount: Good afternoon board and Chief. For the record my name is Eric Blount a lifelong Detroit. And I must say people have said a lot of wonderful things about you Chief but somebody's gotta tell the truth about what a lot of people think. There is a lack of interest, I mean a lack of trust with you and with Detroit Police Department. It goes back even to these meetings. The FBI crime data was disputed for years so we couldn't rely on what you said for the crime data. And now with facial recognition it was done for a year before people really knew about it, including the City Council and the Board of Police Commissioners. And when it comes to discipline, Mark Diaz got a pass, and I don't know how many of you who know who Mark Diaz is. He was charged with a felony and yet not suspended without pay. Chief I do admire you for recommending suspension without pay for Corporal Jones but that still has not happened yet. There is so much distrust and so many reasons for the people to mistrust the police department, this Board and you Chief I just can't go on and on.

Brenda Hill: My name is Brenda Hill and I'd like a little latitude in time because I'd like to think a couple of the officers as well as James Craig. About four years ago he allowed me to create a group of mothers who lost their children and it was called "Inactive, it's really the cold case". And just this past week we got justice for one of the mothers after nine years the two individuals that killed her son. And so with that being said Craig and Bettison and Marlin. And I'm not disrespecting them, I just don't know that a lot of them have gotten promotions. Elaine, Brian, Captain Slappy. All the detectives that helped on the case, mine at the time was Charles Weaver. And with that being done, I have hope today that my own case could be solved. And those that are out there interviewing and listening in the audience I needed to tell them that so that they can I have some hope to hold on a little longer. We never thought that this case would be solved in these offices did that. Did that because a few ladies asked the Chief and Bettison could we do this. It's a rare thing to which has result in a mother having some justice even though she doesn't have her son. And the rest of us can still believe with all the bad things that are going on in this world, in this city. Maybe because we don't have our kids and we have to wake up every day knowing maybe someday we'll have justice, so I'd like to thank them for that. I have a problem with the over policing at these community meetings. We've had more than 15 officers at every meeting and there has never been a threat. A physical threat. A Verbal threat. But yet the community meetings are turning into something like we had in the 60s and 70s STRESS. That must stop. Thank you. Oh and I don't want facial recognition right now.

Ms. Faith: Welcome to this Honorable Board. For the record my name is Miss Faith, I appreciate every one of you and the good that I've seen you devote down to the years. I know there's been a lot of controversy, there's been a lot of things that come up but you've always been levelheaded and you've always been professional and full of integrity. Every statement that was made, every comment that was made, every circumstance has always been balanced every time. For that I Admire and respect y'all for that. I just came from another meeting that they help me also down to the years and I just want to say to Commissioner Bell you're the daddy of them all. You keep everybody in line. And to Commissioner Holly and Commissioner Craig y'all work like a trio. Keep it up you're well-oiled machine. And the rest of the ladies and the other commissioners, well-oiled machines. And I appreciate y'all so very very much. Officer Paster. And I want to honor somebody in their absence. Civilian officer over number 5, I have talk to her for quite a few years also. And she has always been levelheaded and professional and she's always been informative and knowledgeable of her job. And she has not taking me under her wing as family member or anything she is doing her job. She's very professional. I'm not her blood relative but she's doing her job and I admire and respect her for that. And I honor Commissioner Brooks for helping that way also and Commissioner Burch. All the ladies, the guys they always get their honor so I'm honoring the ladies today and the women in blue. Y'all keep on standing I appreciate y'all very very much.

Marie Thornton: For the record my name is Marie Thornton, Precinct Delegate 147 in district 6. I was bought to come here because of what happened on July 9, I did not appreciate that and apparently that Deputy Chief didn't appreciate you all apologizing because he got up and left. And I think some of the comments should've been for him as well. I saw Chief Craig at the City Council meeting asking for \$4 million trying to convince them that these facial recognition was not anything like Green light. But Green light to me is a starter kick for facial recognition. Oh but before I begin, when I came in here, under the Open Meetings Act, why did they take my ID downstairs and put it in a machine. All it made me think about facial recognition that they programming. Under the Open Meetings Act they are not supposed to make you sign or take your ID and all of this other stuff. So I need somebody to explain this to me. But I didn't like you supporting that Deputy Chief and you're on TV, and I'm sitting up in there, I'm a dialysis patient, don't have that much energy but you gave me the energy to come here today to tell you I don't want facial recognition. But I am going to take that tour since I am a part of the community and maybe I might change how I feel about it, but I doubt it because it seems like it's an invasion on my privacy. You're absolutely right this is you all's meeting this is not the police officer meeting and for you to do it in front of Commissioner Burton and say you thought it was legal. Really it wasn't. Because I got trained in the Open Meetings Act.

Bernice Smith: Good afternoon, Chief, Commissioners. I am very very upset because number one I did speak to Commissioner Bell when I saw the display last week on TV. I got several calls because my children thought I was here but I told him no I wasn't because they were fearful for my safety. But in the meantime, I was just want to let the agitators know this is our police meeting, I have been coming here ever since the existence. Matter fact I let everybody know, Even the Commissioners that I looked up the history of the police department in regards to who was first on not only the commission, it wasn't a commission then. It was a crime, People's crime and Coleman Young was grateful enough to put me on the commission along with Joe Madison and Albert Dunmar, an Arab from the president of the grocers Association, and a Latino that came from southwest Detroit who was the president of their organization. Now, setting that I think I have a right to make, not make it but to make the knowledge that like I said a police meeting, this is not the Charter meeting and we do not tolerate the performance that was going on last week. It was said and I've taken several notes and I'm not gone go into all the notes but one thing really hit me good, someone stated that the Orr nominated our Chief. If you look up history you would know that the Mayor always select a Chief. And ever since he's been here, and I'm not such a person that's going to kiss behinds, but I think he has done a wonderful job. When I give him criticism he takes it and he said he'll do better. So don't come here and complain about the police being here because you need it because you performed last week like heathens. So therefore I will tell you this this is our police commission, the people who come here they do not need to be here because we do not tolerate all of this. Get a sergeant of arms Carter and put em out. That's all I have to say, put em out. Take care.

Valerie Glenn: My name is Valerie Glenn I am Precinct Delegate 171 in District 5. I have several concerns about the stress level. Commissioner Carter, Chair Carter, a large reason why we are here is because you didn't respect the process last week. No you didn't. That's all right, but the concern that I've had is the stress level in the community right now. The last three meetings, community meetings that I've been at we've been quite frankly over policed. I'll start out with the police and STRESS level. We are at the level of fearing that we are at a level where all the police officers don't look like most of you all of them treat us like we. Can you ask Ms. Bernice needs to be quiet please? Can you do anything with her please? I'm very sorry but I hope this is not my time. I'm very concerned with the stress levels in the community for instants at Tuesday's evening Council meeting city Council meeting we had a 1 to 3 ratio of police officers per citizen that's too many. Half of them were hidden in a side room where we wasn't supposed to know they were there. We are not that threatened and we don't do anything to deserve that. Just before that of course, we had the removal of Commissioner Willie Burton by a group where he supposed to be a part of the oversight committee. And in my opinion Commissioner Burton didn't do anything to deserve that and that's just my opinion OK. Then we had two activists, one activist at the city charter meeting removed and arrested, and another senior activist surprise a prize it was not me, was threatened to be arrested and that was Ms. Harrison. Oddly enough most these people were NAN members Commissioner Davis, most of them were NAN members, all of them were NAN members as a matter of fact. So I'm beginning to think that maybe we are being targeted. Now I do appreciate, my husband was a police officer Elmore Simons. It's time, OK well I'll write this all down. I am really, really disturbed and Madame Chair we love you and your husband state rep Carter however this isn't right what's going on right now.

Cindy Dara: How much would a police state cost or how much does it. And usually with technology and industry that means you lay off and reduce the job so does Green light mean we're gonna have fewer police? And the Charter Commission in their last meeting said that they were going to hire their own separate security force because they didn't feel safe enough with eight or 10 officers in the Coleman A Young - Erma Henderson Auditorium. Domeeko Williams he was arrested. Now the first time that they started after him, I saw it so I ran through the aisle and followed him And Elena Herrada came out with her camera. So everybody

went and sat back down and we settled that. And many times the officer would come up to me and say this is a warning and this is more than once that this happened. And I asked him how many warnings I was going to get. But I was white, Demeeko was younger and he's black, so when we had an intermission I didn't go right out to go to the bathroom. By the time I go up to go to the bathroom they're taking him down the elevator so I never found out, they haven't dropped the charges I just asked somebody, he is out of jail I don't know how long they kept him but I know the last time I was in Nevada I was like those little kids, those immigrant kids that sleep on the floor. And I just wondered how can they discriminate why are their parents sleeping on the floor too, maybe I didn't get all the news right. But of course we have our own people here sleeping on a cement floor with no heat over there, the time I was there. So I just want to recommend a different procedure for both the charter meeting in this meeting. I would like you to think about having where you all allow public comment before each important vote. Now I don't consider these votes on giving recognition awards to people important but these policy, the votes, every one of them if you want people to be orderly you gotta give them a chance to participate before you take the vote not afterwards at the end of the meeting. And you could even have a public comment in the beginning for people who want to come and say something that they've been thinking about and then have proper time after each issue. Because you can't expect people to be orderly when they really are just in the peanut gallery and they have very little influence if they are allowed to have their voices heard. Now one other thing I want to say I want you to study the constitution as a commission And I want the police officers to be having annual or weekly or monthly studying the constitution and enforcing the law and respecting it so that they can teach other people so that they know something and they're not just abusing power, really they don't know the local laws and they don't know the constitution. And I think that if San Francisco and Cambridge said they did not want the Green light it may be unconstitutional, maybe we can take it all the way to the Supreme Court.

Joanne Underwood: Hi my name is Joanna Underwood I'm a city commissioner on the Detroit Charter Commission. And clearly the board of the police commission is not operating the way that the charter say that it's supposed to operate. Also I'm very concerned about our police force almost half white, we've been able to maintain a 60% or greater black police force for the last 40 years with all the conditions of Detroit has been the same. So the failure of the chief to maintain that needs to be looked at. Also the Greenlight expansion program was approved without a policy, I was there at the City Council meeting and they approved it without a policy, they approved the funding without a policy. And you cannot name me not one Michigan City where we have over 500 law-enforcement agencies, not one is half black. When you look at the majority of the white cities not one of their police force is half black, so there's no justification for a city like Detroit who is majority black to have almost a half white police force when a white population only represent 10% of the population. Our police force should be 75% black or greater. And also to add to the Chief I do think his program is good as far as the expansion with the training program with the boot camp and I would like to extend it that you can use community block grants that you don't have to take out the public safety budget or the general fund budget and also including to middle schools and make it a summer program requirement. And also for the high schoolers make it a credit because they have to give community hours in order to get their high school diploma. Also I got plenty of ideas that I would like to bring right now and submit it officially to the Board and I would like to work with the Board to implement those ideas as far as making sure we have a predominant black police force because this is Detroit in our representation of our police force must reflect the population. I don't care people get upset about it but that's the fact this is the majority black city and we need majority black police officers. Thank you.

Michelle George: Good afternoon Chief Craig, and to Commissioner Carter and the board of police commissioners. Chief Craig I do want to thank you for your comment because we felt that Commissioner Burton should not have been arrested because I got calls across the city as well. The reasons we were concerned about the facial recognition is because in Lansing is House Bill 4810 that the Legislator Robinson and also Senator Lucido wanted ban facial recognition so that is the issue that we had with the Board voting for a facial recognition. I was at a city Council meeting even the city council members was asking Mr. Stallworth, I think he's in Public policy in Lansing, that they were not getting the information they needed on facial recognition. So that's the issue with the disparity. So that was my concern I know you couldn't hear me at the last meeting because of the sound but the issue is that we do not want the disparities always Detroit. And I just received, I emailed Mayor Duggan this morning about the facial recognition and I got on my email that he said he opposed facial recognition. And I don't know if that's true or not but he stated that so the issue is that's the problem that we have with that. Now dealing with the law-enforcement program and Commissioner Holly I'll get with you about this, Chief Craig there was a young man at the school board meeting, I think that's the school Cody, we do want more law-enforcement with our high schools. It need to be not just Cass Tech, not just Golightly, we need at least 10 high schools. But the issue that we're having is the Emergency Management, this is why we having problems at this charter commission. My prayer is, and I wrote the attorney general, that she would dismiss Commissioner Weaver. We are having these issues because it's the emergency management, and one of the issues that I will be fighting, unless we change the

issue with our politician mayor Duggan is going to have to deal with this waiver. We are having problems with this Emergency Management, I don't think Carol Weaver she used the police force during these meetings. Thank you.

Mr. Thomas Khalesh: Good afternoon Commissioners, my name is Thomas Khalesh I'm here on behalf of the taking back pride initiative. Last month, early last June, early this June, at motor city pride a handful of neo-Nazis showed up to march. They were armed, they carried shields, they were incredibly violent, and they were incredibly agitational. Motor city pride knew months in advance that they were coming and they informed the police department that they were coming. We knew that this was going to happen and it happened, they showed up and they were in the free-speech zone, a number of different people were in the free-speech zone protesting. I know as somebody who's been in protest we're always kept in free speed zones, we're always kept on one side of the street. But for some reason this time the police formed up around these Nazis, these people who advocate for genocides, specifically of LGBT people, who have executed genocides of LGBT people, and the police push their way across the street into the line, the very large line of hundreds of people waiting to get in this event. This is a violation of protocol for protest, this is a violation of protocol for extremely dangerous people who are carrying long guns. This has been, pardon me let me collect myself. There are a lot of photos of the Detroit Police Department marching under a swastika. There is an image that is never going to be forgotten there. This is of the people who advocate for a genocide, and the police protected them from unarmed people who were waiting to get into a festival. They marched them down the line. We've been waiting for accountability. We've been waiting for an investigation. We've been waiting for a condemnation at least but nothing has come. Chief Craig I believe that should've been at the actions of the police department that day. We are still waiting and if we're going to keep waiting then we will understand that you've chosen a side. I just want to state that that has not gone unnoticed. Thank you so much for your time.

Reginald Crawford: My name is Reggie Crawford retired Detroit police officer, Former Detroit Police Commissioner, live in the city of Detroit. Good evening commission, good evening Chief Craig. 1974 The Detroit police commission was created never in history of the commission was anyone ever arrested, Citizen, definitely not a police commissioner was ever arrested at a police commission meeting. As the young man just stated Commissioner Burton was arrested last week, but not one Neo-Nazi was arrested. They urinating in public, they called the Black police officers Niggas monkeys but not one of them were arrested. That's a fact. I'm opposed to the facial recognition. We've had facial recognition for years in the city of Detroit and around the country. Anytime you have any person of interest or suspect you put that image or that picture out on the 6 or 11 o'clock news people identify the person, that's called identity policing. So we've had it and it's out there. That identification virtually is 100%. We talk about the facial recognition technology with which is only 77% accurate with whites and 30% accurate with Blacks. I don't know why anyone in a city that's 82% Black in their right Black mind would want to bring in some technology that's flawed and misidentifies black people, it's beyond me. And what occurred next week, or last week, where a commissioner was arrested, or a citizen at the commission meeting made history. And I'll say that that will be the last person arrested at a commission meeting. Thank you.

D'Etta Wilcoxon: Honorable Board, so the residents of the city of Detroit, I am D'Etta Wilcoxon and I came here primarily today to speak not so much to this board but to speak to the record. Detroiters have been robbed of their right to fully vote and to be true recipients of the federal voting rights act through the Emergency Management. Detroiters have been robbed of their right to be Americans, as their mayor and their city Council was stripped of all of their powers that they did not freely relinquish through the Emergency Management. Detroiters have been robbed of their rights to self-governance through home rule that is enjoyed by other Michiganians across the state of Michigan. Detroiters have been robbed of their rights to use their tax dollars to educate their children as their schools were taking over due to Emergency Management. I am asking this board in its official capacity to please, please, please do not take from Detroiters their peoples/civilians oversight department. I.e. the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners or Commission by arresting and handcuffing our elected officials. The optics were not pleasant, in fact they were downright disgusting. We have to engage ourselves in public protocol that is indicative of the caliber of this city that we love so much. We all as human beings have learning curves and we expect everyone to put their teeth on somebody. But what happened last week should be a wakeup call for all of us, we should have learned and extremely valuable lesson. And again Detroiters have been robbed of far too much to tolerate this kind of indignation. Thank you.

Crystal Bonner: Hello, Crystal Bonner retire Detroit public schools special Ed teacher, and current special Ed teacher for the state of Michigan At a mental hospital. Picture this, a group of us are walking down the street and see "ISIS forever death to America, ISIS forever death to America". Do you think that the Detroit Police Department would walk calmly with us? No not at all. To me and to millions of other people the KKK, Nazi organizations or anything similar to that, has no right, and are not covered under the first amendment. They are a hate group, and they are responsible for killing millions of people in Germany. You have some Jewish people today that will say "wait a minute Nazis walking down the street marching and the police are supporting them that is

crazy". And all the millions of deaths that they are responsible for of my African ancestors. And for you Mr. Craig to say on the TV that well both sides said something that wasn't nice. You sort of sounded like Trump, number 45. When the lady was murdered down there in Charlotte with a car by one of these people, it wasn't good on both sides. It wasn't. They should not be allowed and I don't know why we continue in this country to perpetuate systemic racism. Groups like that have no First Amendment right. What you should've done was got a bandwagon and put those people in there and got them off the street, that's what you should've did. You're going to have this Commissioner being arrested last week, are you serious. He's a duly elected official for district 5, and he's arrested for speaking. And look at the crowd here. It's not up yet. No it's not, not while I'm talking into this mic and I don't even need a mic. This place is almost empty, and why is it almost empty? Because you guys sit up here and talk for two hours, didn't this thing start at 3 PM? It started at 3 PM. You didn't start calling in people to speak from the community until two hours later. That is not good. And it's not good community work or whatever you guys are supposed to be doing up here. It's a disgrace. You need to shorten down your time and let people come up here and speak. It shouldn't last this long I have other things to do. Anybody that wants to speak y'all should speak because if you're going to take up two hours or so, then anybody here should be able to speak OK.

Andrea Barber: Good afternoon commissioners, Chief Craig. My name is Andrea barber I am a resident of Eastside Detroit, particularly 6 mile and Gratiot area. Which I am, I think over there is the 9th precinct area. I have lived over in that area since 1983. Prior to that I was living on the west side with my family. My issue is I have, right now my family and my neighborhood has endured a lot. We have endured a lot of drug use in the neighborhood, I have called police several times. To much avail I have received a lot of passing the buck. I called the precinct they tell me my NPO was, I think Aubrey Wade. But I think he, after some issue in the news, he's no longer there. I was then told it was Brad Hawkins who was my NPO. Then I called and tried to speak to him and they say he's no longer with the precinct. Prior to that, I spoke to a lady Aza who has been no help. She was supposed to be coming to the neighborhood to walk the block she has done nothing for us. There's a gentleman I will be speaking to in a minute but I need help in my neighborhood and I have spoken to police and they come out. I understand that there are other pressing issues murders, homicides, and robberies that happen. But at some point I do expect them to show up within, I know sometimes it might take 30 minutes or 45 minutes or so but 2,3,4,5 hours' later or just no-shows is just completely unacceptable. So I need some answers I need some phone numbers I need some people to talk to. I'm not sure if this is on television or not but I do have information so I guess if you can call me a snitch you can call me whatever but I'm tired. I'm 40 years old and I'm tired of what's going on in my neighborhood and it's got to change. Thank you.

Ernest Little: My name is Ernest Little. I'm the president of the third precinct Police Community Relations. Where Franklin Hayes is the commander, and Ronald Cox is the captain. I come here today because I live in the fifth, I also go over in the fifth district which is for city Council. And I know that each person up here is politically connected because each one of them had to get at least 300 or 1000 signatures to at least be a police commissioner or be appointed by the mayor of the city of Detroit. Most people also know me from the fighting 13th and contrary to popular belief I understand a lot of the politics. And one of the greatest person's that we're going to leave is Barren, you know the one that's going to be the city of Southfield. He actually can cool the hotheads down and bring order to the elevator that was going up with the protestors. I hope that moving forward we could other people that can maintain the decorum and that we can have peace. Because contrary to popular believe, Andrea I invited her to this meeting because we had more pressing issues in the streets of the city of Detroit. The most important thing is the police are to maintain the order and contrary if they have to maintain the order in here or you have to move on and have a private security guard because when I came in the building I had no problem giving my ID, because that's what we do when we vote. And another thing with Marie Thornton she actually served with me on the board I appointed her through the community group. At that point Kilpatrick was in office and it was at central district. So contrary to popular belief we are interconnected, the protestors and the protestees. But what we have to do is learn how to respect each other and apologize like we did this week and move on with the important work and keeping the Detroit police and keep Craig or whoever take that position always maintain the order and constitutional policing for everybody in the city no matter what nationality because contrary to popular belief English Spanish and Arabic will always be in Detroit if not others.

Yolanda Greer: Good afternoon to Police Commissioners to our honorable chief of police chief, Chief Craig. Listen I love Detroit. I was born and raised in Detroit but my primary concern today at 62 years old when I look down at the eyes of these children. You know when I was coming up, Oh my God, children were our future. Are they are future today? When you make these decisions please, please, please sir and ma'am please consider these children. Don't take them for granted children are different today they learn a lot they're up all night learning. And they sleep when they come to School OK. So don't take for granted that these children don't know that you're here and what's going on. I teach and I tell my children, Chief Craig, I say to them, watch the news and stay current with events. Because I was taught as a child if you try to stay current with events you'll know what's going on at

your next-door neighbor's house. Some people in this community don't even know their neighbors today. You can't borrow sugar, eggs, peanut butter, or whatever they have in their kitchen. When I was coming up that was the neighborhood, we had neighborhood block clubs OK. Now if you're going to be a police in Detroit, everyone should be a police in Detroit. Organizations like crime stoppers, we've called Crime Stoppers only to be told it's settled. Only to go back in those communities and see the crime is still high there. So something is earthly definitely wrong here. There's shipments coming here with drugs ok, they're stopping them. Opioid, crack cocaine, heroinism, I don't know in Detroit. I haven't been into everybody's backyard but are they growing weed, are they growing crack cocaine? Are they making heroin? I don't know how you do the stuff I'm not a scientist or pharmacist chief. But these drugs have caused the dismantling of our young people. And everybody seems to be making decisions. But why ask yourself why when you're making these decisions, why are the drugs still here in Detroit? Why are we still locking up our young men? I heard today about you getting in the community, you're recruiting. I was recruited in the city of Detroit for police. I passed all my tests except for that physical test you're talking about Chief. I couldn't do the sit ups, I ran, I climbed the poles. OK I passed my test but when it come to the sit ups and pushups I lack skills there. So they told me to go run the steps, so I'm still running for Detroit, y'all run for Detroit.

Kay Hearn: good evening I'm Katy Hearn here representing Detroit community technology project and I'm grateful I was able to stick around today. I appreciate the call to look at the bigger picture as it relates to the facial recognition technology. I wonder what questions were asking as to why other municipalities have outright banned facial recognition. Is it merely a PR move, is it failures to reach consensus on policy, or is it possible that we are less interested in best practices. Another question I want to raise is whether we are eligible for a refund of the real time facial recognition software we aren't going to use. Since it carried over a 1million dollar price tag. As a former PR professional, I do understand the desire to separate Project Green light from facial recognition whether that's streaming or still. But the Dataworks contract does paint the two as peas in a pod. This is not my opinion it says here to purchase facial recognition licensing software and equipment for the Detroit Police Department Green light locations. This contract's details and the decision to obfuscate the use of the technology for two years does not strike confidence in my heart. That a mere policy will somehow protect Detroiters from technology whose creators now caution the use? The fact that DPD, the city council and this board each had a hand in moving this Dataworks contract through without fully researching and comprehending its broader implications is not, particularly inspiring. You are within your right to label me as emotional paranoid or even annoying. But I hope that you can understand that my criticism of this technology is not a criticism of the DPD, it's not a criticism of this board. You are right that this is a complex issue. I do trust that this body will do its due diligence in providing accountability through civility oversight. Thank you.

Joanne Warwick: Hello my name is Joanne Warwick and I'm a resident of District 5. I wasn't planning on coming here today. People advised me that I should go take care of my own business but it was really disturbing to see Commissioner Willie Burton arrested. There were other ways of handling that like turn the mic off or something. I wasn't there. But any way hopefully that's not going to happen again I showed it to a friend of mine who is done sort of policing. He was voted best ambassador in Oakland, California and he couldn't believe it. He also can't believe that the people in Flint don't have clean water and there are water shut offs going on in this city. Just wanted to say I'm against the facial recognition technology and when you were talking about recruitment and you stated insufficient integrity. Well I'm not against police but frankly I think we have insufficient integrity on this police department and I'll direct it to you Commissioner Craig. I don't know how in a city where there water shut offs, when there are people losing their homes for like \$3000 that you could go ahead and allow this 50% discount policy for police and fire. That's a clear violation of the Charter you have a council who went to law school and understands what the market exception is. The way to make that legal is you give it to all Detroiters. I have a big problem with that. That your guys are gonna get a 50% discount when all these houses weren't boarded up. I mean where are our priorities? I don't completely dislike you, police Chief Craig, but I do have a problem with this that you don't apparently see the problem with that. And there's been over policing in my neighborhood and I have greater concerns there will be another 67. What preceded 67 before, people being pushed out, excessive policing and it could blow. And I don't want to see that happen.

Concerned Citizen: Good evening everyone. I'm always speaking about this. We have the tools that we need when the police have body cameras and they have cameras on their cars so that when they drive through our "hood" and focus more on our houses and the people going in and out of the community then we will be safe. We got all that we don't need other cameras or things that they got in China. And now they're using it to harass their people and jail them and all This. That's to the cameras and things. DPD officers are not protecting and serving the citizens of color in this city. They are observed daily in our community sitting around all day hiding and riding doing traffic details against the citizens to trail them, nail them, bail them and jail these people. They don't protect our safety at all. There are too many citizens being carjacked, shot stabbed robbed and murdered daily. This is a travesty appalling and unacceptable. We pay taxes for protection service and deserve better protection for the citizens than we are

currently receiving. These officers work details must be reassigned to protect the citizen's lives first in this city. People of color and Black lives do matter in Detroit and in America. No justice no peace.

Chairperson Carter: Requested a motion to adjourn. **Motion to Adjourn, Dewaelsche, Second, Holt.**

Motion to Adjourn. Chairperson Carter adjourned the meeting at 5:55 PM.