

Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners
Date of Meeting: April 25, 2019 – 3:00 PM
Location: Detroit Public Safety Headquarters, 1301 Third Street, Detroit, MI 48226

BOPC Chair Willie Bell called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (April 25, 2019)

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance		
	Attend	Not-Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson	Yes	
Daryl D. Brown, Vice Chairperson	Yes	
Lisa Carter	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Yes	
Eva Garza Dewaelsche	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton (3:10 PM)	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Evette Griffie	Excused	
Annie Mae Holt	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	10	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for April 25, 2019.

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes:
 Thursday, April 18, 2019**

Chairman Willie E. Bell welcomed attendees to the meeting and ask for introductions of Commissioners, BOPC and DPD staff and other elected and civic representatives. Chairman Bell said “Good Afternoon! I am Police Commissioner Willie Bell, I represent District #4. I serve as the Chair of the Board and will be conducting our meeting today. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance, thank you for joining us. For people viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for viewing our meeting. Commissioner Evette Griffie has asked to be excused.”

INVOCATION: We have invited Chaplain Lucell Trammer to provide the invocation. Chaplain Lucell Trammer gave the invocation.

Chairperson's Report - Willie Bell. Chairman Bell said “On behalf of the Board, I want to express our concern and support for fallen and injured officers. Our concerns for officer safety and citizen protection is ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers. I would ask the Chief of Police during his remarks to provide us with any additional information related to injured and fallen officers. The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas Holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters 3 weeks in the month on Thursdays at 3:00 PM. We also meet in the community every 2nd Thursday of the month at 6:30 PM. Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our citizens are justified in asking “How does civilian oversight of law enforcement help you as a citizen within our community?” Our answer is, we protect the civil rights of citizens. Oversight organizations like the BOPC are at the forefront of investigating, reviewing and auditing individual cases of citizen complaints and patterns of operations by police agencies to eliminate misconduct, discriminatory police practices and unnecessary use of force by police. Our work is based on developing and supporting effective policing. Mutual trust and respect between the police and the community is critical toward increasing the quality of life for residents and visitors to Detroit. The Board of Police Commissioners exists to provide civilian oversight for the work of the Detroit Police Department. As a Board, we receive and investigate non-criminal citizens’ complaints, monitor the operations of the Department and work with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to make or modify police policy.

I want to point to several important items for your consideration and information. The Board is continuing to work with NACOLE (National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement) to host the National Conference on September 22 thru 26, 2019 in Detroit. During the same time, Detroit will be celebrating our 45th year as a civilian oversight organization

on July 22, 2019. We are inviting law-enforcement and other civic minded individuals and organizations to join us at the conference. The planning process is well underway, and again we invite your participation.

I want to acknowledge that the Chief of Police has re-transmitted a proposed directive utilizing traffic light mounted cameras and facial recognition software. This directive was pulled back a few weeks ago for additional refinements by the Chief. This is a resubmission and our Policy subcommittee will be reviewing this proposed directive. The proposed directive is posted at the city and BOPC websites for public review and comments.

Occasionally, I will share some important historical dates with the Board to help center many of our discussions. Today, April 25th, I want to point to three important items. (1) In 1946 Mayor Edward Jeffries, Jr. requested and obtained support from the Detroit Common Council to raze or demolish Black Bottom. While the authority to raze Black Bottom dates back to 1946 according to local historian Ken Coleman, the actual redevelopment creating the Lafayette Park community occurred in the 1960's. Many will say that historically, this region in Detroit was the home of many of the most vibrant business and entertainment districts populated by Blacks. (2) In 1973 Federal Judge Damon Keith ruled in a case brought by Willie Stamps and other Black Detroit Edison employees that Detroit Edison had deliberately discriminated against black workers. The Stamps case started a review of private corporate practices in relation to race based employment discrimination. (3) Today, is the fifth anniversary of the Flint Water Crisis. The Flint water crisis is known for selecting money as the primary reason to govern a city. Under the Flint Emergency Manager, Flint's water source was changed to help balance the Flint budget over the health needs of the neighborhoods. Today, many children and adults continue to experience the effects of contaminated water sources that will hamper their abilities to lead a normal life well into the future. Each of these dates show how important it is for us to follow the work of public and private leaders as they make decisions that will impact our lives. This engagement goes far beyond a simple suggestion for transparency, but should reflect a long term commitment to help people.

Today, we have two presentations. The first is on DPD policies and practices in the "Use of Force." The Board provided the Department with four questions to help shape their presentation. The questions included (1) the number of "Use of Force" Reports filed in the last 30 days. (2) the number of "Use of Force" investigations conducted in the last 30 days. (3) new refinements in the Use of Force policy implemented by DPD in the last year. And (4) any sufficient findings or results from the Director of Professional Standards and Constitutional Policing. The second presentation today will be from Dr. Polly McCallister, Chief Investigator for the Office of the Chief Investigator. The OCI report is a deep dive into citizen complaints filed by residents of the city and investigated by our staff.

Under the DPD Chief's Report, I am requesting an update on our crime statistics and any critical issues facing the Police Department. I would ask the Chief to spend a little time on briefing the public on the Environmental Audit at the 6th Police Precinct.

I also want to point out that USA Today has published a searchable database on police misconduct involving some 85,000 records nationally. The database has a section on MCOLES with some 150 records of police personnel in Michigan. The database is searchable, but does not have a subsection for the City. I would ask the Chief of Police who is the city's representative on MCOLES Board to request a list of officers in the database from Detroit. I will also ask the Chief to share this list with the Board of Police Commissioners.

At the end of the meeting we will have public comments from the audience. Please make sure you print your name on a speaker's card. Cards are located in the back on the table or can be obtained by seeing Mr. Robert Brown. He will need your card before the beginning of public comments. We will hold each speaker to the allotted 2 minutes." Chairman Bell also asked that cell phone be silenced for the meeting.

COP Police Report: Chief of Police James E. Craig. COP James E. Craig reported that crime is continuing to trend downward as against last year. Chief Craig reported utilizing DPD Department CompStat (2019) data for the reporting period ending April 21, 2019. Chief Craig reported percentage change between 2018 and 2019, -21% decrease in Homicides, Sexual Assaults 11% increase, Robbery -11% decrease, Carjacking -45% decrease, Aggravated Assaults 0% decrease, non-fatal shootings -13% decrease, Burglary -4% decrease, Larceny -14% decrease, Stolen Vehicle -8% decrease and Part 1 offenses -7% decrease. Chief Craig commented on the birthday acknowledgement of the late Sgt Erin Stephens. Chief Craig also summarized the findings of a recent Environmental Audit of the 6th Police Precinct. Craig highlighted three changes in the command staff at the 6th Precinct for Management and Supervisory failures resulting in the retirement of one command staff at the 6th Precinct as well as the demotion of a second command staff and the establishment of a supervised work plan for modification with the third command staff. Craig continued indicating that racial concerns were witnessed especially within the afternoon shift wherein fired

officers Garrison and Steele worked. Chief Craig also indicated that he has ordered a review of existing training activity and the establishment of increased training standards on racial and cultural bias. Craig also discussed the effects of the physical condition of the precinct and shared several improvements that are underway at the precinct. Craig also indicated that the process of Environmental Audits would be spread around the city to all police precincts on a rotating bases to reduce the occurrence of future problems.

**Presentations to the Board: (A) Use of Force Training and Polices, Captain Mohammad and Stg. Jeremy James.
(B) Office of the Chief Investigator Monthly Report, Dr. Polly McCallister, OCI Chief Investigator**

(A) Use of Force Training and Polices, Captain Bilal Mohammad provided the following responses to questions previously submitted for the presentation. The responses are as follows (RESPONSES TO THE BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS QUESTIONS REGARDING USE OF FORCE TRAINING AND POLICIES)

Q: The Number of use of force reports filed in the last 30 days?

A: 152. Additionally, 5 reports were completed for an allegation of Use of Force and 2 reports for Detainee Injury

Q: The number of Use of Force Investigations conducted in the last 30 days?

15 category 2 and 29 Category 3 investigations

There were no cases submitted for Category 1 uses of force however 4 cases were submitted for closure

Q: Any refinements in the use of force policy implemented by DPD in the last year?

A: 1 revision to the USE OF FORCE REPORTING STANDARDS. The new reporting standards were implemented to simplify the process of documentation uses of force and to include a more specific breakdown of Category 1, 2, and 3 incidents. The reporting requirements streamlined to reduce duplication of information by updating the headers for category 2 and 3 uses of force. The revision was disseminated in Training Directive 18-02 on December 6, 2018.

Q: Any sufficient funding or results from the Director of Professional Standards and Constitutional Policing?

A: Since his arrival in January, the Director has not identified any patterns of concern regarding Category 1 uses of force.

Sergeant Jeremy James outlined the Professional Education and Training unit and its approach to Use of Force. Sgt. Jeremy James discussed the Consent judgement and the Use of Force continuum as well as other force directives. James also outlined what is taught to members of the force including MCOLES Force Continuum, DPD Policies, training on special weapon systems, case law including Graham v. Conner and de-escalation and reasonableness rules. Sgt. James also discussed Department sponsored Mental Health Training including CAPP - trauma training, Mental Health First Aid and petition requirements for mental impaired persons and suicide prevention training.

(B) Office of the Chief Investigator Monthly Report, Dr. Polly McCallister, OCI Chief Investigator reported from March 2019 OCI accepted and processed 87 citizen complaints. OCI has received 87 complaints in March 2019 as compared to 79 in February 2018, by allegations - use of profanity, incident involving "hit & run" incidents, and electronic evidence (Body Worn Cameras and Electronic Control Weapons). McCallister also reported on false allegations via Body Worn Cameras. Below, please see a table for closed March 2019 Citizen Complaints.

87 OCI CCRs CLOSED – March 2019

146 ALLEGATIONS' FINDINGS

Allegation	Total	Admin_Closure (29%)	Exonerated (14%)	Inconclusive (23%)	Sustained (16%)	Unfounded (18%)
Arrest (1%)	3	0	2	0	0	1
Demeanor (24%)	40	8	0	13	9	10
Entry (1%)	1	1	0	0	0	0
Force (3%)	7	1	2	3	0	1
Harassment (2%)	3	2	0	0	0	1
Procedure (43%)	57	15	10	11	13	8
Property (6%)	6	2	0	3	0	1
Search (1%)	7	1	3	0	0	3
Service (18%)	22	12	3	4	1	2

Total (135 CCRs Closed)	146	42	20	348	23	27
-------------------------	-----	----	----	-----	----	----

BOPC Standing Committee Reports: None.

Report from Secretary to the Board: Mr. Hicks presented 9 items as incoming items into the BOPC on agenda as follows,

1. Email from Sundra Blessett-Jennings Proposal for Detroit's renewal, Protection and Gain
2. Letter from Grant Ha re: Additional Information on the appeal of student police officer Henry Hobbs
3. Planning, research and Development Transmittal of written Directive # 307.6 - Use of traffic Light-Mounted Cameras and facial Recognition Technology (4-23-2019)
4. Greenlight locations as of 4-24-2019; 528 locations
5. FOIA request from Corey Williams, Associated Press Writer, referred to OCI Chief Investigator (4-22-2019)
6. Executive Summary of the 6th Police Precinct Environmental Audit (4-23-2019)
7. USA Today article on Police Misconduct/Searchable Database (4-25-2019)
8. USA Today excerpt - Recruitment Concerns (4-25-2019)
9. Update information on the transition of City e-mail GroupWise to Outlook (BOPC problems)

Old Business: None.

New Business: Commissioner Willie Burton moved for all minutes of the BOPC be made available to the public during the meeting. **Second, William Davis. Discussion -** Mr. Hicks explained that it is impossible to assume that the Board may or may not have corrections to the minutes, therefore it is more reasonable to have them available after they are approved by the Board. Mr. Hicks explained that such written copies of the minutes can be reproduced and available on the back table one week after the approval date by the Board. The action was so order by the Chair.

Commissioner Willie Burton moved all committee meetings have a regular meeting schedule and be posted on the website. **Second Darryl Brown. Discussion -** Commissioner Lisa Carter indicated that as a non-paid volunteer it is difficult to require regular meetings beyond meetings already required in the Charter (Thursday BOPC meetings) and therefore would not support the motion.

VOTE:	Willie Bell - No.	Elizabeth Brooks - No.	Willie Burton - Yes.
	William Davis - Yes	Evette Griffie - Not in attendance.	Annie Holt - No.
	Darryl Brown - Yes.	Shirley Burch - No.	Lisa R. Carter - No.
	Eva Dewaelsche - No.	Jim Holley - No.	

Vote results - Yes =3, No = 7, MOTION NOT APPROVED

Commissioner Willie Burton moved for an independent audit of all committee meetings of the BOPC. Motion did not receive a second, therefore dies for lack of support.

Announcements: Next BOPC meeting May 2, 2019 @ 3:00 PM at the Detroit Public Safety Headquarters Building 1301 Third Street, Detroit MI 48226. The community meeting for May will be May 9, 2019 at 6:30 PM in the 8th Precinct at Macedonia Baptist Church at 14221 Southfield Freeway, Detroit 48223. Commissioner Burch announced an event to be held in District #3 to rededicate the Highland Park City reservoir.

Oral Communications - Public Comment. Ms. Faith indicated that she appreciated the work and words of Chairman Bell and Chief Craig. She also acknowledged the good work of the later Sergeant Erin Stephens. Eric Blount expressed his concerns between the written Use of Force directives and the actual use of force as witnessed in the beating of the female at DRH by Corporal Jones. Karen Gordon indicated she has attempted to talk with Chief of Police about a 2017 arrest by officers in the 7th precinct. Ashley Powell asked for the Board support for the Motor City Brick Challenge a fund raiser to improve Detroit. Scotty Bowman supported Commissioner Burton's call for transparency and asked about the status of Corporal Jones.

Motion to Adjourn Commission Carter. Second by Commissioner Holley. Chairman Bell adjourned the meeting at 5:19 PM.