

**Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners**

**Date of Meeting: March 28, 2019 – 3:00 PM**

Location: Detroit Public Safety Headquarters, 1301 Third Street, Detroit, MI 48226

**BOPC Chair Willie Bell called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (March 28, 2019)**

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance	Attend	Not-Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown, Vice Chairperson	Yes	
Lisa Carter	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Yes	
Eva Garza Dewaelsche	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jim Holley	Excused	
Evette Griffie	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	10	

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for March 28, 2019.**

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes:  
Thursday, March 21, 2019**

**Board of Police Commissioner Chair Willie E. Bell welcomed attendees to the meeting and asked for introductions of Commissioners, BOPC and DPD staff and other elected and civic representatives. Chairman Bell said” Good Afternoon! I am Police Commissioner Willie Bell, I represent District #4. I serve as the Chair of the Board and will be conducting our meeting today. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance, thank you for joining us. For people viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for viewing our meeting. Please note, Commissioner Jim Holley has requested to be excused from today’s meeting. “**

**INVOCATION:** Bell said, “We have invited Nathan Wilson of the Detroit Chaplain Corp to provide the invocation.” Chaplain Nathan Wilson provided the invocation for the meeting.

**Chairman Report:** – Willie Bell, Chair said “On behalf of the Board, I want to express our concern and support for fallen and injured officers. Our concerns for officer safety and citizen protection is ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers. I would ask the Chief of Police during his remarks to provide us with any additional information related to injured and fallen officers.

The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas Holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters 3 weeks in the month on Thursdays at 3:00 PM. We also meet in the community every 2<sup>nd</sup> Thursday of the month at 6:30 PM. Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our citizens are justified in asking “How does civilian oversight of law enforcement help you as a citizen within our community?” Our answer is, we protect the civil rights of citizens. Oversight organizations like the BOPC are at the forefront of investigating, reviewing and auditing individual cases of citizen complaints and patterns of operations by police agencies to eliminate misconduct, discriminatory police practices and unnecessary use of force by police. Our work is based on developing and supporting effective policing. Mutual trust and respect between the police and the community is critical toward increasing the quality of life for residents and visitors to Detroit. The Board of Police Commissioners exists to provide civilian oversight for the work of the Detroit Police Department. As a Board, we receive and investigate non-criminal citizens’ complaints, monitor the operations of the Department and work with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to make or modify police policy.”

Bell continued, “I want to point to several important items for your consideration. The Board is continuing to work with NACOLE (National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement) to host the National Conference on September 22 thru 26, 2019 in Detroit. During the same time, Detroit will be celebrating our 45<sup>th</sup> year as a civilian oversight organization on July 22, 2019. I

will repeat this message several times as we approach the September conference. We are inviting law-enforcement and other civic minded individuals and organizations to join us at the conference. The planning process is well underway, and again we invite your participation.

Today, we have several important agenda items. We have a resolution acknowledging the service of Sergeant Eren Stephens who is retiring after 33 years of service to law enforcement. We wish Sergeant Stephens and her family great opportunities following her service to the City of Detroit. We will take this retirement resolution at the appropriate point in our agenda. We have a presentation from the Chief's Office on the Annual Improvement Plan. On February 21, 2019 in my Chair's report I tried to draw out the difference between the Annual Report and the Annual Operations Improvement Plan. I will repeat this same message by reading the notes from the February 21, 2019 meeting. The Detroit City Charter, Section 7-806 creates several opportunities for the Chief of Police to engage the Commission. I want to list some of these opportunities so that the audience will follow our work as Commissioners. In Section 7-806 sub section #1: it indicates that the Chief shall administer the Department consistent with the policies, rules and regulations established by the Board and shall organize the Department with the approval of the Board. In Section 7-806 sub section #6: it indicates that the Chief shall submit to the Board an Annual Report. The Annual Report is a general purpose report that is available to the general public highlighting the work of the Detroit Police Department. In Section 7-806 sub section #7: it indicates that the Chief submit to the Board an Annual Operations Improvement Plan. The most outstanding difference is that this requirement is for a plan, not a report. In the recent past, the Annual Report and the Annual Operations Improvement Plan have been confused. One report is general and discusses the department. In the past this report has been used to highlight the leadership in the department, celebrate some important partnerships held with the department and some of the community endeavors associated with the department. The Annual Operations Improvement Plan is quite different. Again, it is a plan. It is a systematic review of the department and the Chief's candid opinion of the effectiveness of the department. The plan should show a detailed assessment of each Command, Division, Section and Unit and the Chief's assessment of their performance. The plan should also make projections indicating where the Chief and his Executive staff want to improve on the organization, strategies and the operational goals of the subunits. This plan is critical because it communicates to the Board, the Mayor and the general public on what we must do to improve the department. Generally speaking, an improvement plan should include (1) measures to protect citizens and fight crime, (2) insure officer safety, (3) an evaluation of crime fighting strategies to determine if they are working and what new opportunities exist on the horizon that are in keeping with our nations commitment to civilian control over para-military organizations like the police."

Bell added, "Following the presentation on the Annual Improvement Plan, we will have our monthly report from the Office of the Chief Investigator. Dr. Polly McCalister will be making this presentation on the work of OCI.

As Chair, I want to report on three important issues (1) responding to the Chief's appointments to the rank of Master Sergeant. I indicated that we would take this matter up at this meeting. I have changed my approach on this matter and will be drafting a letter to the Chief of Police with several comments and recommendations on the subject of Master Sergeants. The letter will be circulated for input by the Board before it is transmitted to the Chief. (2) I want to report, the BOPC attended its budget hearing yesterday, March 27, 2019 before the Detroit City Council. Commissioners Carter, Davis and Holt attended and participated in the hearing. Detroit City Councilmember Ayers was interested in the amount of detail that the BOPC exercised in reviewing the Police Department's budget. We reported that we gave full attention to the DPD budget. I recall that we had some 27 questions that we asked the Department about its budget. I will forward these questions to member Ayers for her benefit. We also reported that on January 31, 2019, we approved the budget request from the Police Department. Additionally, we were asked about the BOPC budget. The BOPC budget was approved to be released to the Non-Department and Budget Department on October 30, 2018. Generally speaking, the BOPC budget is largely the same as the previous year budget with a few exceptions including a requirement for a 5% overall reduction and a reduction in travel and training expenses because the NACOLE conference that will be hosted in Detroit. The budget also included the 2.5% wage increase following the pattern set across the city in labor negotiations."

Bell continued, "Finally, the budget sought to increase the reimbursements allotted to Commissioners. In painting a picture for the City Council on the need to reconsider how Commissioners are reimbursed, I focused on the difference between the old Board and the current Board. The old board was composed of five appointees of the Mayor. The NEW BOARD is composed of 7 elected Commissioners and 4 appointed Commissioners. At least for the elected Commissioners, our responsibilities as elected officials have grown dramatically. We attend more meetings than any of the other Boards and Commissions within the City. We meet in the community 12 evenings per year. We respond to and handle constituent complaints and concerns. We also have a greater role in reviewing and setting police policy and regulations as well as weighing in on budgetary or fiscal policy. To think of us as the old Citizen Review Board is not correct, we are an oversight Board with investigative powers and direct responsibilities to our citizens. We made our best appeal to the City Council to reexamine the method and amount of reimbursements for the Board, we are now working directly with Council President Jones to address our issues in an effort to seek a reasonable resolution.

Additionally, Bell said, "I also want to report on some discussions between the Mayor, the Police Chief and members of the Board related to a goal set by the Mayor during his State of the City Address. The goal was to increase the electronic surveillance within the city. The Mayor and Chief of Police has indicated they are developing a policy for review on the subject of electronic surveillance. We have a large number of stakeholders who are interested in this topic. At the appropriate time, after the policy information is generated, we will review the policy as a Board and weight in on issues of privacy, citizen protections and other related issues. We have also been asked by the Detroit City Council to join a workgroup on electronic surveillance. I have assigned staff to participate in the workgroup. At this point, the Board of Police Commissioners have not approved a surveillance strategy that could add 1000 cameras to our streets. We have on several occasions supported the Greenlight program. The Greenlight Program is not the same as a city-wide strategy to introduce a broad network of surveillance resources and to coordinate our surveillance capabilities with other enforcement efforts. Look to the next few months to have this discussion. As a Board, we will be looking for a written strategy that includes policy and resource recommendations from the Mayor and the Chief of Police.

At our last meeting, we voted on a recommendation from the Personnel committee. The motion to approve the Personnel Committee Report had the effect of increasing the compensation for our Personnel Director. After looking at motion requirements under the Open Meeting Act, we needed to place on record the position, name and amount associated with the Personnel Committee Report. Therefore, I am requesting that we vote to ratify last week's action to increase the wages of Dr. Marcella Anderson, Director of Police Personnel to \$120,000.00.

Under the Chief's Report, I am requesting an update on the recent newspaper report indicating the Chief had recently terminated a female officer for misconduct. Additionally, we also asked the Chief to update us on any critical issues facing the Department.

At the end of the meeting we will have public comments from the audience. Please make sure you print your name on a speaker's card. Cards are located in the back on the table or can be obtained by seeing Mr. Robert Brown. He will need your card before the beginning of public comments. We will hold each speaker to the allotted 2 minutes."

Chairman Bell also noted the recent passing of Shelby Lanier, Jr., civil rights leader involved with the Black Police Officers Movement. Shelby Lanier, Jr., Bell added forced the Louisville Police Department to diversify its police department and hire African American officers. Bell added that Lanier initiated a lawsuit for \$4.7 Million against the City of Louisville forcing changes that help shape modern policing."

**Motion:** Commissioner Eva Garza Dewaelsche moved that the Board of Police Commissioners ratify its vote from the last meeting of the BOPC recommending an increase in the wage compensation to Detroit Police Personnel Director Marcella Anderson in the amount of \$120,000.00. Second, Commissioner Lisa Carter.

**VOTE:                      Yes = 8                      No = 2 (Brown and Burton)                      MOTION APPROVED.**

**Commissioner Eva Garza Dewaelsche read into the record a resolution to acknowledge the service of retiring Detroit Police Sergeant Eren Stephens.**

#### **RESOLUTION HONORING SERGEANT EREN STEPHENS**

**WHEREAS** Eren Stephens was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on October 14, 1985. Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Officer Stephens began her career at the Seventh Precinct; and

**WHEREAS** Officer Stephens dutifully served the Seventh Precinct for several years before being promoted to Sergeant on January 1, 1999, and was assigned to the Public Information Office. On September 2, 2009, she was assigned to Police Medical Section where she remained until her retirement; and

**WHEREAS** During her law enforcement career, Sergeant Stephens was the deserving recipient of four Perfect Attendance Awards, three Chief Merit Awards, two Chief's Unit Awards, two Chief's Citations, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, and the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, and numerous letters of commendation from citizens and superiors; and

**WHEREAS** Sergeant Stephens was in charge of many of the Department's annual events, such as coordinating the Department's 911 Memorial Service and Good Fellows for the Lieutenants and Sergeants Association (LSA). She tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for 33 1/2 years. Her professionalism, commitment to public service, integrity and dedication were a credit to the Detroit Police Department. She trained and mentored numerous officers and contributed greatly to the development of many adept professional law enforcement personnel today. She was highly respected by the citizens for whom she served as a consummate professional.

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of Detroit and the Detroit Police

Department, award this resolution in recognition of Sergeant Eren Stephens 33 1/2 years of dedicated and diligent public service. Her professionalism, integrity, and standard of commitment to the city of Detroit and its citizens merit our highest regards. We thank and congratulate you, Sergeant Eren Stephens.

**Motion:** Commissioner Eva Garza Dewaelsche moved the resolution to acknowledge 33.5 years of service for Sergeant Eren Stephens. Second, Commissioner Lisa Carter.

**VOTE: Yes = 10 No = 0 MOTION APPROVED.**

**COP Police Report: Chief of Police James E. Craig.** Chief Craig reported that crime is continuing to trend downward as against last year. COP Craig reported utilizing DPD Department CompStat (2019) data for the reporting period ending March 24, 2019. COP Craig reported percentage change between 2018 and 2019, -22% decrease in Homicides, Sexual Assaults 22% increase, Robbery -9% decrease, Carjacking -53% decrease, Aggravated Assaults 11% increase, non-fatal shootings -12% decrease, Burglary -4% decrease, Larceny -16% decrease, Stolen Vehicle -7% decrease and Part 1 offenses -7% decrease. Chief Craig reported on the termination of a probationary police officer who is alleged to be involved in drug trafficking. COP indicated the investigation was still ongoing and that a warrant request will be submitted to the Wayne County Prosecutor.

**Presentations to the Board: (A) DPD Annual Operation Improvement Plan, Assistant Chief James White**

**(A) DPD Annual Operation Improvement Plan, Assistant Chief James White (AC James White).** AC White on the overall goals of the improvement plan. AC White discussed Enforcement (crime reduction, expansion of Ceasefire program, expansion of project Greenlight and the NPO Traffic program. AC White also discussed fleet deployment, new technological upgrades like Lojack and fingerprint scanners, expansion of the real Time Crime Center (RTCC) and DPD two unit. AC White also discussed improvements in overall administrative operations like a recruitment goal of 30 police candidates per month, a focus on retention of existing officers, and peer support. AC White also discussed three recent environmental audits within the Department involving the gaming unit, 6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> police precincts. AC White also reviewed a schedule of facilities improvement including Merrill Plaisance, 3<sup>rd</sup> Precinct, Grinnell Tow Yards, 8<sup>th</sup>, 10<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> Precincts and Mt. Elliot Tow yard. AC White also discussed improvement is police response time and map of the Greenlight Project. AC White concluded his presentation discussing goals for internal career enrichment programs, community and business partnerships, crime reduction strategies and increases transparency through technology (Body Worn Camera Audits).

**(B) OCI Monthly Report, Dr. Polly McCallister** reported from February 2019 OCI accepted and processed 79 citizen complaints. OCI has received 79 complaints in January 2019 as compared to 80 in January 2018, by allegations - use of profanity, incident involving "hit & run" incidents, and electronic evidence (Body Worn Cameras and Electronic Control Weapons). McCallister also reported on false allegations via Body Worn Cameras. Below, please see a table for closed February 2019 Citizen Complaints.

101 OCI CCRs CLOSED – February 2019						
153 ALLEGATIONS' FINDINGS						
Allegation	Total	Admin_ Closure (35%)	Exonerated (11%)	Inconclusive (18%)	Sustained (16%)	Unfounded (20%)
Arrest (1%)	3	1	2	0	0	1
Demeanor (24%)	44	9	2	11	9	13
Entry (1%)	0	0	0	0	0	0
Force (3%)	7	1	1	1	0	4
Harassment (2%)	8	5	0	1	0	2
Procedure (43%)	65	25	10	9	13	8
Property (6%)	9	4	1	1	2	1
Search (1%)	3	1	1	1	0	0
Service (18%)	14	8	0	4	0	25
Total (135 CCRs Closed)	153	54	17	28	24	30

**BOPC Standing Committee Reports: None.**

**Report from Secretary to the Board: None.**

**Old Business: Commissioner Willie Burton** moved for all of the BOPC subcommittee be open to BOPC members and the public, with notification. Burton also requested a legal opinion from the Board's Attorney. **Second Darryl Brown.** ROLL CALL VOTE REQUESTED.

Darryl Brown = Yes	Shirley Burch = N	Lisa Carter = N	Eva Dewaelsche = N
Annie Holt = Abstained	Evette Griffie = N	William Davis = Y	Willie Burton = Y
Elizabeth Brooks = N	Willie Bell = N	Jim Holley = Not in attendance.	

VOTE: Yes = 3, No = 6, Abstained = 1 MOTION FAILED

**Announcements:** Next BOPC meeting - April 4, 2019, 3:00 PM at Detroit Public Safety Headquarters Building, 1301 Third Street, Detroit Mi. 48226. Next community meeting April 11, 2019 @ 6:30 PM at the Wellness Plan, 4909 East Outer Drive, Detroit, MI 48234 (11<sup>th</sup> Precinct).

**Oral Communications: Ms. D. Etta Wilcoxson** raised issues related to the privacy rights of citizens with the expanded approach for surveillance discussed by the Mayor and the Department. Ms. Wilcoxson also raised the issues that with added cameras we might need police officers. She emphasized that cameras are in almost every setting and is an encroachment on privacy. She requested as the Board undertakes a policy on expanding surveillance that the Board make a sound reasonable decision.

Motion to Adjourn Commission Griffie. Adjournment at 4:26 PM.